Congestion Pricing for New York City


Presentation for

12-13 December 2013
Hangzhou, Zhejiang Province, China
New York City Map

Populations
- Manhattan: 1.6 million
- New York City: 8.3 million
- NYC Metro Region: 20 million
Car trips to CBD impose enormous delays on other road users

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Time period in which vehicles enter Cordon</th>
<th>Delay (hours)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Graveyard</td>
<td>1.98</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A.M. Pre-pk</td>
<td>0.47</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A.M. Peak</td>
<td>2.02</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A.M. Post-pk</td>
<td>1.98</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Midday Pk</td>
<td>1.98</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>P.M. Peak</td>
<td>2.97</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>P.M. Post-pk</td>
<td>1.38</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Outbound
Inbound

Charles Komanoff • Nurture Nature Foundation • New York
Bridges & Tunnels to the CBD

Bridges (FREE)
1. Brooklyn Bridge
2. Manhattan Bridge
3. Williamsburg Bridge
4. Queensboro Bridge

Tunnels
1. Brooklyn Battery Tunnel
2. Holland Tunnel
3. Lincoln Tunnel
4. Queens Midtown Tunnel

* Fee is based on round-trip.
1. Verrazano-Narrows Bridge
2. Marine Parkway-Gil Hodges Memorial Bridge
3. Cross Bay Veterans Memorial Bridge
4. Robert F. Kennedy-Triborough Bridge
5. Bronx-Whitestone Bridge
6. Throgs Neck Bridge
7. Henry Hudson Bridge

* Fee is based on round-trip.
What are NYC’s traffic and transportation problems?

1. **Traffic Gridlock**
   (CBD 8 am - 6 pm average: 9 mph)

2. **Underfinanced Transit System**
   (aging buses & subways)

3. **Toll Imbalance**
   (inefficient & unfair)

4. **Tailpipe Pollution**
   (problem largely solved)
What was Mayor Bloomberg’s 2007-2008 Congestion Pricing Proposal?

- All private autos entering Manhattan CBD pay $8.00 (round-trip).
- Large trucks pay extra.
- All tolls are charged only 12 x 5 (6am-6pm, Mon-Fri).
- Taxis pay $0.72 per trip (average) instead of entry fee.
- MTA bridge tolls remain.
A Comparison

Bloomberg 2007-08: Summary

**Vision**
- Environmental

**Proponent**
- Billionaire Mayor

**Features**
- $8.00 round-trip, 12 x 5
- Small taxi surcharge
- MTA bridges unchanged

**Results**
- CBD Speed gain: 8%
- Net revenue: $640M/year
- Manhattan pays: 12% of total
What is the “Move New York” Toll-Rebalancing Proposal?

• All private autos entering Manhattan CBD pay $10.66 (round-trip) — same as MTA tunnels to CBD.

• Large trucks pay extra, but only once per day.

• Taxicabs pay congestion-based surcharge averaging $1.70 per trip instead of entry fee.

• All tolls are charged 24 x 7 (every hour of year).

• Reduce round-trip toll on all “major” MTA bridges by $5.00 (for “minor” MTA bridges: $2.00 off).
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th><strong>Bloomberg 2007-08: Summary</strong></th>
<th><strong>Move NY 2014-15: Summary</strong></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Vision</strong></td>
<td><strong>Vision</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Environmental</td>
<td>• Transport/Economy</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Main Proponent</strong></td>
<td><strong>Main Proponents</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Billionaire Mayor</td>
<td>• Business + Labor + Community</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Features</strong></td>
<td><strong>Features</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• $8.00 round-trip, 12 x 5</td>
<td>• $10.66 round-trip, 24 x 7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Small taxi surcharge</td>
<td>• Larger taxi surcharge</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• MTA bridges unchanged</td>
<td>• MTA bridges $5.00 less</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Results</strong></td>
<td><strong>Results</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• CBD Speed gain: 8%</td>
<td>• CBD Speed gain: 20%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Net revenue: $640M/year</td>
<td>• Net revenue: $1,500M/year</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Manhattan pays: 12% of total</td>
<td>• Manhattan pays: 25% of total</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Tolling needs taxi surcharge and non-CBD bridge discounts to balance burden

- 70% of cab use is by Manhattan residents.
- Few Manhattan residents use non-CBD bridges.
Revenue Sources: Move NY Plan

- Toll on non-CBD inbound trips via QBB Upper Roadway
- Cordon Toll
- Toll & Fare Admin.
- Outer-Borough Toll Relief
- Cordon Toll Revenue Appropriated by NYC
- Greater Use of Outer-Borough Bridges
- More Transit Riders
- More Taxi Trips Paying "Ravitch" Surcharge
- New Medallion-Taxi Surcharge
- Zero Out Manhattanites’ Parking Rebate
- Net (Sum of All Prior Items)

New or Changed Road Tolls
MTA Windfalls
Medallion Taxi Surcharges
Misc.
Total Net Revenue

$ Million per Year
$1,750
$1,500
$1,250
$1,000
$750
$500
$250
$0

-750
-500
-250
0
$250
$500
$750
$1,000
$1,250
$1,500
$1,750
Benefits and Costs: Move NY Plan

Net Benefit: $2.4 billion/yr
Move NY Campaign: Strategy + Schedule

• Emphasize:
  – Revenue (40%)
  – Efficiency (30%)
  – Toll Equity (20%)
  – Environment (10%)

• Quietly build public and political support.

• Late 2014-Early 2015 “window”:
  – After New York State elections (Nov. 2014)
  – Plug hole in MTA Capital Plan (starts 2015)
Balanced Transportation Analyzer Spreadsheet Model (BTA)

- 5 MB XLS (Excel 2007 or later).
- 62 “tabs” (interlinked).
- Runs modified scenarios in seconds.
- Open source:
  - [http://www.nnyn.org/kheelplan/BTA_1.1.xls](http://www.nnyn.org/kheelplan/BTA_1.1.xls)
  - Or google “BTA 1.1” for link.