

CD 1

- 01 Overture: The Trolley Song/Over the Rainbow/The Man That Got Away (4:40)  
(Blane, Martin/Harburg, Arlen/I. Gershwin, Arlen)
- 02 When You're Smiling (The Whole World Smiles with You) (3:13)  
(Fisher, Goodwin, Shay)
- 03 Medley: Almost Like Being in Love/This Can't Be Love (3:33)  
(Lerner, Loewe/Hart, Rodgers)
- 04 Do It Again (4:44) (De Sylva, G. Gershwin)
- 05 You Go to My Head (2:36) (Gillespie, Coots)
- 06 Alone Together (3:19) (Dietz, Schwartz)
- 07 Who Cares? (As Long as You Care for Me) (1:18) (I. Gershwin, G. Gershwin)
- 08 Puttin' on the Ritz (1:53) (Berlin)
- 09 How Long Has This Been Going On? (3:28) (I. Gershwin, G. Gershwin)
- 10 Just You, Just Me (1:20) (Klages, Greer)
- 11 The Man That Got Away (4:41) (I. Gershwin, Arlen)
- 12 San Francisco (3:42) (Kahn, Kaper, Jurmann)
- 13 I Can't Give You Anything But Love (6:14) (Fields, McHugh)
- 14 That's Entertainment (2:20) (Dietz, Schwartz)

CD 2

- 01 Come Rain or Come Shine (3:42) (Mercer, Arlen)
- 02 You're Nearer (2:04) (Hart, Rodgers)
- 03 A Foggy Day (in London Town) (2:52) (I. Gershwin, G. Gershwin)
- 04 If Love Were All (2:15) (Coward)
- 05 Zing! Went the Strings of My Heart (3:26) (Hanley)
- 06 Stormy Weather (6:02) (Koehler, Arlen)
- 07 Medley: You Made Me Love You/For Me and My Gal/The Trolley Song (3:45)  
(McCarthy, Monaco/Leslie, Goetz, Meyer/Blane, Martin)
- 08 Rock-A-Bye Your Baby with a Dixie Melody (3:01) (Lewis, Young, Schwartz)
- 09 Over the Rainbow (5:49) (Harburg, Arlen)
- 10 Swanee (2:43) (Caesar, G. Gershwin)
- 11 After You've Gone (3:00) (Creamer, Layton)
- 12 Chicago (4:42) (Fisher)

Mort Lindsey & His Orchestra (40-pieces, including Mort Lindsey, piano; John Bello, trumpet; William Lavorgna, drums; and Howard Hirsch, percussion). Recorded live by Capitol Records at Carnegie Hall, NYC, April 23, 1961. Original producer: Andy Wiswell; Recording engineer: Robert Arnold. High definition transfer by Robert Witrak, HDTT (2022), at DSD256; restoration and remastering by John H. Haley, Harmony Restorations LLC (2022), at 352.8 kHz, 24 bits (best format for post-processing DSD-originated digital recordings). Cover design by Raphael Geroni Design. Booklet, compilation, restorations and remasterings: © (p) 2022 High Definition Tape Transfers, Inc., 118 Tower Hill Road, Richmond Hill, Ontario, Canada L4E 0K6. Product of Canada. All rights reserved.



For more info e-mail us:  
[info@highdeftapetransfers.ca](mailto:info@highdeftapetransfers.ca)  
or visit our website:  
[www.highdeftapetransfers.ca](http://www.highdeftapetransfers.ca)

# JUDY GARLAND

## THE GREATEST NIGHT IN SHOW BUSINESS HISTORY



CARNEGIE HALL ♦ APRIL 23, 1961

## ***Judy Garland: The Greatest Night in Show Business History, Carnegie Hall, April 23, 1961 in High-Definition Audio***

### **COMPLETE LINER NOTES BY LAWRENCE SCHULMAN**

The late audio engineer Robert Parker once told me that his job was to try to restore the sound he was working on to what engineers of an earlier time would have done had they had today's technical capacities. His goal was not to colorize sound, but to restore it to its original colors. Are not restorers of the Sistine Chapel doing the same? His work was archeological, not personal. His goal was to find the original truth of a recording, not to alter it.

The concert by Judy Garland (June 10, 1922-June 22, 1969) at Carnegie Hall on April 23, 1961 was an event and a recording. Attendees at the concert heard the event; generations since then have heard the recording of that event. The truth of the event is subject to personal perceptions; the truth of the recording depends on the engineers who have worked on it over the years. The recording is a rendering of the event.

Garland's approach toward recording *Carnegie Hall* is well documented. As conductor Mort Lindsey stated: "Her attitude was, 'I'm going to do my concert and if you can make a record out of it, go ahead.' At one point the producer was concerned that the drums were going to be too loud on the record, but Judy just said, 'The heck with you. This is my night. We're doing a concert, we're not doing a recording.'"

The first engineer who tried to turn the event into a recording was Robert Arnold, who won a Grammy Award for Best Engineering Contribution for a Popular Recording for his work (the original double LP release was an instant hit, spending 73 weeks on the *Billboard* charts, 13 at the number one spot, and collected five Grammy Awards, including Album of the Year). Very little is known about Arnold. His son, Geoff, has stated that his father was gay, and that he died in January 1995. The website Discogs.com states that Arnold was an "American recording engineer and producer, associated often with the studios of Capitol Records in New York, active in the 1960s. Moved to Florida in the early 1970s. Died in 1995."

Arnold's *Carnegie Hall* is rambunctious, percussive, and closely miked. Whether it was he or Capitol who gave the 1961 LP extra reverb is an open question. The original 3-channel recording has been nicely folded down to stereo and is a thrilling listening experience. Garland's voice is front and center, as it should be. Despite the concert's being abridged to fit onto four LP sides (though all musical selections are included), it was this *Carnegie Hall* that left generations of listeners floored, and although the concert was remastered and resequenced onto CD by Larry Walsh at Capitol Recording Studios in 1986 and 1989, the latter of which release included some of Garland's between-song banter for the first time, listeners had to wait until the new millennium to experience the full show, newly remastered with aplomb in not one but two iterations.

DCC Compact Classics' 2000 *Judy at Carnegie Hall*, a gold CD remastered by Steve Hoffman, marked the first time that the full concert, with Garland's stories and banter with the audience, was ever released. Hoffman's goal was to rid the 1961 LP version of all extraneous artifacts and artificiality, mainly added reverb and incorrect sequencing, and make the recording what listeners in Carnegie Hall actually heard. The recording and the event were to be the same. He has stated: "I mixed and mastered *Judy at Carnegie Hall* for DCC Compact Classics using the original Capitol three-track session tapes. There were two remote Ampex 300 1/2" 3-channel tape machines in use at Carnegie Hall for the Judy taping with many surviving reels from each machine. Two machines started apart from each other so that if one machine ran out of tape, the other would catch the performance and give the engineer a chance to rethread the other machine. In this way the entire concert was caught without missing a note of the performance.... 1/2" Scotch 111 brand tape was used and the reels had this configuration: Channel one/Orchestra left, Channel two/Judy, dry, Channel three/Orchestra right. When I remixed I didn't add any fake reverb like Capitol did back in the day because I felt there was enough natural room echo on the tapes and I wanted

people to hear what it actually sounded like without fake audience overdubs or fake reverb. Some people loved it, some thought it went too far from the original Capitol version but I didn't care, I loved being able to hear what it really sounded like on that night."

Capitol's 2001 40<sup>th</sup> anniversary edition is, musically, the same as the DCC version: complete, with all of Garland's between-song banter. It differs from the DCC release in that slight reverb has been added compared to the drier DCC. In an *ARSC Journal* review at the time, the author called this version, remastered by Bob Norberg at Capitol Mastering, "resplendent."

It took until 2022, Garland's centenary, and the release of Avid Entertainment Ltd.'s *Judy at Carnegie Hall*, as remastered by Nick Dellow based on the LP, for further progress on the sound to be made. The Avid press release states that "For the first time, Garland's concert performance has been properly pitched across the entire recording (the original LP runs slightly sharp), giving her voice - and the orchestra under the direction of Mort Lindsey - greater depth, intimacy and 'pow,' as Garland put it in a 1961 *Life Magazine* profile. ...". In a 2019 interview, Dellow stated that "Lawrence Schulman and I established that most of Garland's Capitol recordings were mastered sharp...even if they weren't actually recorded sharp. I don't think there is anything particularly unusual about this. Many times I have come across tracks on 1950s and early 1960s LPs that are out of pitch. Sometimes the problem is due to a technical issue with the tape machines or acetate master cutting machine at the mastering stage. But the fact that some tracks were mastered sharp was often the result of a deliberate policy carried out by record companies in order to 'brighten' the sound, and that is especially true when it came to recordings of popular music singers. ..."

High Definition Tape Transfer's 2022 Carnegie Hall release, appropriately titled "Judy Garland: The Greatest Night in Show Business History," is also released to honor Garland on her centenary. It is the first release, ever, of this historic recording in stunning hi-def sound. Restored and remastered by Robert Witrak of HDTT and John H. Haley of Harmony Restorations LLC, it is pitched correctly and based on a superior initial high-resolution DSD 256 transfer and then restored in PCM format at a 352.8 kHz sampling rate (this is usual for DSD production, as DSD files cannot be edited for restoration). For the first time, the concert is being made available in multiple high-definition formats as a download, but also in a 44.1 kHz/16 bit CD format. In a 2014 interview, Haley stated his philosophy insofar as audio restoration: "I have to agree with my friend Jon Samuels, an audio restoration guru for many years, that the first rule of audio restoration is the same Hippocratic oath that doctors take: 'Do no harm.' It's really all about the music, not about the egos of the people who step in between the performing artist and his or her ultimate audience. The goal for a restoration person is to be invisible. If I have done a good job on something, a listener should be unaware of my work."

Just as The Beatles' *Sgt. Pepper's Lonely Hearts Club Band*, *The White Album*, *Abbey Road*, and *Let It Be*, George Harrison's *All Things Must Pass*, and The Band's *Cahoots* have all in recent years been remastered masterfully in hi-def, it is high time that *Judy at Carnegie Hall*, a legendary, multi-Grammy award-winning bestseller, be shown the same honors. This new high definition release, truly a culmination of what has come before, brings us even closer to Robert Arnold's goal of making the recording truly match the electrifying event, more closely revealing the original truth of this spine-tingling concert, one of the greatest of the 20<sup>th</sup> century.

*By Lawrence Schulman*

# ***Judy Garland: The Greatest Night in Show Business History, Carnegie Hall, April 23, 1961 in High-Definition Audio***

## ***Technical Notes by John H. Haley***

This is the first high-definition release of a famous recording of a famous concert, in a brand new restoration prepared for release in DSD256 format and other digital download formats, and also available on regular CD.

Judy Garland's live concert at Carnegie Hall on April 23, 1961 was by all accounts a pinnacle in her career as a concert artist. The great Capitol LP recording of that event, which won five Grammy Awards, including Album of the Year and Best Female Vocal Performance, remained on the *Billboard* charts for 73 weeks, including 13 weeks at the number one spot. This iconic recording has likewise become a touchstone for quality among Garland's many outstanding commercial recordings.

In the six decades since its release, as audio formats came and went, this recording was remastered a number of times in various ways to present different "slants" on it, but this new restoration and remastering, released to celebrate Garland's centennial, sets a new standard. The initial transfer was made by HDTT engineer Robert Witrak at the highest sampling rate in use today, DSD256, using HDTT's proprietary methods and superior equipment. It was then meticulously restored and remastered in DXD PCM 352.8 kHz, 24/32 bit, which is the best format for post-processing DSD-originated digital recordings, by John H. Haley of Harmony Restorations LLC.

The goal has been to present as realistic a sonic image as possible of Garland appearing live on the stage of Carnegie Hall, performing in front of the brilliant accompanying forty-piece orchestra led by Mort Lindsey. This endeavor includes precisely correct pitching (the original release and many subsequent ones were slightly sharp), as well as respect for the unique acoustic of Carnegie Hall, universally recognized as a crown jewel of the world's concert venues. Abetted by the far greater level of detail permitted by the high-definition format, this new release strives to put listeners in a prime seat in Carnegie Hall.

As we know from prior accounts, this recording was originally made in three channels, with the orchestra occupying the left and right channels in a normal stereo spread, and Garland recorded in the center channel, said to be captured "dry" (without reverb, natural or otherwise). Garland was of course using a hand-held mic that was feeding the Carnegie Hall PA system, which would have dispersed her voice throughout the hall, and we can speculate with some level of certainty that this same mic feed would have been used for the center channel of the recording.

Much has been made of the generous reverberation heard in some versions of this recording. If in fact Garland's voice was recorded "dry," then some amount of artificial reverb was certainly added to her vocals before they were mixed into the left and right channels to create the two-channel stereo version heard on most stereo releases (no three-channel version has ever been

released). Reverb has of course been routinely added to enhance pop vocal recordings since external reverb became a possibility, and Garland's commercial recordings are no exception, starting at least in the 1950's. As revealed by the greater level of detail present in HDTT's high-definition capture, the sound of the orchestra does possess a realistic presentation of the sound of Carnegie Hall, well known for both its clarity and its fulsome and rather long natural hall reverb. If artificial reverb was added to the orchestral channels to mimic the sound of Carnegie Hall (which seems doubtful), it was quite skillfully done. We believe it is likely that the hall reverb heard on the orchestral playing is entirely or at least mostly genuine, helping to create a brilliant, full-bodied yet detailed sound.

Regarding the reverb heard on the vocals, which is much less likely to be natural hall reverb, and again as heard in HDTT's detailed hi-def capture, we were struck by the extent to which the original mixers succeeded in matching the sound of Garland's voice to the reverb heard in the orchestra channels. It seems obvious that their intent was the same as ours, to present a sonic picture of Garland on the stage of Carnegie Hall in front of the orchestra, appearing together in the same sonic "envelope." But this process was nevertheless imperfect back in 1961, resulting in what many would agree is a touch of excessive vocal reverb, worse in certain spots. We have addressed this issue both overall with a light touch and with more attention given to those particular excessive spots, in an effort to keep her matching the sound of the orchestra as much as possible.

It is surprising to us how many of the past restorations of this concert have abandoned all effort to preserve the sound of Carnegie Hall or present any kind of realistic image of an actual concert taking place there, instead treating this recording more like some kind of studio recording. While we do not doubt the good intentions behind prior efforts, there seem to have been many other operative priorities in how the sound was treated.

We have also addressed any number of smaller issues, such as annoying loud low frequency thumps coming from aspirations by Garland into her mic (which we have removed) and some obvious tape splicing errors. One in particular stands out—in the opening line of her well-known theme song "Over the Rainbow," on the second syllable of the word "rainbow," Garland appears to have croaked, with an odd warble such as we do not hear from her elsewhere, in a song that she had performed hundreds of times. Close examination of this trouble spot on the waveform, on the computer screen, shows that two crude tape splices occur in this spot, a few seconds apart, so the croaking sound is clearly not anything that came out of Garland's mouth at the concert. It is hard to imagine the reason for such a crude "correction"—damage to the master tape in this spot seems like a good guess. We just repaired this spot. As another example, in another spot a bad splice resulted in a double entrance by Garland, which surely did not actually occur.

We hope that this new hi-def release will bring listeners closer than ever before to "being there" at one of the most exciting live concerts ever recorded.