

Outline Of Differences Between Vacellier's 16 Études and the Corresponding Ferling 48 Études

As compared to Kostis Hassiotis' 2010 critical edition of the Ferling 48 Études

Compiled by Cameron Hewes, 2021/06

No. 1: copies Ferling no. 23

changes key from F-sharp Minor to B Minor

tempo text maintained ("Andante")

- mm. 1-16 copy Ferling directly
- mm. 17-32 are new material in relative major
- mm. 33-48 copy Ferling.
- mm. 49-64 are new material in major mode.
- mm 65-72: Ending portion partially incorporates original Ferling in these bars.

No. 2: copies Ferling no. 24

changes key from F-sharp Minor to E-flat Minor.

Tempo text changed from "Scherzando" to "Allegro"

- mm. 1-16 copy Ferling directly
- mm. 17-35 are new material
- mm. 36-59 copy Ferling directly
- mm. 60-113 are new material, modulating to parallel E-flat Major
- changes key back to E-flat Minor, and copies Ferling directly for mm. 114-119.
- mm. 120 to end are new material; references original Ferling for ending, with the gradually ascending chords interspersed with repeated articulated notes.

No. 3: copies Ferling no. 47

changes key from E-flat Minor to B-flat Minor

Tempo text changed from "Grave" to "Andante"

- mm. 1-8 copy Ferling directly
- mm. 9-16 are new material
- mm. 17-24 copy Ferling directly
- mm. 25-32 are new material
- mm. 33-40 (beats 1 & 2) copy Ferling directly, and adds tempo change "Un peu plus anime"
- mm. 40 (beats 3 & 4)-48 are new material
- returns to Tempo I in m. 49, and copies Ferling directly for mm. 49-58 (adds half-note appoggiatura on downbeat of m. 58)
- mm. 59-70 (beat 1) are new material
- mm. 70 (beats 2-4)-73 copy Ferling directly
- Extends ending by one measure, by repeating last note one octave lower

No. 4 copies Ferling no. 28

Key signature is same

Tempo text changed from "Allegro spirituososo" to "Allegro"

- Substantial expanding and varying of original material. There are a few portions which directly copy Ferling, like mm. 2, 3 (beats 1-3), 13-14, 15 (octave displaced), 16-17, 19 (beats 1-3), and 60, for example.
- The chromatic scale is used in first half of m. 12, and all of m. 48, a scale not include in the original Ferling.
- mm. 22-23, 25, and 29 include leaps of 2 octaves, an interval wider than anything seen in the original Ferling.
- In general, everything is more drawn out: sequences start on lower octaves and pass through a wider amount of the instrument's range. This lengthening is most noticeably employed with the descending diminished broken chord stretched over four measures in mm. 55-58.

No. 5 copies Ferling no. 45

Key signature is same

Tempo text changed from "Andante sostenuto" to "Largo"

- mm. 1-8 copy Ferling directly (transposes m. 1's first note down an octave, and m. 5's first note up an octave)
- mm. 9-16 (through notes 1 & 2) are new material
- mm. 16 (notes 3-6)-24 copy Ferling, with slight modifications.
- mm. 25-32 continue in the F-Major key, delaying the original Ferling's switch to the relative minor mode of D-sharp Minor.
- switches to D-sharp Minor mode in m. 33, and mm. 33-44 copy Ferling directly.
- mm. 45-56 are new material, including triplet-quarter-notes broken chords, a rhythm not seen in the original Ferling.
- mm. 57-69 copy Ferling directly, with a small one-measure extension at the end by elongating the resolution to the tonic.
- While the original Ferling does have one slurred octave interval (m. 39 in Vacellier), the Vacellier has a handful more of similarly large leaps, including a ninth and tenth (mm. 25-26), and several major sevenths (mm. 17-18, 19-20, 51, 54).
- The accents in the original Ferling's mm. 21-23 (mm. 37-39 in Vacellier) are absent in the Vacellier.

No. 6 copies Ferling no. 40

changes key from G-sharp Minor to F-sharp Minor

Tempo text changed from "Allegretto" to "Scherzo"

- mm. 1-16 copy Ferling directly
- mm. 17-32 are new material, repeating initial 16 measures at a lower octave, and varying music with longer and shifted rests and inverted chord direction.
- mm. 33-56 copy Ferling directly
- mm. 57-147 are new material. This includes a 52 measure passage in a new key signature of four flats, starting in F Minor in m. 94 and briefly modulating to the relative A-flat Major later.
- mm. 148-162 copy Ferling directly
- mm. 163-177 are new material, repeating previous 16 measures at a lower octave and varying similar to before.
- mm. 178-203 are new material which precedes the original Ferling, instead of following it. While Vacellier usually states a given chunk of Ferling's original material first and only thereafter modifies it, this is an exception where the new material comes first. The chromatic scale's originally descending direction is inverted, the eighth-note placement is shifted to disrupt the expected "sway" of the 3/8 time signature, and a diminished harmony (not used in the Ferling's analogous area) is employed.
- mm. 204-227 copy Ferling directly
- Vacellier's articulation has more slurs in general compared to the original Ferling. For example, mm. 53-54 feature a descending scale which Vacellier encompasses in a single slur, and Ferling has all individually articulated.
- Vacellier includes some slurred intervals which are wider than any seen in the original Ferling, like in mm. 80 and 81, which each contain a 3-note fragment which slurs down an octave from the altissimo range, and then immediately slurs back up an octave on the next note. Articulated octave intervals are also seen in mm. 131 and 132.

No. 7 copies Ferling no. 15

changes key from B Minor to C-sharp Minor

Tempo text changed from "Largo mesto" to "Largo"

- mm. 1-12 copy ferling, except for transposing it down one octave, and changing m. 8's last three notes' rhythm from [quarter + eighth] to [triplet-quarter]
- mm. 13-28 are new material
- mm. 29-40 imitate Ferling, with the insertion of new material in mm. 32-34 & 38, transposing down one octave, and lengthening the phrase's last note from half-note to whole-note.
- mm. 62-81 imitate Ferling, with the insertion of new material in mm. 68, & 70-72, transposing down one octave, and elongating final note by 1.5 measures
- Vacellier focuses on the chalumeau register, shifting most of this etude down an octave compared to the original - the highest pitch is a clarion A5, compared to an altissimo E6 in the original Ferling (factoring in key change). He also expands on the triplet rhythm by using it a total of 17 times, and notating triplets in sixteenth-notes, eighth-notes, and quarter-notes (Ferling only uses triplet sixteenths once).

No. 8 copies Ferling no. 44

changes key from B-flat Minor to G Minor

Tempo text same (Ferling: "Tempo di Marcia", Vacellier: "Marche")

- mm. 1-8 copy Ferling, except for m. 4 beat 4 through m. 5 beat 2, where the chord is rewritten to ascend higher in range before descending
- mm. 9-17 are new material
- mm. 18-25 copy Ferling directly
- mm. 26-33 are new material, including a brief modulation to F Major which eventually returns to G Minor
- mm. 34-41 copy Ferling directly
- mm. 42-50 are new material
- mm. 51-58 copy Ferling, with some octave displacements and change in direction of the arpeggio lines being the primary alterations.
- mm. 59-100 are new material, with a modulation to B-flat Major in mm. 59-78, at which point it transitions back to cadence in G Minor in m. 84. G Minor remains for the remainder of the etude.
- Vacellier introduces two types of new material in this etude, the first, seen in mm. 9-17, is a constant triplet rhythm which recalls the characteristic rhythm of the original Ferling material. The second type of new material initially appears in mm. 26-33, which takes the opening measure of the study and switches out the triplet-eighth-notes for regular sixteenth-notes. This rhythm eventually becomes constant sixteenth notes from m. 67 onward, and the tempo even increases slightly for the last 15 measures to drive to the end.

No. 9 copies Ferling no. 39

changes key from G-sharp Minor to C-sharp Minor

Tempo text same (Ferling: "Largo", Vacellier: "Lent")

- mm. 1-37 copy the entirety of the Ferling, with a one-measure extension of the final note. The most notable change is the addition of many gruppetti, 21 in total. They occur on half-notes, dotted-quarter-notes, quarter-notes and eighth-notes, providing abundant practice of the ornament in different rhythmic contexts.
- The remaining mm. 38-109 comprise three sections of new material, each interspersing the original theme with additional notes. Mm. 38-72 present a constant flurry of sixteenth notes, mm. 73-88 use sextuplets, and mm. 89-109 use thirty-second notes.

No. 10 copies Ferling no. 43

changes key from B-flat Minor to G-sharp Minor

Tempo text same

- mm. 1-8 (downbeat) copy Ferling directly
- mm. 8 (beat 2)-17 are new material, in E Major and faster tempo
- mm. 18-25 copy Ferling directly
- mm. 26-33 (first two notes) are new material, including a modulation to E Major
- mm. 33 (last two notes)-41 copy Ferling, except that the first three notes are transposed down one octave
- mm. 42-49 are new material
- mm. 50-60 copy Ferling, excluding the two pickup notes seen in Ferling (last two notes of Ferling m. 24), and transposing mm. 50-51 up one octave).
- Vacellier maintains the key change for mm. 18-25 seen in Ferling (mm. 17-24)
- Whereas Vacellier usually maintains the order of each "chunk" of borrowed Ferling, this etude is a rare exception where the order changes; Ferling's section of mm. 17-24, in the relative major key, appears in Vacellier's adaptation *prior* to the original Ferling's section of mm. 9-16.

No. 11 copies Ferling no. 38

changes key from B Major to A-flat Major

Tempo text same

- mm. 1-8 (beat 3) copy Ferling directly
- mm. 8 (last note)-23 (beat 3) are new material
- mm. 23 (last note)-31 copy Ferling, with m. 31 adding a half-note delay of the resolution to tonic
- mm. 32-48 are new material
- mm. 49-64 copy Ferling, with m. 64 adding a half-note delay of the resolution

- mm. 65-81 (beat 2) are new material, and are marked "Poco più mosso" tempo
- mm. 81 (last note)-89 copy Ferling, returning to Tempo Primo, with m. 89 adding a half-note delay of the resolution to tonic
- mm. 89-97 are new material
- m. 74 is an example of why tuplets should always show their numerals. In this edition, which dates from a time where it was acceptable to beam three eighth-notes together in a common time signature (4/4) as opposed to breaking it into [2+1] or [1+2] (depending on the placement in the measure), it is far too easy to read the final three notes of the measure as triplet eighths, instead of normal eighths.

No. 12 copies Ferling no. 37

key is same

Tempo text changed from "Andante" to "Moderato"

- tuplet numeral is missing in mm. 4 (first 6 notes) and 31 (last 6 notes): a "6" should be marked to designate the sextuplet
- mm. 1-32 directly copy the entirety of the original Ferling
- mm. 33-128 are new material
- The majority of the etude is a virtuosic expansion on the original theme, created by interspersing the melody with increasingly quick notes. Mm. 33-64 are constant sixteenths, mm. 65-120 employ sixteenth-sextuplets, and the final 8 mm. are a flourish of thirty-second notes. A new key of B Minor is introduced for mm. 65-96, and this passage also includes a brief modulation to G Major in mm. 81-88.

No. 13 copies Ferling no. 36

key is same

Tempo text changed from "Scherzo" to "Allegro"

- mm. 1-5 copy Ferling; the first two measures are written one octave lower, and the following arpeggiated chord progression in mm. 2-5 is extended by one measure compare to the original Ferling. By extending the last two chords (pre-dominant and dominant) to twice their original duration, the listener is denied the expected "Classical" rate of harmonic change - a very strange effect.
- mm. 5-9 copy Ferling, tweaking the last chord of the phrase in beat one of m. 9
- mm. 10-18 (first 7 notes) are new material, primarily arpeggios, followed by a repetition of mm. 8-10 with the harmonies changed from diminished/minor to
- mm. 18 (last 4 notes)-50 copy Ferling's mm. 9-18, with each phrase fragment repeated and harmonically varied, stretching the original Ferling's 10 measures to 32 measures in the Vacellier. For example, the broken arpeggio sequence seen in the original Ferling's mm. 15-16 is extended an additional four measures in the Vacellier.
- mm. 51-83 copy Ferling's mm. 19-26 with similar repetitions and harmonic variations. An interesting new development occurs in Vacellier's mm. 97-73 where an arpeggio pattern is repeated with articulation alternating between slurring groups of two notes versus three notes in a given bar; this plays with the two methods of counting the compound 6/8 meter in either two or three beats.
- mm. 84-118 copy Ferling's mm. 27-34 with similar repetitions and harmonic variations.
- This study introduces almost no new material, instead repeating each of the original's phrase fragments in turn, frequently varying the harmony.

No. 14 copies Ferling no. 19

Changes key from G Minor to B Minor

Tempo text changed from "Andante" to (Nothing, it's omitted)

- mm. 1-18 copy Ferling; Ferling's resolution to tonic in m. 18 is suspended for one beat in Vacellier's m. 18.
- mm. 19-36 are new material, repeating Ferling's opening 10 bars in the new key of B Major in mm. 19-28; the rhythm is changed to sextuplet-sixteenths in mm. 25-37, and the focus on faster rhythms continues with more sextuplet-sixteenths and thirty-second-notes.
- mm. 37-38 briefly reference Ferling's mm. 19-20, but still in the altered key of B Major, with expanded new material following in mm. 39-44.
- mm. 45-52 copy Ferling directly (mm. 27-32), slightly extending the resolution of the phrase.
- mm. 53-73 are "remixed" borrowings of the Ferling's previous phrase fragments. For example, mm. 68-70 copy Ferling's mm. 34-36. The ending is extended by two additional bars of held notes.

No. 15 copies Ferling no. 48

changes key from E-flat Minor to G Minor

Tempo text changed from Allegretto to Scherzo

- mm. 1-15 copy Ferling; m. 13 is written only once, where it is immediately repeated an octave lower in the original Ferling's m. 14
- mm. 16-43 are new material which regularly references the original Ferling's trilled downbeats motive, as seen in mm. 33-34 of the Ferling, for example.
- mm. 44-55 copy Ferling, shortening the "back-and-forth" harmonic tension-building mm. 48-50 to three measures, compared to the original's five measures (mm. 21-25 in Ferling).
- mm. 55-69 are new material, transitioning a new key of G Major
- mm. 70-138 are new material which makes prominent use of single grace notes not seen in the original Ferling. The natural emphasis of the triple meter is purposefully shifted and obscured to unsettling effect for the listener, particularly in mm. 87-93. Mm. 124-132 mark a descending sequence using triplet-eighth-notes, a rhythm not seen in the original Ferling. The key changes back to 2 flats in m. 133, and mm. 133-138 continuing the transition to the original Ferling material.
- mm. 139-183 copy Ferling with only slight alterations to register and some notes. It also includes a fermata on the last note in m. 183.

No. 16 copies Ferling no. 46

changes key from F-sharp Major to E Major

Tempo text is same

- Since the Vacellier often doesn't include numerals alongside the beams for triplet notes, some measures in this etude have potentially confusing rhythms; case in point: in m. 4 of the original Ferling, the first three notes are triplets and the last three notes are normal eighths - in the Vacellier, the first three notes lack a "3" numeral denoting triplet eighths, and the onus is on the reader to extrapolate that these first three notes are meant to be triplets rhythm.
- mm. 1-8 (first 2 beats) copy Ferling directly, except the three pickup notes have been re-notated as triplet-eighths, where they were basic eighths in the original Ferling.
- mm. 9-16 (first 3 beats) are new material, emphasizing the triplet-eighth rhythm.
- mm. 16 (last beat)-24 copy Ferling directly
- mm. 25-32 are new material, evoking the declamatory, sprightly march spirit of the original Ferling etude
- mm. 33-48 copy Ferling; trills are added on m. 45's beats 1 and 3, and m. 46's downbeat
- mm. 49-68 are new virtuosic material in a "Più vivo" tempo, consisting of running sixteenths (mm. 49-60) followed by slower large leaps (mm. 61-68).
- mm. 69-74 copy Ferling directly, but then instead of continuing the original Ferling's dramatic ascending scale (m. 38 of Ferling), it resolves more gently downward with mm. 75-76, delaying the true ending by means of additional material.
- mm. 77-97 are new material which returns to the Più vivo tempo's mood, concluding the study with several measures of running sixteenths.