

Franciscans Doing Theology

An Independent Study Program

prepared by
Mary C. Gurley, O.S.F.

to accompany

The History of Franciscan Theology

Edited by Kenan Osborne, O.F.M.
Published by The Franciscan Institute, 1994

and based on

The National Franciscan Forum

Franciscans Doing Theology

June 10-15, 1997

Franciscan Center

Colorado Springs, Colorado

Franciscans Doing Theology

An Independent Study Program

prepared by
Mary C. Gurley, O.S.F.

to accompany

The History of Franciscan Theology

Edited by Kenan Osborne, O.F.M.

Published by The Franciscan Institute, 1994

and based on

The National Franciscan Forum

Franciscans Doing Theology

June 10-15, 1997

Franciscan Center, Colorado Springs, Colorado

The Franciscan Institute
St. Bonaventure University
St. Bonaventure, New York 14778
1999

Copyright © 1999
The Franciscan Institute
St. Bonaventure University
St. Bonaventure, New York 14778

Library of Congress Catalog Card Number:

99-61582

ISBN: 1-57659-165-4

Printed in the United States of America

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Preface	vii
Introduction	ix
Faculty Presenters	xi
Resources	
Video Tape Titles	xiii
List of Readings	xiv
Selected Christology Bibliography	xvi
Unit Components	xviii
Presentations	
Michael Blastic, O.F.M. Conv.	
<i>"It Pleases Me That You Should Teach Sacred Theology"</i>	
St. Francis's Letter to St. Anthony	
Outline	3
Suggested Reading	7
Follow-up Questions	8
Zachary Hayes, O.F.M.	
<i>"Of God's Fullness We Have All Received"</i>	
The Teachings of St. Bonaventure on Creation	
Outline	9
Suggested Reading	14
Follow-up Questions	15
William P. Short, O.F.M. and Margaret E. Guider, O.S.F.	
<i>The Christological Question: Why Did God Become Human?</i>	
The Teachings of John Duns Scotus	
Outlines	
Part I (Short)	17
Part II (Guider)	21
Suggested Reading	24
Follow-up Questions	25

Kenan Osborne, O.F.M. and Margaret Carney, O.S.F.	
<i>Franciscans Claiming Their Distinctive Mission</i>	
The Teachings of Bonaventure and Peter John Olivi	
Outlines	
Part I (Osborne)	27
Part II (Carney)	31
Suggested Reading	35
Follow-up Questions	36
Reflection and Synthesis	
Edward Coughlin, O.F.M.	
<i>So What Difference Does It Make?</i>	37
Anthony Carrozzo, O.F.M.	
<i>"What Has Been Ours to Do!"</i>	
Outline	41
Follow-up Questions	43
Readings	
1. "It Pleases Me. . . ."	47
2. Texts on Creation	51
3. Christ, Word of God. . . .	57
4. Redemption and Incarnation	59
5. Foundations for a Theology of Presence	61
6. Poverty Controversies	69
7. Defense of the Mendicants	73
Related Articles	
1. Blastic, "It Pleases Me. . . ."	83
2. Colosi, "The Heresy of the Franciscan Spirituals"	99
3. Doyle, "St. Francis and Theology"	107
4. Flood, "Peter Olivi on Prayer"	111
5. Gerken, "Identity and Freedom"	115
6. Hayes, "Christ, Word of God and Exemplar"	127
7. Hayes, "The Intellectual Tradition"	139
8. Higgins, "Franciscan Spirituality and Christology"	151
9. Iammarrone, "Timeliness and Limitations"	159
10. Mulholland, "Duns Scotus and Teilhard de Chardin"	173
11. Pompei, "The Role of Christ"	179
12. Saggau, "Editorial"	197
13. Short, "Pied Beauty"	199
14. Ühlein, "Facing the Christ Incarnate"	207

PREFACE

When I was a young man studying philosophy, Alexander of Hales, Bonaventure of Bagnoregio, John Duns Scotus, and William of Ockham were simply footnotes in philosophical textbooks. Generally, these footnotes briefly pointed out the theories of these Franciscan philosophers, judged them according to the Thomistic system, and set them aside as dangerous, often erroneous. This came as no surprise since Thomas Aquinas had not only been canonized but his system of thought had been mandated by Pope Leo XIII. Franciscans obeyed, vowing to live the Franciscan way of life while thinking in a Thomistic worldview, never concerning themselves with the dichotomy between feeling and thought that such an approach created.

With the Second Vatican Council's call to return to our sources, we Franciscans did so with nerve and energy. The writings of Francis and Clare were poured over, studied, and written about for new insight into the meaning of Franciscan life. The way of Francis and the style of Clare were explored, rediscovered and reinterpreted for our times.

It took longer for Franciscans to realize that it would not be enough to revitalize the life plans of Francis and Clare. It would also be imperative to study the works of those Franciscan scholars at Paris and Oxford and Bologna who philosophized and theologized out of their Franciscan experience. These philosophers and theologians discovered new perspectives and arrived at far different systems of thought than the revered Thomas Aquinas because they ventured into study with the mindset of Clare and the advice of Francis to his brother Anthony to proceed "with the spirit of prayer and devotion."

While articles on the Franciscan intellectual heritage have appeared for many years in various Franciscan journals, it was not until 1994 that The Franciscan Institute published *The History of Franciscan Theology*. This work, which was commissioned by the English-speaking Conference of The Order of Friars Minor, was edited by the eminent Franciscan theologian, Kenan Osborne. Now Franciscans would have a companion to the *Writings of Francis and Clare* that would lead them into the intellectual worlds of Alexander of Hales, Bonaventure, Peter John Olivi, John Duns Scotus, and William of Ockham. Anyone who even perused the work easily came to the conclusion that Franciscans not only live differently but they also think differently.

In 1997, in an effort to make Franciscans more aware of their astounding intellectual heritage, a gathering was held in Colorado Springs that attracted scholars and practitioners to spend a few days together viewing the gems contained in *The History of Franciscan Theology*. Our days together were structured in such a way that there was time for individual reading and study, presentations by the theologians, roundtable dialogue, and application of the theology to contemporary issues, all within the context of prayer and liturgical celebration.

This workbook is a further step to help Franciscans capture their intellectual heritage. The videos, reading materials, and study questions, prepared by Sister Mary Gurley, O.S.F., one of the participants in the 1997 Forum, provide an in-depth focus on the major conference presentations and reading selections. It is our hope in presenting them in this form that many Franciscans will not only come to know and appreciate the daring intellectual journeys of our ancestors but even more come to realize that the Franciscan lifestyle leads one to new and invigorating thought patterns.

Anthony M. Carrozzo, O.F.M.
Director, The Franciscan Institute

INTRODUCTION

The 1997 National Franciscan Forum which brought together the writings of the early Franciscan theologians, the expertise of contemporary theologians, and the interest of Franciscans from all branches of the family was rightly called *Franciscans Doing Theology*. The Forum drew its energy—and its success—from the commitment of the entire body to enter into serious study of our sources, and to do so within a model of cooperative learning, inter-dependence, and shared prayer. This *Independent Study Program* attempts to capture both the content and the dynamics of the Forum. It is offered to the wider Franciscan family with an invitation that they, too, join in the conversation to reclaim the theological foundations of Franciscan evangelical life.

The videos, study questions, and reading materials that are included in this Study Program provide an in-depth focus on the major conference presentations and are intended to guide you through the study process used at the Forum. Users of the materials are encouraged to follow the methodology outlined below.

- The keynote address, the lecture presentations, the faculty dialog, and the concluding remarks are central to the study and have been included here as uncut videos. Comprehensive outlines of their content have been prepared and should prove helpful in following the video-taped presentations.
- At the Forum, participants were given time prior to each lecture presentation to prepare specific readings and texts that had been suggested by the Forum faculty. Some participants chose to do this alone; others worked in teams, reading to one another and sharing insights. This preparation was invaluable, and users of this Study Program may wish to address the material in a similar manner. The recommended preparatory readings are included in their entirety and are referenced as “Readings” on page xiv of the section on Resources.
- Following each presentation, faculty and students engaged in small group, roundtable discussions on the content of the presentation. It is suggested that users of this Study Program follow the same process. The three sets of questions that follow each of the outlines are intended 1) to provoke discussion around the content of the presentations; 2) to widen the conversation into broader areas of understanding and action; and 3) to lead to personal reflection.
- Follow-up readings complete the study of each section. These are intended for individual or collective use and as a means of furthering the reader’s understanding of the theology. These articles were not part of the Forum itself, though faculty urged participants to continue their readings beyond the Forum experience. The follow-up readings are referenced as “Related Articles” on page xv of the section on Resources.

There are some elements of the Forum, however, that cannot be reproduced. One is the fact that participants at the Forum were fortunate to be able to interact with the presenters, who were available throughout the Forum days to field questions and to keep the theological conversation alive. While such a situation cannot be reproduced, it would be helpful to have an individual or team leader/teacher designated to assume responsibility for guiding the group through the Study Program process.

A second area of great significance to the success of the program was the prayerful environment that framed and enriched the study components. Morning prayer, evening prayer, and Eucharistic liturgy were prepared with great care and formed the context within which study was pursued. Accordingly, users of this Study Program are encouraged to situate their study in communal prayer experiences appropriate to their own circumstances.

Special thanks for their assistance in producing this workbook are due to Elise Saggau, O.S.F., Assistant Director of Publications at The Franciscan Institute, and to Megan Schutte, student assistant, who assiduously prepared copies of the articles for reprint. We are pleased to present this resource for your study.

Mary C. Gurley, O.S.F.
St. Bonaventure University

FACULTY PRESENTERS

Michael Blastic, O.F.M. Conv., is a friar of the St. Bonaventure Province, Chicago. He taught theology and courses in the Franciscan tradition at Washington Theological Union for a number of years. He is a full-time faculty member at The Franciscan Institute, St. Bonaventure University, New York, and completing a term of service as Dean of the Franciscan Studies program. He is general editor of the scholarly annual, *Franciscan Studies*.

Margaret Carney, O.S.F., is a member of the Sisters of St. Francis of the Providence of God, Pittsburgh, Pennsylvania, whom she served for eight years as general minister. Having taught for two years as a full-time faculty member at The Franciscan Institute, St. Bonaventure University, New York, she was appointed, as of June 1999, Director of the Institute and Dean of the Franciscan Studies program. She is a member of the Franciscan Pilgrimage staff and author of *The First Franciscan Woman, Clare of Assisi & Her Form of Life* (Franciscan Press, 1993).

Anthony Carrozzo, O.F.M., is a friar of Holy Name Province, New York. He served as provincial for nine years and as Director of The Franciscan Institute and Vice-President for the Franciscan Charism at St. Bonaventure University, New York, from 1996-1999. He teaches courses in the School of Franciscan Studies and has published *Refounding in the Franciscan Tradition*, essays on the province's refounding experience (St. Bonaventure, NY: The Franciscan Institute, 1994, Spirit and Life Series, 5).

F. Edward Coughlin, O.F.M., a friar of Holy Name Province, New York, is Provincial Secretary and Director of Franciscan Institute Publications. He serves many congregations as a consultant and workshop facilitator. He was Director of The Franciscan Institute from 1991 to 1996 and also taught courses in the School of Franciscan Studies, St. Bonaventure University, New York, during that time.

Margaret Eletta Guider, O.S.F., is a member of the Sisters of St. Francis, Joliet, Illinois. She teaches theology at Weston School of Theology, Cambridge, Massachusetts, and is on the summer faculty at The Franciscan Institute, St. Bonaventure University, New York. She is author of *Daughters of Rahab: Prostitution and the Church of Liberation in Brazil* (Minneapolis: Fortress Press, 1995).

Zachary Hayes, O.F.M., is a friar of the Sacred Heart Province, St. Louis. He has been a professor of historical and systematic theology at Catholic Theological Union, Chicago, since 1968 and has served as a visiting professor at the University of Notre Dame, the Franciscan School of Theology, Berkeley, and The Franciscan Institute, St. Bonaventure University, New York. He is author of *The Hidden Center: Spirituality and Speculative Christology in St. Bonaventure* (St. Bonaventure, NY: The Franciscan Institute, 1992) and *A Window to the Divine: a Study of Christian Creation Theology* (Quincy: Franciscan Press, 1997).

Kenan B. Osborne, O.F.M., a friar of the Saint Barbara Province, Oakland, California, is a professor of systematic theology at the Franciscan School of Theology and the Graduate Theological Union in Berkeley. He is author of *Sacramental Theology* (1988); *The Christian Sacraments of Initiation* (1987); *Ministry* (1993); *Priesthood: A History of Ordained Ministry* (1989); *Reconciliation and Justification* (1990); and *The Resurrection of Jesus: New Considerations for Its Theological Interpretation* (1997), all published by Paulist Press. He was editor of *The History of Franciscan Theology*, published in 1994 by The Franciscan Institute.

William Short, O.F.M., is a friar of the Saint Barbara Province, Oakland, California, and Professor of Franciscan Spirituality at the Franciscan School of Theology in Berkeley. His work focuses particularly on Franciscan spirituality in the Middle Ages. He is author of *The Franciscans* (Wilmington, DE: Michael Glazier, 1989) and has recently contributed to *St. Francis of Assisi: Early Documents*, the new "omnibus" of sources currently being published by New City Press.

RESOURCES

VIDEO TAPE TITLES

- # 1 **“It Pleases Me That You Should Teach Sacred Theology”**
St. Francis’s Letter to St. Anthony
[approximately 50 minutes]
Michael Blastic, O.F.M. Conv
- #2 **“Of God’s Fullness We Have All Received”**
The Teachings of St. Bonaventure on Creation
[approximately 60 minutes]
Zachary Hayes, O.F.M.
- #3 **The Christological Question: Why Did God Become Human?**
The Teachings of John Duns Scotus
[approximately 50 minutes]
William Short, O.F.M. and Margaret Guider, O.S.F.
- #4 **Franciscans Claiming Their Distinctive Mission**
The Teachings of Bonaventure and Peter John Olivi
[approximately 70 minutes]
Kenan Osborne, O.F.M. and Margaret Carney, O.S.F.
- #5 **So What Difference Does It Make?**
A Faculty Conversation
[approximately 50 minutes]
Edward Coughlin, O.F.M. and Faculty
- What Has Been Ours To Do**
Reflection on the Forum Experience
[approximately 15 minutes]
Anthony Carrozzo, O.F.M.

LIST OF READINGS

BASIC TEXTS:

Kenan Osborne, O.F.M., ed. *The History of Franciscan Theology*. St. Bonaventure, NY: Franciscan Institute Publications, 1994.

Damian McElrath, ed. *Franciscan Christology*. St. Bonaventure, NY: Franciscan Institute Publications, 1980 (reprinted, 1994).

READINGS (to accompany presentations):

- #1 **“It Pleases Me That You Should Teach Sacred Theology”**
[outline]
To accompany Michael Blastic presentation (see p. 47)

- #2 **“On the Creation of the Universe”**: texts from the *Breviloquium*
of St. Bonaventure
To be read prior to Zachary Hayes presentation (see p. 51)

- #3 **“Christ, Word of God and Exemplar of Humanity”** [outline]
Follow-up reading to Zachary Hayes presentation (see p. 57)

- #4 **“Redemption and the Incarnation”** from the *Ordinatio* of John
Duns Scotus
To be read prior to William Short presentation (see p. 59)

- #5 **“Foundations for a Theology of Presence”**
To be read prior to Margaret Guider presentation (see p. 61)

- #6 **“Franciscan Poverty Controversies”**
To be read prior to Margaret Carney presentation (see p. 69)

- #7 ***The Works of Bonaventure*: “Defense of the Mendicants”**
[chapter 2]
To be read prior to Kenan Osborne presentation (see p. 73)

RELATED ARTICLES:

- Blastic, Michael, O.F.M. Conv. "It Pleases Me That You Should Teach Sacred Theology: Franciscans Doing Theology." *Franciscan Studies* 55 (1998): 1-25. (See p. 83.)
- Colosi, Peter J. "The Heresy of the Franciscan Spirituals." *The Cord* 48.1 (1998): 7-17. (See p. 99.)
- Doyle, Eric. O.F.M. "Saint Francis and Theology." *The Cord* 32.4 (1982): 108-11. (See p. 107.)
- Flood, David, O.F.M., trans. "Peter John Olivi on Prayer." *The Cord* 48.1 (1998): 3-6. (See p. 111.)
- Gerken, Alexander, O.F.M. "Identity and Freedom: Bonaventure's Position and Method." Trans. Myles Parsons, O.F.M. Cap. *Greyfriars Review* 4.3 (1974): 91-105. (See p. 115.)
- Hayes, Zachary, O.F.M. "Christ, Word of God and Exemplar of Humanity: The Roots of Franciscan Christocentrism and Its Implications for Today." *The Cord* 46.1 (1996): 3-17. (See p. 127.)
- . "The Intellectual Tradition in the Franciscan Order." *Congressus Repraesentantium Sedum Studiorum, O.F.M.* Rome, July 4, 1994. (See p. 139.)
- Higgins, Michael, T.O.R. "Franciscan Spirituality and Christology." *The Cord* 48.2 (1998): 64-72. (See p. 151.)
- Iammarrone, Giovanni, O.F.M. Conv. "The Timeliness and Limitations of the Christology of John Duns Scotus for the Development of a Contemporary Theology of Christ." Trans. Ignatius McCormick, O.F.M. Cap. *Greyfriars Review* 7.2 (1988): 229-48. (See p. 159.)
- Mulholland, Seamus, O.F.M. "Duns Scotus and Teilhard De Chardin—The Cosmic Christ: Two Visions, One Voice." *The Cord* 44.9 (1994): 236-42. (See p. 173.)
- Pompei, Alfonso M., O.F.M. Conv. "The Role of Christ in Human Knowledge according to St. Bonaventure." Trans. Edward Hagman, O.F.M. Cap. *Greyfriars Review* 6.2 (1989): 211-35. (See p. 179.)
- Saggau, Elise, O.S.F. Editorial. *The Cord* 48.1 (1998): 1. (See p. 197.)
- Short, William, O.F.M. "Pied Beauty: Gerard Manley Hopkins and the Scotistic View of Nature." *The Cord* 45.3 (1995): 27-36. (See p. 199.)
- Ühlein, Gabriele, O.S.F. "Facing the Christ Incarnate: An Experience in Living Christology." *The Cord* 48.2 (1998): 50-63. (See p. 207.)

SELECTED CHRISTOLOGY BIBLIOGRAPHY

Prepared by the Franciscan Federation T.O.R, Washington, DC

- Betoni, Efrem, O.F.M. *Nothing for Your Journey*. Chicago: Franciscan Herald Press, 1959.
- Blastic, Michael, O.F.M. Conv. "The Teacher Taught: The Christology of Saint Bonaventure's Sermons on Saint Francis." *The Cord*, 36.6(1986): 163-72.
- Brady, Ignatius C., O.F.M. "St Bonaventure's Theology of the Imitation of Christ." In *Proceedings of the Seventh Centenary Celebration of the Death of St. Bonaventure*. St. Bonaventure, NY: Franciscan Institute Publications, 1974.
- Bynum, Caroline Walker. *Jesus as Mother: Studies in the Spirituality of the High Middle Ages*. Berkeley, CA: University of California Press, 1982.
- Cousins, Ewert H. *Christ of the 21st Century*. Rockport, MA: Element, Inc., 1992.
- Doyle, Eric, O.F.M. *St. Francis and the Song of Brotherhood and Sisterhood*. Reprinted. (St. Bonaventure, NY: Franciscan Institute Publications, 1997).
- Gemelli, Anthony O.F.M. *The Message of St. Francis*. Chicago: Franciscan Herald Press, 1964.
- Haught, John F. *The Promise of Nature: Ecology and Cosmic Purposes*. Mahwah, NJ: Paulist Press, 1993.
- Hayes, Zachary, O.F.M. "Christology and Metaphysics in the Thought of Bonaventure." *The Journal of Religion*, Supplement (1978).
- . "Incarnation and Creation in the Theology of St. Bonaventure." In *Studies Honoring Ignatius Charles Brady*. Ed. Romano Almagno, O.F.M. and Conrad Harkins, O.F.M. St. Bonaventure, NY: Franciscan Institute Publications, 1976.
- . *The Hidden Center: Spirituality and Speculative Christology in St. Bonaventure*. Reprinted. St. Bonaventure, NY: Franciscan Institute Publications, 1993.
- . *What Manner of Man? Sermons on Christ by St. Bonaventure*. Chicago: Franciscan Herald Press, 1974.

- Meilach, Michael D., O.F.M. *The Primacy of Christ. Doctrine and Life*. Chicago: Franciscan Herald Press, 1964.
- Mulholland, Seamus, O.F.M. "The Humanity of Duns Scotus: A Reflection on the Spirituality of Franciscan Christology." *The Cord*, 43.1 (1993): 6-12.
- Nguyen-Van-Khanh, Norbert, O.F.M. *The Teacher of His Heart: Jesus Christ in the Thought and Writings of St. Francis*. Trans. Ed Hagman, O.F.M. Cap. St. Bonaventure, NY: Franciscan Institute Publications, 1994.
- Pirkl, Margaret, O.S.F. *One Earth, One World, One Heart: Preparing for the Next Millennium—A Resource Collection for Franciscans*. Washington, DC: The Franciscan Federation T.O.R.
- . "Grieving the Earth." *The Cord* (1990): 228-35.
- . "Our Wounded World: A Testing Ground for Exploration into Goodness." *CMSM Forum* (Spring/Summer 1991), 23-36.
- Short, William, O.F.M. *The Franciscans*. Collegeville, MN: The Liturgical Press, 1989.
- Wolter, Allan, O.F.M. and Blane O'Neill, O.F.M. *John Duns Scotus: Mary's Architect*. Chicago: Franciscan Herald Press, 1993.

UNIT COMPONENTS

Each unit contains:

Video copy of the presentation

Outline of the presenter's talk

Suggested readings

Preparation for the presentation
Follow-up to the presentation

Questions

For understanding

For discussion

For personal reflection