ISSN 2508-7835

Volume 8 | Issue II | June 2024

8

II

A Quarterly Journal
Humanities and Social Sciences
Young Scholars Worldwide

The Schola

The Schola | Volume 8 | Issue II | June 2024

Editor: Eva M Shin
Publisher: Veritaum
Editorial contact: editorial@theschola.org
Cover design: Leo Solluna

For further information on *The Schola*, visit our website: www.theschola.org.

CONTENTS

Volume 8 | Issue II | June 2024

Philosophy

Sense and Essence: The Ambiguities of Aristotle's Reception in Modern Science

Saiya Sahai Mittal '25
Pine Crest School
Florida, United States

Abstract

The history and development of science have long been focal points of academic inquiry, prompting scholarly debates regarding the enduring influence of classical natural philosophy, particularly Aristotle's. While some assert that Aristotle's philosophy of nature holds much contemporary relevance, others disagree. Scholars who dissent frequently emphasize that many Aristotelian theories, especially those related to astronomy, have been discarded and replaced by modern scientific findings, a transition prominently illustrated by the contributions of Galileo Galilei. In this paper, I contend that Aristotle's natural philosophy has significantly influenced the evolution of modern scientific disciplines, such as astronomy. Although a number of his conclusions have been rejected, Aristotle's unique methodology, centered around empirical observation, continues to shape scientific development in profound ways. To advance this claim, I first develop an interpretation of Aristotle's philosophy of nature, as it appears in *Physics*, by situating it in the discursive context of his engagement with Plato, specifically as it is revealed in the *Republic*. I then show the significance of this scientific approach in Galileo's *Dialogue Concerning the Two Chief World Systems*. This analysis emphasizes the importance of Aristotle's processes and principles, rather than his specific conclusions, in shaping contemporary scientific disciplines. By introducing empirical observation and sensory information as foundational scientific methods, Aristotle has greatly influenced and contributed to the rise of modern science.

Introduction

The ancient classical world was a period of much scientific development and significant advancement in natural philosophy. The ancient Greeks emphasized studies of the philosophy of nature, leading to the emergence of novel scientific concepts and theories.[1] Due to its intricacies, the development of science throughout history, as well as the question of the influence of the ancients, has been the focus of many academics. This has been demonstrated by scholars such as Edward Grant and Thomas Kuhn in their respective texts, *Science and Religion, 400 B.C. to A.D. 1550: From Aristotle to Copernicus* and *The Structure of Scientific Revolutions*, where they note that the influence of the ancients on the moderns is important and complex.[2,3] To understand the rise of modern science itself, it is essential to make sense of the ambiguous influence of developments from the past, as any progressive field of study, such as science, is profoundly dependent on antiquity.

From the perspective of many scholars (Casper, 1977; Drake, 1964; Schrenk, 2004), this influence is insignificant, as they view the advent of modern science as characterized by the rejection of classical Greek views and the replacement of numerous Aristotelian theories. Though attending to different facets of Aristotle's thought, these scholars nonetheless held the common viewpoint that Aristotle's conclusions about the heavens were opposed and replaced by the later conclusions of Galileo Galilei.[4,5,6]

In what follows, however, I argue that Aristotle's philosophy of nature, specifically his observational approach, shaped the work of the modern scientist Galileo Galilei. First, I review the relevant literature on the question regarding the extent to which Aristotle's natural philosophy influenced the rise of modern science. I consider perspectives that argue that Aristotelian concepts greatly influenced the development of modern science, as well as perspectives that focus on Aristotelian theories that

---

[1] For a discussion on the advancements of the Ancient Greeks, see Sarton, George. Ancient Science Through the Golden Age of Greece. New York: W.W. Norton, 1970.
[2] Edward Grant. *Science and Religion, 400 B.C. to A.D. 1550: From Aristotle to Copernicus*. Baltimore, MA: The Johns Hopkins University Press, 2006.
[3] Thomas S. Kuhn. *The Structure of Scientific Revolutions*. Chicago, IL: The University of Chicago Press, 1962.
[4] Barry M. Casper, "Galileo and the Fall of Aristotle: A Case of Historical Injustice?" *American Journal of Physics* 45, no. 4 (April 1, 1977): 325–30. https://doi.org/10.1119/1.10614.
[5] Stillman Drake, "Galileo and the Law of Inertia." *American Journal of Physics* 32, no. 8 (August 1, 1964): 601–8. https://doi.org/10.1119/1.1970872.
[6] Marcus A. Schrenk, "Galileo vs. Aristotle on Free Falling Bodies." *Logical Analysis and History of Philosophy* 7 (2004).

have been proven to be incorrect and replaced. In the following section, I take the first step in establishing Aristotle's influence by identifying his originality, which I conduct through a reconstruction of his disagreement with Plato. To complete this task, I closely analyze sections from Part 1 of Aristotle's *Physics* as well as sections of Book VI of Plato's *Republic*. I compare both philosophers' approaches to knowledge in the natural world to identify and explain Aristotle's novel perspective of primarily using sensory information to gain knowledge. In the final section, I more closely consider Aristotle's influence on modern science by focusing on Galileo's engagement with Aristotle. Through concepts analyzed in the previous section from Aristotle's *Physics*, I evaluate the use of Aristotelian natural philosophy in Galileo's *Dialogue Concerning the Two Chief World Systems*. I conclude this argument by synthesizing these diverse ideas to affirm that Aristotle's focus on empirical observation has a profound impact on modern scientific methodologies and thinking.

Literature Review

Scholarly analyses of Aristotle's modern science are often categorized into two primary groups. The first consists of those who argue that Aristotle has been significantly influential, and the second consists of those who argue that he has been replaced. While both perspectives have value, they are nonetheless marked by notable omissions that obscure Aristotle's enduring relevance.

Aristotle as Enduringly Relevant

In the view of some scholars, Aristotle innovated in the study of nature in ways that continue to influence scientific fields. Wolfgang Kullmann, in "Aristotle as a Natural Scientist," and Jochen Althoff, in "Aristotle, the Inventor of Natural Science," discuss their shared view that Aristotle's ideas and contributions to scientific methodology persist to the modern day.[7,8] Kullmann emphasizes Aristotle's contributions to biology and goes into detail about how Aristotle used his observations to create theories about the different species of animals. He notes that although Aristotle had not comprehensively understood the concept of evolution, his use of observation of the natural world in forming concrete ideas led to theories and approaches that greatly shaped those

[7] Wolfgang Kullmann, "Aristotle as a Natural Scientist." *Acta Classica* 34 (1991): 137–50. http://www.jstor.org/stable/24591937.

[8] Jochen Althoff, Paul Keyser, and John Scarborough. "Aristotle, the Inventor of Natural Science." Essay. In *The Oxford Handbook of Science and Medicine in the Classical World.* Oxford University Press, 2018.

of modern society.[9] Althoff agrees with Kullmann's notion that Aristotle branched away from Plato's sole focus on the philosophy of ideas and moved towards observational study to develop his philosophy of nature. Althoff emphasizes that Aristotle, unlike philosophers before him, focuses on physical elements of the environment and their influences on the natural world.[10] Althoff, like Kullmann, dedicates much of his work to discussing Aristotle's contributions to biology and zoology. He discusses Aristotle's creation of different groups of animals based on their physical characteristics and physical parts, which he argues has been influential to modern taxonomy.[11] Kullmann and Althoff conclude their work by claiming that even though many of Aristotle's interpretations have been replaced by more accurate ideas, his work developing the process of observing nature to draw conclusions has influenced modern science.[12,13]

Despite much summary of Aristotle's works by Kullmann and Althoff, there is an overly general engagement with their philosophic vocabulary and thoughts. This research aims to contribute to and expand upon this understanding by looking specifically at sections of Aristotle's writings for a greater analysis of his ideas. In addition, these articles solely focused on Aristotle's influence on biological sciences; however, they are limited in scope, as Aristotle also had a profound impact on other scientific fields, namely astronomy, which has largely been ignored by these scholars.[14,15,16] In this work, I aim to highlight the impact of Aristotelian thought, particularly his process of empirical observation, on the modern astronomer Galileo Galilei.

Aristotle as Superseded

Insofar as scholars have attended to Aristotle on astronomy, they have tended to fall into a second group that argues that Aristotle is largely irrelevant to modern science, specifically by emphasizing the ways in which his views were superseded by Copernicus and later, Galileo.[17,18,19] For this reason, Galileo is widely considered to have

[9] Kullmann, "Aristotle as a Natural Scientist."
[10] Althoff, "Aristotle, the Inventor of Natural Science."
[11] Althoff, "Aristotle, the Inventor of Natural Science."
[12] Kullmann, "Aristotle as a Natural Scientist."
[13] Althoff, "Aristotle, the Inventor of Natural Science."
[14] Kullmann, "Aristotle as a Natural Scientist."
[15] Althoff, "Aristotle, the Inventor of Natural Science."
[16] Casper, "Galileo and the Fall of Aristotle: A Case of Historical Injustice?"
[17] Casper, "Galileo and the Fall of Aristotle: A Case of Historical Injustice?"
[18] Drake, "Galileo and the Law of Inertia."
[19] Schrenk, "Galileo vs. Aristotle on Free Falling Bodies."

created his own path in scientific inquiry through his rejections of, rather than additions to, previous work done by Aristotle. In the essay "Galileo vs. Aristotle on Free Falling Bodies," Marcus A. Schrenk contrasts Aristotle's theory relating weight and the speed of free-falling objects with that of Galileo. The essay clearly states that Galileo rejected Aristotle's theory, proved it incorrect, and created his own, opposing theory.[20] Similar concepts are discussed in Barry M. Casper's article, "Galileo and the Fall of Aristotle: A Case of Historical Injustice?" This article also focuses on Aristotle's theory on falling objects and Galileo's rejection of this theory, strengthening the perspective of many modern scientists who view Aristotle's scientific theories and conclusions to be outdated and incorrect.[21] In the paper "Galileo and the Law of Inertia," Stillman Drake discusses Galileo's distinct definition of motion, as well as his disagreement with Aristotle's definitions of motion.[22] These scholars view Aristotle's thoughts in the fields of physics and astronomy as having been rejected and replaced by modern scientists such as Galileo. As a result, a notable amount of Aristotelian logic has been left in the past and is commonly perceived as obsolete.[23,24,25]

Though the literature captures an important dimension of Galileo's treatment of Aristotle, it is nonetheless limited, as it focuses on an unduly limited portion of Aristotle's scientific writings. While it is true that Galileo's conclusions oppose those of Aristotle's as stated in astronomical texts such as *On the Heavens*, it is also necessary to consider the ways in which Galileo's work has been influenced by Aristotelian concepts from non-astronomical texts such as *Physics*.[26,27] One objective of this research is to exemplify the use of Aristotelian ideas from *Physics* in Galileo's arguments and conclusions to illustrate the influence of Aristotle on modern science.

---

[20] Schrenk, "Galileo vs. Aristotle on Free Falling Bodies."
[21] Casper, "Galileo and the Fall of Aristotle: A Case of Historical Injustice?"
[22] Drake, "Galileo and the Law of Inertia."
[23] Casper, "Galileo and the Fall of Aristotle: A Case of Historical Injustice?"
[24] Drake, "Galileo and the Law of Inertia."
[25] Schrenk, "Galileo vs. Aristotle on Free Falling Bodies."
[26] Aristotle. "The Internet Classics Archive: On the Heavens by Aristotle." Translated by J. L. Stocks. The Internet Classics Archive | On the Heavens by Aristotle. Accessed March 7, 2024. https://classics.mit.edu/Aristotle/heavens.2.ii.html.
[27] Aristotle. "The Internet Classics Archive: Physics by Aristotle." Translated by R.K. Gaye and R.P. Hardie. The Internet Classics Archive | Physics by Aristotle. Accessed March 1, 2024. https://classics.mit.edu/Aristotle/physics.1.i.html.

The Development of Aristotle's Philosophy of Nature

To understand Aristotle's influence, it is necessary to first gain a clear understanding of just what his views were. To provide such an understanding, in what follows, I reconstruct the basis of Aristotle's philosophy of nature, which I do so by situating his remarks in the discursive context of his engagement with Plato. While Plato's thinking considered sensory information to be only a preliminary form of knowledge and held abstract reasoning to be of the highest value, Aristotle's thinking emphasized the importance of observation as the primary means of learning and gaining knowledge.[28,29]

Philosophy of Nature Before Aristotle: The Ideologies of Plato

Aristotle develops his views by distancing himself from previous thinkers. In Part 8 of Book 1 of Aristotle's *Physics*, he describes the way in which earlier thinkers thought of nature and contrasts his opinion with theirs. Aristotle states that the first thinkers were misled in their study of nature. He writes, "They say that none of the things that are either comes to be or passes out of existence, because what comes to be must do so either from what is or from what is not, both of which are impossible."[30] What Aristotle means by this is that earlier philosophers were not properly able to study the ideas of change and existence, as they dismissed the idea of something new evolving from something preexistent. Earlier philosophers believed that it was impossible for something to come from something that already exists because if a thing already exists, nothing new can come from it. They also thought something new could not emerge from nothing, as they held the view that everything must have a fundamental basis to start with.

In these remarks, Aristotle appears to be referencing Plato. In the *Republic*, Plato offers an account of knowledge where he details his point of view and thoughts. Whereas Aristotle's works describe the value of visual observation to learn about the world and its processes of change and existence, Plato's *Republic* sets up a contrasting foundation of knowledge. Plato's *Republic* is written as a dialogue between himself and his teacher, Socrates, which allows Plato to explore his own philosophical ideas through extended and insightful discussions that prompt him to answer challenging questions about his thoughts.

---

[28] Plato, Allan Bloom, and Adam Kirsch. *The Republic of Plato*. New York: Basic Books, 2016.
[29] Aristotle, "The Internet Classics Archive: Physics by Aristotle."
[30] Aristotle, "The Internet Classics Archive: Physics by Aristotle."

To discuss his philosophy of nature in Book VI of the *Republic*, Plato uses an analogy of a line divided into four sections.[31] The line has two main sections: the "visible" and the "intelligible," and each of these sections is divided into two sections of its own. When referring to these sections, Plato references ideas that will be fully developed in Book VII, which involve the concepts of "Being" and "Becoming." "Being" and "Becoming" are two important concepts of philosophical thought that Plato often focused on in his thinking and writing. Plato discusses "Being" when referring to the stability of things or ideas that exist eternally. On the other hand, he discusses "Becoming" when referring to entities that evolve or alter, signifying their emergence into existence and subsequent dissolution.[32]

Plato begins his analysis with a discussion of the visible segment of the line. This is representative of the physical world that can be perceived through vision and the other senses, which corresponds to the realm of "Becoming." In his discussion of this concept, Plato says, "In terms of relative clarity and obscurity, you'll have one segment in the visible part for images. I mean by images first shadows, then appearances produced in water and in all close-grained, smooth, bright things, and everything of the sort."[33] In this section, Plato describes the first section of the visible segment of the line, which he classifies as the "obscurity" segment. The obscurity represents shadows and reflections of physical objects that are produced by water and light on shiny surfaces. Here, Plato discusses that the first step in his four-step path to knowledge is seeing unclear or indirect representations of the real world. The next step in Plato's philosophy of nature is the second section of the visible segment of the line, which he defines as "the animals around us, and everything that grows, and the whole class of artifacts."[34] Plato discusses the second section of the visible segment as processing the physical world directly through one's senses, rather than relying on perceptions through shadows and reflections. The second step in Plato's path to knowledge is the observation of animals, plants, and objects in the world around him.

Plato holds the intelligible segment to a higher value than the visible segment, as he views the visible segment to be a preliminary form of knowledge. The intelligible segment of the line is a representation of abstract concepts and ideas that cannot be perceived physically using one's senses. Plato discusses the first section of the intelligible line

[31] Plato, *The Republic of Plato*.
[32] Plato, *The Republic of Plato*.
[33] Plato, *The Republic of Plato*.
[34] Plato, *The Republic of Plato*.

segment as "using as images the things that were previously imitated, is compelled to investigate on the basis of hypotheses and makes its way not to a beginning but to an end."[35] In this statement, Plato differentiates the intelligible segment of the line from the visible segment. The intelligible segment, rather than using sensory information to draw conclusions, uses hypotheses, reason, and universal truths to reach conclusions, which is representative of the realm of "Being." Plato further expands on this section of the line by providing examples of geometry and calculation, as these concepts use previous information and conclusions to solve novel problems and reach a true form of knowledge. The second section of the intelligible segment is described by Plato as "that which argument itself grasps with the power of dialectic, making the hypotheses not beginnings but really hypotheses – that is, steppingstones and springboards – in order to reach what is free from hypothesis at the beginning of the whole."[36] By this, Plato attempts to convey that the ultimate phase in his philosophy of nature is when hypotheses cease to serve as mere starting points; instead, they are viewed as incremental steps on the path to attaining an understanding completely independent of hypotheses. In Plato's philosophy of nature, the pinnacle of knowledge is the understanding of abstract forms and ideas not rooted in hypotheses that are dependent on sensory information.

Plato's philosophy of nature described empirical observation and information gained through the senses to be only a beginning form of knowledge. He held much higher value for the contemplation of abstract concepts that were not rooted in the physical world, as he believed that these concepts were the highest form of knowledge and education.[37] Aristotle, however, expanded on and moved away from this idea in ways that helped to make room for empirical observation of the physical world.[38] It is insightful to examine first how Aristotle disagreed with Plato.

Aristotle's Unique Philosophy of Nature

In his discussion of earlier views on evolution and existence that argued the impossibility of the creation of anything new, as developed in *Physics*, Aristotle indicates a flaw in the early thinkers and philosophers. He writes that they "exaggerated the consequence" of this idea.[39] Earlier

---

35 Plato, *The Republic of Plato*.
36 Plato, *The Republic of Plato*.
37 Plato, *The Republic of Plato*.
38 Aristotle, "The Internet Classics Archive: Physics by Aristotle."
39 Aristotle, "The Internet Classics Archive: Physics by Aristotle."

thinkers believed that it was impossible for something new to come out of something already existing or out of nothing. Aristotle believed that this overgeneralization prevented philosophers such as Plato from gaining an understanding of evolution and existence. Aristotle writes that the "exaggeration" and incorrect universal application of this thought process led earlier philosophers "to deny even the existence of a plurality of things, maintaining that only Being itself is."[40] Here, Aristotle emphasizes the fault of earlier thinkers, which is the belief that only one thing exists: "Being." Aristotle expresses that the consequence of this fault is that earlier thinkers ignored the reality of the change and evolution of many things that came to be. Rather, they solely focused on the existence of the "Being," the eternal concepts or objects that do not undergo growth and change the way that most natural objects do. Aristotle references the concepts of "Being" and "Becoming" developed by Plato, but provides a contrasting interpretation. While Plato holds a higher value for "Being," Aristotle's philosophy of nature emphasizes the concept of "Becoming."

Aristotle's focus on "Becoming" shapes the way he approaches his study of the natural world. Aristotle connects his philosophical statements to examples in the natural world by saying that, "in every case something that underlies from which proceeds that which comes to be; for instance, animals and plants from seed."[41] Here, Aristotle focuses on the "Becoming" by giving an example of his notion that there is an underlying substance for everything that grows, changes, or evolves; a seed is an underlying substance that eventually can transform into plants or animals. This understanding of nature may seem simplistic now, but was a novel understanding at the time of Aristotle's study.

Aristotle emphasizes the use of observation and classification through his description of the complexity of objects as coming "to be from both subject and form."[42] He states the importance of studying an object in terms of its many different elements, and writes, "It is clear then that what comes to be will come to be from these elements."[43] By this, Aristotle aims to convey that everything that comes into existence has a subject and a form that its subject takes, which can be made up of many different elements. He believes that breaking an object into its elements of "subject and form" will allow for greater understanding and analysis of the growth and change of the object as a whole. Aristotle also states that "Now the subject is one numerically, though it is two in

---

[40] Aristotle, "The Internet Classics Archive: Physics by Aristotle."
[41] Aristotle, "The Internet Classics Archive: Physics by Aristotle."
[42] Aristotle, "The Internet Classics Archive: Physics by Aristotle."
[43] Aristotle, "The Internet Classics Archive: Physics by Aristotle."

form," meaning that although the subject that is undergoing a change is counted as one singular whole object, there are multiple qualities or characteristics that the object may take.[44]

Expanding on this idea, Aristotle posits that natural objects are founded upon three principles. He states, "This then is one principle (though not one or existent in the same sense as the 'this'), and the definition was one as we agreed; then further there is its contrary, the privation. In what sense these are two, and in what sense more, has been stated above. Briefly, we explained first that only the contraries were principles, and later that a substratum was indispensable, and that the principles were three."[45] Aristotle establishes the three principles of natural objects as the substratum, the underlying substance of everything that goes through change; the "one principle," which is the quality that may be being applied to this substratum; and finally, the privation, which is the opposite of the "one principle" or quality that represents its absence. Aristotle's analysis of the way things grow, change, and come into existence introduced the significant process of learning based on detailed observations of the natural world, therefore advancing the previously understood philosophy of nature and progressing toward the study of modern science.

An important implication of Aristotle's philosophy of nature, especially his rethinking of the nature of being, is that it marks a shift in the understanding of what needs to be done to learn about the natural world. A paramount feature of Aristotle's work is that it moves away from earlier thinkers,' such as Plato's, focus solely on the "Being" and moves towards a study of the "Becoming."[46,47] By focusing on the "Becoming," Aristotle is able to consider processes of existence and change in the natural world, and he does so through visual observation. The Aristotelian focus on "Becoming," change, and growth focuses primarily on empirical evidence and observation. Aristotle's reliance on visual observation to gain an understanding of the natural world diverges from Plato's view that only a preliminary understanding can be gained through visual information. Through the visual analysis of many complexities of transformation and existence, Aristotle was able to use logical, scientific reasoning to draw his own novel conclusions. These conclusions included the creation of a classification system for objects in the natural world, the development of a thorough understanding of many aspects of nature, and the establishment of empirical observation

[44] Aristotle, "The Internet Classics Archive: Physics by Aristotle."
[45] Aristotle, "The Internet Classics Archive: Physics by Aristotle."
[46] Aristotle, "The Internet Classics Archive: Physics by Aristotle."
[47] Plato, *The Republic of Plato*.

as a central process in scientific methodology, all of which endure to this day in some manner.[48,49]

The Influence of Aristotle on Modern Science: The Case of Galileo

To further understand the ways in which Aristotle's analysis of nature has an enduring influence not only on modern biological thought but also on other fields of scientific thought, namely astronomy, I now examine Galileo's perspective on Aristotle. As noted previously, many academics consider Galileo to have been fully critical of Aristotle's views; however, in this section, I suggest that there is a strong current of agreement with Aristotle running through Galileo's work.[50,51,52]

Galileo's Rejection of Aristotelian Conclusions

The *Dialogue Concerning the Two Chief World Systems*, written by Galileo, is structured as a discussion in which Galileo presents his theories on the universe and proposes a heliocentric model, therefore rejecting Aristotle's geocentric model.[53] Throughout this dialogue, Galileo develops a disagreement with Aristotle regarding theories of position and movement in the universe. In *On the Heavens*, Aristotle claims that the Earth does not revolve around the sun; rather, the Earth is stationary at the center of the universe, and the other celestial bodies revolve around it. To support his claim that the Earth is central and stationary, Aristotle also outlines his theory of the immutability of the heavens. Aristotle proposed that celestial bodies are made out of a pure and unchanging substance, which then led him to conclude that the heavens are eternal and not subject to any change.[54] Contrastingly, Galileo contends that the sun is the center of the universe; therefore, the Earth and the other planets revolve around the sun. Galileo rejects the idea of the immutability of the heavens following his observations of sunspots and the moon's changing appearance and surface. These observations provided Galileo with empirical evidence that celestial bodies were not made of perfect, unchanging substances.[55] Galileo consequently rejected this Aristotelian theory and formed his subsequent

[48] Althoff, "Aristotle, the Inventor of Natural Science."
[49] Kullmann, "Aristotle as a Natural Scientist."
[50] Casper, "Galileo and the Fall of Aristotle: A Case of Historical Injustice?"
[51] Drake, "Galileo and the Law of Inertia."
[52] Schrenk, "Galileo vs. Aristotle on Free Falling Bodies."
[53] Galileo Galilei. Edited by S.E. Sciortino. Translated by Stillman Drake. *Dialogue Concerning the Two Chief World Systems.* Accessed March 1, 2024. https://www.reed.edu/math/wieting/mathematics537/Dialogue1.pdf.
[54] Aristotle, "The Internet Classics Archive: On the Heavens by Aristotle."
[55] Galileo Galilei, *Dialogue Concerning the Two Chief World Systems*.

conclusion that the heavens are imperfect and mutable. This led Galileo to believe that Aristotle's conclusion of a stationary, immutable, and central Earth in the universe may be incorrect.

The Influence of Aristotelian Methodology on the Work of Galileo

However, despite the fact that his conclusions are in opposition to the conclusions made by Aristotle, Galileo significantly drew on Aristotle's philosophy of nature and approach to science to form his conclusions. When referring to Aristotle's conclusion of the immutability of the heavens, Galileo describes the methodology used by Aristotle. Galileo writes that he believes that Aristotle "first obtained [his argument] by means of the senses, experiments, and observation, to assure himself as much as possible of his conclusions."[56] Here, Galileo highlights Aristotle's reliance on sensory information and empirical observation as his primary means of drawing conclusions. Galileo says that after Aristotle had formed conclusions through observation, he then "sought to make them demonstrable…because when the conclusion is true, one may by making use of analytical methods hit upon some proposition which is already demonstrated, or arrive at some axiomatic principle; but if the conclusion is false, one can go on forever without ever finding any known truth – if indeed one does not encounter some impossibility or manifest absurdity."[57] Galileo claims that Aristotle developed his thoughts and conclusions using sensory data rather than abstract arguments.

The fact that Galileo's conclusions oppose those of Aristotle makes it seem as if Galileo completely rejects Aristotelian natural philosophy; however, in reality, Galileo agrees with Aristotle far more than is at first apparent. Galileo explains the importance of Aristotle's scientific approach: first relying on sensory information before moving to analytical concepts of logic and reasoning. After using visual observation to build an initial basis to form conclusions, Aristotle then proceeds to validate his conclusions through the use of analytical methods. Galileo believes that the respective steps in this process are essential to drawing new scientific conclusions. This is due to the idea that when a conclusion is unobservable and consequently false, the pursuit of knowledge will be endless and futile. Galileo contends that analytical thinking will never lead to truth and discovery where a conclusion is false; Aristotle's approach avoids false conclusions by first using sensory information to form a true, observable conclusion as an

[56] Galileo Galilei, *Dialogue Concerning the Two Chief World Systems*.
[57] Galileo Galilei, *Dialogue Concerning the Two Chief World Systems*.

initial basis.[58,59] Analytical methods such as logical reasoning and deduction can then be applied to derive additional information, principles, and conclusions, leading to a more comprehensive form of knowledge, which is based on sensory perception. Through this description, Galileo expresses agreement with Aristotle's methodology; this is evident in Galileo's own work, as, regardless of his conclusions and having been influenced by Aristotle, Galileo centers his studies around sensory information and empirical observation.[60]

Having suggested that Aristotle developed his claims through sensory data rather than through abstract reasoning, Galileo goes on to offer the additional claim that, had his predecessor had access to the same sensory observations, he would have reached the same conclusions as Galileo himself. When considering two aspects of Aristotle's work, Galileo writes that "of the two propositions, both of them Aristotelian doctrines, the second – which says it is necessary to prefer the senses over arguments – is a more solid and definite doctrine than the other, which holds the heavens to be inalterable." The first Aristotelian idea that Galileo describes is that the "heavens," which refers to celestial bodies such as planets and stars, are immutable. Although Galileo disagrees with this idea, he agrees with the second Aristotelian idea, which is that observations made through the senses should be valued more highly than theoretical explanations.[61] Galileo's emphasis on the importance of Aristotle's scientific advancement of using visual observation and empirical evidence to accurately understand the world clearly demonstrates Aristotelian influence in his thinking.[62] To further this assertion, Galileo states that "it is better Aristotelian philosophy to say 'Heaven is alterable because my senses tell me so,' than to say, 'Heaven is inalterable because Aristotle was so persuaded by reasoning.' Add to this that we possess a better basis for reasoning about celestial things than Aristotle did."[63] Here, Galileo emphasizes the importance of the Aristotelian development of empirical observation as the primary way to learn about the universe. Galileo argues that Aristotle's philosophy of nature would support a rejection of Aristotle's conclusions if this rejection were reinforced by visual evidence.[64] Observation holds the highest value in Aristotelian natural philosophy; therefore, Galileo believes that in the case that it contradicts Aristotle's conclusions, observation should be prioritized regardless. Specifically, Galileo

[58] Galileo Galilei, *Dialogue Concerning the Two Chief World Systems*.
[59] Aristotle, "The Internet Classics Archive: Physics by Aristotle."
[60] Galileo Galilei, *Dialogue Concerning the Two Chief World Systems*.
[61] Galileo Galilei, *Dialogue Concerning the Two Chief World Systems*.
[62] Aristotle, "The Internet Classics Archive: Physics by Aristotle."
[63] Galileo Galilei, *Dialogue Concerning the Two Chief World Systems*.
[64] Galileo Galilei, *Dialogue Concerning the Two Chief World Systems*.

contends that it would not be appropriate to conclude that the heavens are immutable solely based on the fact that Aristotle believed this to be so. He claims that using sensory perception to conclude that the heavens are moving and changing would align with Aristotelian logic to a greater extent than blindly accepting Aristotle's conclusions would.[65,66]

However, Galileo provides reasoning as to why he can draw more complete and accurate conclusions about the planets and the stars than Aristotle did. Galileo provides an explanation for Aristotle's incorrect conclusions by stating that, "[Aristotle] admitted such perceptions to be very difficult for him by reason of the distance from his senses, and conceded that one whose senses could better represent them would be able to philosophize about them with more certainty."[67] Since it was very hard for Aristotle to gather visual information about the heavens, he was unable to draw accurate conclusions. Conversely, due to Galileo's access to more advanced tools such as the telescope, he was able to directly observe the universe to draw accurate conclusions. Galileo indicates that the invention of the telescope significantly improved scientists' ability to observe the universe and its celestial bodies in detail, leading to greater confidence in their studies of the heavens.[68]

Based on these passages, then, it is shown that Aristotle's influence on Galileo is more complex than it first appears to be. It is true that Galileo's conclusion of the alterability of the heavens, as well as his rejection of the geocentric model in favor of the heliocentric model of the universe, directly opposed Aristotle's scientific conclusions. However, Galileo reached his conclusions using Aristotelian scientific processes of empirical observation and sensory perception.[69,70] Without Aristotle's approach and advancements in the field of scientific research, Galileo would have been unable to confidently and accurately reach his conclusions. Galileo's conclusions are essential when considering the history of astronomy, as the heliocentric model, as well as the discovery of the mutability of the heavens, was arguably the start of modern astronomy and the basis of further developments in the field. Despite Aristotle's astronomical theories being opposed and replaced by Galileo's, his concepts and empirical approach, particularly as highlighted in *Physics*, have evidently persisted throughout the history of science. Aristotle's moving away from universal, theoretical beliefs and moving

---

[65] Aristotle, "The Internet Classics Archive: Physics by Aristotle."
[66] Galileo Galilei, *Dialogue Concerning the Two Chief World Systems*.
[67] Galileo Galilei, *Dialogue Concerning the Two Chief World Systems*.
[68] Galileo Galilei, *Dialogue Concerning the Two Chief World Systems*.
[69] Aristotle, "The Internet Classics Archive: Physics by Aristotle."
[70] Galileo Galilei, *Dialogue Concerning the Two Chief World Systems*.

towards detailed, visual observation as a primary form of knowledge is responsible for influencing modern scientists' abilities to advance in their respective scientific fields.

Conclusion

Aristotle's philosophy of nature emphasized the importance of observation to understand changes that occur in natural processes. While Plato viewed sensory information as a preliminary step to knowledge, Aristotle viewed it as the primary form of information. Consequently, Aristotle was able to focus on processes of evolution and change, which had not previously been explored or understood by earlier thinkers such as Plato. By moving away from Plato's reliance on a universal realm of truth and moving towards empirical observation to gain knowledge beyond these thoughts, Aristotle was able to study the natural world in greater detail. The importance of observation and sensory information in Aristotelian thought influenced not only the biological fields of science but also the field of astronomy. The work and conclusions of Galileo Galilei, supporting the alterability of the heavens and the heliocentric model of the universe, were made possible by the Aristotelian scientific process of observation. Without understanding the importance of empirical investigation to gain detailed information about the universe, Galileo would likely not have been as successful in his discoveries. Although today, the idea that processes of observation and sensory perception are essential to scientific research is not credited to Aristotle, it was Aristotle's thinking that marked a shift and the start of this new, modern approach to scientific thought.

The novel focus of this paper, looking at Galileo's texts on astronomy through the philosophical lens of Aristotle's *Physics* rather than the cosmological lens of Aristotle's *On the Heavens*, has drawn attention to the robust influence of ancient scientific thought on modern science, specifically the modern field of astronomy. Rather than viewing Galileo's conclusions as a complete opposition to and rejection of Aristotle's astronomical conclusions, I focused on the process Galileo used to reach his conclusions. The processes Galileo used in his astronomical work are deeply interconnected with the processes outlined by Aristotle in *Physics* for observing and understanding the natural world, proving the strong influence of Aristotelian thought on the rise of modern science. Understanding this influence is essential, as gaining comprehensive insight into the historical development and evolution of scientific ideas and methodologies will allow modern scientists to work more successfully to overcome the scientific challenges of the present day. Scientific ideas from the ancient classical world have continued to have a significant influence on the modern approach to science, and they are constantly being used, modified, and reused to gain an appreciation for scientific knowledge and progress in the future.

Bibliography

Althoff, Jochen, Paul Keyser, and John Scarborough. "Aristotle, the Inventor of Natural Science." Essay. In *The Oxford Handbook of Science and Medicine in the Classical World*. Oxford University Press, 2018.

Aristotle and William Charlton. *Aristotle Physics: Books I and II*. Oxford University Press, 1970.

Aristotle. "The Internet Classics Archive: On the Heavens by Aristotle." Translated by J. L. Stocks. The Internet Classics Archive | On the Heavens by Aristotle. Accessed March 7, 2024. https://classics.mit.edu/Aristotle/heavens.2.ii.html.

Aristotle. "The Internet Classics Archive: Physics by Aristotle." Translated by R.K. Gaye and R.P. Hardie. The Internet Classics Archive | Physics by Aristotle. Accessed March 1, 2024. https://classics.mit.edu/Aristotle/physics.1.i.html.

Bodnar, Istvan. "Aristotle's Natural Philosophy." *Stanford Encyclopedia of Philosophy*, April 24, 2023. https://plato.stanford.edu/entries/aristotle-natphil/#NatuFourCaus.

Casper, Barry M. "Galileo and the Fall of Aristotle: A Case of Historical Injustice?" *American Journal of Physics* 45, no. 4 (April 1, 1977): 325–30. https://doi.org/10.1119/1.10614.

Drake, Stillman. "Galileo and the Law of Inertia." *American Journal of Physics* 32, no. 8 (August 1, 1964): 601–8. https://doi.org/10.1119/1.1970872.

Galilei, Galileo. Edited by S.E. Sciortino. Translated by Stillman Drake. *Dialogue Concerning the Two Chief World Systems*. Accessed March 1, 2024. https://www.reed.edu/math/wieting/mathematics537/Dialogue1.pdf.

Grant, Edward. *Science and Religion, 400 B.C. to A.D. 1550: From Aristotle to Copernicus*. Baltimore, MD: The Johns Hopkins University Press, 2006.

Kuhn, Thomas S. *The Structure of Scientific Revolutions*. Chicago, IL: The University of Chicago Press, 1962.

Kullmann, Wolfgang. "Aristotle as a Natural Scientist." *Acta Classica* 34 (1991): 137–50. http://www.jstor.org/stable/24591937.

Plato, Allan Bloom, and Adam Kirsch. *The Republic of Plato*. New York: Basic Books, 2016.

Sarton, George. *Ancient Science Through the Golden Age of Greece*. New York: W.W. Norton, 1970.

Schrenk, Marcus A. "Galileo vs. Aristotle on Free Falling Bodies." *Logical Analysis and History of Philosophy* 7 (2004).

Literature

Maxine Hong Kingston's Disruption of Category in *The Woman Warrior*

Cheryl Chen '25
Havergal College
Ontario, Canada

Abstract

The Woman Warrior: Memoirs of a Girlhood Among Ghosts (1976) by Maxine Hong Kingston is an autobiographical novel that stirred controversy upon its reception. Released amidst the so-called Canon Wars of the late twentieth century, the book was lauded for "breaking into the canon"; however, it simultaneously faced substantial criticism for its depiction of Chinese-American culture. Both responses, however, failed to understand Kingston's own resistance to categorization. This paper re-examines Kingston's *The Woman Warrior* as an extension of her disruption of cultural and literary categories. After introducing the text and author, it explores the book's place in contemporary conversations of multiculturalism and traditionalism, both of which seek to highlight *The Woman Warrior* as *the* narrative standard for the Asian-American experience. In contrast, the essay posits that Kingston's work attempts to challenge cultural stereotyping and the expectation placed on minority writers to embody an entire culture. The second half of the paper performs a close reading of Kingston's work, highlighting how this disruption of category continues at every level. Through disruption (of myth, gender standards, taboos), Kingston articulates her personal struggles against those forces of oppression. Ultimately, this paper contends that Kingston's life narrative should be viewed as an extension of her struggle against narrative constraints and the very idea of a literary canon.

Introduction

In traditional Chinese mythology, the dragon (*loong*) has no wings. Its body is snake-like, weaving in and out of clouds; more fluid than the beast. As Kingston writes, "The dragon lives in the sky, ocean, marshes, and mountains; and the mountains are also its cranium…sometimes the dragon is one, sometimes many."[1] The Chinese dragon is a creature so pervasive that it becomes elusive, refusing to be caught or contained. A beautiful paradox, the nature of the dragon mirrors that of Maxine Hong Kingston's *The Woman Warrior*: *Memoirs of a Girlhood Among Ghosts*, a piece of literature that subverts any direct genre of categorization, both in its form and content.

Maxine Hong Kingston is a Chinese-American writer born and raised in California. After graduating from Berkeley, Kingston taught English and math while writing on the side. Kingston became renowned in the world of American literature with the publication of *The Woman Warrior* in 1976, which won the year's National Book Critics Circle Award for Nonfiction. Known for her engagement in ethnical and feminist frameworks, Kingston is considered one of the most prominent yet controversial Asian American writers of her time. Even today, academic and public reception of her avant-garde approach towards cultural portrayal and life-writing oscillates between celebration and criticism.

The semi-autobiographical text begins with Kingston's mother, Brave Orchid, forbidding her from doing exactly what this text sets out to do: speak openly. "'You must not tell anyone,' my mother said, 'what I am about to tell you'."[2] What unravels is an idiosyncratic autobiography that follows our protagonist, Kingston herself, as she weaves together an intricate braid of ancestral anecdotes, traditional Chinese folklore, and most importantly, her own interpretations and imaginings of her cultural realities.[3]

As seen in both the book's content and its reception, *The Woman Warrior* is a disruptive text. Through dissecting criticisms of the text and conducting literary analysis of crucial passages, this paper seeks to examine *how*, exactly, Kingston's text disrupted the literary canon, as well

[1] Maxine Hong Kingston, *The Woman Warrior: Memoirs of a Girlhood Among Ghosts* (New York: Knopf Doubleday Publishing Group, 1989), 25.
[2] Kingston, *The Woman Warrior,* 1.
[3] Much debate surrounds *The Woman Warrior*'s status as an autobiography. Many believe that the text contains too many distorted retellings of traditional Chinese folklore and shrouded factual experiences to be considered "authentic." More on this debate is discussed in later sections of this paper.

as examine the problems with viewing the book as "representative" of an entire ethnicity. This essay contends that the true way in which *The Woman Warrior* disrupts literary conventions is by defying and dismantling the very idea of the classics. Kingston's text repudiates the violence of rigid categorization by illustrating a narrative full of cultural paradoxes and intersections in a genre-defying format. This violence is evident in both the exclusivist concept of Western literature and the homogenization of cultural groups. Rather than fighting *for* a place in acceptable literature, Kingston is fighting *against* two forms of homogenization: 1) the reifying notion of a 'canon' as a fixed set of 'great works,' and 2) the stereotyping of a cultural group as "represented" or "fixed" in a given text. Against these reductive impulses, Kingston insists that humans possess an inherent capacity for a crescendo of cultural intersections and complexities that prevent categorization into a monolith.

The Canon Wars and Critical Multiculturalism in America

To better understand the impact of *The Woman Warrior* and the whirlpool of conversations that followed, a review of the historical and cultural contexts is in order. 1980s America marked a period of momentum for the Canon Wars, a cultural and intellectual conflict concerning the formation of the literary canon: an established body of texts commonly considered authoritative within the academic and literary tradition. Debates that garnered less attention, which will be revisited later in the paper, include those asking: What is the literary canon? Does and should it exist? Yet the perceived 'canon' often influences which stories and perspectives are most well-known and revered. Thus, the agreed-upon entries have the power to shape the cultural centrality of a civilization. In the late twentieth century, there existed two main opposing ideological factions: traditionalists and multiculturalists. Traditionalists believed that the established literary standard should be preserved; they viewed that certain works held timeless literary and historical significance, capturing the essence of the American experience. Many traditionalists were concerned that if the criteria were to be diluted with emergent texts and uncharted ways of thought, the quality and cohesion of American education would be diminished.[4] However, at the time, America was becoming increasingly diverse as a country.

The multiculturalists gained traction following the Civil Rights Movement in the 1960s and the 1965 Immigration and Nationality Act, which opened the door for immigrants around the globe.[5] Many

[4] Rachel Donadio, "Revisiting the Canon Wars," *New York Times,* 16 September 2007.
[5] This act abolished the national-origins quota in America.

academics and readers began to question the 'Western [American] canon,' which at the time consisted of works by predominantly white European and North American authors (*The Great Gatsby*, *On the Road*, *To Kill a Mockingbird*). Multiculturalists advocated for the expansion of accepted stories to represent a more diverse range of identities, including queer and ethnic communities. Many argued that viewing the literary canon as rigid resulted in its remaining Eurocentric and thus "almost always…an exclusionist corpus."[6] Marginalized readers and writers (e.g., James Baldwin, Alice Walker, and Kingston herself) found themselves excluded from the epicenter of respected 'real literature.' With the rise of diversity in America, it became increasingly difficult to claim that a singular body of "accepted" literature could define the human condition in a country brimming with citizens who possessed multifaceted identities.

As Kingston states in a 2006 interview, "We are talking about being outside the realm of 'real literature,' [where] the books by immigrants [and] minorities are being studied as anthropology or sociology."[7] American texts by writers of a cultural minority are often approached primarily for their sociocultural content rather than for their artistic or literary merits. Thus, the richness and complexity of the author's literary craft, as well as their individual identity, are often overlooked or reduced to their cultural commentary. Ethnic authors found it difficult to be taken seriously; their work was often reduced to an exotic fantasy or evidence of difference.

Misrepresentation or Misreading?

Society lacked sufficient attention directed towards the diverse intricacies of cultures that deviated from the 'mainstream' (Eurocentric), leading to misconceptions, stereotypes, and often, an oriental fascination with or scrutiny of certain cultures. Kingston's *The Woman Warrior* premiered within this context. Her genre-defying work was perceived by many to be representative of an entire cultural group – the Chinese-American. Prior to Nixon's trip to China in 1972, "China, to the average American, was largely shrouded in mystery."[8] Sau-Ling Cynthia Wong states, "…Kingston, simply in her capacity as a 'Chinese Woman,' has often been endowed with ethnographic authority to present a 'real'

[6] Ankhi Mukherjee, *What Is a Classic? Postcolonial Rewriting and Invention of the Canon* (Stanford: Stanford University Press, 2013), 4.
[7] Nicoleta Alexoae Zagni, "An Interview with Maxine Hong Kingston," *Revue française d'études américaines* 110, no. 4 (2006): 97-106, at 104.
[8] Sau-ling Cynthia Wong, "Introduction," in *Maxine Hong Kingston's The Woman Warrior: A Casebook,* ed. by Sau-ling Cynthia Wong (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1999), 6.

Chinese culture constructed as timeless, monolithic, and unremittingly exotic…"[9] Critics – both within and without the Eurocentric perspective – expected Kingston's book to construct a satisfactory representation of her ethnic culture. They focused on the text's cultural "authenticity" and how well its cultural portrayals reflected Chinese culture, including what kind of light Chinese-Americans were painted in.

In *The Woman Warrior: A Casebook*, Wong describes Kingston's text as being "steeped in controversy, enthusiastically claimed, ingeniously deployed, and at times bitterly denounced by contesting interpretive communities."[10] After it was published, the text was often disparaged by other Chinese-American writers and critics for its 'failure' to properly represent Chinese-American people. These criticisms reveal that the burden of broad representation was presumed not just by the Eurocentric audience but also by those within Kingston's cultural group. The charge of cultural distortion stems from the perspective that Kingston has "'failed' to represent faithfully the socio-historical reality of the experience of Chinese Americans (as they see it) in her work."[11] This charge suggests three assertions: 1) that Kingston had the intent or responsibility to act as an ambassador of her own ethnic group in America; 2) that there exists a singular, definitive socio-historical reality of Chinese-Americans; and 3) that *The Woman Warrior* strayed from or distorted this "collective reality" of Chinese-Americans. These critics reinforced the strain placed on minority authors to only serve as a minority within 'the canon,' yet they also frequently misread Kingston's literary intent and her efforts to defy categorization in telling her story.

One prominent critic is Frank Chin, an Asian-American author and playwright. Chin claims that Kingston's version of the myth of Fa Mu Lan promotes "the stereotype of the Chinese woman as a pathological white supremacist victimized and trapped in a hideous Chinese civilization."[12] Chin implies his belief that Kingston's 'guilt-obsessed' Christian background fueled her distortion of traditional Chinese myths in a way that exoticized and diminished the portrayal of Chinese culture, especially that of Chinese men. However, Kingston did not attempt to write new myths, but rather, she personalized them to her own experiences and struggles with identity. These struggles encompass her own Chinese-American culture (including, though perhaps more

[9] Wong, "Introduction," 5.
[10] Wong, "Introduction," 3.
[11] Helena Grice, *Maxine Hong Kingston* (Manchester: Manchester University Press, 2013), 20.
[12] Frank Chin, *The Big Aiiieeeee!: An Anthology of Chinese American and Japanese American Literature* (New York Meridan, 1991), 3.

subconsciously, her Christianity) and gender roles and power structures in society. Moreover, her adaptations, in part, stem from *her* understanding of the original narrative, using her changes as a means to call attention to certain elements. Certainly, to brand it as 'white supremacist' propaganda endows her literary engagement with a nefariousness and intensity that only reinforces the need for restrictive cultural borders – East vs West, White vs Asian.

Chin harbors a monolithic view of cultural identity and fails to consider the implications of intersectionality. Kingston is Chinese-American, a woman, a Christian, and her own individual. As an author of a (fictional) autobiography, Kingston does not hold the responsibility to give up her experiences and memories of violent misogyny to protect the image of Chinese men. Her work begs the reader to consider the nuances of gender and intersectionality. To this, Chin refutes that "…personal pain…must be subordinated to political purpose."[13] This "political purpose" is, as stated above, to *positively* represent a whole group. For critics like Chin, the problem is not with Kingston's experiences as a Chinese-American, but rather that North American critics were quick to deem Kingston's text as *the* representative work of Chinese culture. Then, efforts to 'include' it in 'the canon' positioned it as the authoritative text on the Asian-American experience.

Newspapers provide a strong indication of public labeling of *The Woman Warrior* as a "representative" work. A 1978 article in *The Daily Utah Chronicle* headlined *The Woman Warrior* as "Book mirrors Chinese culture," framing the book as a perfect reflection of Chinese culture.[14] Furthermore, reviews of Kingston's text frequently underscore a cultural divide between Chinese and American identities. In the *Arlington Heights Herald*, reviewer Joann Van Wye states that *The Woman Warrior* "…is an autobiographical account of a girl growing up, caught between two cultures," and that the text is an account of a "…Chinese-American girl trying to assimilate two cultures as she searches for an identity."[15] In *Del Rio News Herald*, an article characterizes Kingston's text as "…the story of a life torn between modern western culture in the United States and Chinese culture…the story of a woman in limbo between two worlds,

[13] Quoted in Sau-ling Cynthia Wong, "Autobiography as Guided Chinatown Tour? Maxine Hong Kingston's *The Woman Warrior* and the Chinese American Autobiography Controversy," in *A Casebook*, 35. Chin also contributes a chapter to this volume: Frank Chin, "The Most Popular Book in China," in *A Casebook,* 23-28.
[14] Richard Barnum-Reece, "Book mirrors Chinese culture," *The Daily Utah Chronicle*, 8 November 1978.
[15] Joann Van Wye, "A brilliant memoir of growing up as a Chinese-American," *Arlington Heights Herald*, 12 March 1977.

never quite able to settle peacefully into either one."[16] The notion that Kingston is "torn between two cultures" implies that she must choose to live and "represent" one or the other; that the grappling between these contrasting identities must result in a single answer that adheres to a preexisting cultural paradigm. When society frames being "Chinese-American" as an identity that inherently subjects the individual to a fruitless (but "culturally complex") battle between two rigid cultural categories that are a consequence of socio-historical expectations, it is impossible to please both sides of this externally imposed paradox.

In regard to criticisms against her cultural representations, Kingston once stated:

> When I said, 'the writer writes for herself,' I must have said that in response to interviewers who wanted to corner me. As a writer, can you speak for everyone? Who elected you representative of a people? Then I thought, 'I don't want to argue this, I am just speaking for myself'.[17]

To be regarded as a "representative of a people" is an ill-fated pedestal. Countless literary texts resonate with various aspects of the reader's identity. The problem, however, arises when people begin to measure this representation against an invented standard of truth. "…Intent on liberating Chinese-American writers from one set of constraints, Kingston's detractors have imposed another, in the meantime failing to take note of the most fundamental freedom of all that *The Woman Warrior* has wrestled from a priori generic categories and cultural prescriptions: the freedom to create in literature a sui-generis Chinese-American reality."[18] *The Woman Warrior* should not be expected to speak for every Chinese-American. Kingston's right to a sui-generis reality should not be restrained by the expectation to "represent" a model Chinese-American experience.

During the 1970s and 80s, it was less common for literature written by ethnic minority authors to gain an extensive amount of recognition.[19] However, soon after its publication, Kingston's postmodern text became the subject of scholarship and heated discussion. Many scholars interpret Kingston's text as a disruptor of the

---

[16] "'Warrior' Takes Critics Award," *Del Rio News Herald*, 10 July 1977.
[17] Zagni, "An Interview with Maxine Hong Kingston," 100.
[18] Wong, "Autobiography as Guided Chinatown Tour?," 48.
[19] Tamara J. Palmer and Beverly J. Rasporich, "Ethnic Literature," *The Canadian Encyclopedia*, 19 April 2011 [Last edited 4 March 2015]. https://www.thecanadianencyclopedia.ca/. Accessed September 2023.

Western narrative standard, a "warrior" in a battle to "claim its place inside this restrictive canon," and, to be fair, *The Woman Warrior* accomplished a fair share of cultural and intellectual expansion, "[calling] on readers to extend their interpretive expectations, practices, and understanding."[20] This essentially sets Kingston's autobiography in the multiculturalist camp. Yet, this view posits Kingston's work as an expansion that "betters" the American classics by diverging from a Eurocentric perspective. This argument still places priority on the concept of an elite narrative. Instead of seeking to "claim a place" within this realm, Kingston's work serves as a disruptor of the canon itself. Its structure, content, and authorial voice call for setting aside select texts as the authoritative descriptions of being.

Defiance of Category Within the Text

Another common objection to *The Woman Warrior* is the text's fraught relationship with the category of 'memoir'. The book is predominantly considered an autobiography, though many critics have questioned Kingston's autobiographical integrity by pointing out how "…so much of the book departs from the popular definition of autobiography as an unadorned factual account of a person's own life."[21] Kingston often weaves elements of mythical retellings and subjective interpretations of past familial events. Memoir is presumed to relate to "reality," but reality includes subjective ways of viewing the world, including misremembering, visions, and childlike wonder. However, as ethnic authors are often seen as ambassadors of their own cultural groups, there exists a "…special obligation on the ethnic American autobiographer: to provide a positive portrayal of the ethnic community through one's self-portrayal."[22] Moreover, to be "representative," the ethnic memoir is expected to feature "model minorities" who have more or less experienced similar forms of oppression.

However, an individual sense of self often conflicts with cultural hegemony, especially in memoirs. To which reality – individual or collective – is the author expected to stay authentic? In writing *The Woman Warrior*, Kingston mediates between the two, looking for a third way. She embraces both parts of her culture that have hurt her and empowered her, unafraid to integrate her personal interpretations of family events from the immigrant generation as someone who grew up

---

[20] Kristin L. Matthews, *Reading America: Citizenship, Democracy, and Cold War Literature* (Amherst: University of Massachusetts Press, 2016), 132.
[21] Wong, "Autobiography as Guided Chinatown Tour?," 30.
[22] Wong, "Autobiography as Guided Chinatown Tour?," 37.

in America. Kingston has plowed the path for multiple realities to coexist, clash, and ultimately reside under a narrative together.

Kingston's resistance to cultural categories is further evident within her book's narrative. Upon examining the full title of Kingston's text – *The Woman Warrior: Memoirs of a Girlhood Among Ghosts* – and considering the book's narrative context, each noun in the title is a category that Kingston disrupts. Similar to how Kingston experiments with and reinvents the genre of 'memoir', she also challenges literal and metaphorical implications in the four categories displayed in the title: 'Woman', 'Warrior', 'Girlhood', and 'Ghosts'. As an author, storyteller, and conduit for a sui generis reality, Kingston holds the power to make room for paradoxes within sociocultural categories. By disrupting these categories and disavowing cultural collectivism, Kingston reveals the complexities of individual identity. Nehali Patel writes, "As a female child of immigrants, [Kingston's] identity is full of contradictions, where her Chinese upbringing challenges her American lifestyle, and her femaleness challenges her voice as a writer."[23] Throughout *The Woman Warrior*, Kingston tousles, rouses, blends, and embraces these contradictions, as evident in select narrative scenes in which paradox is illustrated most vividly. As American novelist Diane Johnson states, "Autobiography…requires some strategy of self-dramatization,"[24] and when the "self" entails – and breaks – multiple categories, this dramatization makes for a rich, multidimensional crescendo of culture and individuality. In the words of Kingston herself, "I hope my writing has layers, as human beings have layers."[25]

Girlhood

In the latter half of the chapter "White Tigers", Kingston depicts her life growing up as a Chinese-American girl. She interrogates the experience of girlhood, emphasizing the agonizing desire to self-actualize in an environment where one's culture dismisses one's potential due to sexist beliefs. Kingston first alludes to this desire by referring to talk-story, an oral tradition that entails the passing on of myths, anecdotes, and stories from older to younger generations. Kingston writes, "When we Chinese girls listened to the adult talk-story, we learned that we failed

---

[23] Nehali Patel, "Challenging the Canon: How Maxine Hong Kingston Narrates Nonfiction with Ghosts and Talk-Story." *Paper Shell Review* (Spring 2019). Online Edition. https://english.umd.edu/research-innovation/journals/paper-shell-review/paper-shell-review-spring-2019/challenging-canon.
[24] Johnson, Diane, "Ghosts," *The New York Review of Books*: 3 February 1977.
[25] Kingston, *The Woman Warrior,* 103.

if we grew up to be but wives or slaves."[26] These stories ignite a fear of failure, of ending up in a subservient role, such as "wives and slaves." This fear leads Kingston to associate failure with the female identity, as she was told countless times that failure is the fate of a girl.

This appears in her writing through degrading phrases such as "Feeding girls is feeding cowbirds" and "Better to raise geese than girls."[27] In the book, whenever Kingston's parents or the emigrant villagers say these phrases, Kingston "would thrash on the floor and scream so hard [she] couldn't talk. [She] couldn't stop."[28] Her reaction illustrates female rage after being constantly dismissed and wronged. These derogatory remarks that permeate Kingston's girlhood heighten her will to prove herself, but also deepen the hatred she has learned to associate with the fact of being a girl. "'I'm not a bad girl,' [she] would scream. 'I'm not a bad girl. I'm not a bad girl.' [She] might as well have said, 'I'm not a girl.'"[29] For Kingston, girlhood marked the beginning of a complex relationship with her female identity and the development of internalized misogyny, in which she believed that the only way to achieve success and self-actualization was to abandon her femininity entirely.

When Kingston does try to embrace her femininity, she has the added struggle of trying to assimilate into the American feminine ideal. "…All the time [she] was having to turn American feminine, or no dates."[30] This struggle to become "American feminine" reflects the societal pressure on individuals from diverse backgrounds to assimilate into the dominant culture's norms to appear desirable. In Kingston's case, it meant suppressing aspects of her Chinese cultural identity to adhere to American standards of femininity. The phrase "or no dates" highlights the very tangible consequences of not conforming: the loss of a social life and romantic relationships, which she and the dominant culture believed were significant aspects of her girlhood. However, Kingston also fights towards a different path from 'Americanizing' herself or abandoning her femininity. The quote about "wives or slaves" ended with "We could be heroines, swordswomen."[31] Her family's talk stories instill in Kingston the idea that being a girl did not equate to passivity or conformity. Thus, Kingston realizes that she could become powerful like a swordswoman by standing her own ground.

[26] Kingston, *The Woman Warrior,* 19.
[27] Kingston, *The Woman Warrior,* 46.
[28] Kingston, *The Woman Warrior,* 46.
[29] Kingston, *The Woman Warrior,* 45.
[30] Kingston, *The Woman Warrior,* 47.
[31] Kingston, *The Woman Warrior,* 19.

Woman Warriors

Kingston uses her 'girlhood' to set up the violence of categories imposed on her, but her own path forward emerges through her disruption of 'woman warriors.' She unravels the layers of identity hidden beneath societal gender norms of 'woman' while concurrently disrupting the 'warrior' archetype.

In "White Tigers," Kingston relates the tale of the woman warrior, Fa Mu Lan.[32] Fa Mu Lan is depicted as a highly agile and adroit fighter, diligently observing the dynamics of warfare and imitating the lethal grace with which animals – big and small – carried themselves. For instance, she "[copies] the tigers, their stalking kill and their anger…[and feel] a wild, bloodthirsty joy."[33] Fa Mu Lan's rigorous training and dedication to battle and warfare since childhood erode a common patriarchal expectation in which women were typically confined to domestic roles in society. Her ability to mimic the movements and instincts of wild animals illustrates her exceptional patience and observance. The "wild, bloodthirsty joy" she experiences further accentuates her prowess in combat, subverting the prevailing notion that women are physically and psychologically weaker than men.

Kingston also examines the intersections between the identities – 'woman' and 'warrior'. Not only does Fa Mu Lan acknowledge her female identity, but she also does not hide it from her people: "I put on my men's clothes and armor and tied my hair in a man's fashion. 'How beautiful you look,' the people said. 'How beautiful she looks.'"[34] Her female identity is not stifled under the men's clothes or her identity as a warrior. Rather, her beauty and bravery are met with reverence by her village. Through Fa Mu Lan, Kingston is able to have "womanhood" and "warriorhood" coexist, such as when Fa Mu Lan and her husband care for their baby: "We made a sling for the baby inside my big armor, and rode back into the thickest part of the fighting. The umbilical cord flew with the red flag and made us laugh."[35] The juxtaposition between the sling for the baby and Fa Mu Lan's big armor draws a similarity between a mother and a warrior – both have the duty to protect. Here, Kingston places the armor and sling in harmony as she herself works to find harmony in her life experiences and identities.

---

[32] Fa Mu Lan was among the myths that Chin accused Kingston of diluting through Christianity.
[33] Kingston, *The Woman Warrior*, 28.
[34] Kingston, *The Woman Warrior*, 36.
[35] Kingston, *The Woman Warrior,* 40.

As a military leader, "[Fa Mu Lan] inspired [her] army, and [she] fed them. At night [she] sang to them glorious songs that came out of the sky and into [her] head. When [she] opened [her] mouth, the songs poured out and were loud enough for the whole encampment to hear; [her] army stretched out for a mile."[36] Fa Mu Lan not only leads her army, but she also feeds and sings to them; it is these nurturing and creative qualities that make her a capable military leader. This passage also reinforces the power of voice and words. Kingston's portrayal of Fa Mu Lan challenges the belief that second-wave feminism necessitates a complete separation from "feminine" practices and identity. In doing so, Kingston re-embraces the notion of femininity that she had rejected in her girlhood.

Moreover, Kingston transforms the bounds of being a warrior. Kingston does not wield a sword in her modern-day life in America, but she draws an important connection between herself and Fa Mu Lan:

> The swordswoman and I are not so dissimilar…What we have in common are the words at our backs. The idioms for revenge are "report a crime" and "report to five families." The reporting is the vengeance – not the beheading, not the gutting, but the words. And I have so many words – "chink" words and "gook" words too – that they do not fit on my skin.[37]

Words, instead of violence, are the means by which the "woman warriors" in Kingston's story achieve vengeance and peace. Like the names and addresses carved on Fa Mu Lan's back before she left for battle, Kingston, too, holds many words on her skin: both American and Chinese words alike. It is through articulating, recording, and speaking these words that Kingston embarks on a journey of grappling with and reconciling her intersectional identities. By writing, "the reporting is the vengeance – not the beheading, not the gutting, but the words," Kingston is highlighting the power of storytelling and narrative as a form of retaliation against oppression or injustice.[38] As can be seen in "No Name Woman" in Chapter 1, the notion of storytelling as a form of power aligns with Kingston's broader exploration of the complexities of identity, silence, and voice, where reclaiming one's narrative becomes an act of defiance and empowerment, allowing individuals to challenge and resist the injustices imposed upon them. Here, writing is illustrated as a pacifist weapon used to grapple with the at times violent intersections

[36] Kingston, *The Woman Warrior*, 37.
[37] Kingston, *The Woman Warrior*, 53.
[38] Kingston, *The Woman Warrior*, 53.

between one's identity and the rigid categories established by dominant society. A warrior does not have to wield a sword; rather, she can wield words.

Another woman warrior featured in Kingston's narrative is her mother, Brave Orchid, and her power of "talk story." Through writing, Kingston transmits the stories she was told of her mother into text, amplifying but changing this power. In the chapter "Shaman," Kingston highlights the quiet drive that pushed Brave Orchid to earn a medical degree in China and move to America; she also depicts Brave Orchid's ability to exorcize ghosts. Brave Orchid faces these ghosts with a fierce nonchalance, a 'warrior' against these ghosts not through 'masculine' traits, but through words or even simple gestures or looks. In "Sitting Ghost," Brave Orchid refuses protective talismans and goes "to her own room and got weapon and book,"[39] after stating:

> If I take charms, then the ghost will hide from me. I won't learn what kind of ghost it is, or whether or not a ghost lives in there at all. I'll only bring a knife to defend myself and a novel in case I get bored and can't sleep.[40]

Brave Orchid rejects the traditional tokens of protection from ghosts, even worrying about boredom. This nonchalance, in addition to her willingness to face the ghost head-on, emphasizes Kingston's depiction of Brave Orchid as an unconventional warrior. Brave Orchid is neither completely aggressive nor completely passive, allowing her to draw near enough to the ghost to banish it. Later, she begins to "…read aloud; perhaps the others could hear how calmly. The ghost might hear her too; she did not know whether her voice would evoke it or disperse it."[41] The act of reading words aloud enhances Brave Orchid's ability to interact with the paranormal. Whether her words evoke the ghost from hiding or disperse it from the room, they act as a weapon.

This weapon, instead of eliminating the threat or opponent, serves to draw its target closer. Kingston does not wield her words with the purpose of eliminating all who oppose her narrative; rather, she uses a narrative to first draw the audience – those who agree with her and those who disagree – closer to the story she wishes to tell. Brave Orchid's tales underscore the power of talk story and the power of passing on narratives, even if they are ultimately personal ones. Kingston shows how stories shaped her life, and how she now shapes the telling of

[39] Kingston, *The Woman Warrior,* 67.
[40] Kingston, *The Woman Warrior,* 67.
[41] Kingston, *The Woman Warrior,* 68.

it. Much as Brave Orchid seeks to know "what kind of ghost it is," Kingston aims to reveal her character to the audience, to show the type of individual she is. Through retelling the warrior traits of Fa Mu Lan, Kingston articulates her own battle with gender expectations and finding a balance. By using the weapon of words, sung by Fa Mu Lan and voiced by her mother, she ultimately battles to tell her own truth as she sees it.

Ghosts

As seen above, Kingston's autobiography weaves together many lives, including the mythical and the supernatural. She bends rigid conceptions of the 'realness' of memoir by making ghosts commonplace. Her ghosts are also complex, at times made corporeal through her writing, at other times, the reader questions if the ghost even exists in Kingston. Regardless of their 'real' existence, Kingston invites the readers to think of *any* ghost mentioned in the novel as complex, intriguing beings worthy of a place in the narrative.

The Woman Warrior features casual appearances of the Newsboy Ghost, the Wall Ghost, and the Sitting Ghost, and a chilling description of a drowned, weeping ghost, "wet hair hanging and skin bloated, [who] waits silently by the water to pull down a substitute."[42] She also invokes another ghostly figure in the chapter "No Name Woman," where the title refers to her deceased aunt, of whom no one in Kingston's family speaks. The lack of details surrounding No Name Woman renders her a wraith, haunting Kingston's family history through absence: "You must not tell anyone…In China your father had a sister who killed herself…We say that your father has all brothers because it is as if she had never been born."[43] However, in telling her readers, Kingston dismantles the boundaries and stigmas between the living (Kingston and us) and the dead (No Name Woman).

In the text, No Name Woman experiences repeated instances of sexual assault and is shunned by her village for perceived adultery, as she becomes pregnant while her husband is away. The village's aggression towards No Name Woman quickly escalates into a violent raid against her entire family, including Kingston's mother and father. Due to this incident, the existence of No Name Woman is not to be broached. Kingston's aunt is seen as the instigator of tragedy and shame upon the family. Hence, No Name Woman is condemned to being a unidimensional, dead entity. Ghosts, including that of No Name Woman, are often categorized as taboo and malicious. By revealing the

---

[42] Kingston, *The Woman Warrior,* 16.
[43] Kingston, *The Woman Warrior,* 3.

story of her aunt through a female perspective, Kingston breaks No Name Woman out of the category of being a disgraceful, promiscuous ghost of the past. Blending past and present, reality and interpretation, Kingston breathes new life into a neglected ghost, a neglected life.

A crucial example of the reintroduction of character and complexity into a 'ghost' is near the end of this chapter, as Kingston reimagines No Name Woman's last moments before giving birth to her child and jumping into a well:

> The black well of sky and stars went out and out and out forever; her body and her complexity seemed to disappear. She was one of the stars, a bright dot in blackness, without home, without a companion, in eternal cold and silence. An agoraphobia rose in her, speeding higher and higher, bigger and bigger; she would not be able to contain it; there would be no end to fear.[44]

The stifling hopelessness of No Name Woman illustrates two dimensions of death and of being a ghost: 1) the death and disappearance of corporeal existence (the body); and 2) the death of identity (complexity) and the freedom to assert one's personal narrative. The death of complexity is the exact fate that No Name Woman is subjected to: she is shackled under the rigid label of a disgrace, a symbol of shame. However, simultaneously as the reader realizes No Name Woman's fate, Kingston is undoing it; retelling becomes resuscitation, and No Name Woman is restored into existence for Kingston and for the reader. In doing so, No Name Woman becomes a paradox, breaking boundaries of life and death, past and present. However, the story of No Name Woman seemed to be only one of the many tales that Kingston's mother would impart:

> "Whenever she had to warn us about life, my mother told stories that ran like this one, a story to grow up on. She tested our strength to establish realities…Those of us in the first American generations have had to figure out how the invisible world the emigrants built around our childhoods fits in solid America."[45]

Through telling these stories, Kingston's mother is testing Kingston's strength to make sense of one's past and fit it into one's present reality. The binary of the "invisible world" of emigrants and

[44] Kingston, *The Woman Warrior,* 14.
[45] Kingston, *The Woman Warrior,* 5.

"solid America" further illustrates the border between past and present worlds. The use of the word "invisible" draws a connection to the concept of ghosts. If the emigrant world was a ghost, and America the corporeal world it must integrate itself into, then the task of reconciling the two worlds completely is as much of a paradox as attempting to grant a ghost a corporeal body. Kingston highlights this tension but also embraces the paradox. Neither Kingston's emigrant generation (her cultural past) nor America (her cultural present) is completely solid: both are permeated with ghosts.

The uncanny is defined as something that is both strange and familiar. Through embracing ghosts of both the past and present, Chinese and American, Kingston embraces the paradox of the uncanny in both cultures. One does not have to seamlessly fit into the other in order to coexist in one identity. Like the dragon, Kingston fluidly moves between identity and places, unbound to a singular nature.

Conclusion

Born into the age of the Canon Wars, Maxine Hong Kingston's *The Woman Warrior* not only transcends the bounds of the restrictive ideal in America but dismantles the very idea of a literary canon. Kingston's text was notoriously difficult to categorize into one specific genre. By braiding intergenerational experiences, Kingston crafts her own sui generis narrative that defies the expectations of preexisting cultural hegemonies. Her literary endeavors repeatedly defy metaphorical and cultural categories, ranging from the concept of ghosts to the Chinese-American identity. Throughout the book, Kingston grapples with the paradoxes of her life as someone who experiences a multitude of cultures and identities. Among these categorical intersections, Kingston does not settle into any of them. In her defiance of the sociological category, Kingston combats the restrictive expectation to "pick a side" in regard to one's cultural and individual identity. *The Woman Warrior* illustrates that an identity may belong to a person, but a person is never obligated to belong to the hegemony of that identity.

Bibliography

Barnum-Reece, Richard. "Book mirrors Chinese culture." *The Daily Utah Chronicle* [Salt Lake City], 8 November 1978.

Chin, Frank. *The Big Aiiieeeee!: An Anthology of Chinese American and Japanese American Literature*. New York: Meridan, 1991.

Donadio, Rachel. "Revisiting The Canon Wars," 16 September 2007, *New York Times*. https://www.nytimes.com/2007/09/16/books/review/Donadio-t.html. Accessed 19 September 2023.

Grice, Helena. *Maxine Hong Kingston*. Manchester: Manchester University Press, 2013.

Johnson, Diane. "Ghosts | Diane Johnson." *The New York Review of Books*, 3 February 1977, https://www.nybooks.com/articles/1977/02/03/ghosts/. Accessed 19 September 2023.

Kingston, Maxine Hong. *The woman warrior*. New York: Knopf Doubleday Publishing Group, 1989.

Matthews, Kristin L. *Reading America: Citizenship, Democracy, and Cold War Literature*. Amherst: University of Massachusetts Press, 2016. Accessed 19 September 2023.

Mukherjee, Ankhi. *What Is a Classic? Postcolonial Rewriting and Invention of the Canon*. Stanford: Stanford University Press, 2013.

Palmer, Tamara J. and Beverly J. Rasporich. "Ethnic Literature." *The Canadian Encyclopedia*, https://www.thecanadianencyclopedia.ca/en/article/ethnic-literature. 19 April 2011 [Last edited 4 March 2015]. https://www.thecanadianencyclopedia.ca/. Accessed September 2023.

Patel, Nehali. "Challenging the Canon: How Maxine Hong Kingston Narrates Nonfiction with Ghosts and Talk-Story." *Paper Shell Review* (Spring 2019). Online Edition. https://english.umd.edu/research-innovation/journals/paper-shell-review/paper-shell-review-spring-2019/challenging-canon.

Van Wye, Joann. "A brilliant memoir of growing up as a Chinese-American." *Arlington Heights Herald* [Arlington Heights], 12 March 1977.

"'Warrior' Takes Critics Award." *Del Rio News Herald* [Del Rio], 10 July 1977.

Wong, Sau-ling Cynthia, ed. *Maxine Hong Kingston's The Woman Warrior: A Casebook*. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1999.

Zagni, Nicoleta Alexoae. "An Interview with Maxine Hong Kingston," *Revue française d'études américaines* 110, no. 4 (2006): 97-106.

Greco-Roman History

The New Rhetoric and the Fall of the Roman Republic

Michael Lu '24
Groton School
Massachusetts, United States

Abstract

Rhetoric, both written and oral, became a powerful political instrument during the late Roman Republic. The employment of wealth and arms as tools of political influence is extensively chronicled by historians. However, studies on the rise of rhetoric as an art form and a tool of political leverage during the second century BC are scarce. This essay details the ways in which political leaders of the period skillfully shaped public discourse through the novel use of rhetoric in the *contio* (public assembly), the Roman forum, and the newly established criminal courts. The careers of Marcus Tullius Cicero and Caius Julius Caesar show that rhetoric became a crucial political tool in the second century BC. In the Roman criminal courts, Cicero first began to utilize rhetoric in a political context to defend political allies and attack rivals. Through the development of his persuasive Rhodian style of oration and the use of rhetorical tactics in his speeches against Catiline, Cicero gained great influence in the Senate and was even hailed as a "father of the city." Similarly, through his concise commentaries on the Gallic conquest, Caesar advanced the Latin language itself while swaying the Roman people and influencing the annals of history. In his treatise on grammar, *De Analogia*, Caesar also began the process of democratizing Latin for the Roman populace. Through their mastery of rhetoric, these two eminent figures also played a role in the downfall of the republic, showcasing the extent of their influence through their sophisticated oratory skills.

Introduction

The rumblings of change in the late Roman Republic were heralded by the rise of *novi homines* (new men) in positions of office and power. Unbound to an illustrious name or distinguished family, ambitious new men utilized wealth, arms, and rhetoric to gain power and climb the ranks of the republic, thus defying the hereditary aristocracy that had dominated the Roman Senate for centuries past. The following sections detail the development of rhetoric in the late Republic, utilized by orators and writers like Cicero and Caesar. Their style of rhetoric, far more sophisticated than the crude, unpolished language of their forebears, was marked by eloquence and concision. Whether in the public assembly, the criminal courts, or the senate, rhetoric equaled the political influence of wealth and arms through its accessibility, the speed of its dissemination, and its relative safety.

Cicero and Rhetoric in Oration

In the first century BC, oratory and writing became an easily accessible route to political prominence, as they allowed young politicians, often *novi homines,* to spread their ideas, manipulate popular belief, and gain immense support among the urban public, all in relative safety. Many rising politicians began their political careers in criminal courts established by Lucius Cornelius Sulla, which allowed orators to attack their enemies or defend their friends publicly and freely.[1] They quickly realized that these public trials also offered opportunities to weaponize their speeches, attacking political rivals by charging them with various wrongdoings. Orators could aid their political allies by prosecuting them too: if a lawyer managed to prosecute a friend before his enemies did, he could then procure the accused person's exoneration by deliberately mishandling the case.[2]

Cicero's Trials in the Criminal Courts

One *novus homo* in particular, Marcus Tullius Cicero, began his political career in Sulla's criminal courts by defending wealthy nobles who had been charged with some wrongdoing. His military experience was extraordinarily limited for a Roman, consisting only of brief service during the Social War; and though he did hold the office of aedile, his

[1] George Mousourakis, "Crime, Criminal Justice, and the Jury Courts in Late Republican Rome," *Hiroshima Law Journal*, 170.
[2] Mousourakis, "Crime, Criminal," 179.

games were lackluster in comparison to the pomp of Caesar's.[3] Despite his lack of talent for things military and the absence of the financial resources necessary for hugely impressive games, Cicero won allies and political recognition through his defenses.[4] With every case he won, he earned a debt of gratitude owed by the defendant. Finally, when Cicero was a candidate for a magistracy, the nobles he defended were obligated by "the duty of gratitude" to support him and mobilize their clients to vote for him. Thus, through many successful defenses, Cicero built a reputation as a great orator and a political following; in 75, he served as a quaestor in western Sicily.[5]

Rhetoric and drama played a large role in criminal courts, rivaling the importance of the truth itself. Oftentimes, the guilt or innocence of Cicero's client was secondary to the image of the case he painted for the jury and the boldness with which he presented his claims. Cicero's tactics included the flamboyant use of certain rhetorical devices, extensive self-reference, and invoking the ambiance of the arena or the comic theater.[6] Furthermore, Cicero also developed the Latin vocabulary itself, creating loan words from Grecian philosophy and oratory to express himself more precisely.[7] He also played on the pre-existing prejudices of the jury, which consisted entirely of members of the Senate: since they could also be tried at any time, jurors were certainly inclined to acquit as many cases as they could, barring the crimes too egregious to ignore. Cicero himself admitted this in a letter to his close friend Atticus, saying that "it is clear that the jurors do not care a bit about electoral malpractice, [...] at least they do not want to see a paterfamilias killed in his own house."[8]

Oratory Tactics and the Rhodian Style

Since Cicero was a dramatic and eloquent orator, his use of rhetoric itself allowed him to win many cases. Nor did he merely adopt a preexisting style of oratory, either the Asiatic or Attic style; rather, he spearheaded a new, "middle style" (*genus medium*), named the Rhodian

---

[3] Plutarch, "Life of Cicero," 41.6. https://penelope.uchicago.edu/Thayer/E/Roman/Texts/Plutarch/Lives/Cicero*.html.
[4] Catherine E. W Steel, *Cicero, Rhetoric, and Empire*, reprinted ed. (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2006), 164.
[5] Plutarch, "Life of Cicero." 6.1.
[6] Andrew M. Riggsby, *Crime and Community in Ciceronian Rome* (Austin, TX: University of Texas Press, 1999), 23.
[7] Plutarch, "Life of Cicero." 40.2.
[8] Cicero, "Letters to Atticus," 4.15. http://www.perseus.tufts.edu/hopper/text?doc=Perseus%3Atext%3A1999.02.0022%3Atext%3DA%3Abook%3D4%3Aletter%3D15.

style after his famous master Molo of Rhodes.[9] Cicero's criticisms of established style and his subsequent modifications and improvements can be found in his treatises *Brutus* and *De Oratore*.

In *Brutus*, Cicero compared his own rhetoric to that of Quintus Hortensius, a famous proponent of the Asiatic style; by pointing out the flaws in Hortensius' oratory, he critiqued the style indirectly as well.[10] Firstly, Cicero described the Asiatic style as a florid, ornate diction used by orators who had an "admirable command of language, with very little elegance of sentiment."[11] Cicero also noted that while this sort of flowery rhetoric was suitable for younger speakers, it was "entirely destitute of that gravity and composure which befits a riper age."[12] Although youthful exuberance and Asianist tendencies were not in themselves liabilities, they became so when Hortensius failed to reform his flamboyant rhetoric as he matured; by expanding this critique to the Asianic style as a whole, Cicero explained its failure to gain prominence in the evolving and expanding criminal courts and *contiones* which demanded evidence alongside eloquence. Claiming that Hortensius preferred charming expression over the practical demands of argumentation (*magis venustae dulcesque sententiae quam aut necessariae aut interdum utiles*) (charming and delicate sentiments rather than either necessary or sometimes useful), Cicero again emphasized the importance of striking a balance between flair and substance through a middle path (*moderatio*).[13] Finally, Cicero believed that oratory could only advance in the hands of someone "better instructed in philosophy, law, and history" (*a philosophia a iure civili ab historia fuisse instructior*); someone such as himself.[14] By adding substance and knowledge to a style based on eloquence and flair, Cicero created an attractive style of rhetoric that could both dazzle audiences with flair and convince juries with facts.

In *Brutus*, Cicero also critiqued Atticism and detailed his own contributions to the art of rhetoric. Describing the Attic style as "paltry," "dry and lifeless," and "a strict bareness of style," Cicero condemned it as a bland form of oratory clearly unsuited to the clamor of the *contio* or the Senate.[15] Instead, he declared that "the courts demand a fuller, and

[9] Quintilian, "Institutio Oratoria," 12.10.18. http://penelope.uchicago.edu/Thayer/E/Roman/Texts/Quintilian/Institutio_Oratoria/12B*.html#6.
[10] Christopher Sean Van den Berg, *The Politics and Poetics of Cicero's Brutus: The Invention of Literary History* (Cambridge, UK: Cambridge University Press, 2021), 35.
[11] Cicero, "Brutus." 325, http://www.attalus.org/cicero/brutus1.html.
[12] Cicero, "Brutus." 326.
[13] Cicero, "Brutus." 326.
[14] Cicero, "Brutus." 161.
[15] Cicero, "Brutus." 284.

more elevated tone" for an orator with a "commanding air."[16] Cicero emphasized the ability to move the crowd to laughter or tears at will, something that he did frequently through his rhetorical devices and often somewhat theatrical performances. Likewise, in *De Oratore*, Cicero stated that the simple Attic style was restrained and lacked *ornatus* (embellishment); the literary devices, complex sentence structure, clauses, and rhetorical questions present in Cicero's orations were all used sparingly. Furthermore, he believed that wit, a literary technique all but ignored by the Roman Attici, should be part of an orator's repertoire.[17] Although Cicero did not reject Atticism outright, he pointed out many flaws in its one-dimensional style. By striking a balance between the austere concision of Attic oratory with the flowery eloquence of Asianism, Cicero's Rhodian style of oratory became extremely persuasive.

After building a sufficient reputation from his defense cases, Cicero launched his career as a prosecutor in the criminal courts, relying on the Rhodian style to win his cases. Two of Cicero's prosecutions in particular display the effectiveness of rhetoric in swaying a court to one's advantage. First, in 70, a few years after his stint as quaestor in Sicily, he prosecuted Caius Verres, a Roman magistrate known for his extortion and for stealing works of art from temples and private collectors.[18] Despite Verres' blatant crimes, this was no easy case for Cicero, as Verres was being defended by Quintus Hortensius, recognized at the time as the greatest orator in Rome.[19] A tactic Cicero used in his speeches was his repetitive use of the word *hostis* instead of *inimicus* (a personal enemy) to address Verres. *Hostis*, and its specific designation for enemies of the state, implied that the governor had, through his behavior, put himself outside the Roman state, and might even be a danger to it. Cicero aroused public hostility against Verres and suggested that he was a danger to Rome as well as its provinces, depicting his condemnation as a matter of urgent importance.[20] By using the nuances of the Latin language to his advantage, Cicero forced Verres to flee the city in exile and bested his rival Hortensius, securing his status as the greatest orator in Rome.[21]

Cicero's second prosecution is another example of using rhetoric to defeat a political opponent. Having gained sufficient political prominence through the criminal courts, Cicero ran for consul in 63. His

---

[16] Cicero, "Brutus." 289.
[17] Van den Berg, *The Politics*, 193.
[18] Cicero, "In Verrem," 1.11 https://www.attalus.org/cicero/verres1.html.
[19] Andrew R. Dyck, "Rivals into Partners: Hortensius and Cicero," *Historia: Zeitschrift Für Alte Geschichte* 57, no. 2 (2008): 144, http://www.jstor.org/stable/25598427.
[20] Steel, *Cicero, Rhetoric*, 177.
[21] Dyck, "Rivals into," 150.

competition in the election included a certain Catiline, who had established an electoral pact with M. Antonius (who was indeed elected alongside Cicero), and more importantly, had the support of two powerful Romans, Crassus and Caesar.[22] To secure his consulship, a few days before the election, during a senatorial debate, Cicero delivered a great speech denouncing his rivals. He alleged, among numerous other accusations of criminal and immoral behavior, that Catiline and Antonius were conspiring to overthrow the existing order of the Senate.[23] Even wearing a metal breastplate during his speech, Cicero gave a dramatic indication of the dangers he would face to counter Catiline's plotting.[24] Thus, he was triumphantly elected as consul by defaming his rival in a speech, despite Catiline's greater political backing.

The Catilinarian Conspiracy

During his consulship, Cicero most famously accused Catiline of conspiring to destroy the city of Rome. Attacking his political rival fiercely in a series of political speeches, Cicero deployed a great number of rhetorical devices to persuade his listeners to support his cause: rhetorical questions, hyperbole, metaphors, tricolon, anaphora, and more. Cicero was also willing to manipulate facts to support his immediate objective. In the First Catilinarian, Catiline himself is depicted as the leader of the conspiracy; in the Fourth, when Cicero is attempting to convict Publius Cornelius Lentulus, another chief figure of the conspiracy, he instead paints Lentulus as the sole leader of the plot, despite earlier claiming that the city would be safe after Catiline's departure.[25] Thanks to a combination of rhetorical flair and (oftentimes fictitious) factual evidence, the cumulative effect of Cicero's speeches was so great that Catiline fled the city before a trial was set and was eventually killed in battle; having been empowered by a *senatus consultum ultimum,* Cicero also executed five of Catiline's co-conspirators who remained in Rome without the conclusion of a proper trial. After this episode, Cicero was hailed as the savior of Rome and given the title of *pater patriae* (father of the country).[26] Through his rhetorical ability and oftentimes theatrical performances, Cicero rivaled even Pompey or Caesar in his power and prestige, reaching the pinnacle of Roman politics as consul, and executing his enemies even without a trial.

---

[22] D. H. Berry, *Cicero's Catilinarians* (New York, NY: Oxford University Press, 2020), 19.
[23] Richard A. Billows, *Julius Caesar: The Colossus of Rome* (London: Routledge, 2012), 87.
[24] Steel, *Cicero, Rhetoric*, 179.
[25] Robin Seager, "Iusta Catilinae," *Historia: Zeitschrift Für Alte Geschichte* 22, no. 2 (1973): 242, http://www.jstor.org/stable/4435332.
[26] Billows, *Julius Caesar*, 96.

The lingering effects of rhetoric can be seen in the aftermath of the Catilinarian conspiracy. Although the extent of Catiline's involvement in Manlius' revolt is disputed by historians today, Cicero's publicly promulgated speeches were so convincing that he managed to convince the city and the senate of the real danger that Catiline posed, blurring the lines between fact and fiction.[27] Due to Cicero's sheer effrontery, historians such as Sallust, Plutarch, Appian, and Dio all believed his claims, demonizing and painting ludicrous, sometimes contradictory pictures of Catiline's schemes in turn.[28] For example, Sallust claimed that Catiline and his supporters seized strategic positions in Rome apparently without anybody trying to stop them; he also stated that Catiline also tried to kill consul Lucius Manlius Torquatus, an ally who had defended Catiline in a trial in 65.[29] Furthermore, Sallust also accused Catiline of encouraging the aging wives of certain *optimate* politicians to procure either the support or the death of their husbands. This accusation is once again ridiculous: why should these courtesans, no longer possessed of either charm or beauty, want to kill their husbands, their sole source of luxury and income? And how would Catiline's influence be greater than that of their husbands'?[30] The persisting effect of Cicero's lies can be seen in Catiline's reputation even after his death: his name was a substitute for villainy in Roman literature and a nickname for unpopular emperors.[31]

From Catiline's reaction to Cicero's charges (fleeing the city), it seems that his allegations were taken almost as fact, turning public opinion strongly against the accused. It is even possible that Catiline's decision to join Manlius' revolt was ultimately fueled by the vitriol of Cicero's *First Catilinarian Oration*; sensing that his dignity would be better preserved in rebellion than in exile, he reluctantly decided to embrace the violent persona painted for him by the calumny of Cicero and his contemporaries.[32] In his exile, Catiline sent a number of letters claiming that he had been falsely accused, but that since he was unable to challenge Cicero's accusations, he would yield to fortune and go into

---

[27] E. J. Phillips, "Catiline's Conspiracy," *Historia: Zeitschrift Für Alte Geschichte* 25, no. 4 (1976): 441, http://www.jstor.org/stable/4435521.
[28] Phillips, "Catiline's Conspiracy," 441.
[29] Richard J. Hoffman, "Sallust and Catiline," *The Classical Review* 48, no. 1 (1998): 51, http://www.jstor.org/stable/713695.
[30] K. H. Waters, "Cicero, Sallust and Catiline," *Historia: Zeitschrift Für Alte Geschichte* 19, no. 2 (1970): 6, http://www.jstor.org/stable/4435130.
[31] Mary Beard, *SPQR: A History of Ancient Rome* (New York: Liveright Publishing Corporation, a Division of W.W. Norton & Company, 2015), 42.
[32] Seager, "Iusta Catilinae," 242; Seager, "Iusta Catilinae," 248.

exile at Massalia.[33] These muddy trails point to the conclusion that while the danger of Manlius and his army was certainly present, Catiline's involvement was less pronounced than what Cicero claims; perhaps motivated by a desire to present himself as having done something of note during his consulship, Cicero decided to dramatize the threat that Catiline posed to the republic through his influence and rhetoric.[34]

Throughout his career until his execution by Mark Antony, Cicero was at the forefront of the political happenings in the late Republic, whether in the Roman criminal courts or the Senate, where a consulship was granted to him in 63. By creating a completely new style of rhetoric, Cicero dominated public discourse, shaped the political narrative, and even influenced historical records. As Cicero was the leading figure in every detail of the Catilinarian conspiracy, many historians were inclined to base their own accounts on his speeches; Roman politicians were able to use rhetoric to offer a powerful, persistent narrative. As one of the only publicly available sources of information in Rome, they were often able to undermine the notion of truth through subtle and persuasive lies.

Caesar and Rhetoric in Writing

Like Cicero, Caius Julius Caesar also used an original style of rhetoric to improve his image and craft a political narrative. During the winters of his campaign in Gaul, Caesar consistently wrote commentaries disclosing his victories and achievements. To this day, his eight books of *De Bello Gallico* (DBG) are recognized as the pinnacle of Latin literature: his lucidity, concision, and grammatical accuracy are taught in schools worldwide. While Caesar was not the first person to utilize the memoir style of writing to publicize his achievements, he used it in an innovative fashion. Notably, Rutilius Rufus, Lucius Lucullus, and Sulla had all written memoirs in the past, but while Lucullus' memoir was published in Greek, largely inaccessible to Rome's urban public who only spoke and read Latin, Caesar wrote his in Latin, thus circulating his accomplishments throughout Rome. Furthermore, while early memoirs had all written at the end of a long political career to retroactively justify decisions, Caesar was the first to write his memoir whilst his career was still ongoing; DBG was written not only to document his exploits in Gaul, but also to ensure that his political backing would remain intact

[33] Sallust, "Catiline's War," 34.2 https://penelope.uchicago.edu/Thayer/e/roman/texts/sallust/bellum_catilinae*.html.
[34] Waters, "Cicero, Sallust," 196.

while he was away from Rome.[35] Indeed, the epithet *magni* may reflect the enthusiasm of the time for Caesar's feat; he was awarded a *supplicatio* (public celebration) of twenty days for it.[36] It seems that not only had Caesar's achievements found their way into Rome, but also had been well received by the Roman public. Regardless, it can be safely said that his memoirs were accessible to the public by 46 when they were reviewed by Cicero.[37] Praising Caesar's polished brevity and precision, Cicero described the commentaries as "bare, upright and elegant, with every ornament of oratory removed, like a cloak" (*nudi enim sunt, / recti et venusti, / omni ornatu orationis tamquam veste detracta*).[38]

Caesar's Literary Strategy

One way Caesar used rhetoric to bolster his public image was through cautious neutrality. While he certainly wanted to impress the people of Rome with his military ability, he was also careful to seem credible at all times so as to cast no doubt over his achievements in Gaul. Cicero, no political friend of Caesar, could find no criticism of his veracity.[39] One notable feature of DBG was Caesar's consistent use of the third person, only using first-person verbs very sparingly. The effect of Caesar referring to himself as "Caesar" and not "I" was that his account seemed clearly objective. Furthermore, the way Caesar credited the achievements of his subordinates and soldiers, who were often singled out by name or legion, and also acknowledged the abilities of his Gallic opponents, made him seem genuinely fair in his assessment of events. At the same time, being both the commander of capable soldiers and the victor over strong and capable opponents all contributed to the greater glory of Caesar himself.[40] His commentaries complemented his military success and maintained his popularity in Rome.

Although Caesar's rhetoric was convincingly neutral, he nevertheless attempted to portray himself as a strategic mastermind and

[35] A point of contention among historians is whether Caesar published his commentaries yearly during his eight-year campaign or all at once in 51. I am inclined to believe that Caesar sent his commentaries back to Rome annually; a poem written by Catullus in 54, during the fifth year of Caesar's campaign, references the "*Caesaris [...] monimenta magni"* (the monuments of great Caesar), alluding to the bridges Caesar built in Germany to cross the Rhine. Catullus, "Catullus 11," https://en.wikisource.org/wiki/Translation:Catullus_11.
[36] T. E. Kinsey, "Catullus 11," *Latomus* 24, no. 3 (1965): 541, http://www.jstor.org/stable/41523237.
[37] Max Radin, "The Date of Composition of Caesar's Gallic War," *Classical Philology* 13, no. 3 (1918): 2, http://www.jstor.org/stable/263259.
[38] Cicero, "Brutus." 262.
[39] Billows, *Julius Caesar*, 131.
[40] Billows, *Julius Caesar*, 199.

omniscient general. This careful characterization can be seen in both the micro and macro scale, whether zooming in on specific word choice and the careful selection of verb number, or the content of the books themselves. Regardless of magnitude, Caesar relied on his highly developed rhetoric and style to sway the narrative of DBG to favor him in every interaction.

For instance, Caesar's insistence on using the same word to describe one thing throughout his books provided his readers with a clear and consistent image of battle and action. Throughout DBG, Caesar consistently used *castra* or *hiberna* to describe his camps or winter camps, and always in the plural case. Similarly, he employed highly specialized vocabulary, such as *quadrigae* (four-horsed chariot), *vallum* (rampart), *falces* (hooks), or *testudines* (shields), in all of his battle descriptions. Finally, he delineated clearly between different types of ships, whether *scaphae* (skiffs), *naves longae* (warships), *oneraria* (freight ships), or *speculatoria navigia* (spy crafts). In his treatise on grammar, *De Analogia*, Caesar stated that "the choice of words is the fountainhead of eloquence;" clearly, his consistent use of specialized vocabulary was a deliberate choice.[41]

Indeed, the purpose of *De Analogia* was, in part, to democratize the Latin language, removing its irregularities and Latinizing Grecian or Gallic loan words, thus allowing the common Roman to better understand and utilize Latin in turn. In his treatise, Caesar "used" *Calypsonem* as the accusative of the Greek word Calypso, and translated Gallic terms (such as the names of tribes like the Allobroges) into palatable third declension nouns.[42] The remaining fragments concerned specific minutiae of Latin usage and grammar, such as the correct formation of various case forms, for example, of the genitive and dative singular forms of fourth declension nouns like *victus* and *exercitus*, both words commonly used in DBG.[43] Through his claim that "a strange and unusual word must be avoided like a rock," Caesar made clear his desire to foster a concordant style of Latin; nothing could be more distracting from his narrative in Gaul than weird spellings and unconventional participles, genitives, and conditionals.[44] Through his dedicated style of literary consistency cultivated in *De Analogia*, Caesar not only cleared any

[41] Cicero, "Brutus." 253.
[42] W. A. Oldfather and Gladys Bloom, "Caesar's Grammatical Theories and His Own Practice," *The Classical Journal* 22, no. 8 (1927): 590, http://www.jstor.org/stable/3289155.
[43] Eleanor Dickey and Anna Chahoud, *Colloquial and Literary Latin* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2010), 232; Oldfather and Bloom, "Caesar's Grammatical," 594.
[44] Oldfather and Bloom, "Caesar's Grammatical," 601.

doubt or confusion about the unfolding events in Gaul but also put the image of a calculating, organized commander in the minds of his readers.

The Politics of De Bello Gallico

Caesar's use of specific words in DBG also served to put him in the best possible light. He tended to use singular verbs when describing action, thus attributing as much glory to himself as possible. When Caesar and his troops prepare for a siege in the winter of his fourth year in Gaul, they collect grain, repair ships, and gather wood and bronze for the camp. Although these are clearly the actions of his soldiers, Caesar nevertheless used singular verbs (*conferebat, iubebat*) and even directly declared that "[Caesar himself] made it possible for others to sail more easily" (4.31.4). In other cases, he reported that he "saw to it" that something be built (*faciendum curat*, 1.13.1) or simply "decided to" build something (6.9.1). In the descriptions of the construction of the Rhine bridge and Alesia fortifications, Caesar is the subject of all of the active verbs of making.[45] By recounting action in the singular number, he painted a picture of a hardworking general who did not simply delegate tasks to the common soldier. Caesar also used superlative adjectives to emphasize his worth in battles. When a Roman camp is being attacked by the Britons, Caesar returns with reinforcements (*auxilium*) at just the right moment (*tempore opportunissimo*) (4.34.1), thus fending off the raid and saving his men. By describing his intervention as "most opportune," Caesar gave the reader the impression of a somewhat omniscient commander, able to sense danger and rescue his men at the direst time. Through rhetorical subtleties, Caesar constantly reinforced his contributions to the Gallic conquest.

Finally, Caesar's justifications for his crimes in Gaul – namely his genocide, execution, incarceration, and enslavement of captives and civilians alike – were based on his separation of Gallic culture from that of Rome.[46] While he did emphasize the threat that the Gallic tribes posed to Rome throughout DBG, Caesar also crafted overarching themes to highlight the differences between the two civilizations. Two elements in particular stand out in Caesar's description of the Gauls: their cruelty and their treachery. He refers at least eight times to Gallic torture, and notes the religious sacrifice of innocent civilians in Book 6. Caesar even broke out of his objective third-person narration to explicitly criticize the "singular and nefarious cruelty" (7.77.3) of the Arverni, referring to their cannibalism of the elderly and useless. In

---

[45] Andrew M. Riggsby, *Caesar in Gaul and Rome: War in Words* (Austin: University of Texas Press, 2006), 104.
[46] Riggsby, *Caesar in Gaul*, 188.

regard to Gallic treachery, Ambiorix lies about granting safe passage to Sabinus and Cotta, and later to Quintus Cicero; in Book 3, the Gauls detain four Roman knights on a diplomatic mission, having already given hostages to the Romans to guarantee their good behavior.[47] Since Romans seem to have felt that heralds and envoys were sacrosanct, the taking of the knights can be seen as a violation of a general obligation, almost the equivalent of breaking *xenia*, or hospitality. By emphasizing Gallic bad faith, cruelty, and trickery, Caesar depicted a backward nation far removed from the civilization of the Roman Republic; thus, he justified his campaign as a necessary and almost altruistic one, not waged for mere personal glory. Aside from simply removing a relevant danger from the vicinity of the republic, by conquering Gaul, Caesar was promulgating the culture and refinement of the Roman world, perhaps even doing the barbaric tribes a favor as he defeated them one by one. Certainly, his justifications were accepted by the Roman populace; despite being declared an enemy of the state by the Senate in 49, Caesar marched on Rome while enjoying great popularity throughout Italy.[48]

While maintaining relative objectivity throughout his memoir, Caesar deliberately utilized rhetoric to shape the narrative surrounding his Gallic campaign. The persuasiveness and apparent credibility of DBG are evident, as it has largely been relied on as the primary source for Caesar's campaigns in Gaul throughout history. Beginning in the 20th century, however, modern historians have begun to doubt the extent of DBG's authenticity, questioning in particular the accuracy of Caesar's reported statistics in his battles and ethnography.[49] Though Caesar might not have lied outright in his memoirs, he certainly exaggerated statistics and presented events in a biased light to make his achievements seem more impressive. With doubts cast on Caesar's work, it is appropriate to also reevaluate the suitability of his justifications for his actions. While the Gallic tribes did indeed implement cruel customs and punishments, it is plausible that Caesar honed in on and amplified this fact to push his own agenda and fame in Rome.

Rhetoric and the Fall of the Republic

In their careers, Cicero and Caesar both utilized rhetoric as a formidable weapon. While Caesar used his commentaries to complement his military success, Cicero relied entirely on rhetoric to kickstart and

---

[47] Riggsby, *Caesar in Gaul*, 101.
[48] Billows, *Julius Caesar*, 232.
[49] David Henige, "HE CAME, HE SAW, WE COUNTED: THE HISTORIOGRAPHY AND DEMOGRAPHY of CAESAR'S GALLIC NUMBERS," *Annales De Démographie Historique*, no. 1 (1998): 215, http://www.jstor.org/stable/44385386.

advance his career. These two powerful politicians benefited greatly from the opportunities presented by the burgeoning Latin language, reaching great heights in the peaks of their careers. In the hands of skilled orators and writers, rhetoric became a potent tool capable of swaying public opinion, owing to its accessibility and versatility, whether in the forum, in criminal courts, in the Senate, or in writing.

Finally, it is clear that the republic's downfall was exacerbated by the rise of rhetoric. While wealth and arms had been an integral part of political intrigue since the rise of the Roman Kingdom, it was not until the second century BC that rhetoric began to influence political affairs, weakening the Senate by creating mistrust and confusion amongst the public. When Cicero gave persuasive speeches, how did the crowd know when to and when not to trust him? Was Catiline really the villain Cicero painted him to be? As he tried to sway the jury to his side in prosecution cases, Cicero would often omit and obscure the truth, even boasting to a friend that he had "covered the jurors in shade" in one case – a phrase likely similar to "pulling the wool over their eyes."[50] Likewise, how was the public to know if Caesar was lying about his exploits in Gaul and in his assessment of the barbarians? News traveled slowly in the ancient world, and there was little by way of proof save for word of mouth. Without the emphasis that he placed upon his memoirs, Caesar's exploits in Gaul might have faded from the people's memory by his return to Rome; without his efforts to justify his actions in Gaul, Caesar might not have been received so kindly after being declared an enemy of the state. Roman politicians created subtle propaganda through rhetoric, sowing instability and doubt among the Roman people and bolstering their own public image.

Conclusion

This study demonstrates that the power of rhetoric matched that of wealth and military might, evident both in the lives of the Romans who mastered it and in its role in the fall of the Republic. The zeniths of orators like Cicero challenged and even eclipsed the careers of the wealthiest and most powerful politicians of their time. And it was no accident that Caesar was the man to finally establish the Roman Empire. By combining wealth, arms, and rhetoric to charm the Roman people, muster a loyal army, and defeat political rivals, he was able to overturn centuries of stagnant customs made weak by inaction and decadence. Without the emphasis that he placed upon his memoirs, published yearly, Caesar's exploits in Gaul might have faded from the people's memory by the time he returned to Rome; without his efforts to justify

[50] Riggsby, *Crime and Community*, 29.

his actions in Gaul, Caesar might not have been received so kindly after being declared an enemy of the state.

The use of rhetoric in ancient Rome may also serve as a cautionary tale today: through speeches, in the criminal courts, and via memoir, Roman politicians weaponized their words to besmirch their enemies, improve their public image, or justify their campaigns and actions. As Cicero and Caesar obscured the truth in their speeches and commentaries, modern-day politicians are similarly capable of blurring the line between fact and fiction, influencing their followers, and shaping political discourse through staged photo-ops and intentionally inflammatory statements. Although fact-checkers and censorship do serve to keep misinformation in check on the Internet, rhetoric is a potent threat that must be regulated and moderated. By interpreting the past as a preview to the present, it is important to be alert to the dangers of this rising form of "oratory," dangerous during the late republic and still dangerous today. Though it may be overeager to suggest that countries today will indeed crumble into an autocracy *a lá* the Roman Republic, it is certainly not amiss to be aware of the trends that they share.

Bibliography

Primary Sources

Caesar, "De Analogia"

Cicero, "De Oratore"

Cicero, "In Verrem"

Cicero, "Letters to Atticus"

Cicero, "Brutus"

Plutarch, "Life of Caesar"

Plutarch, "Life of Cicero"

Plutarch, "Life of Caius Gracchus"

Plutarch, "Life of Tiberius Gracchus"

Quintilian. "Institutio Oratoria."

Sallust, "Catiline's War"

Suetonius, "The Life of Julius Caesar"

Secondary Sources

Abramowitz, Alan I. *The Great Alignment* (n.p.: Yale University Press, 2018).

Batstone, William W. "The Antithesis of Virtue: Sallust's 'Synkrisis' and the Crisis of the Late Republic." *Classical Antiquity* 7 1-29 (1988).

Bloom, Gladys and Oldfather, W. A. "Caesar's Grammatical Theories and His Own Practice," *The Classical Journal* 22, no. 8 (1927).

Beard, Mary. *SPQR: A History of Ancient Rome* (New York: Liveright Publishing Corporation, a Division of W.W. Norton & Company, 2015).

Beness, J. Lea and T. W. Hillard, "The Theatricality of the Deaths of C. Gracchus and Friends," *The Classical Quarterly* 51, no. 1 (2001).

Berry, D. H. *Cicero's Catilinarians* (New York, NY: Oxford University Press, 2020).

Billows, Richard A. *Julius Caesar: The Colossus of Rome* (London: Routledge, 2012).

Dickey, Eleanor, and Anna Chahoud, *Colloquial and Literary Latin* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2010).

Dyck, Andrew R. "Rivals into Partners: Hortensius and Cicero," *Historia: Zeitschrift Für Alte Geschichte* 57, no. 2 (2008)

Henige, David. "HE CAME, HE SAW, WE COUNTED: THE HISTORIOGRAPHY AND DEMOGRAPHY OF CAESAR'S GALLIC NUMBERS," *Annales De Démographie Historique*, no. 1 (1998).

Hoffman, Richard J. "Sallust and Catiline," *The Classical Review* 48, no. 1 (1998).

Kinsey, T. E. "Catullus 11," *Latomus* 24, no. 3 (1965).

Mousourakis, George. "Crime, Criminal Justice, and the Jury Courts in Late Republican Rome," *Hiroshima Law Journal* (2021).

Phillips, E. J. "Catiline's Conspiracy," *Historia: Zeitschrift Für Alte Geschichte* 25, no. 4 (1976).

Radin, Max. "The Date of Composition of Caesar's Gallic War," *Classical Philology* 13, no. 3 (1918).

Riggsby, Andrew M. *Crime and Community in Ciceronian Rome* (Austin, TX: University of Texas Press, 1999).

Riggsby, Andrew M. *Caesar in Gaul and Rome: War in Words* (Austin: University of Texas Press, 2006).

Scullard, H. H. and Dominic Rathbone, *From the Gracchi to Nero: A History of Rome from 133 B.C. to A.D.68* (London: Routledge, 2011).

Seager, Robin. "Iusta Catilinae," *Historia: Zeitschrift Für Alte Geschichte* 22, no. 2 (1973).

Steel, Catherine *Cicero, Rhetoric, and Empire*. (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2006).

Van den Berg, Christopher Sean. *The Politics and Poetics of Cicero's Brutus: The Invention of Literary History* (Cambridge, UK: Cambridge University Press, 2021).

Waters, K. H. "Cicero, Sallust and Catiline." *Historia: Zeitschrift Für Alte Geschichte* 19, no. 2 (1970).

Wesley J. Hanson, "A Literary and Narratological Reading of Titurius Sabinus and Quintus Cicero in Julius Caesar's Bellum Gallicum" (2015).

Williams, Jr, Charles E. "Pompey and Cicero: An Alliance of Convenience" (2013).

Sociology

Elites, Privilege and Capital: Social Marginalisation in Hong Kong International Schools

Meagan Hsu '26
Chinese International School
Hong Kong SAR, China

Abstract

The complex and varied education system in Hong Kong inevitably leads to class disparities. Borrowing from the ideas of Bourdieu's forms of capital (1986) and Khan's definition of elites in society and education (2012), this paper explores the educational advantages and the social inequalities that stem from Hong Kong's international, aided, and Direct Subsidy Scheme schools. This paper argues that international schools are elite institutions that foster future elites and offer advantages because they create and distribute economic, social, and cultural capital within their educational setting. International schools benefit from a range of distinct characteristics such as sufficient funding, international curricula, high-quality staffing, dense social networks, and educational resources, which enable them to reproduce economic, social, and cultural capital. The analysis finds how the accumulated resources in international schools allow for a wider capacity for cultural and social capital and the conversion to economic capital, providing elite students with a higher chance of obtaining tertiary education, high-income jobs, and advantageous social connections. Subsequently, the paper elaborates on how access to elite resources in international schools exacerbates social exclusion and limits non-elites. Because of school and student rankings, school choice, and high tuition, non-elites are left with lower-quality education, including smaller educational resources, economic opportunities, and social networks, exacerbating social stratification in education and income.

Introduction

Education serves as the fundamental pillar for knowledge acquisition, societal advancement, and individual development. While free education has been implemented in Hong Kong, the increase in educational opportunities does not mean that educational inequalities have been eliminated or that educational opportunities have been equally distributed. In Hong Kong, underlying gender, racial, wealth, and social inequalities have restricted the educational capacities of targeted groups. The coexistence of different types of schools gives rise to varying outcomes, creating divides in educational quality, affordability, and resources that can contribute to social exclusion and socioeconomic disparities.

Through the lens that schools are social institutions that foster cultural capital, this article analyses the emergence of elite identification in local and private schools. Firstly, the paper establishes the context of Hong Kong's education system and the different types of schools. The next section delves into the concepts of elites and capital through the ideas of several sociologists, elaborating on existing information about elitism in education and defining terms for the remainder of the paper. Then, the paper extrapolates the aforementioned sociological concepts into the Hong Kong context by discussing the distribution of capital and elite identification in schools, and the subsequent social marginalisation of the remaining non-elites. Finally, the paper concludes by summarising and acknowledging the suggestions and limitations of this research.

Hong Kong Schools

Public Sector Schools

Hong Kong schools are grouped into public and private; the majority of schools are public. These schools are entirely government-funded and provide free primary and secondary education.[1] Government schools are facilitated by the Education Bureau (EDB), comprised of civil servants.[2] These schools receive subsidies from the government but are owned and run by separate entities, such as religious, charity, or

---

[1] Hong Kong Special Administrative Region Government, "Education," in *Hong Kong Yearbook 2022* (Hong Kong Information Services Department, 2023), https://www.yearbook.gov.hk/2021/en/pdf/E08.pdf.

[2] Michael Tien and Rosanna Yick-Ming Wong, "Report on Review of Medium of Instruction for Secondary Schools and Secondary School Places Allocation," December 2005, https://www.e-c.edu.hk/doc/en/publications_and_related_documents/education_reform/MOI&SSPA_report_Eng.pdf.

community organisations, which can provide additional funding and are operated by incorporated management committees.[3] In contrast, aided schools enjoy augmented financial freedom. They can employ their selected staff, such as principals, teachers, and administrators, and have complete control over the funds and assets from the government through an incorporated management committee.[4] However, the administrative choices made by non-government bodies must comply with the EDB's Code of Aid and thus, be approved by the government.[5] While education for public schools is free, aided schools may charge supplementary fees for specific purposes, such as entrance examinations and equipment damage. These charges per student are a maximum of 450 HKD.[6] Generally, the medium of instruction (MoI) for public sector schools is Cantonese.[7]

Public school students have to take several public exams, the most prominent being the Territory-wide System Assessment (TSA) and the Hong Kong Diploma of Secondary Education Examination (HKDSE). The TSA is an assessment that gauges a student's Basic Competency in Chinese, English, and maths within the local curriculum. According to the Hong Kong Examinations and Assessment Authority (HKEAA), basic competency is the minimum proficiency level a student must achieve and pass to advance to the next stage of learning independently.[8] The exam is taken at the "key stages of development", which are the year ends of Primary 3, Primary 6, and Secondary 3 (ages

---

[3] EDB, "Hong Kong: The Facts. Education," EDB (Hong Kong Education Bureau, May 2023), 1, https://www.edb.gov.hk/attachment/en/about-edb/publications-stat/hk_thefacts_education/Education_The%20Facts_EN_2023.pdf.
[4] EDB, "Guide to Financial Management for Aided Schools Operated by Incorporated Management Committees Education Bureau," EDB.gov, April 2022, 2, https://www.edb.gov.hk/attachment/en/sch-admin/sbm/corner-imc-sch/fm%20guide%20english.pdf.
[5] EDB, "Code of Aid for Secondary Schools," EDB.gov, September 1994, 3, https://www.edb.gov.hk/attachment/en/sch-admin/regulations/codes-of-aid/coa_sec_e.pdf.
[6] EDB, "Approved List of Fines/Charges/Fees for Specific Purposes in Aided and Caput Schools," EDB, accessed February 8, 2024, 1, https://www.edb.gov.hk/attachment/en/student-parents/sch-info/fees-charges-in-sch/aided-sch/collection%20of%20fines%20and%20charges_aided_en.pdf.
[7] Puja Kapai, "Education of Ethnic Minority Children," Legco, December 12, 2011, 4, https://www.legco.gov.hk/yr11-12/english/panels/ed/papers/ed1212cb2-570-2-e.pdf.
[8] EDB, "Assessment for Learning," EDB, 2019, https://www.edb.gov.hk/en/curriculum-development/assessment/about-assessment/assessment-for-learning.html.

8, 11, and 14 respectively).[9] The purpose of this assessment is to improve teaching through the identification of students' general strengths and weaknesses. The HKDSE is a public, university entrance exam that is taken after the completion of secondary school. The examination aims to measure the attainment of knowledge. The HKDSE is graded on a scale of 1 to 5, with 1 being the lowest and 5 being the highest. Individuals with a level below 1 are deemed as 'unclassified'.[10]

Private Sector Schools

Hong Kong private schools are independent, self-financed bodies with little to no government involvement in their management. Thus, these schools enjoy almost total autonomy in deciding admission exams (if any), fees, staffing, student criteria, MoI, and curricula.[11] There are five main sub-categories within private sector education: caput, English Schools Foundation (ESF), Private Independent (PISs), international, and Direct Subsidy Scheme (DSS) schools. Caput schools are non-profit institutions similar to aided schools; the government provides subsidies to the school in compensation for buying secondary school spaces from the school and the students' tuition fees. Their fees cannot exceed those of aided schools.[12] The ESF is an organisation that encompasses 22 schools and provides an English-dominant education to Hong Kong students.[13] PISs are self-financing schools that facilitate the development of private schools and broaden parental choices within the private school system.[14] PISs are given a grant for the school campus and must allocate a 10 percent minimum of their annual school fee income towards financial assistance and scholarships for commendable students. PISs are intended for permanent Hong Kong residents, requiring at least 70

---

[9] HKEAA, "Territory-Wide System Assessment (TSA) for Schools," HKEAA, April 2014, https://www.bca.hkeaa.edu.hk/web/TSA/en/pdf/TSA_HKEAA_Leaflet_Eng.pdf.
[10] HKEAA, "Hong Kong Examinations and Assessment Authority - Introduction," HKEAA, March 31, 2021, https://www.hkeaa.edu.hk/en/hkdse/introduction/.
[11] "Xianggang Butong Zhonglei Zhongxue de Fenbu" [Hong Kong's Distribution of Different Types of Secondary Schools], Schooland, accessed February 19, 2024, https://www.schooland.hk/post/sspa04.
[12] LegCo, "Transitional Subsidy for Caput Schools to Join the Direct Subsidy Scheme," LegCo (Legislative Council of the Hong Kong), September 2005, 1, https://www.legco.gov.hk/yr04-05/english/panels/ed/papers/edcb2-2505-1e.pdf.
[13] English Schools Foundation, "ESF - HK's Largest English-Medium International School Organisation," About ESF, accessed February 8, 2024, https://www.esf.edu.hk/about-esf/.
[14] Michael Suen, "LCQ12: Private Independent Schools," GovHK, June 1, 2011, https://www.info.gov.hk/gia/general/201106/01/P201106010148.htm.

percent of local students within the school.[15] International schools are designed for students belonging to particular cultural, racial, or linguistic backgrounds, or for students who aspire to study abroad and offer multicultural curricula. The government provides multiple international schools with land grants, while others are sponsored by their governments or communities.[16] International schools foster a multicultural learning environment, often with a diverse student body that includes students from expatriate families. These schools have higher tuition fees and international curricula, including IB or AP.

Direct Subsidy Scheme Schools

Lastly, while DSS schools are labelled as a part of the private sector, they are a mix between public and private. The Hong Kong government established the concept of DSS schools in 1991 to diversify the education system, providing parents with increased options for schools,[17] strengthening the development of the private school sector, promoting privatisation,[18] and increasing competition between schools.[19] Although DSS schools run like public schools, they are financed by individual providers or educational trust sectors.[20] They receive government subsidies, with the amount of the subsidy determined by the number of enrolled students and the notional price of a similarly sized aided school.[21] In contrast to public schools, DSS schools enjoy wider autonomy in student admission requirements and curricula. They can construct an entrance exam better suited to the school's academic

[15] EDB, "Guidance Notes on Application for a School Site for the Construction of a Private Independent School (PIS)," EDB, November 2001, 1–2, https://www.edb.gov.hk/attachment/en/sch-admin/sch-premises-info/allocation-of-sch/sae-result/guide_site_1031.pdf.
[16] Education Commission, "Education Commission Report No 3," Education Commission, June 1988, 52–53, https://www.e-c.edu.hk/doc/en/publications_and_related_documents/education_reports/ecr3_e.pdf.
[17] Choi Yuk-lin, "LCQ2: Non-Local Courses Offered by Direct Subsidy Scheme Secondary Schools," GovHK, July 6, 2022, https://www.info.gov.hk/gia/general/202207/06/P2022070600448.htm.
[18] Education Commission, 72.
[19] Beatrice Oi-yeung Lam, Soo-yong Byun, and Moosung Lee, "Understanding Educational Inequality in Hong Kong: Secondary School Segregation in Changing Institutional Contexts," *British Journal of Sociology of Education* 40, no. 8 (August 14, 2019): 1170–87, https://doi.org/10.1080/01425692.2019.1642736.
[20] Lixun Wang and Andy Kirkpatrick, "Trilingual Education in Hong Kong Primary Schools: An Overview," *Multilingual Education* 5, no. 1 (April 24, 2015): 3, https://doi.org/10.1186/s13616-015-0023-8.
[21] EDB, "General Information on DSS," Education Bureau, accessed February 4, 2024, https://www.edb.gov.hk/en/edu-system/primary-secondary/applicable-to-primary-secondary/direct-subsidy-scheme/info-sch.html.

standards and the EDB's basic educational standards. Moreover, they have the option to charge tuition fees; in return, they must invest in facilities and staffing.[22] Sponsors also have a wider scope in designing their curriculum, which must be tailored towards local students to provide ample preparation for public examinations. All aided schools are qualified as DSS applicants.[23]

This paper focuses on three specific school types: aided, DSS, and international schools. Through the selection of one representative school from each sector, as well as a school that embodies characteristics from both sectors, the analysis demonstrates the elite identification occurring in international schools and explores the social marginalisation of local school students. In examining these areas, this research presents an understanding of the interplay between the public and private sectors, social exclusion, and the formation of elites in Hong Kong.

Elites and Capital in Education

Origins of the Elites

The concept of elites was developed long before its literary mentions. Niccolò Machiavelli formed the concept through the words 'aristocrats' and 'nobles'. Henri de Saint-Simon highlighted the impact of the French Revolution on elites, in which elites based on functional contributions rather than social status gained dominance over traditional, landed aristocrats. Historically, the ideas around elites underline human excellence and aristocracy, establishing them as individuals with "superior moral and psychological makeup".[24]

Vilfredo Pareto was one of the first to use the term elite in his works.[25] In *The Mind and Society*, Pareto labels elites as the "upper stratum of society". He defines elites as those who score the highest in certain social-value indexes, such as power, wealth, and knowledge.[26] In further

[22] Education Commission, 75–76.
[23] EDB, "General Information on DSS,".
[24] Phillip Korom, "Elites: History of the Concept," in *The International Encyclopedia of Social and Behavioral Sciences*, ed. James D. Wright (Elsevier, July 1, 2015), 390, https://www.academia.edu/39674901/Elites_History_of_the_Concept.
[25] Korom, 390–391.
[26] Vilfredo Pareto, The Mind and Society, ed. Arthur Livingston, trans. Arthur Livingston and Andrew Bongiorno (Harcourt, Brace & Company, 1935), 1423-1432; Vilfredo Pareto and Hans L Zetterberg, *The Rise and Fall of Elites: An Application of Theoretical Sociology* (1968; repr., Transaction Publishers, 1991), 8, https://www.google.co.jp/books/edition/The_Rise_and_Fall_of_the_Elites/uaRwAAAAQBAJ.

work, John Scott draws attention to the 'superiority' in Pareto's model of elites, emphasising the consideration of an elite through a measured skill set or attribute assessed on a scale of inferiority and superiority. This can be applied to various occupations, such as athletes, artists, or sociologists, where the elite consists of the highest ranking in the ranges of the particular field. In a broader sense, elites represent the overarching collection of all the different elite groups in society, irrespective of their domains of expertise.[27]

Another sociologist on this topic is C. Wright Mills, whose ideas about elites are relevant to better understanding the ideas around elites, capital, and privilege. In *The Power Elite*, he states elites are "men whose positions enable them to transcend the ordinary environments of ordinary men and women" and can make decisions that have impactful outcomes.[28] For example, the economic, military, and political powers in the hands of American elites considerably expand the range of available avenues of power at their disposal, heightening the repercussions of their decisions. It is also significant to stress the importance of the possessed capacity to make influential decisions rather than the outcome of the decisions. These elites are typically leaders or members of the dominating hierarchies and organisations and operate as collective groups rather than individuals. From a different point of view, elites, when referring to higher echelons in society, are defined by their highly valued resources and experiences that include a greater share of wealth, power, prestige, and lifestyle. Mills suggests that higher circles consist of members from the top class, classifying elites as the 'inner circle' of the upper social stratum. These elites are "selected, trained and certified, and permitted" privileged access to a larger volume of social capital – in other words, they are granted connections to powerful individuals within the "impersonal, institutional hierarchies of modern society".[29]

Elite Resources

Shamus Rahman Khan defines an elite as an individual in a position holding a notable advantage in terms of access to resources, influence, and "disproportionate" control.[30] Khan highlights the five key resources elites possess. The first is political power; he argues that the exercise of power by elites exacerbates inequality, as they tend to

[27] John Scott, "Pareto and the Elite," in *Vilfredo Pareto: Beyond Disciplinary Boundaries*, ed. Joseph V. Femia and Alasdair J. Marshall (Routledge, 2016), 9–18, https://books.google.co.jp/books?hl=en&lr=&id=UwmOCwAAQBAJ.
[28] C. Wright Mills, *The Power Elite* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1956), 9.
[29] Mills, 19.
[30] Shamus Rahman Khan, "The Sociology of Elites," *Annual Review of Sociology* 38, no. 1 (August 11, 2012): 362, https://doi.org/10.1146/annurev-soc-071811-145542.

prioritise the problems of the wealthy and neglect the less fortunate. Khan asserts that political power is inherent in the arrangement of politics and deliberately constructs biases that favour specific groups. Secondly, elites have immense control over economic resources. The wealthy benefit from the unequal distribution of wealth, leading to increased inequality and stagnated social mobility. The paper later examines how wealth inequality affords elites educational advantages. Thirdly, elites possess cultural capital, a resource reflective of social status. It is a means for elites to identify each other and allocate opportunities based on displayed desirable attributes. This point is particularly important when discussing the differences in cultural capital between local and private schools. Next is social networks, which coordinate the actions of elites. The small size of elites and dense social networks enable them to steer large corporations toward favourable decisions or displace the poor in the interest of the business. The last resource is pivotal to the maintenance and unity of the elite powers – Khan suggests that elites use ideologies to manipulate less powerful individuals to adopt their interests and consolidate themselves.[31]

For discussions in the remaining sections, elites are defined as a group of individuals who possess ample capital. The extrapolation involves how elite schools distribute different forms of capital and how that contributes to forms of elite identification. One aim of this study is to investigate how elites have an advantage in education and its effect on the underlying educational inequality in Hong Kong. Hence, understanding elites is imperative in grasping the constitutional power one holds simply by bearing the 'elite' title.

The Language of Merit

Khan expands his study of elites by investigating elites in schools. He argues that educational institutions play a role in reproducing elites and improving social mobility. Elite schools, labelled as "engines of inequality" by Khan,[32] increase access to "valuable resources" for marginalised groups.[33] However, the conversion of social privileges into credentials occurring inside these schools masks the underlying inequality in these schools. Although elite schools shift away from the appeals of social connections and progressively use talent, merit, and hard work, the behaviours that are "rewarded" in schools "generally match how the already advantaged tend to play the game."[34] Adopting

[31] Khan, "The Sociology of Elites," 370.
[32] Khan, "The Sociology of Elites," 362.
[33] Khan, "The Sociology of Elites," 372.
[34] Khan, "The Sociology of Elites," 372.

this viewpoint, the paper touches on the advantages that boost elite admissions to private schools.

In another paper, Khan defines elite schools as institutions with control over elite resources, such as academic capital, social networks, economic capacity, and culture.[35] He emphasises that elite schools are not isolated but interconnected entities within a network of relationships. Additionally, elite schools search for students with quality academic performance and soft skills, such as cultural competence, social connections, leadership, and symbolic advantage. Khan finds that wealth alone does not guarantee the prospect of admission; rather, the investment in the child improves the likelihood of them possessing attributes schools look for. Elite schools have established "metrics of 'qualification'" that can be acquired with the right amount of money, thereby increasing the likelihood of admission for wealthy children.[36] The rise of meritocracy (discipline and intelligence replacing social connections and status) reduces nepotism and increases access for undervalued, talented individuals to elite schools. Contrastingly, it fosters the belief that outcomes are inherent to individuals rather than their circumstances.[37] It is important to note that Khan's research centres around American universities, missing relevant details in the Hong Kong context. Nonetheless, the final section incorporates how student selection criteria and requirements reinforce elite identification in education in the next section.

Another view on elites demonstrates that elite schools are institutions that offer a socialisation model that influences students' public and private lives through formal and 'hidden' curricula. Agnès van Zanten lists physical closure, small size, specific curricula, and activities as distinctions for elite schools that are included in the elite culture's internal cohesion. Van Zanten highlights that in England and America, private school students have a high likelihood of attending elite universities, as students receive higher levels of guidance and support for tertiary education through internal staff and college agencies.

Similar to Khan, van Zanten proposes that richer families have an advantage in the realm of merit and academics for elite school admissions, which stems from the high-quality education at private schools. The families can use money to help their children through

[35] Shamus Rahman Khan, "The Education of Elites in the United States," *L'Année Sociologique* Vol. 66, no. 1 (January 1, 2016): 171–92, https://doi.org/10.3917/anso.161.0171.
[36] Khan, "The Education of Elites in the United States," 172.
[37] Khan, "The Education of Elites in the United States," 185.

school choice and private tutoring; alumni parents can use their legacy. Van Zanten's conceptualisation of elite advantages is used to support the arguments in the paper. He argues that upper-class families typically support education systems that favour their social class and limit others from an elite education. Again, because van Zanten's research is based on the contexts of France, the UK, and the US, he disregards Hong Kong elites. Nevertheless, it can be reasonably assumed that Hong Kong follows those nations similarly.

Forms of Capital

Another idea that is of equal importance is capital. This paper employs Pierre Bourdieu's framework on cultural, social, and economic capital. According to Bourdieu, capital is a labour-obtained resource that can be used to exploit the labour of others.[38] Cultural capital, distinguished by the possession of skills or knowledge, can be present in an objectified, embodied, or institutionalised state. Embodied cultural capital, the "external wealth converted into an integral part of the person," is linked to the body and requires a "labour of inculcation" and personally invested time for successful attainment.[39] Otherwise, it is culture gained through self-cultivation, such as etiquette, languages, sports performance, etc. Objectified cultural capital is the ownership and understanding of material culture, such as art, music, and writing. Institutionalised cultural capital is capital recognised by educational institutions, measured through qualifications, degrees, certifications, credentials, etc. The possession of this capital distinguishes the holder's competence through the validation of recognised institutions.

Social capital is "the aggregate of the actual or potential resources" that are linked to "[the] possession of a durable network of … institutionalised relationships of mutual acquaintance and recognition."[40] Bourdieu states that the amount of social capital one has depends on the vastness of the social network and the volume of capital that their connections possess – the more resources and advantages their connection has, the greater the social capital. Hence, this form of capital is "maintained and reinforced" through social exchanges and continuous effort.[41] Moreover, given the time the development and establishment of social obligations require, social capital is not a readily available resource.

[38] Pierre Bourdieu, "The Forms of Capital," in *Handbook of Theory and Research for the Sociology of Education*, ed. John G Richardson (Westport, Conn.: Greenwood Press, 1986), 15.
[39] Bourdieu, 18.
[40] Bourdieu, 21.
[41] Bourdieu, 21.

However, the investment into connections fosters sociability, leading to the "recognition of nonspecific indebtedness", or gratitude.[42]

Finally, economic capital is the most straightforward; it is financial and monetary assets, including money, property rights, and investments. This capital contains the "[immediate and direct]" ability to be converted into money.[43] The forms of capital are not independent of one another and can be amplified or interchanged. Bourdieu states that economic capital serves as the foundation of all other forms of capital "at the cost of a … great effort of transformation".[44] He expresses the importance of converting capital in maintaining or elevating wealth and social position. However, during this process, the user must consider the potential losses and strategise the most efficient and least costly method. In the context of this paper, it is crucial to study Bourdieu's concepts to capture the broad picture of 'educational inequality' in measuring the difference in the distribution of capital between private and public schools in Hong Kong. This then allows for exploring the correlation between the amount of capital owned by a family and the type of school attended by the children, and the intrinsic advantages an individual with considerable amounts of capital has in or beyond education.

Elites' Inner Circle in Hong Kong Education

In the study of educational inequalities in Hong Kong, the selection of schools from both the public and private sectors is important. Therefore, this paper analyses specific schools in the order of limited, moderate, and complete autonomy in their design: aided, DSS, and international schools. However, aided and DSS schools are broadly referred to as local or public schools due to their adherence to the local EDB curriculum. This section draws upon concepts related to Bourdieu's capital and its conversion; it argues how international schools benefit their attendees as they cultivate elites and aid in elite identification through the reproduction of capital. The section contends that the promotion of elite identification in international schools fosters social exclusion, which limits opportunities for non-elites due to a scarcity of school choices and educational resources.

The Advantages of International Schools

Enrollment in international schools offers students an advantage as it cultivates and reproduces various forms of capital. Under Khan's

[42] Bourdieu, 24.
[43] Bourdieu, 16.
[44] Bourdieu, 24.

definition of elite schools, Hong Kong international schools can be classified as elite institutions.[45] This indicates that international schools have disproportionate access to quality educational resources that can be used to enhance their methods of education and learning environment. These educational resources can include physical facilities (e.g., laboratories, classrooms, libraries, buildings), subject-specific materials (e.g., science, art, physical education equipment), computers and technology, qualified staff, and textbooks. Consequently, the allocation of capital is predominantly among elite students who possess the resources to utilize and gain from them, creating a system where the elites have an increased advantage owing to the greater probability that their schools have access to extensive resources and opportunities. This concept is referenced in "The Forms of Capital," where Bourdieu suggests that an individual's capacity to utilize their capital effectively hinges on the distribution of resources available for acquisition.[46] Mills notes that elites are "permitted" privileged access to capital.[47] Ergo, international school students are granted access to more opportunities for international exposure. This includes studying abroad at boarding schools, overseas summer programs, and the eligibility to apply to local Hong Kong and international universities. This expands their social and cultural capital by broadening their network and cultivating greater cultural understanding, increasing the likelihood of gaining admission to international and or elite universities, and securing their obtainment of institutional cultural capital.

Furthermore, elite students are more likely to secure coveted job positions with a wider array of international or domestic choices due to the distribution of capital in private schools. In education, the forms of capital have more distinct references.

Cultural capital involves assets that contribute to academic success, primarily emphasising knowledge while encompassing skills, educational expectations, cultural orientations, etc. Social capital includes social networks and relationships that can enhance educational prospects. International schools are a site for the congregation and socialisation of elites as they attract wealthy students with networks.[48] The distribution of these forms of capital for students in international schools is advantageous for later years in securing economic capital.

---

[45] Khan, "The Education of Elites in the United States," 174-176.
[46] Bourdieu, 19.
[47] Mills, 19.
[48] Trevor Tsz-lok Lee and Stephen Wing-kai Chiu, "Curriculum Reform and the Social Class Achievement Gap," *Social Transformations in Chinese Societies* 12, no. 2 (October 3, 2016): 150, https://doi.org/10.1108/stics-05-2016-0002.

Economic capital, while not quite present for secondary school students, is attained through tertiary education or employment and still refers to financial resources. The amount of cultural and social capital that international school students gather in their schools and elite tertiary education allows for a greater capacity for capital conversion from social and cultural to economic capital, which is enabled by the competitive advantage of greater institutional capital in the form of credentials. Attending international schools can significantly enhance the acquisition of tertiary education and the attainment of high-level employment positions, thereby increasing the amount of economic capital (and other forms that can be converted through economic capital) an elite individual can accumulate.

Bourdieu states that in a certain field, which, in this case, is the field of education, the possession of capital provides individuals with the means to accumulate their profits, further enabling them to expand and convert their capital.[49] Therefore, economic capital affords the ability to invest in greater educational pursuits, establish influential connections, and engage in activities that build their identification as an elite – or, in other words, convert their forms of capital. International schools demonstrate the advantage of distributing capital through their nearly unlimited autonomy and vast economic capacity. Schools that receive substantial funding can allocate the money towards enriching students' educational achievements by providing various resources, such as top-quality staff, classroom materials, and infrastructure.

The Social Marginalisation of Non-Elites

The presence of international schools exacerbates the social alienation of non-elite students due to their limited access to the resources and benefits available to students at local schools. Given that elites possess resources that confer an advantage, it is logical to deduce that elites may monopolise access to these resources or exclude non-elites from such privileges.[50] Local schools have less overall capital and therefore have a limited distribution of capital for their students. Due to the inadequate effort and limited financial resources of local schools, students have less cultural capital compared to their counterparts in international schools, thus affecting the quality of education in local schools. While social networks may be dense, the social capital exchanged through said relationships is minimal, given the low overall capital possessed by local students – the potential for accessing influential connections or exposure to more diverse networks is limited,

[49] Bourdieu, 15.
[50] Khan, "The Sociology of Elites," 362.

hindering the available opportunities to local school students beyond the school setting. As a result, the limited capital obtained in local schools leads to a greater likelihood of attending less prestigious universities, securing lower-paying jobs, or forgoing higher education entirely, diminishing the prospects for upward social mobility. This is reinforced through student selection, school ranking, wealth, and tuition fees.

Elite School Choice

Given the diversity of schools that exist in Hong Kong's school system, it is important to consider the relevance of school choice in this discussion. School or educational choice grants parents the opportunity to select and pursue the school their children want to attend, allowing for extended educational diversity.[51] In the context of Hong Kong, the introduction of DSS schools is aimed at boosting the practice of school choice.[52] The paper contends that having access to school choice offers an advantage. According to van Zanten, educational choice revolves around cultural and economic resources.[53] Hence, the high overall capital of the upper class grants them the intrinsic quality of educational choice, allowing them flexibility for a wide range of schools for selection, such as prestigious or boarding schools. Van Zanten's idea that elites advocate for education systems that cater to their social class and marginalise others from elite education is evident.[54] The ability of the elite to accumulate substantial economic capital and channel it into educational investments creates a cycle of exclusivity tied to socioeconomic status. This points to a deeper social inequality that fosters educational disparity.

Selection and Identification of Elites

One factor that contributes significantly to the perception of exclusivity based on elite identification is student selection and school ranking. For international schools, high competition in admissions can be expected, especially because of the rising popularity of schools with

---

[51] Atila Abdulkadiroğlu and Tayfun Sönmez, "School Choice: A Mechanism Design Approach," *The American Economic Review* 93, no. 3 (May 2003): 729, https://doi.org/10.1257/000282803322157061.
[52] EDB, "General Information on DSS".
[53] Agnès van Zanten, "Educating Elites: The Changing Dynamics and Meanings of Privilege and Power," in *World Yearbook of Education 2015*, ed. Stephen J Ball, Brigitte Darchy-Koechlin, and Agnès van Zanten (Routledge, 2015), 5.
[54] Agnès Van Zanten, "The Sociology of Elite Education," in *The Routledge International Handbook of the Sociology of Education*, ed. Michael W. Apple, Stephen J. Ball, and Luis Armando Gandin (Routledge, 2009), 335, https://sciencespo.hal.science/hal-00972726/file/avz-the-sociology-of-elite-education.pdf.

international curricula and an English MoI.[55] In reference to Khan, international school admissions processes are similar to those adopted by US or UK schools, relying on academic aptitude and hard or soft skills.[56] However, this factor is primarily centred around local schools.

In local schools, the EDB implements an entrance system called the Secondary School Places Allocation System (SSPA). The SSPA consists of two stages aimed at allocating students to secondary schools. In the first stage, students are allowed to choose and order up to two schools without any constraints on districts. The schools have discretionary places (DPs) that can be used for admission according to the school's admission criteria. Secondary schools are to reserve a maximum of 30 percent DPs, although DSS schools can increase this percentage at their own discretion. Schools have the flexibility to establish their entrance requirements, procedures, and weightings, excluding any written exams.[57] These admission criteria can include considerations of school conduct, academic performance, extra-curricular activities, service, and interview performance.[58] Students are then assigned to one of the two schools in Stage 2, according to the criteria for Central Allocation (CA). Based on the school choices, the student is allocated in compliance with an allocation band and a random number. The number decides the order of the students' allocation within the same band. Secondary schools are sorted by academic performance into three bands. Band 1 is the highest and much more selective than the other two bands, and thus is first in the allocations. Students are sorted into three bands according to academic performance, meaning it is quite competitive due to parents' desire for their children to get into a Band 1

[55] Moosung Lee, Hyejin Kim, and Ewan Wright, "The Influx of International Baccalaureate (IB) Programmes into Local Education Systems in Hong Kong, Singapore, and South Korea," *Educational Review* 74, no. 1 (March 9, 2021): 3, https://doi.org/10.1080/00131911.2021.1891023.
[56] Khan, "Education of Elites in the United States," 183.
[57] EDB, "Secondary School Places Allocation System 2022/2024 (for Admission to Secondary 1 in September 2024) Frequently Asked Questions (DP)," EDB, September 2023, https://www.edb.gov.hk/attachment/en/edu-system/primary-secondary/spa-systems/secondary-spa/general-info/FAQ_SSPA_2024_Sept_DP_EN.pdf; EDB, "Secondary School Places Allocation System 2022/2024 (for Admission to Secondary 1 in September 2024) Frequently Asked Questions (General)," EDB, September 2023, https://www.edb.gov.hk/attachment/en/edu-system/primary-secondary/spa-systems/secondary-spa/general-info/FAQ_SSPA_2024_Sept_General_EN.pdf.
[58] Baptist Lui Ming Choi Secondary School, "Frequently Asked Questions about S1 Discretionary Places Admission," 2023, https://www.blmcss.edu.hk/main/uploads/files/FAQs(English).pdf.

school.[59] In turn, the priority in the allocation process for Band 1 school students creates unequal access to school choices for students in Band 2 and Band 3.[60] This disparity arises from the limited 30 percent reserved spots in Band 1 schools and the high demand from parents for their children to secure a place in these popular institutions. Moreover, students have an amplified chance of getting sent to schools that have a similar band to the student. As a result, Band 1 students are constitutionally guaranteed a spot at Band 1 schools, leaving Band 2 and Band 3 students with a reduced range of school choices, suggesting school ranking is linked to student admissions.[61]

From the school's perspective, popular local schools – especially DSS schools – face stress and competition over selecting students. In "Schooling in Hong Kong", Wing-Wah Law mentions a conundrum that schools face, similar to the chicken and egg problem, that questions whether students make a school successful or if the school makes a student successful. As simple as the answer may be, a school and its students are equally dependent on one another for their respective success. According to the Law, DSS schools require well-performing students for an acclaimed reputation.[62] While it is true that schools categorised as Band 1 are judged solely on the basis of students' internal examination results, it is crucial to recognize that schools play a vital role in nurturing a student's knowledge, behaviour, skills, and virtues. This comprehensive development can ultimately lead to student success in higher education, employment, and achieving a high income. Trevor Tsz-lok Lee and Stephen Wing-kai Chiu reiterate this idea in their paper, which emphasises elite schools, in which attendance at elite schools greatly benefits a student's educational success.[63] It is arguable that the

[59] EDB, "Secondary School Places Allocation System 2022/2024 (for Admission to Secondary 1 in September 2024) Frequently Asked Questions (Control Allocation Mechanism)," EDB, September 2023, https://www.edb.gov.hk/attachment/en/edu-system/primary-secondary/spa-systems/secondary-spa/general-info/FAQ_SSPA_2024_Sept_CA_EN.pdf; Daphnee Hui Lin Lee and Chi Shing Chiu, "'School Banding': Principals' Perspectives of Teacher Professional Development in the School-Based Management Context," Journal of Educational Administration 55, no. 6 (2017): 695, https://doi.org/10.1108/JEA-02-2017-0018.
[60] Aohua Ni, "Ability-Grouping and Secondary Student Attributions of Success and Failure in Hong Kong and Shanghai," May 2016, 13, https://etda.libraries.psu.edu/files/final_submissions/11781.
[61] EDB, "Secondary School Places Allocation System 2022/2024 (for Admission to Secondary 1 in September 2024) Frequently Asked Questions (General)".
[62] Wing-Wah Law, "Schooling in Hong Kong," in *Going to School in East Asia*, ed. Gerard Postiglione and Jason Tan (Bloomsbury Publishing USA, 2007), 111, https://books.google.com.hk/books?id=67POEAAAQBAJ.
[63] Lee and Chiu, 160.

relationship between schools and students in terms of success is symbiotic and cannot be attributed to a single factor.

Wealth Disparity and Exclusivity

Another factor that contributes to the exclusivity of the schools is wealth. International schools are well-known for their high costs; the median school fee of private schools is approximately 161,000 HKD.[64] In 2023, the median monthly household income in Hong Kong stood at 30,000 HKD, translating to an annual income of 360,000 HKD.[65] The financial requirements for international schools pose a significant barrier for lower-income families. International schools are then rendered financially unviable for low and middle-class groups, as their average tuition accounts for nearly 45 percent of the average annual income. This renders international schools predominantly accessible to the upper class or elites, thereby reinforcing the status of international schools as institutions for the elite. Furthermore, ideas from van Zanten and Khan suggest an extra advantage for wealthier students in admissions. Affluent families may leverage their financial resources by investing in tutoring to boost academic achievement or by applying to a broad array of schools, thereby expanding their educational options and increasing their chances of admission.[66] If their child's performance is less than adequate, elite families can marshal their economic capital and send them to overseas boarding schools or other similar environments.[67]

Restricted access to educational options due to socio-economic status reinforces wealth disparities and social stratification, resulting in diminished social mobility for students from lower-income backgrounds.[68] The notion of increased inclusivity and flexibility for parent choices around school offered by the concept of the DSS is somewhat misleading; a DSS school's 'flexible' option to add school fees inadvertently decreases the choices of schools for families who are unable to afford it. According to Anita Poon and Yiu-Chung Wong, tuition fees in DSS schools additionally perpetuate social exclusion for

[64] "Hong Kong School Fees by Grade (2024)," Edarabia, February 7, 2024, https://www.edarabia.com/hong-kong-school-fees/.
[65] Census and Statistics Department, "Quarterly Report on General Household Survey," Census and Statistics Department, November 30, 2023, https://www.censtatd.gov.hk/en/wbr.html?ecode=B10500012023QQ03&scode=500.
[66] Khan, "Education of Elites in the United States," 183.
[67] Lee and Chiu, 150.
[68] Anita Y.K. Poon and Yiu-Chung Wong, "Equity vs Excellence: A Preliminary Exploration of Hong Kong's Education Reform," *Digital Commons @ Lingnan University*, December 2005, 25, https://commons.ln.edu.hk/cgi/viewcontent.cgi?article=1053&context=capswp.

lower-class families by creating more elitism in socioeconomic classes. The school choice limitations for less affluent students are further constrained by the growing number of aided and government schools transitioning to DSS. They describe this effect as a brain drain – the migration of upper-middle-class students transferring to DSS schools for better education, while lower-class students are obliged to stick to "second-rate" local schools.[69] As a result, the Hong Kong wealth gap continues to widen, exacerbating the inequality in educational resources and opportunities between socioeconomic classes. This further perpetuates the unequal distribution of educational advantages, hindering their social mobility prospects and making it increasingly challenging for lower-class students to compete on an equal footing with their elite counterparts.

Conclusion

The paper suggests that international schools, as elite institutions, distribute cultural and social capital, which confers significant career advantages and reinforces social stratification. This is in contrast to students in local schools, who have access to educational resources of lower quality. This paper argues that elites are given an intrinsic advantage enabled by educational resources, qualified staff, sufficient funding, international curricula, and vast social networks, granting them the privilege of school choice. The career and educational opportunities available can potentially lead to greater success by transforming cultural and social capital into economic capital. This paper also highlights how Hong Kong's student admissions, ranking, and tuition disparities contribute to the relevance of school choice, leading to social stratification among the elites and the immobilisation of opportunities for education, employment, and connections for local school students.

Ultimately, it is important to approach the arguments presented in this paper with an open mind. They rely on a small set of data and sociological concepts that partially examine the context of Hong Kong. The analysis is centred around the synthesis of existing literature and dated data in lieu of collecting new data through interviews, case studies, etc. Moreover, there is a lack of information regarding Hong Kong's elites in education. For instance, it is difficult to answer the question of how elite educational resources facilitate the distribution of convertible capital without venturing outside of this paper's scope and gathering empirical evidence. Regardless, it is imperative to note that these

[69] Anita Y.K. Poon and Yiu-Chung Wong, "Education Reform in Hong Kong: The 'Through-Road' Model and Its Societal Consequences," *International Review of Education* 54, no. 1 (December 6, 2007): 48, https://www.jstor.org/stable/27715432.

concerns do not strip the legitimacy of the argument – they simply suggest that this paper's findings are purely theoretical. The paper's insights can be improved by gaining empirical evidence through further research, such as participant observation or interviews with students, schools, and experts.

Bibliography

Abdulkadiroğlu, Atila, and Tayfun Sönmez. "School Choice: A Mechanism Design Approach." *The American Economic Review* 93, no. 3 (May 2003): 729–47. https://doi.org/10.1257/000282803322157061.

Baptist Lui Ming Choi Secondary School. "Frequently Asked Questions about S1 Discretionary Places Admission," 2023. https://www.blmcss.edu.hk/main/uploads/files/FAQs(English).pdf.

Bourdieu, Pierre. "The Forms of Capital." In *Handbook of Theory and Research for the Sociology of Education*, edited by John G Richardson, 241–58. Westport, Conn.: Greenwood Press, 1986.

Census and Statistics Department. "Quarterly Report on General Household Survey." *Census and Statistics Department*, November 30, 2023. https://www.censtatd.gov.hk/en/wbr.html?ecode=B10500012023QQ03&scode=500.

Edarabia. "Hong Kong School Fees by Grade (2024)," February 7, 2024. https://www.edarabia.com/hong-kong-school-fees/.

EDB. "Approved List of Fines/Charges/Fees for Specific Purposes in Aided and Caput Schools." *EDB*. Accessed February 8, 2024. https://www.edb.gov.hk/attachment/en/student-parents/sch-info/fees-charges-in-sch/aided-sch/collection%20of%20fines%20and%20charges_aided_en.pdf.

———. "Assessment for Learning." EDB, 2019. https://www.edb.gov.hk/en/curriculum-development/assessment/about-assessment/assessment-for-learning.html.

———. "Code of Aid for Secondary Schools." *EDB.gov*, September 1994. https://www.edb.gov.hk/attachment/en/sch-admin/regulations/codes-of-aid/coa_sec_e.pdf.

———. "General Information on DSS." Education Bureau. Accessed February 4, 2024. https://www.edb.gov.hk/en/edu-system/primary-secondary/applicable-to-primary-secondary/direct-subsidy-scheme/info-sch.html.

———. "Guidance Notes on Application for a School Site for the Construction of a Private Independent School (PIS)." *EDB*, November

2001. https://www.edb.gov.hk/attachment/en/sch-admin/sch-premises-info/allocation-of-sch/sae-result/guide_site_1031.pdf.

———. "Guide to Financial Management for Aided Schools Operated by Incorporated Management Committees, Education Bureau." *EDB.gov*, April 2022. https://www.edb.gov.hk/attachment/en/sch-admin/sbm/corner-imc-sch/fm%20guide%20english.pdf.

———. "Hong Kong: The Facts. Education." *EDB*. Hong Kong Education Bureau, May 2023. https://www.edb.gov.hk/attachment/en/about-edb/publications-stat/hk_thefacts_education/Education_The%20Facts_EN_2023.pdf.

———. "Information Leaflet on the Secondary School Places Allocation System." *EDB*, September 2023. https://www.edb.gov.hk/attachment/en/edu-system/primary-secondary/spa-systems/secondary-spa/general-info/SSPA_2024_leaflet_EN.pdf.

———. "Secondary School Places Allocation System 2022/2024 (for Admission to Secondary 1 in September 2024) Frequently Asked Questions (Control Allocation Mechanism)." EDB, September 2023. https://www.edb.gov.hk/attachment/en/edu-system/primary-secondary/spa-systems/secondary-spa/general-info/FAQ_SSPA_2024_Sept_CA_EN.pdf.

———. "Secondary School Places Allocation System 2022/2024 (for Admission to Secondary 1 in September 2024) Frequently Asked Questions (DP)." *EDB*, September 2023. https://www.edb.gov.hk/attachment/en/edu-system/primary-secondary/spa-systems/secondary-spa/general-info/FAQ_SSPA_2024_Sept_DP_EN.pdf.

———. "Secondary School Places Allocation System 2022/2024 (for Admission to Secondary 1 in September 2024) Frequently Asked Questions (General)." EDB, September 2023. https://www.edb.gov.hk/attachment/en/edu-system/primary-secondary/spa-systems/secondary-spa/general-info/FAQ_SSPA_2024_Sept_General_EN.pdf.

———. "Student Enrolment Statistics, 2022/23 (Kindergartens, Primary and Secondary Schools)." *EDB*, July 2023. https://www.edb.gov.hk/attachment/en/about-edb/publications-stat/figures/Enrol_2022.pdf.

Education Commission. "Education Commission Report No 3." *Education Commission*, June 1988. https://www.e-c.edu.hk/doc/en/publications_and_related_documents/education_reports/ecr3_e.pdf.

English Schools Foundation. "ESF - HK's Largest English-Medium International School Organisation." About ESF. Accessed February 8, 2024. https://www.esf.edu.hk/about-esf/.

HKEAA. "Hong Kong Examinations and Assessment Authority - Introduction." HKEAA, March 31, 2021. https://www.hkeaa.edu.hk/en/hkdse/introduction/.

———. "Territory-Wide System Assessment (TSA) for Schools." HKEAA, April 2014. https://www.bca.hkeaa.edu.hk/web/TSA/en/pdf/TSA_HKEAA_Leaflet_Eng.pdf.

Hong Kong Special Administrative Region Government. "Education." In the *Hong Kong Yearbook 2022*. Hong Kong Information Services Department, 2023. https://www.yearbook.gov.hk/2021/en/pdf/E08.pdf.

Kapai, Puja. "Education of Ethnic Minority Children." Legco, December 12, 2011. https://www.legco.gov.hk/yr11-12/english/panels/ed/papers/ed1212cb2-570-2-e.pdf.

Korom, Phillip. "Elites: History of the Concept." In *The International Encyclopedia of Social and Behavioral Sciences*, edited by James D. Wright, 25:390–95. Elsevier, July 1, 2015. https://www.academia.edu/39674901/Elites_History_of_the_Concept.

Lam, Beatrice Oi-yeung, Soo-yong Byun, and Moosung Lee. "Understanding Educational Inequality in Hong Kong: Secondary School Segregation in Changing Institutional Contexts." *British Journal of Sociology of Education* 40, no. 8 (August 14, 2019): 1170–87. https://doi.org/10.1080/01425692.2019.1642736.

Law, Wing-Wah. "Schooling in Hong Kong." In *Going to School in East Asia*, edited by Gerard Postiglione and Jason Tan, 86–121. Bloomsbury Publishing USA, 2007. https://books.google.com.hk/books?id=67POEAAAQBAJ.

Lee, Daphnee Hui Lin, and Chi Shing Chiu. "'School Banding': Principals' Perspectives of Teacher Professional Development in the School-Based Management Context." *Journal of Educational Administration* 55, no. 6 (2017): 688–89. https://doi.org/10.1108/JEA-02-2017-0018.

Lee, Moosung, Hyejin Kim, and Ewan Wright. "The Influx of International Baccalaureate (IB) Programmes into Local Education Systems in Hong Kong, Singapore, and South Korea." *Educational Review* 74, no. 1 (March 9, 2021): 1–20. https://doi.org/10.1080/00131911.2021.1891023.

Lee, Trevor Tsz-lok, and Stephen Wing-kai Chiu. "Curriculum Reform and the Social Class Achievement Gap." *Social Transformations in Chinese Societies* 12, no. 2 (October 3, 2016): 148–65. https://doi.org/10.1108/stics-05-2016-0002.

LegCo. "Transitional Subsidy for Caput Schools to Join the Direct Subsidy Scheme." LegCo (Legislative Council of Hong Kong), September 2005. https://www.legco.gov.hk/yr04-05/english/panels/ed/papers/edcb2-2505-1e.pdf.

Mills, C. Wright. *The Power Elite*. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1956.

Ni, Aohua. "Ability-Grouping and Secondary Student Attributions of Success and Failure in Hong Kong and Shanghai," May 2016. https://etda.libraries.psu.edu/files/final_submissions/11781.

Pareto, Vilfredo. *The Mind and Society*. Edited by Arthur Livingston. Translated by Arthur Livingston and Andrew Bongiorno. Harcourt, Brace & Company, 1935. https://archive.org/details/ParetoTheMindAndSocietyVol4TheGeneralFormOfSociety.

Poon, Anita Y.K., and Yiu-Chung Wong. "Education Reform in Hong Kong: The 'Through-Road' Model and Its Societal Consequences." *International Review of Education* 54, no. 1 (December 6, 2007): 33–55. https://www.jstor.org/stable/27715432.

———. "Equity vs Excellence: A Preliminary Exploration of Hong Kong's Education Reform." *Digital Commons @ Lingnan University*, December 2005. https://commons.ln.edu.hk/cgi/viewcontent.cgi?article=1053&context=capswp.

Rahman Khan, Shamus. "The Education of Elites in the United States." *L'Année Sociologique* Vol. 66, no. 1 (January 1, 2016): 171–92. https://doi.org/10.3917/anso.161.0171.

———. "The Sociology of Elites." *Annual Review of Sociology* 38, no. 1 (August 11, 2012): 361–77. https://doi.org/10.1146/annurev-soc-071811-145542.

School and. "Xianggang butong zhonglei zhongxue de fenbu" [Hong Kong's Distribution of Different Types of Secondary Schools]. Accessed February 19, 2024. https://www.schooland.hk/post/sspa04.

Scott, John. "Pareto and the Elite." In *Vilfredo Pareto: Beyond Disciplinary Boundaries*, edited by Joseph V. Femia and Alasdair J. Marshall, 9–18. Routledge, 2016. https://books.google.co.jp/books?hl=en&lr=&id=UwmOCwAAQBAJ.

Suen, Michael. "LCQ12: Private Independent Schools." GovHK, June 1, 2011. https://www.info.gov.hk/gia/general/201106/01/P201106010148.htm.

———. "LCQ17: Teacher Salaries." GovHK, November 2, 2011. https://www.info.gov.hk/gia/general/201111/02/P201111020184.htm.

Tien, Michael, and Rosanna Yick-Ming Wong. "Report on Review of Medium of Instruction for Secondary Schools and Secondary School Places Allocation," December 2005. https://www.e-c.edu.hk/doc/en/publications_and_related_documents/education_reform/MOI&SSPA_report_Eng.pdf.

Vilfredo Pareto and Hans L Zetterberg. *The Rise and Fall of Elites: An Application of Theoretical Sociology*. 1968. Reprint, Transaction Publishers, 1991. https://www.google.co.jp/books/edition/The_Rise_and_Fall_of_the_Elites/uaRwAAAAQBAJ.

Wang, Lixun, and Andy Kirkpatrick. "Trilingual Education in Hong Kong Primary Schools: An Overview." *Multilingual Education* 5, no. 1 (April 24, 2015): 3. https://doi.org/10.1186/s13616-015-0023-8.

Yuk-lin, Choi. "LCQ2: Non-Local Courses Offered by Direct Subsidy Scheme Secondary Schools." GovHK, July 6, 2022. https://www.info.gov.hk/gia/general/202207/06/P2022070600448.htm.

Zanten, Agnès van. "Educating Elites: The Changing Dynamics and Meanings of Privilege and Power." In *World Yearbook of Education 2015*, edited by Stephen J Ball, Brigitte Darchy-Koechlin, and Agnès van Zanten, 3–9. Routledge, 2015.

———. "The Sociology of Elite Education." In *The Routledge International Handbook of the Sociology of Education*, edited by Michael W. Apple, Stephen J. Ball, and Luis Armando Gandin, 329–37. Routledge, 2009. https://sciencespo.hal.science/hal-00972726/file/avz-the-sociology-of-elite-education.pdf.

World History

Racial Segregation in the Korean War: The 24th Infantry Regiment in the Battle of Sangju and Masan

Stephanie Se-Aun Park '24
Milton Academy
Massachusetts, United States

Abstract

The inaugural Black unit in the Korean War, the 24th Infantry Regiment, was a component of the 25th US Army Division. While the initial performance of the 24th Regiment in the first three months of the conflict was generally inferior to that of other white units in the 25th Infantry Division, it would be unfair to attribute this to any inherent racial shortcomings of the Black soldiers. The subpar showing of the 24th Regiment in Sangju and Masan can be attributed to specific factors: consequential errors and racial biases exhibited by white officers commanding the regiment. These factors underscore the internal discord between white officers and Black soldiers, stemming from institutionalized racial discrimination in the US military. This research finds that the discriminatory practices faced by the 24th Regiment in Sangju and Masan had adverse effects on the combat effectiveness and morale of both Black and white soldiers. The most representative adverse effect was straggling, which was clearly due to the unequal and inappropriate treatment of Black soldiers. The unjust discrimination not only weakened the 24th Regiment but also posed a threat to the overall operational objectives of the 25th Division on the battlefield. Regrettably, addressing this issue required both Black and white soldiers to endure more casualties than necessary. By analyzing both the racial discrimination toward Black soldiers and their contributions, this paper offers an unbiased view of history.

Introduction

The main body of the first all-Black unit to participate in the Korean War was the 24th Infantry Regiment, a subunit of the 25th US Army Division. During the first three months of the Korean War, the record of the 24th Regiment was generally not as good as other white units within the 25th Infantry Division. The 24th Regiment revealed several problems in the Battle of Sangju in July 1950 and the Battle of Masan in August and September. The primary issues faced by the 24th Regiment were inadequate combat training and notably low morale. Because of these two factors, straggling occurred much more frequently in the 24th Regiment than in white units. Major General William B. Kean, the commander of the 25th Division, was dissatisfied with the combat performance of the 24th Regiment,[1] and this reinforced the US military forces' long-lasting prejudice that Black soldiers were inherently inferior, intellectually and mentally in specific, specifically to white soldiers. In the US mainland, white media outlets fueled the vilification of Black soldiers by portraying them as cowards.[2]

However, it was unjust to attribute the poor combat performance of the regiment's Black soldiers to their racial inferiority. The 24th Regiment soldiers' performance in Sangju and Masan was unsatisfactory due to other factors. This paper aims to show that discriminatory practices prevalent in the US military and society at the time were the primary cause of lowering the combat power and morale of the 24th Regiment soldiers during the initial phase of the Korean War. The paper presents two pieces of evidence: consequent mistakes and racial biases of white officers who commanded the 24th Regiment. These two factors demonstrate the internal discord between white commanding officers and Black soldiers due to institutionalized racial discrimination within the military.

Historical Context

When the 24th Regiment participated in the Korean War in July 1950, its soldiers faced the enemy under extremely disadvantageous conditions compared to white soldiers due to racism. The various forms of racial discrimination that the 24th Regiment experienced during the Korean War have continued since the establishment of the 54th Massachusetts Volunteer Infantry Regiment, the first Black army unit, in

---

[1] Morris J. MacGregor, Jr., *Integration of the Armed Forces 1940-1965* (Washington, DC: Center of Military History of the United States Army, 2001), 436.
[2] Christine Knauer, *Let Us Fight as Free Men: Black Soldiers and Civil Rights* (Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 2014), 195-196.

1863. Three types of discrimination against Black soldiers within the military persisted until the Korean War. First, there were ongoing systematic and widespread attempts to denigrate Black soldiers' performance in combat. Groundless criticisms of the combat effectiveness of Black soldiers persisted within the military and were frequently used as justification for racial discrimination and segregation in the armed forces. As a notable example, during World War II, the US military implemented measures to prevent numerous Black soldiers, who had demonstrated exceptional bravery and valor, from receiving the Medal of Honor.[3] Despite the Black soldiers' frequent demonstration of remarkable combat prowess, their white superiors often failed to recognize or acknowledge these accomplishments.[4] Second, it was challenging for Black individuals to attain positions of command on the actual battlefield. Due to the longstanding tradition of discrimination within the US armed forces, which resisted commissioning Black soldiers as officers or non-commissioned officers, the number of Black mid-level commanders was disproportionately low compared to their white counterparts. Furthermore, these few Black officers and non-commissioned officers could only command Black soldiers and were not allowed to lead white soldiers. For instance, during World War II, by the time the war was coming to an end in 1945, Black soldiers accounted for approximately 8.5 percent of the total US Army personnel.[5] In contrast, the number of Black officers was around 6,600, accounting for roughly 1.9 percent of the total number of Army officers.[6] Third, Black soldiers often did not have the opportunity to engage in combat and instead spent a significant number of their days in the military involved in menial labor in reserve units. The harsh prejudices concerning the combat abilities of Black soldiers led to them receiving only basic combat training and facing significant limitations in their opportunities for actual combat engagement. In 1944, approximately 700,000 Black soldiers were serving in the US Army during World War II. Among them, only around 12 percent, roughly 86,000 individuals, were assigned to infantry, artillery, and armored units for combat participation, while the rest were

---

[3] Elliott V. Converse III, Daniel K. Gibran, John A. Cash, Robert K. Griffith, Jr., and Richard H. Kohn, *The Exclusion of Black Soldiers from the Medal of Honor in World War II: The Study Commissioned by the United States Army to Investigate Racial Bias in the Awarding of the Nation's Highest Military Decoration* (Jefferson: McFarland & Company, 1997), 10.
[4] Ibid., 9.
[5] William T. Bowers, William M. Hammond, and George L. MacGarrigle, *Black Soldier, White Army: The 24th Infantry Regiment in Korea* (Washington, DC: Center of Military History of the United States Army, 1996), 29.
[6] Krewasky A. Salter I, *The Story of Black Military Officers, 1861-1948* (New York: Routledge, 2014), 121.

primarily deployed in rear support roles.[7] The US military command primarily employed Black soldiers in roles such as stevedores, construction crews, truck drivers, cooks, and similar positions.[8] As a result, all-Black units were relegated to being perceived as the least combat-effective units.

The 24th Regiment's Poor Performance in the Battle of Sangju and Masan

The 24th Regiment had been stationed in the Gifu area of Japan for occupation duties since 1947.[9] Approximately two weeks after the outbreak of the Korean War, they arrived in Pusan, South Korea, on July 12th and 13th.[10] The regiment consisted of 3,157 personnel,[11] and among them, except for several white officers, nearly all members were Black non-commissioned officers and soldiers. Upon arriving in Korea, the 24th Regiment was assigned the mission to move to Sangju and halt the advancing North Korean forces heading south.[12] The soldiers arrived in Sangju approximately one week later, on July 20th, and participated in the battle to defend the area until July 31st.

After arriving in Sangju, the 3rd Battalion of the regiment secured the town of Yechon in the northeast. Shortly thereafter, they encountered the advanced elements of the North Korean 8th Division and came under attack.[13] The forces of the 3rd Battalion successfully repelled the attack over the course of two days, July 20th and 21st, and defended their position in Yechon. Despite the engagement, they incurred minimal casualties, with two soldiers killed and twelve wounded. According to the testimony of First Lieutenant Charles M. Bussey, who was assigned to the 77th Engineer Combat Company and participated in combat alongside the 24th Regiment, it is reported that approximately 258 North Korean soldiers were killed in the engagement.[14] The 3rd Battalion of the regiment achieved a notable victory, becoming the first among the US forces engaged in the Korean

[7] Gary Gerstle, *American Crucible: Race and Nation in the Twentieth Century* (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 2001), 214.
[8] Ibid., 15.
[9] Troy Mosley, *The Armed Forces and American Social Change: An Unwritten Truce* (Lanham: Hamilton Books, 2021), 124.
[10] Bowers et al., *Black Soldier, White Army*, 70.
[11] Ibid., 159.
[12] Roy E. Appleman, *South to the Naktong, North to the Yalu* (Washington, DC: Center of Military History of the United States Army, 1992), 190.
[13] Bowers et al., *Black Soldier, White Army*, 92.
[14] Charles M. Bussey, *Firefight at Yechon: Courage and Racism in the Korean War* (McLean: Brassey's, 1991), 106.

War to achieve a significant triumph. This news was warmly welcomed by the US political sphere and the media, eager for military victories at the time. During the 81st session of the US House of Representatives, Thomas J. Lane of Massachusetts praised the combat performance of the soldiers of the 24th Regiment in the Battle of Yechon as follows:

> Communist propaganda took it on the chin at Yechon when the Korean Reds were blasted by American Negro troops who believed not only in the United States as it is, but in the better Nation that it will become when intolerance is also defeated.[15]

However, the initial brief triumph of the 24th Regiment was soon overshadowed by the subsequent clumsy performance, causing the news of victory to fade quickly from the public's memory. The Battle of Sangju, which started on July 20th in Yechon, continued until the 31st of the same month. During this time, the US 25th Infantry Division and the Republic of Korea (South Korean) 1st Infantry Division engaged in multiple conflicts with the 15th North Korean Division. Experienced officers and non-commissioned officers led the 15th North Korean Division with a wealth of combat experience. However, most of the division's soldiers were inexperienced recruits who had only recently completed their training after the outbreak of the Korean War in late June. In a word, the 15th North Korean Division was one of North Korea's least capable.[16] Nonetheless, due to the poorer military readiness of the US 25th Division and the ROK 1st Infantry Division, they had to relinquish control of Yechon and Sangju to the North Korean 15th Division. The 24th Regiment endured relatively low casualties in this battle, with a total of 34 killed, 275 wounded, and 99 missing out of a force of 3,157.[17] However, the nature of the combat was indeed unfavorable, and the overall outcome of the battle was considered ineffective. A significant number of soldiers in the 24th Regiment experienced panic and frequently deviated from their defensive positions in the face of enemy attacks.[18] The First Office of the Chief of Army Field Forces Observer Team, upon witnessing the serious 'straggling' problem of Black soldiers, reported to the Far East Command that Black

---

[15] US Congress, House, "First United States Victory in Korea Won by Negro GI's," Congressional Record, 81st Cong., 2d sess., vol. 96, pt. 8, 24 July 1950, 10866, accessed March 12, 2023. https://www.congress.gov/bound-congressional-record/1950/07/24/house-section.
[16] Bowers et al., *Black Soldier, White Army*, 97.
[17] Ibid., 121.
[18] Ibid., 115.

soldiers' combat performance was only about 80 percent of that of white soldiers.[19]

After the ill-fated battle, as the 25th Division was retreating from Sangju, Lieutenant General Walton H. Walker, the commander of the 8th Army, urgently dispatched the division to the Masan area, the southernmost point of the Korean Peninsula.[20] By the time the area secured by the 8th Army and the South Korean forces was a very narrow region, with Daegu and Pohang to the north and Masan serving as the western boundary. The 8th Army headquarters managed to obtain intelligence just two days before the North Korean 6th Division, one of their elite divisions, was set to advance toward the Masan area.[21] Aware of the imminent collapse of the western boundary, General Walker issued an urgent order on August 1st for the 25th Division and the 5th Infantry Regiment to immediately move to Masan and halt the enemy's advance. Shortly after their arrival, they engaged in bloody combat with the 7,500 troops of the North Korean 6th Division, which possessed 25 T-34 tanks and 36 artillery pieces.[22]

In the Defensive Battle of Masan, the US forces fought against the North Korean army with a focus on two core points: Chungam-ni in the northwest of Masan and Chindong-ni in the southwest coastal area of Masan.[23] A significant portion of the 24th Regiment troops were deployed near Chindong-ni in the southwest, along with the white unit, the 5th Regiment. However, the 24th Regiment displayed a disappointing combat capability compared to the white regiments they fought alongside. On August 11th, the 5th Regiment came under a large-scale attack by the North Korean forces and faced a crisis. The 3rd Battalion of the 24th Regiment was dispatched as reinforcement, but they were unable to carry out their support mission due to the North Korean interception.[24] In the meantime, both the 5th Regiment and the 555th Field Artillery Battalion, which did not receive support from the Black soldiers, suffered significant casualties. In addition, on August 18th, during the battle at Sobuk-san, the 2nd Battalion of the 24th Regiment displayed an apparent lack of effectiveness and relinquished control of the strategic high ground to the North Korean forces. Afterward, the 5th Regiment served as the central force and continued

[19] Ibid., 123.
[20] Sun-Bok Ha, "Re-examination the Defensive Battle of Masan on the Battle Lines around the Nakdong River," *The Journal of Human Studies* 59 (2022): 309.
[21] Ibid., 273.
[22] Institute of Military History of ROK, *The Battle of Nakdong River Defense Line* (Seoul: Institute of Military History of ROK, 2008), 274.
[23] Ibid., 278-279.
[24] Appleman, *South to the Naktong, North to the Yalu*, 281, 285.

intense fighting for control of the Sobuk-san. Finally, the white soldiers of the regiment managed to secure the crucial strategic position. This location became the site of the most intense fighting in the subsequent Battle of Masan, with the control of the hill changing hands a total of 19 times.[25] While the white soldiers of the 5th Regiment displayed proficiency and persistence in the ongoing battle at Sobuk-san, the Black soldiers of the 24th Regiment, except for some exceptions, often showed signs of faltering in the face of enemy attacks due to inadequate training and deteriorating supply conditions. The straggling of Black soldiers continued to occur, similar to the situation in the Battle of Sangju.[26] Thus, the tumultuous battle at Sobuk-san concluded with the pattern of the white unit, the 5th Regiment, retaking the strategic position that had been weakly relinquished by the Black unit, the 24th Regiment, at a significant human cost.

Likewise, in the Battle of Masan, the white regiments assigned to the 25th Division – the 27th, 35th, and 5th regiments – achieved relatively satisfactory combat results, while the 24th Regiment exhibited disappointing performance. The main reason for the poor performance of the 24th Regiment was the demoralization of the Black soldiers and the consequent issue of straggling. In the letter written on September 9th, General Kean expressed concerns about the serious straggling issue within the Black units, stating that they lacked reliable combat capabilities. He suggested excluding the 24th Regiment from combat operations in Korea.[27]

Cause of Poor Performance in Sangju: Incapable White Officers

In Sangju and Masan, the Black soldiers of the 24th Regiment clearly showed lower combat performance in comparison to the white units. However, a closer look at the situation and the details of the combat experienced by the regiment's soldiers reveals that the inadequate combat performance of Black soldiers can be attributed to several discriminatory practices rooted in racial prejudice.

First, the practice of allowing only white officers to hold command positions on the battlefield contributed to the lack of military effectiveness of the soldiers in the 24th Regiment. They had to be led by officers who had no practical experience in combat and were ignorant of

[25] Institute of Military History of ROK, *The Battle of Nakdong River Defense Line*, 300.
[26] Bowers et al., *Black Soldier, White Army*, 149, 152.
[27] Lisha B. Penn, ed., *Records of Military Agencies Relating to African Americans from the Post-World War I Period to the Korean War* (Washington, DC: National Archives and Records Administration, 2006), 39.

the realities of warfare. Such practice was deeply intertwined with the long-lasting prejudice within the US military toward Black soldiers, based on groundless beliefs that Black soldiers were intellectually inferior and should therefore be under the command of white officers. Furthermore, most white officers also had little desire to be assigned to the perceived inferior Black units like the 24th Regiment, as they believed it would tarnish their military careers and be seen as a significant setback. For instance, after the Battle of Sangju, General Walker expressed his desire for the elite commander Major Ned D. Moore, who was leading a battalion in the 7th Division, to take command of the 24th Regiment. However, Moore turned down Walker's request, choosing not to assume leadership of the regiment. In later remarks, Moore reflected on the matter, stating, "Nobody, including me, wanted command of the 24th."[28]

The issue of incompetent white commanders was most evident in the case of the 2d Battalion during the Battle of Sangju. Lieutenant Colonel William M. Cohoon, who commanded the 2d Battalion in Sangju, had prior experience training soldiers in the US during World War II; however, he did not have combat experience in a command role. Furthermore, he was 43 years old and had physical conditions that made it difficult for him to participate in combat directly.[29] During the Battle of Sangju, he made two critical mistakes. First, on July 22nd, during the engagement between the 2d Battalion and the 48th Regiment of the 15th North Korean Division near the small village of Idang, Cohoon left his battalion headquarters in Idang while sending his operations officer, Captain James O. Gardner, along with the Black soldiers, to the frontline positions that were as far as 5 miles away. The 2d Battalion's radios were unable to cover 5 miles, resulting in a continuous communication breakdown between the battalion headquarters and the frontline combat positions.[30] It was evident that he could not effectively command the battle without personally approaching the battlefield. Cohoon's decision to remain at a safe distance in the rear while sending his subordinate officers and soldiers to engage in combat was a disastrous misjudgment.[31] Such circumstances greatly amplified the distrust and resentment of the 2nd Battalion's Black soldiers toward Cohoon, significantly undermining their morale. So, the frontline soldiers who faced the enemy's attack lacked a strong fighting spirit and surrendered

---

[28] Clay Blair, *The Forgotten War: America in Korea 1950-1953* (New York: Times Books, 1987), 164.
[29] Bowers et al., *Black Soldier, White Army*, 73.
[30] "War Diary, 24th Infantry Regiment, Jul 50, 19-20," accessed March 30, 2023. https://www.koreanwar2.org/kwp2/jpac/25id_bk6_24infreg_jul50.pdf.
[31] Bowers et al., *Black Soldier, White Army*, 100.

their defensive positions without much resistance. Also, due to the chaotic retreat, numerous stragglers occurred in various places.[32] Out of approximately 1,000 battalion soldiers, at least 150 or more abandoned their defensive posts and became stragglers before the retreat order was given.[33]

In addition to Cohoon's misjudgment, the inadequate strategy of Colonel White, who was in charge of commanding the entire 24th Regiment, also played a crucial role in the poor combat performance of the regiment in Sangju. As White had no prior experience in commanding combat units, he chose a deployment strategy unsuited to the Sangju frontline's conditions. Instead of selecting a few important defending posts and concentrating forces, White decided to disperse small numbers of personnel across various posts across the entire frontline in Sangju.[34] The measure was probably implemented to avoid the isolation of any platoon or company on the front line. Also, it aimed to establish a close interconnection between units while also facilitating the rapid detection of North Korean infiltration routes. However, due to the rugged mountainous terrain in the field, the troops deployed at each post were unable to provide timely assistance to adjacent posts when they came under attack. As a result, the enemy's concentrated point attacks quickly neutralized the defensive line.[35] Furthermore, White's deployment strategy extended the supply routes for rations and ammunition excessively, resulting in each post's soldiers not receiving proper resupply. This ultimately became a critical flaw, leading to severe consequences.[36] After a brief victory in Yechon, from July 22nd to July 31st, for approximately ten days, the Black soldiers of the 24th Regiment were isolated and dispersed by the enemy's concentrated attacks. Many of them became stragglers, caught in chaos and confusion during a disorderly retreat. To address the dire situation faced by the 24th Regiment, General Kean dispatched military policemen on July 26th and 27th specifically to control the stragglers.[37] Additionally, Kean sent troops from the 35th Regiment, consisting of white soldiers, as reinforcement to the area defended by the 24th Regiment.

Pamela Moss and Michael J. Prince point out in their work, *Weary Warriors: Power, Knowledge, and the Invisible Wounds of Soldiers*, that unjust oppression and alienation within the military ranks dramatically

[32] War Diary, 24th Infantry Regiment, Jul 50, 20.
[33] Bowers et al., *Black Soldier, White Army*, 115.
[34] War Diary, 24th Infantry Regiment, Jul 50, 25.
[35] Bowers et al., *Black Soldier, White Army*, 108.
[36] War Diary, 24th Infantry Regiment, Jul 50, 26.
[37] Bowers et al., *Black Soldier, White Army*, 114.

undermine the morale of soldiers. The two authors explain that such morale decline among soldiers is a manifestation of their resistance against unit commanders who adopt wrong regulatory methods.[38] According to the analysis by Moss and Prince, if unjust practices that dominate relationships between commanders and soldiers, as well as among the soldiers themselves, exist within the unit and fail to be eliminated, it inflicts a kind of psychological wound on the soldiers. This invisible wound triggers mistrust and resentment toward the commanders and the military system within the soldiers' hearts. As a result, the soldiers directly or indirectly resist the orders of their commanders, leading to a significant decline in morale on the battlefield.[39] This analysis accurately reflects the dynamics of the relationship and psychological interactions between white commanders and Black soldiers within the 24th Regiment during the Battle of Sangju. The regiment was a marginalized group within the entire US Army, systematically deprived of promotions, command positions, and opportunities for combat by the discriminatory command structure composed of white generals and officers. Even before the regiment participated in bloody battles during the early stages of the Korean War, the Black soldiers had already long suffered from invisible psychological wounds. These wounds engendered feelings of resentment and resistance toward the white commanders. The tactical incompetence of the white commanders further exacerbated the resentment and resistance in the hearts of the African American soldiers. As a result of all these adverse conditions acting simultaneously on the battlefield, the Black soldiers of the 24th Regiment experienced a significant decline in morale, which immediately led to a large number of stragglers.

Cause of Poor Performance in Masan: Bitter Sentiment Among Black Soldiers

The mistrust and resistance toward the white commanders among the Black soldiers, which significantly affected the Battle of Sangju, intensified further during the Battle of Masan. On August 5th, the day following the urgent orders from General Walker for the entire 25th Division to move toward Masan, General Kean, recognizing the flawed operations that led to the setback of the 24th Regiment in the Battle of Sangju, relieved Colonel White of his command and appointed Colonel Arthur J. Champeny as the new commander of the regiment.[40]

---

[38] Pamela Moss and Michael J. Prince, *Weary Warriors: Power, Knowledge, and the Invisible Wounds of Soldiers* (New York: Berghahn, 2014), 93.
[39] Ibid., 95.
[40] "War Diary, 24th Infantry Regiment, Aug 50, 7," accessed April 7, 2023. https://www.koreanwar2.org/kwp2/jpac/25id_24infreg_aug50.pdf.

Champeny, a war hero who had participated in both World Wars and commanded combat units, was highly regarded as an excellent commander with extensive combat experience.[41] It is evident that General Kean had high expectations that Champeny could leverage his experience and abilities to improve the combat effectiveness of the 24th Regiment to some extent.

However, Kean's expectations began to falter from the very first day Champeny took command of the unit. On his first day assuming command of the 24th Regiment, Champeny stated in front of the troops that "colored people did not make good combat soldiers." Furthermore, he emphasized that as long as he was in command, he would "change the frightened 24th into the fighting 24th."[42] Although Champeny chose this approach to instill strong combat motivation in the Black soldiers of the regiment, it had the opposite effect on many of the soldiers. In an interview several years later, Captain Gustav Gillert, a white intelligence officer who was part of the 1st Battalion of the regiment, reflected that Champeny's approach in handling the Black soldiers demonstrated his "misunderstanding of the combat situation and the poor tactical condition of the regiment."[43] Due to Champeny's apparent racial bias, many Black soldiers under his command had a strong belief that he was an unreliable superior.[44] It is evident that Champeny was a diligent and capable commander, as acknowledged by some Black soldiers within the regiment.[45] However, he treated the soldiers of the regiment based on the prevailing racial prejudices at the time. As a result, Champeny failed to earn the trust of Black soldiers and instead evoked resentment from them.[46]

Champeny's racist remarks and attitude conveyed to the Black soldiers a sense that their lives were undervalued and they were regarded as simply expendable. Also, Champeny's blatant discrimination made them realize that even if they fought valiantly in combat, they would never receive any respect or recognition from the US military or white people back home. Despite Champeny's tactical abilities and diligence, he was unable to significantly improve the combat capabilities and morale of the 24th Regiment.[47] Stragglers continued to emerge within the regiment also during the defense of Masan.

[41] Ibid., 133.
[42] Ibid.
[43] Ibid.
[44] Ibid.
[45] Ibid.
[46] Bussey, *Firefight at Yechon*, 136.
[47] Ibid.

Ross Pigeau and Carol McCann propose three types of conflicts that influence soldiers' morale on the battlefield: person-versus-person conflicts, person-versus-nature conflicts, and person-versus-self conflicts. Person-versus-person conflicts refer to clashes and combat with enemy soldiers, while person-versus-nature conflicts represent the struggles soldiers face in adapting to the natural environment of the battlefield. Person-versus-self conflicts signify the self-doubt and anxiety soldiers feel regarding their engagement in combat.[48] Among these three conflicts, the most significant factor contributing to the lower combat performance of the soldiers of the 24th Regiment in the Battle of Masan compared with the performance of the all-white units they fought alongside is the third conflict. According to Pigeau and McCann, person-versus-self conflicts refer to issues related to soldiers' self-awareness and are directly linked to a decrease in the value they attribute to themselves within the military organization or on the battlefield. Competent commanders are well aware that person-versus-self conflicts are a decisive factor in the success or failure of a mission.[49] Therefore, they encourage their soldiers to have confidence and trust in their combat motivation, combat effectiveness, and personal values.

The observation indicates that Champeny's critical error was in reminding Black soldiers of the persistent discrimination they faced within the military and broader American society, even while on the battlefield. Champeny's inappropriate racial remarks and attitude of treating Black soldiers as inferior contribute to the person-versus-self conflict triggered by severe social injustice. Insofar as their worth was forcefully diminished both as soldiers and as individuals, Black soldiers would have struggled to understand what they were fighting for. Given the lack of acknowledgment, respect, or appreciation for the achievements of Black soldiers, who were often regarded as expendable instruments of war, it is entirely reasonable to comprehend the impact such treatment would have on their morale.

Champeny's inadequate understanding of the psyche of Black soldiers had a particularly negative impact on the intense battles that took place in Sobuk-san. Sobuk-san, located in the mountainous area west of Masan, was the most crucial position that provided complete surveillance and control over the surrounding area due to its elevation of over 2,400 feet.[50] The 24th Regiment was the first US military unit that

---

[48] Ross Pigeau and Carol McCann, "The Human in Command: A Brief Introduction," in *The Human in Command: Exploring the Modern Military Experience*, eds. Carol McCann and Ross Pigeau (New York: Springer Science+Business Media, 2000), 2-3.
[49] Ibid., 3.
[50] Appleman, *South to the Naktong, North to the Yalu*, 369.

attempt to capture this decisive battleground of the Masan Defensive Battle. However, the regiment's first battle on Sobuk-san, which took place from August 7th to August 13th, failed, and the strategic high ground was surrendered to the enemy.[51] This failure soon resulted in additional casualties for the entire 25th Division. The North Korean troops, who occupied the summit of Sobuk-san, launched multiple attacks on the US military vehicles transporting supplies to the frontline units, inflicting significant damage.[52] On August 14th, the 24th Regiment troops found themselves pushed even further back from the point they initially launched the assault.[53] Subsequently, the 6th North Korean Division, advancing towards Masan, and the 7th North Korean Division, which recently arrived on the Masan front in early September, were embroiled in fierce battles to take control of Sobuk-san.

The fighting continued back and forth between the US forces and North Korean forces, with the high location changing hands 19 times, until the North Korean troops reached the culminating point of attack and began retreating on September 22nd. In the initial stages of the Sobuk-san battle, the 24th Regiment assumed the role of the main US unit. However, the 24th Regiment's combat capability was significantly lacking in defending these crucial positions. Therefore, the 24th Regiment had to depend on the support of the 5th Regiment and the 27th Regiment, all-white units that defended the north and the south of Sobuk-san, to recapture the high ground.[54] Naturally, not only the soldiers of the 24th Regiment but also those of the 5th Regiment and the 27th Regiment suffered heavy casualties or significant injuries. On August 31st, while the intense battle surrounding Sobuk-san was ongoing, the 24th Regiment incurred a total of 1,235 casualties (39.1 percent of the regiment's total strength), including both battle casualties and non-battle casualties, out of their total strength of 3,157 personnel. Meanwhile, the 27th Regiment incurred 790 casualties (39.0 percent of the regiment's total strength) out of their total strength of 2,370 personnel. As for the 5th Regiment, out of their total strength of 3,497 personnel, they suffered 1,127 casualties (32.2 percent of the total strength). The majority of these casualties occurred during the August battle of the Masan defense, rather than in July.[55]

---

[51] Bussey, *Firefight at Yechon*, 136.
[52] Japan Land Warfare History Research Society, *Korean War 2: Securing the Pusan Perimeter*, tr. Won-bok Lee (Seoul: Myoungseong, 1991), 167-168.
[53] Republic of Korea Army Headquarters, *United Nations Forces War History*, vol. 1, *From Nakdong to Yalu River* (Daejeon: Republic of Korea Army Headquarters, 2001), 211.
[54] Institute of Military History of ROK, *The Battle of Nakdong River Defense Line*, 300, 311.
[55] Bowers et al., *Black Soldier, White Army*, 159.

Champeny was incensed by his regiment's poor combat performance and reportedly apologized to the white soldiers who came to support the regiment. On September 1st, when the white troops of the 27th Regiment came to support and recapture the positions that had been taken from the Black soldiers of the 24th Regiment, Champeny repeatedly shook his head from side to side and apologized to the white soldiers, saying, "I'm sorry boys. I'm sorry."[56] Champeny's attitude reflects his deep-seated prejudice toward the Black soldiers under his command. It reveals his belief that the Black soldiers of the 24th Regiment were inherently inferior and of lower value, leading to his frustration and anger that the supposedly capable and valuable white soldiers had to shed blood in combat due to the mistakes of Black soldiers.

Champeny, while personally inspecting the defense posts at Sobuk-san on September 6th, sustained severe injuries from sniper fire by North Korean forces, rendering him unable to continue commanding the regiment.[57] Lieutenant Colonel John T. Corley, the commander of the 3rd Battalion of the regiment, assumed command of the entire 24th Regiment as Champeny's successor.[58] Corley was well aware of Champeny's discriminatory attitude and understood that it severely undermined the morale of the 24th Regiment and contributed to a high number of stragglers. Therefore, he made a conscious effort not to belittle or oppress the Black soldiers but instead encouraged them to have confidence in their combat capabilities.[59] Yet, Corley's efforts alone were insufficient to improve the situation at Sobuk-san immediately.[60] The cumulative effects of racial discrimination within the US military had a significant psychological and practical impact on the Black soldiers of the 24th Regiment.

Fortunately for the US military and the 24th Regiment, the overall strategic situation of the Korean War shifted significantly in their favor on September 15th. General Douglas MacArthur, the commander of United Nations forces in the Far East, devised a strategic plan for an amphibious landing at Inchon, located right next to Seoul.[61] After the Battle of Inchon, the entire North Korean army that had infiltrated throughout South Korea became isolated, unable to receive supplies, and

---

[56] Ibid., 167.
[57] "War Diary, 24th Infantry Regiment, Sep 50, 11," accessed April 19, 2023. https://www.koreanwar2.org/kwp2/jpac/25id_bk8_24infreg_wd_sep_50.pdf.
[58] Ibid.
[59] Bowers et al., *Black Soldier, White Army*, 174.
[60] Ibid., 177.
[61] David Halberstam, *The Coldest Winter: America and the Korean War* (New York: Hyperion, 2007), 293, 295.

fell into panic.[62] The forces of the 6th and 7th North Korean Divisions that were attacking the Masan area also reached the culminating point of attack on September 22nd and began to retreat toward North Korea. Thus, the 25th Division, despite suffering significant losses, was able to achieve the main objective of the Battle of Masan, which was to repel the advancing 6th Division toward Masan.

After the Battle of Masan, General Kean expressed great dissatisfaction with the high number of stragglers and the tendency of the 24th regiment's soldiers to abandon defense posts easily.[63] Kean reported to General Walker in a letter as follows: "It is my opinion that the 24th Infantry has demonstrated in combat that it is untrustworthy and incapable of carrying out missions expected of an infantry regiment."[64] Kean acknowledged that a small number of Black soldiers had performed their duties reliably, but he believed that their efforts were "completely nullified by the actions of the majority."[65] Kean's report was indeed based on factual observations. However, he did not thoroughly analyze the underlying causal relationship between the structural racial discrimination within the US military and the combat effectiveness and morale decline of all-Black units. Kean's report, which ignored the problematic reality of the 24th Regiment soldiers, and the general investigation conducted by the 8th Army, contributed to the perpetuation or even reinforcement of unjust biases held by white military leaders and intermediate commanders regarding Black soldiers' intellectual and physical capabilities.

Conclusion

The 24th Regiment, an all-Black unit that participated in the initial phase of the Korean War, fought against the North Korean forces in an abysmal state of combat readiness, encompassing the chronic racism prevailing within the US military. At the onset of the Korean War, the combat readiness of the US military had markedly deteriorated due to the substantial demobilization following World War II and the Truman administration's inaccurate assessment of the situation in North Korea. However, unlike other all-white units, the 24th Regiment was in an even more dire situation. Historically, the US military did not offer adequate combat training to Black soldiers, and competent white commanders often hesitated to lead all-Black units because of racial prejudices. Moreover, capable Black intermediate commanders were not

[62] Halberstam, *The Coldest Winter*, 311.
[63] Bowers et al., *Black Soldier, White Army*, 177.
[64] Ibid., 175.
[65] Ibid.

given proper opportunities for actual unit command. These shortcomings directly contributed to the poor performance of the 24th Regiment in the battles of Sangju and Masan. Incompetent white commanders like Cohoon and White, and white commanders who openly displayed racial bias, such as Champeny, further undermined the already poor combat effectiveness and morale of the 24th Regiment. And amidst all these adverse conditions, the soldiers of the 24th Regiment were treated as "inferior" due to unfair and biased evaluations and reports by white commanders, without receiving recognition for their combat achievements.

A significant fact to note regarding the discrimination and injustices faced by the 24th Regiment in Sangju and Masan is that the detrimental effects of racial discrimination on the combat effectiveness and morale of Black soldiers ultimately demanded a price not only from the Black soldiers but also from white soldiers. In these two battlefields, the soldiers of the 25th Division, regardless of being part of all-white or all-Black units, formed a unified community of comrades sharing the same operational objectives. The unjust discrimination based on race led to segregation practices within this community and weakened the 24th Regiment compared with other all-white units. This, in turn, posed a risk of jeopardizing the overall operational objectives of the 25th Division on the actual battlefield, creating an element of uncertainty and hindrance. Unfortunately, both Black and white soldiers had to shed more blood than necessary to address this problem. The consequences of discrimination eventually came full circle, affecting Black soldiers and placing burdens and sacrifices on white soldiers. The adverse effects of institutional and structural racism are not limited to the battlefield alone but extend to various aspects of society. Discrimination and prejudice inflict harm not just on those targeted but also on the perpetrators themselves and society as a whole. As both sides are members of the same community of fate, any malicious discrimination and bias against any racial group traditionally leads to a decline in the overall social utility of that community. The cases of the 24th Regiment in Sangju and Masan are some of the best historical examples that prove this fact. The Black war heroes of the regiment fought to defend South Korea's freedom and democracy, risking their lives even in conditions in which they were not adequately prepared for combat and faced prejudice and unjust treatment. Overlooking the different forms of racial discrimination against them and diminishing their contributions distorts historical representation.

Bibliography

Appleman, Roy E. *South to the Naktong, North to the Yalu*. Washington, DC: Center of Military History of the United States Army, 1992.

Blair, Clay. *The Forgotten War: America in Korea 1950-1953*. New York: Times Books, 1987.

Bowers, William T., Hammond, William M., and MacGarrigle, George L. *Black Soldier, White Army: The 24th Infantry Regiment in Korea*. Washington, DC: Center of Military History of the United States Army, 1996.

Bussey, Charles M. *Firefight at Yechon: Courage and Racism in the Korean War*. McLean: Brassey's, 1991.

Converse III, Elliott V., Gibran, Daniel K., Cash, John A., Griffith, Jr., Robert K., and Kohn, Richard H. *The Exclusion of Black Soldiers from the Medal of Honor in World War II: The Study Commissioned by the United States Army to Investigate Racial Bias in the Awarding of the Nation's Highest Military Decoration*. Jefferson: McFarland & Company, 1997.

Gerstle, Gary. *American Crucible: Race and Nation in the Twentieth Century*. Princeton: Princeton University Press, 2001.

Halberstam, David. *The Coldest Winter: America and the Korean War*. New York: Hyperion, 2007.

Ha, Sun-Bok. "Re-examination of the Defensive Battle of Masan on the Battle Lines around the Nakdong River." *The Journal of Human Studies* 59 (2022): 303-328.

Institute of Military History of ROK. *The Battle of the Nakdong River Defense Line*. Seoul: Institute of Military History of ROK, 2008.

Japan Land Warfare History Research Society. *Korean War 2: Securing the Pusan Perimeter*. Trans. by Won-bok Lee. Seoul: Myoungseong, 1991.

Knauer, Christine. *Let Us Fight as Free Men: Black Soldiers and Civil Rights*. Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 2014.

MacGregor, Jr., Morris J. *Integration of the Armed Forces 1940-1965*.

Washington, DC: Center of Military History of the United States Army, 2001.

Mosley, Troy. The Armed Forces and American Social Change: An Unwritten Truce. Lanham: Hamilton Books, 2021.

Moss, Pamela, and Prince, Michael J. *Weary Warriors: Power, Knowledge, and the Invisible Wounds of Soldiers*. New York: Berghahn, 2014.

Penn, Lisha B., ed. *Records of Military Agencies Relating to African Americans from the Post-World War I Period to the Korean War*. Washington, DC: National Archives and Records Administration, 2006.

Pigeau, Ross, and McCann, Carol. "The Human in Command: A Brief Introduction." In *The Human in Command: Exploring the Modern Military Experience*. Edited by Carol McCann and Ross Pigeau. New York: Springer Science+Business Media, 2000.

Republic of Korea Army Headquarters. *United Nations Forces War History*, vol. 1, *From Nakdong to Yalu River*. Daejeon: Republic of Korea Army Headquarters, 2001.

Salter I, Krewasky A. *The Story of Black Military Officers, 1861-1948*. New York: Routledge, 2014.

US Congress, House. "First United States Victory in Korea Won by Negro GI's." Congressional Record, 81st Cong., 2d sess., vol. 96, pt. 8, 24 July 1950. Accessed March 12, 2023. https://www.congress.gov/bound-congressional-record/1950/07/24/house-section.

"War Diary, 24th Infantry Regiment, Aug 50." Accessed April 7, 2023. https://www.koreanwar2.org/kwp2/jpac/25id_24infreg_aug50.pdf.

"War Diary, 24th Infantry Regiment, Jul 50." Accessed March 30, 2023. https://www.koreanwar2.org/kwp2/jpac/25id_bk6_24infreg_jul50.pdf.

"War Diary, 24th Infantry Regiment, Sep 50." Accessed April 19, 2023. https://www.koreanwar2.org/kwp2/jpac/25id_bk8_24infreg_wd_sep_50.pdf.

US History

Mendez v. Westminster: Making Mexicans White

Shelley Tang '25
Noble and Greenough School
Massachusetts, United States

Abstract

The landmark Supreme Court case *Brown v. Board of Education*, decided in 1954, forced the end of legally mandated de jure segregation in the American education system. And yet, a case eight years prior had desegregated schools in one of the largest states in America. In September 1943, Sylvia Mendez was denied access to Westminster Main School because of her Mexican-American ethnicity, spurring the *Mendez v. Westminster* case, which would successfully end segregation in schools for Mexican Americans in California. While historians have frequently referred to *Mendez v. Westminster* as a precursor to *Brown v. Board of Education*, this essay illuminates the underlying reasons why *Mendez v. Westminster* did not establish a precedent for all minorities in America by narrating the story of the Mendez family and their efforts to dismantle segregation in Orange County. Specifically, the rise in the Mexican-American population during the late 1800s and early 1900s cultivated a stringent political climate in Orange County, resulting in the segregation of Mexican and white children in schools. Through analysis of the trial transcripts, the California State Law, and the Constitution, this paper concludes that the distinct legal classification of Mexican Americans as white obstructed the broader application of the *Mendez v. Westminster* decision.

Introduction

The Pearl Harbor bombing on December 7, 1941, altered the lives of Japanese Americans along the West Coast, including the Munemitsu family living in Westminster, California.[1] Three months later, President Franklin D. Roosevelt issued Executive Order 9066, requiring the internment of 120,000 families.[2] This action set into motion a major change for a Mexican-American family, who were contacted about the availability of 40 acres of land, due to the Munemitsu's relocation.[3] Thus, in the summer of 1943, the Mendezes would unknowingly benefit from the incarceration of Japanese Americans by moving onto Munemitsu's farm. The location of this farm sparked a case that would have widespread implications for Mexican Americans living in California. The Mendez family believed that moving onto this farm would allow their children to attend the local school; however, they would face their battle against oppression when, in September, Sylvia Mendez and her siblings were denied the right to attend the Westminster Main School because of their race.

Similarities Between Two Landmark Cases

Despite being far less well-known than the widely recognized *Brown v. Board of Education* case, *Mendez v. Westminster* has made its way into school curricula across the country.[4] However, much like the media coverage of the case, students are taught that *Mendez v. Westminster* served as a precursor to *Brown v. Board of Education*, because of its similarities in the ruling as well as the involvement of Justices Earl Warren and Thurgood Marshall.[5] With these remarkable similarities, it provokes the question of why *Mendez v. Westminster* did not impact the American education system as profoundly as *Brown v. Board of Education*.[6]

---

[1] Marisela Martinez-Cola, *The Bricks Before Brown: The Chinese American, Native American, and Mexican Americans' Struggle for Educational Equality*, 1st ed. (Athens, Georgia: University of Georgia Press, 2022), 129.
[2] Cola, *Bricks Before Brown*, 129.
[3] Cola, *Bricks Before Brown*, 129.
[4] Maribel Santiago, "From Multicultural to Romanticized Representations of the Past: How *Mendez v. Westminster*'s Significance Shapeshifts to Appeal to Different Contexts," J*ournal of Social Studies Research* 44, no. 1 (2020): 102, https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jssr.2019.04.004.
[5] Rebecca López, "*Mendez V. Westminster*: The Latino *Brown V. Board of Education*," *Reflections: Narratives of Professional Helping* 10, no. 1 (January 1, 2004): 41, https://reflectionsnarrativesofprofessionalhelping.org/index.php/Reflections/article/view/1180.
[6] Sarah Sadlier, "*Mendez v. Westminster*: The Harbinger of *Brown V. Board*," *Ezra's Archives* 4, no. 1 (2014): 76–89, https://ecommons.cornell.edu/items/26bdc359-f808-431b-91db-7ed037dadba7.

Special Status of Mexican Americans

The complicated racial status of Mexican Americans in American law and society prevented *Mendez v. Westminster* from creating a precedent for school desegregation across the country that would impact other minority groups. The Mendez family case was unique for many reasons, including two loopholes that existed in both California state law and federal law that allowed them to use the 14th Amendment to desegregate the Orange County school district. While the desegregation of the county schools was a remarkable and unexpected result of this case, it was due to a legal interpretation of Mexican Americans as white, which made it impossible to apply at a larger scale across the country.

The Mendez Family and the Westminster Main School

The educational and racial background of the Mendez parents contributed to their desire to file a petition against the Westminster Main School. Gonzalo Mendez, the Mexican father of Sylvia Mendez, attended the designated white school, known as the Westminster Main School, as opposed to the Hoover School, which was designated for Mexican children, until 5th grade, when he left to work on farms.[7] The separate schools were implemented shortly after Mende's departure.[8] Mendez's right to attend the main white school was the same one he now fought for his children following their move back to Westminster, even though they were US citizens.[9] Felicitas Fuentes, mother of Sylvia, was born in Puerto Rico, an automatic US citizen, and her husband was naturalized in 1943, thus justifying their belief that their children should attend the same school as other American children.[10]

Mendez's aim in filing the court case was to provide his children with an integrated education that would not discriminate against them due to their Mexican heritage. In September of 1943, Soledad Vidaurri, the aunt of Sylvia Mendez, brought 5 children to Westminster Main

[7] "Trial Transcript - July 10, 1945," Mendez et al. v. Westminster, 5, accessed April 23, 2024, https://www.dropbox.com/s/lbkneymsenlfke4/Trial_Transcript_July_10_1945.pdf?e=1&dl=0.

[8] "Trial Transcript - July 10, 1945," 5.

[9] Philippa Strum, "'We Always Tell Our Children They Are Americans': *Mendez v. Westminster* and the Beginning of the End of School Segregation," *Journal of Supreme Court History* 39, no. 3 (November 2014): 312, https://search.ebscohost.com/login.aspx?direct=true&db=a9h&AN=99196357&site=ehost-live.

[10] "Trial Transcript - July 10, 1945," 3.

School for enrollment.[11] Vidaurri's own two daughters were allowed to register, as they appeared lighter-skinned and had a French-sounding last name.[12] Sylvia Mendez (9), Gonzalo Mendez, Jr. (8), and Geronimo (Jerome) Mendez (7), her niece and nephews, were rejected and instructed to go to apply to the Hoover School instead. Jerome, Sylvia's younger brother, understood that his "darkness" was why he was being rejected from the school.[13] Mendez immediately met with Superintendent James Kent seeking an explanation for the discrimination, to which Kent responded that Mexicans needed to elevate their unclean living conditions before they could attend the Main School.[14] Kent's unequivocal refusal and lack of justifiable reasoning led Mendez to seek the counsel of David Marcus, a lawyer based in Los Angeles. Marcus instructed Mendez to gather additional examples from throughout the Orange County District to fortify the case. By conducting numerous interviews and meetings with Mexican-American communities across Orange County, Mendez succeeded in convincing four additional families to join the cause.[15] The inclusion of additional plaintiffs bolstered their case and propelled the legal proceedings forward.[16]

California State Law and the 14th Amendment

History of Education Laws in California

Discrimination in schools against non-white Californians began in the mid-1800s. However, due to the relatively small Mexican-American population at that time, the legislation primarily targeted African, Asian, and Native American children. In 1855, California enacted a law that allocated the State School Fund to counties according to a census of white children.[17] In 1859, the State School Superintendent, Andrew J. Moulder, recognized the implied meaning of the law by the framers;

---

[11] Strum, "We Always Tell," 307.
[12] Strum, "We Always Tell," 307.
[13] Strum, "We Always Tell," 307.
[14] "Trial Transcript - July 9, 1945," Mendez et al. v. Westminster, 104, accessed April 23, 2024, https://www.dropbox.com/s/qidqlxehqpthtn4/Trial_Transcript_July%209_1945.pdf?e=1&dl=0.
[15] Frederick Aguirre, "*Mendez v. Westminster School District*: How It Affected *Brown v. Board of Education*," *Journal of Hispanic Higher Education* 4, no. 4 (2005): 324, https://search.ebscohost.com/login.aspx?direct=true&db=a9h&AN=20125127&site=ehost-live.
[16] Aguirre, "*Mendez*," 324.
[17] Charles Wollenberg, "*Mendez v. Westminster*: Race, Nationality and Segregation in California Schools," *California Historical Quarterly* 53, no. 4 (1974): 318, https://doi.org/10.2307/25157525.

thus, he argued that it was both for the benefit of the "inferior" races and whites that separate schools should be created.[18] Subsequently, in 1860, separate public schools were established for Asian, African, and Native American children.[19] This would then lay the groundwork for further segregation of other minority groups.

California law did not explicitly prohibit Mexican-American children from attending white schools, an ambiguity that Marcus was later able to exploit. Although most states in the US had also issued discriminatory laws, California was oddly specific in its discrimination. Established in 1885, the California Education Code Section 8004 read, "When separate schools are established for Indian children or children of Chinese, Japanese, or Mongolian parentage, the Indian children or children of Chinese, Japanese, or Mongolian parentage shall not be admitted into any other school."[20] However, since Mexican-American children constituted a relatively small population in California, they were not specifically addressed in the legislative clause, providing Marcus with a potential basis for argument.

Mexican-American Population Growth

As the Mexican population increased in the 1900s, California's mandate for school attendance for children aged eight to fourteen was challenged.[21] Between 1910 and 1920, the Mexican population grew by 175 percent in Orange County, becoming the largest concentration of Mexicans in California.[22] The rise in the number of Mexican students in schools was met with disapproval by both the white administrators and the community. By 1921, a separate "Mexican" school was created, with another being added in 1928.[23] It is in this context that the Mendez family faced rejection from Westminster School, leading them to thoughtfully contemplate the possible repercussions should they fail to

---

[18] Wollenberg, "*Mendez*," 318.
[19] Irving Hendrick, *Public Policy Toward the Education of Non-White Minority Group Children in California, 1849-1970. Final Report.* (Washington, D.C.: National Institute of Education, 1975), 40, https://eric.ed.gov/?id=ED108998.
[20] Wollenberg, "*Mendez*," 318.
[21] Christopher Arriola, "Knocking on the Schoolhouse Door: *Mendez v. Westminster*, Equal Protection, Public Education, and Mexican Americans in the 1940's," *Berkeley La Raza Law Journal* 8, no. 2 (1995): 170, https://lawcat.berkeley.edu/record/1115276.
[22] Arriola, "Knocking," 170.
[23] Mary Peters, "The Segregation of Mexican American Children in the Elementary Schools of California: Its Legal and Administrative Aspects," (M.A. Thesis, UCLA, 1948), 37, 39, quoted in Charles Wollenberg, "*Mendez v. Westminster*: Race, Nationality and Segregation in California Schools," *California Historical Quarterly* 53, no. 4 (1974): 329, https://doi.org/10.2307/25157525; Arriola, "Knocking," 170.

present a well-considered argument to the court. Challenging the California state law poses a risk that it could be easily amended to encompass "Mexicans," forcing Marcus to seek alternatives within federal law.[24]

Federal vs. State Law

Marcus' strategic decision to use the 14th Amendment's Equal Protection Clause allowed the case to be heard in federal court and avoided confronting the California state law directly. However, a new problem presented itself in bringing the case through the federal court system. In 1898, the landmark *Plessy v. Ferguson* decision allowed for states to segregate passengers based on race as long as the accommodations made for the white riders were equal to those for the Black riders, creating the "separate but equal" doctrine used for years to follow. Marcus intentionally avoided directly challenging the *Plessy v. Ferguson* precedent because he believed that the timing for such a case would not be favorable to the Mendez family, especially when racial segregation was legal across the country.[25] Marcus was not the only lawyer questioning the timing; Thurgood Marshall, the head of the NAACP, had also cautioned colleagues that the time was not yet right.[26] However, Marcus understood that he still would be trying the case using the 14th Amendment Equal Protection Clause.[27] Thus, Marcus would be potentially setting up the case for failure due to American sentiments towards non-white Americans. In order to avoid the legal basis of *Plessy v. Ferguson*, Marcus would need to convince the court that Mexican Americans were white, essentially exposing another loophole, this time in federal law.[28]

The Second Loophole

Mexican American: Race or Ethnicity

The history of Mexican Americans in the United States showed a complicated interpretation of their racial status, with the government often recognizing Mexican Americans as white, while American society treated them as non-white. The introduction of Mexican Americans into

---

[24] Strum, "We Always Tell," 314.
[25] Strum, "We Always Tell," 314.
[26] Strum, "We Always Tell," 315.
[27] Jane Kamensky *et al.*, *A People and a Nation*, (New York: Cengage, 2019), A-11.
[28] Eddie A. Jauregui and Barbara A. Martinez, "*Mendez v. Westminster*: The Mexican-American Fight for School Integration and Social Equality Pre-*Brown v. Board of Education*," *Federal Lawyer* 68, no. Issue 3 (May 1, 2021): 10, https://www.hklaw.com/en/insights/publications/2021/06/mendez-v-westminster.

the United States by the Treaty of Guadalupe Hidalgo labeled them as white. At the time, the presiding Naturalization Act of 1790 stated that only a "free white person" could become an American citizen.[29] On February 2, 1848, the Article IX of the Treaty of Guadalupe Hidalgo, a peace treaty that ended the Mexican-American war, the government allowed "Mexicans in the territories aforesaid… [to] be incorporated into the Union of the United States …to the enjoyment of all the rights of citizens of the United States, according to the principles of the Constitution."[30] This effectively meant that Mexican Americans were recognized as a "free white person" by the federal government which allowed them to grant Mexican Americans citizenship. However, even in 1848, Senator John Calhoun questioned the motion of "incorporat[ing] a people [Mexican Americans] so dissimilar from us in every respect," foreshadowing the fluid status of Mexican Americans by law.[31]

While the Treaty of Guadalupe Hidalgo allowed for a legal interpretation of Mexican Americans as white, the next hundred years of American societal opinion would categorize Mexicans as people of color. Ironically, as early as 1857, the Treaty of Guadalupe Hidalgo was also used in the Supreme Court case *Scott v. Sandford* by two dissenting justices as proof that the United States had previously granted citizenship to non-whites.[32] Justice Benjamin Curtis, disagreeing with the opinion of the Chief Justice, wrote, "Color was not a necessary qualification of citizenship… large bodies of Mexican and North American Indians, as well as free colored inhabitants of Louisiana, have been admitted to citizenship of the United States."[33] Curtis' questioning signifies that Mexican Americans were not acknowledged by all Americans as white.[34] The prejudice would only increase during the 1920s and 30s, as a string of educators published articles claiming the inherent incapability of Mexican Americans, justified by "biological determinism."[35] By 1930, the government had temporarily categorized Mexican Americans into a racial category called "Mexican" in the Census Bureau.[36]

---

[29] "Nationality Act of 1790," Immigration History, accessed April 23, 2024, https://immigrationhistory.org/item/1790-nationality-act/.
[30] "Treaty of Guadalupe Hidalgo," National Archives, accessed April 23, 2024, https://www.archives.gov/milestone-documents/treaty-of-guadalupe-hidalgo.
[31] Thomas Saenz, "Mendez and the Legacy of Brown: A Latino Civil Rights Lawyer's Assessment," *Berkeley La Raza Law Journal* 15, no. 1 (2004): 279, https://search.ebscohost.com/login.aspx?direct=true&db=a9h&AN=14692772&site=ehost-live.
[32] Saenz, "Mendez," 280.
[33] "Dred Scott v Sandford: The Dissents," Famous Trials, accessed April 23, 2024, https://famous-trials.com/dredscott/2545-scott-v-sandford-the-dissent.
[34] Saenz, "Mendez," 280.
[35] Strum, "We Always Tell," 310.
[36] Hendrick, *Public Policy*, 21.

Against all odds, Mendez was educated in the white Westminster Main School, and while Marcus agreed with Mendez's right to attend the same school as their father, it put Marcus in a difficult position. The fight through the 14th Amendment Equal Protection Clause as discrimination against a separate race would be difficult and unlikely to win, given the sentiment against Mexican Americans. Similarly, arguing the California law solely based on an omission in wording would be dangerous, as the law could be simply modified to include Mexican Americans. Then, Marcus wondered what would happen if race were taken entirely out of the case. Utilizing their complex identity in America as a "double-edged sword" could potentially allow them to win the case.[37]

Mendez v. Westminster

Defining Whiteness

The uniquely flexible racial status of Mexican Americans created an opportunity for Marcus to pursue the case on the basis that Mexican Americans were white through the federal court system. Mendez's petition argued the constitutionality behind Mexican children's inability to use the white school facilities and the forced implementation of separate Mexican schools, based solely on their "Mexican or Latin descent."[38] Through the precondition, Marcus's wording of "Mexican or Latin descent" essentially masked racial discrimination with ethnicity, effectively removing any possibility of disproving *Plessy v. Ferguson*. Marcus's language in the petition was intentional. He avoided delineating Mexicans as a separate race by focusing on their ethnic ancestry. During the pretrial motion, the school districts and David Marcus agreed that Mexican Americans were white.[39] George Holden, the lawyer for Orange County, clarified the designation of Mexicans and whites through language: Spanish-speaking and English-speaking, respectively.[40] The difference between white Americans and Mexican Americans was therefore established on the basis of language and heritage, and not race.

---

[37] Wollenberg, "Mendez," 321.
[38] "Petition in *Mendez v. Westminster* School District," National Archives, accessed April 23, 2024, https://www.docsteach.org/documents/document/petition-mendez.
[39] Maribel Santiago, "Diluting Mexican American History for Public Consumption: How Mendez Became the 'Mexican American Brown,'" *Teachers College Record* 122, no. 8 (2020): 3, https://search.ebscohost.com/login.aspx?direct=true&db=a9h&AN=148614033&site=ehost-live.
[40] "June 26, 1945 Pretrial Transcripts," Mendez et al. v. Westminster, 7, accessed April 23, 2024, https://mendezetalvwestminster.com/court-documents/.

The argument, however, was not overlooked by Judge Paul J. McCormick and the Westminster school district's lawyer, David Holden; both questioned the race classification. On the fourth day of the trial, Judge McCormick asked for clarification about the actual designation of the "Caucasian race" used by both parties. To which Mendez replied, "Including Mexican, too… We speak mostly English there, and a little Spanish, because the ones that work for me are mostly of Mexican Descent."[41] Marcus had clearly prepared Mendez well. His refusal to acknowledge being Mexican as a race and using the word "descent" helped strengthen the position that the only difference between Mexican Americans and white Americans was potentially language.

Similarly, Felicitas Fuentes, the mother of Sylvia Mendez and wife to Mendez, was also called to stand as a witness. During cross-examination, Holden asked her whether there were mostly Mexican people who lived in their neighborhood, to which she responded that there were American people as well. Holden followed up, saying, "Well, they are all American people?"[42] She answered, "Well, they are what you call white, and they are American citizens, and I am a citizen too."[43] Holden rephrased, "You never heard me call them anything but American people of Mexican descent, did you?"[44] Fuentes responds, "I didn't, but some others have. Not you, maybe not."[45] Through this exchange, Fuentes further ingrained the belief that Mexican Americans were part of the white race. Holden's quick rewording signified the steadfast acknowledgment of how race would be defined during the case, confirming Mendez's previous testimony and emphasizing to the Court that the Mexican students, different from white students only through ethnicity, were being separated from the others solely based on their language abilities.

Justification for Segregation

With the "white race" stipulation elucidated, Marcus avoided any possibility of a partial ruling by centering his argument on the unfounded segregation of Mexican Americans, avoiding bringing to Court two

[41] "Trial Transcript - July 10, 1945," 4.
[42] "Trial Transcript - July 6, 1945," Mendez et al. v. Westminster, 4, accessed April 23, 2024, https://www.dropbox.com/s/qvbs0b30l967vxj/Trial_Transcript_July%206_1945.pdf?e=1&dl=0.
[43] "Trial Transcript - July 6, 1945," 5.
[44] "Trial Transcript - July 6, 1945," 5.
[45] "Trial Transcript - July 6, 1945," 5.

researchers to refute the language separation reasoning.[46] First, Marcus conceded that the Mexican schools in Orange County had equal facilities to the white Main School, despite being knowingly untrue.[47] Twenty years previously, two USC professors had looked into the Santa Ana district schools, finding that the schools had a wooden fire hazard, were too high in temperature, and due to the lack of light, would cause eye strain for students.[48] However, Marcus' acknowledgment prevented any possibility of a *Plessy v. Ferguson* decision, in which segregation could continue if the schools were made "equal."[49] In addition, the Westminster School District's reason for separation was based on language, a slippery argument, which Marcus brought two specialists, Ralph L. Beals and Marie Hughes, to address. Beals informed the court that his studies found children who were separated based on ethnicity were more likely to develop "opposition" and "hostility" toward mainstream society.[50] Thus, Beals's suggestion denied the very foundation on which the school district based its argument; the district insisted that children were segregated in order to be "Americanized."[51] Both experts' opinions alluded to the counterproductive ideals the segregation of Mexican Americans would, in actuality, serve, and unlike other forms of accepted racial segregation, the plaintiffs and defense had already agreed that Mexican Americans were white, forcing school officials to reach for another explanation for the segregation.

The school district believed that Spanish-speaking children were unable to perform at the same caliber as their white counterparts due to the difference in language.[52] Holden started by acknowledging Mexican children's right to equal treatment and insisted that they were receiving it. He stated that because Mexican families spoke Spanish at home, they were consequently "unfamiliar" with the English language; he argued that it was in the best interests of both Spanish-speaking and English-speaking students to learn in different settings until they had the same

---

[46] Joy C. Shaw, "Foreshadowing *Brown v. Board*: The 1946 Case of *Mendez v. Westminster*." *California Supreme Court Historical Society Newsletter* 2004, no. Issue 2 (September 15, 2004): 2, https://www.cschs.org/wp-content/uploads/2017/04/2004-Newsletter-Fall-Foreshadowing-Brown.pdf.
[47] Shaw, "Foreshadowing," 2.
[48] Strum, "We Always Tell," 309.
[49] Shaw, "Foreshadowing," 2.
[50] "Trial Transcript - July 11, 1945," Mendez et al. v. Westminster, 93, accessed April 23, 2024, https://www.dropbox.com/s/dcwxm7vxa1131wo/Trial_Transcript_July%2011_1945.pdf?e=1&dl=0.
[51] "Trial Transcript - July 11, 1945," 85.
[52] Molly Nance, "The Landmark Decision that Faded into Historical Obscurity," *Diverse Issues in Higher Education* 24, no. 22 (2007): 30, https://eric.ed.gov/?id=EJ782226.

level of proficiency in English.[53] James L. Kent, superintendent of the Garden Grove School District, was called to the stand. Kent reiterated his previously held beliefs by telling the court that school officials believed Mexican-American pupils were behind their peers in academic ability.[54] Kent's baseless claims were echoed by Richard F. Harris, the Westminster Superintendent of Schools, who added that because Mexican Americans did not grow up with "stories of our American heroes, stories of our American frontier, rhymes, rhythms, [they] had to be educated separately."[55] Kent and Harris both argued that segregation was necessary due to the culture and language barrier; the very reason Beals and Hughes asserted that integration was all the more important. If Californians accepted segregation based on language skills alone, they would be forced to address the lack of segregation for other white immigrant groups, such as Italians, Germans, Armenians, and Russians, for example. Many white ethnic groups, across America, spoke languages other than English in their homes, thereby weakening the argument that Mexican Americans were unique in this experience. Ultimately, the time-honored tradition of assimilating and Americanizing white immigrant groups would win in court.

The Short-Term Impact

Lower and Appellate Court Ruling

The short-term impact of the Mendez ruling permitted Mexican-American children to attend white schools, with a caveat that they had met the English language requirements. On February 18, 1946, Judge Paul McCormick declared Mexican Americans could not be legally discriminated against and that Mexican-American students, being white, had the right to attend white schools. He wrote, "It is conceded by all parties that there is no question of race discrimination in this action…. [Nevertheless], the equal protection of the laws pertaining to the public school system in California is not provided by furnishing in separate schools the same technical facilities, textbooks, and courses of instruction to children of Mexican ancestry that are available to the other

[53] Strum, "We Always Tell," 316.
[54] "Trial Transcript - July 5, 1945," Mendez et al. v. Westminster, 68, accessed April 23, 2024, https://www.dropbox.com/s/dqvysoekzvrk67z/Trial_Transcript_July_5_1945.pdf?e=1&dl=0.
[55] "Testimony of Superintendent Richard Harris in *Mendez v. Westminster*," National Archives, accessed April 23, 2024, https://www.docsteach.org/documents/document/2-trial-transcript.

public school children regardless of their ancestry."[56] McCormick's ruling, therefore, deemed that Mexican-American segregation was unconstitutional according to both the 14th Amendment and California State Code.[57] However, his ruling did not affect any of the school segregation policies against Asian Americans and Native Americans, as they were not white. He also continued language segregation, on the basis that the student must first be tested, creating an exception administrator would later exploit.[58] Following an appeal by the Westminster school district, the Ninth Circuit Court of Appeals upheld the District Court judge's decision unanimously, 7-0, a year later. Judge Albert Lee Stephens wrote the opinion, "The respondents 'did not hew to the line of their authority': they overstepped it."[59] Marcus' strategy worked perfectly. The court avoided the *Plessy v. Ferguson* precedent and ruled in favor of their argument.

Desegregation and Media Coverage

Despite the small media broadcast of the case, California legislators were listening. In the aftermath of *Mendez v. Westminster*, Mexican Americans were permitted to attend white schools with the contingency of being fluent in English. The Mendez children subsequently attended the Westminster Main School in the following September of 1947. Considering the wide-reaching implications of the case, there was little news coverage regarding the resolution of the case. An article published on February 20, 1946, in the *Los Angeles Times* was brief and did not detail much of the case except for McCormick's ruling.[60] Potentially, the relatively little coverage suggests the small impact the case had on the public.[61] *The Fresno Bee* reported the case on page 5 briefly in December of 1946, mentioning the Westminster School District's appeal.[62] However, Californians' denial or lack of interest did not mean officials were not aware of what was happening. On January

[56] "Conclusions of the Court," Mendez et al. v. Westminster, 4, 11, accessed April 23, 2024, https://mendezetalvwestminster.com/court-documents-3/.
[57] Santiago, "Diluting," 25.
[58] Santiago, "Diluting," 3.
[59] Santiago, "Diluting," 3.
[60] "RULING GIVES MEXICAN CHILDREN EQUAL RIGHTS," *Los Angeles Times*, Feb 20, 1946. https://www.proquest.com/historical-newspapers/ruling-gives-mexican-children-equal-rights/docview/165649006/se-2.
[61] Carlos Moreno, "*Mendez v. Westminster* and School Desegregation," *California Legal History* 14 (January 1, 2019): 104, https://heinonline.org/HOL/LandingPage?handle=hein.journals/calegh14&div=11&id=&page=.
[62] "Appeals Court Studies Order Banning School Segregation of Mexicans," *The Fresno Bee,* December 10, 1946. https://basic.newspapers.com/clip/75229276/mendez-v-westminster/.

27, 1947, two and a half months before the Ninth Circuit upheld the District Court's ruling on Mendez, four members of the California Assembly introduced Assembly Bill 1375, which repealed the sections of the Education Code that allowed separate schools.[63] Six months later, or two months following the appellate court's ruling, on June 14, 1947, Governor Earl Warren signed the bill into law, making California the first state to desegregate schools. Although there is no clear-cut connection, the case can be seen as part of a larger societal push toward achieving integration through litigation efforts, as *Mendez* had already significantly weakened the legal segregation to only those explicitly written in the California State Code.[64]

Mendez vs. Brown

Earl Warren

Because of the similarities between the Mendez and Brown cases, historians often interpret *Mendez v. Westminster* as a precursor that set the stage for *Brown v. Board of Education*. There is a good reason for connecting the two cases due to some remarkable similarities.[65] The most notable resemblance lies in Earl Warren's involvement. In 1946, Warren personally directed the Attorney General of California, Robert W. Kenny, to submit a brief in the Mendez case, in which he clearly showed his sympathies toward Mexican Americans' plight.[66] In November, Kenny entered the case as an amicus, arguing that any segregation in California schools was unconstitutional. Kenny's brief expressed general dissent with the segregation established in California schools, with his statement symbolizing the disapproval of the California governing body and, hence, Warren.[67] The timing of Kenny's amicus curiae likely coincided with the introduction of legislation to end segregation in California.[68] Remarkably, seven years later, the now Chief Justice, Earl Warren, would also declare the ruling for the landmark *Brown v Board of Education of Topeka* case. *Brown v. Board of Education*, all questioning the constitutionality of segregation based on race, allowed by *Plessy v. Ferguson*.[69] Thus, when Warren heard the *Brown v. Board of*

---

[63] Richard Valencia, "*Mendez v. Westminster*," in *Chicano Students and the Courts: The Mexican American Legal Struggle for Educational Equality*, (New York: New York University Press, 2008), 36-37.
[64] Arriola, "Knocking," 199.
[65] Kristi Bowman, eds, *The Pursuit of Racial and Ethnic Equality in American Public Schools: Mendez, Brown, and Beyond*, (East Lansing: Michigan State University Press, 2014), 35.
[66] Aguirre, "*Mendez*," 329.
[67] Aguirre, "*Mendez*," 326.
[68] Shaw, "Foreshadowing," 12.
[69] *Brown v. Board of Education*, 347 US 483 (1954).

Education case in the Supreme Court, there is reason to believe that he remembered the Mendez case decision from his years as Governor of California.

Warren's decision six years later in *Brown v. Board of Education* resembles that of McCormick's in many ways. McCormick and Warren both emphasized the importance of integration in nurturing American beliefs in all Americans through their shared use of "culture": McCormick had written, "commingling of the student body instills … a common cultural attitude," which Warren had echoed, "a principal instrument [is] awakening the child to cultural values."[70] In addition, both judges directly turned students' supposed "retarded" abilities, a niche word used by Superintendent Kent during testimony, on its head, instead suggesting that segregation is what causes the delayed learning process for Mexican and African Americans.[71] However, although both shared a similar sentiment and employed similar language while doing so, establishing that "Separate education facilities are inherently unequal," the cases had very different circumstances.[72]

The Mendez case was a mostly family-funded fight for equal rights, which therefore decided to remove race to potentially win the case.[73] In fact, the plaintiffs and lawyers in the case actively sought to avoid a fight over mass desegregation for all races. The Brown case, on the other hand, was a highly researched and organized campaign that was fighting directly against racial discrimination.[74] Despite the similar language used by the judges, the rationale was different. Warren viewed the plaintiff as other than white, whereas in the Mendez case, Mexican Americans were white citizens being segregated. This overlooked difference, the pretrial "white race" stipulation, was, in reality, crucial to the success of Mendez, but also became what prevented the Mendez case from becoming a Brown case.[75]

It should also be remembered that Earl Warren, although having some connection with *Mendez v. Westminster*, did not have a large impact on the result of the case. Warren did not write the amicus curiae; rather, it was his Attorney General, Kenny, who did. Any connection between

---

[70] "Trial Transcript - July 10, 1945," 93; "*Brown v. Board of Education*," National Archives, accessed April 23, 2024, https://www.archives.gov/milestone-documents/brown-v-board-of-education#transcript.
[71] "Trial Transcript - July 10, 1945," 93; "Brown."
[72] "*Brown*."
[73] Saenz, "Mendez," 277.
[74] Saenz, "Mendez," 277.
[75] Saenz, "Mendez," 278.

the two is simply hearsay.[76] Further, Warren's end of de jure segregation did not necessarily mean an end to de facto segregation. Mexican Americans continued to be highly segregated and, in some cases, even more segregated over the years following the decision, a situation that was also unfortunately repeated after the success of *Brown v. Board of Education*.[77] Although the law had changed, the de facto result of "white flight" still kept public school students segregated.[78]

NAACP

In addition to the link with Warren, the NAACP's involvement in *Mendez v. Westminster* later aided *Brown v. Board of Education*, indicating the similarities between the two cases. For one, Thurgood Marshall, the leading attorney in *Brown*, submitted an amicus curiae during the Mendez appeal process, citing that school racial segregation violated the Equal Protection Clause of the 14th Amendment and thus *Plessy v. Ferguson*.[79] An attorney who worked alongside Marshall acknowledged the use of *Mendez* as a "test case" for when the NAACP later tried to overturn *Plessy*, adding that the amicus curiae was similar to the first brief the NAACP filed in Brown.[80] Further, during the 1950s, Marshall would ask for Marcus's assistance when preparing for *Brown v. Board of Education*; Marcus would subsequently send his brief and case notes.[81]

However, although the NAACP filed a brief, they cited cases regarding Black segregation, whereas the Mendez case was uniquely about Mexican-American segregation. Thus, the federal court "rejected" the call and stated that the school did not apply to the "separate but equal" doctrine established in *Plessy v. Ferguson*, as it did not mention race.[82] A refusal that was disappointing for the NAACP.[83] In addition, the amicus curiae submitted by the NAACP was written entirely by Robert L. Carter, the second signature on the brief. Carter identified the lone similarity of the briefs as the subject: segregation was unconstitutional; he noted that because *Mendez* came first, the brief

[76] Santiago, "Diluting," 14.
[77] Valencia, "Mendez," 37; Gary Orfield, Sara Schley, Diane Glass, and Sean Reardon, *The Growth of Segregation in American Schools: Changing Patterns of Separation and Poverty Since 1968*, (UCLA: The Civil Rights Project, 1993), 8, 11, accessed April 23, 2024, https://escholarship.org/uc/item/1hh2567k.
[78] Orfield et al., *Growth of Segregation,* 6.
[79] Santiago, "Diluting," 15; Thurgood Marshall, Robert Carter, and Loren Miller, "NAACP Westminster Brief," Internet Archive, accessed April 23, 2024, https://archive.org/details/NAACPWestministerBrief/page/n17/mode/2up.
[80] Aguirre, "*Mendez,*" 326.
[81] Strum, "We Always Tell," 322.
[82] Saenz, "Mendez," 277.
[83] Valencia, "Mendez," 36.

became a model for the one he would write for *Brown*.[84] Carter's interview essentially confirmed the true nature of the NAACP's involvement; the support was offered solely as a "rehearsal" before their intended trial for African Americans. The NAACP was not able to use the Mendez case in a meaningful way because the racial status of Mexican Americans could not be applied to African Americans, which was the focus of *Brown v. Board of Education*.[85]

Conclusion

The success of the Mendez case was part of a bigger fight against segregation that tried but never directly challenged the "separate but equal" precedent.[86] *Mendez v. Westminster* provides insight into the Mexican-American narrative of school desegregation, an account often overshadowed by the African-American experience. The Mendez family's fight highlighted the struggles Mexican-American families faced in California during the early 1900s: discrimination from their white counterparts forced the growing Mexican population into separate, inferior schools on the basis of language and ethnicity. The Mendez family's lawyer was able to successfully exploit two loopholes in California and federal law, allowing Mexican Americans to be labeled as white in court. This specification ultimately won the case for the Mendez family, which the appellate court subsequently upheld. The similarities between *Mendez v. Westminster* and *Brown v. Board of Education*, including the involvement of Earl Warren, the NAACP, and Thurgood Marshall, previewed what would come in the following decade.

The Mendez family's case was successful partly due to the fluid racial status of Mexican Americans, which, however, also hindered their ability to challenge segregation in its entirety. Despite their contributions, the Mendez case warrants separate examination from the Brown case and deserves recognition as a pivotal legal decision that altered segregation practices for Mexican Americans in particular.

---

[84] Santiago, "Diluting," 15.
[85] Marshall, "NAACP."
[86] Jeanne M. Powers, "*Mendez v. Westminster* (1946) as a Window into Mid-Century Racial Ideologies." *Conference Papers - American Sociological Association*, 2007, 16, https://research-ebsco-com.ezproxysuf.flo.org/linkprocessor/plink?id=4533b7d3-d86e-33aa-96ff-983d691442d3.

Bibliography

Aguirre, Frederick. "*Mendez v. Westminster School District*: How It Affected *Brown v. Board of Education*." *Journal of Hispanic Higher Education* 4, no. 4 (2005): 321–32. https://search.ebscohost.com/login.aspx?direct=true&db=a9h&AN=20125127&site=ehost-live.

"Appeals Court Studies Order Banning School Segregation of Mexicans." *The Fresno Bee,* December 10, 1946. https://basic.newspapers.com/clip/75229276/mendez-v-westminster/.

Arriola, Christopher. "Knocking on the Schoolhouse Door: *Mendez v. Westminster*, Equal Protection, Public Education, and Mexican Americans in the 1940s." *Berkeley La Raza Law Journal* 8, no. 2 (1995): 166–207. https://lawcat.berkeley.edu/record/1115276.

Bowman, Kristi, eds. *The Pursuit of Racial and Ethnic Equality in American Public Schools: Mendez, Brown, and Beyond.* East Lansing: Michigan State University Press, 2014.

"*Brown v. Board of Education* (1954)." National Archives. Accessed April 23, 2024. https://www.archives.gov/milestone-documents/brown-v-board-of-education#transcript.

Brown v. Board of Education. 347 US 483 (1954).

"Conclusions of the Court." Mendez et al. v. Westminster. Accessed April 23, 2024. https://mendezetalvwestminster.com/court-documents-3/.

"Dred Scott v Sandford: The Dissents." Famous Trials. Accessed April 23, 2024. https://famous-trials.com/dredscott/2545-scott-v-sandford-the-dissent.

Hendrick, Irving. *Public Policy Toward the Education of Non-White Minority Group Children in California, 1849-1970. Final Report*. Washington, D.C.: National Institute of Education, 1975. https://eric.ed.gov/?id=ED108998.

Jauregui, Eddie A., and Barbara A. Martinez. "*Mendez v. Westminster*: The Mexican-American Fight for School Integration and Social Equality Pre-

Brown v. Board of Education." *Federal Lawyer* 68, no. Issue 3 (May 1, 2021): 9–22. https://www.hklaw.com/en/insights/publications/2021/06/mendez-v-westminster.

"June 26, 1945 Pretrial Transcripts." Mendez et al. v. Westminster. Accessed April 23, 2024. https://mendezetalvwestminster.com/court-documents/.

Kamensky, Jane, *et al*. *A People and a Nation*. 11th ed. New York: Cengage, 2019.

López, Rebecca. "*Mendez V. Westminster*: The Latino *Brown V. Board of Education*." *Reflections: Narratives of Professional Helping* 10, no. 1 (January 1, 2004): 39–48. https://reflectionsnarrativesofprofessionalhelping.org/index.php/Reflections/article/view/1180.

Marshall, Thurgood, Robert Carter, and Loren Miller. "NAACP Westminster Brief." Internet Archive. Accessed April 23, 2024. https://archive.org/details/NAACPWestministerBrief/page/n17/mode/2up.

Martinez-Cola, Marisela. *The Bricks Before Brown: The Chinese American, Native American, and Mexican Americans' Struggle for Educational Equality*. 1st ed. Athens, Georgia: University of Georgia Press, 2022.

Moreno, Carlos. "*Mendez v. Westminster* and School Desegregation." *California Legal History* 14 (January 1, 2019): 93–105. https://heinonline.org/HOL/LandingPage?handle=hein.journals/calegh14&div=11&id=&page=.

Nance, Molly. "The Landmark Decision that Faded into Historical Obscurity." *Diverse Issues in Higher Education* 24, no. 22 (2007): 28–31. https://eric.ed.gov/?id=EJ782226.

"Nationality Act of 1790." Immigration History. Accessed April 23, 2024. https://immigrationhistory.org/item/1790-nationality-act/.

Orfield, Gary, Sara Schley, Diane Glass, and Sean Reardon. *The Growth of Segregation in American Schools: Changing Patterns of Separation and Poverty Since 1968*. UCLA: The Civil Rights Project. (1993). Accessed April 23, 2024. https://escholarship.org/uc/item/1hh2567k.

Peters, Mary. "The Segregation of Mexican American Children in the Elementary Schools of California: Its Legal and Administrative Aspects." M.A. Thesis, University of California, Los Angeles, 1948. Quoted in Charles Wollenberg. "*Mendez v. Westminster*: Race, Nationality and Segregation in California Schools." *California Historical Quarterly* 53, no. 4 (1974): 317–32. https://doi.org/10.2307/25157525.

"Petition in *Mendez v. Westminster School District*." National Archives. Accessed April 23, 2024. https://www.docsteach.org/documents/document/petition-mendez.

Powers, Jeanne M. "*Mendez v. Westminster* (1946) as a Window into Mid-Century Racial Ideologies." *Conference Papers - American Sociological Association*, 2007. https://research-ebsco-com.ezproxysuf.flo.org/linkprocessor/plink?id=4533b7d3-d86e-33aa-96ff-983d691442d3.

"Ruling Gives Mexican Children Equal Rights." *Los Angeles Times*, Feb 20, 1946. https://www.proquest.com/historical-newspapers/ruling-gives-mexican-children-equal-rig hts/docview/165649006/se-2.

Sadlier, Sarah. "*Mendez v. Westminster*: The Harbinger of *Brown V. Board*." *Ezra's Archives* 4, no. 1 (2014): 76–89. https://ecommons.cornell.edu/items/26bdc359-f808-431b-91db-7ed037dadba7.

Saenz, Thomas. "Mendez and the Legacy of Brown: A Latino Civil Rights Lawyer's Assessment." *Berkeley La Raza Law Journal* 15, no. 1 (2004): 276–82. https://search.ebscohost.com/login.aspx?direct=true&db=a9h&AN=14692772&site=ehos t-live.

Santiago, Maribel. "Diluting Mexican American History for Public Consumption: How Mendez Became the 'Mexican American Brown.'" *Teachers College Record* 122, no. 8 (2020): 1–30. https://search.ebscohost.com/login.aspx?direct=true&db=a9h&AN=148614033&site=eho st-live.

Santiago, Maribel. "From Multicultural to Romanticized Representations of the Past: How *Mendez v. Westminster*'s Significance Shapeshifts to

Appeal to Different Contexts." J*ournal of Social Studies Research* 44, no. 1 (2020): 91-103. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jssr.2019.04.004.

Shaw, Joy C. "Foreshadowing *Brown v. Board*: The 1946 Case of *Mendez v. Westminster*." *California Supreme Court Historical Society Newsletter* 2004, no. Issue 2 (September 15, 2004): 1–12. https://www.cschs.org/wp-content/uploads/2017/04/2004-Newsletter-Fall-Foreshadowing-Brown.pdf.

Strum, Philippa. "'We Always Tell Our Children They Are Americans': *Mendez v. Westminster* and the Beginning of the End of School Segregation." *Journal of Supreme Court History* 39, no. 3 (November 2014): 307–28. https://search.ebscohost.com/login.aspx?direct=true&db=a9h&AN=99196357&site=ehost-live.

"Testimony of Superintendent Richard Harris in *Mendez v. Westminster*." National Archives. Accessed April 23, 2024. https://www.docsteach.org/documents/document/2-trial-transcript.

"Treaty of Guadalupe Hidalgo." National Archives. Accessed April 23, 2024. https://www.archives.gov/milestone-documents/treaty-of-guadalupe-hidalgo.

"Trial Transcript - July 5, 1945." Mendez et al. v. Westminster. Accessed April 23, 2024. https://www.dropbox.com/s/dqvysoekzvrk67z/Trial_Transcript_July_5_1945.pdf?e=1&dl=0.

"Trial Transcript - July 6, 1945." Mendez et al. v. Westminster. Accessed April 23, 2024. https://www.dropbox.com/s/qvbs0b30l967vxj/Trial_Transcript_July%206_1945.pdf?e=1&dl=0.

"Trial Transcript - July 9, 1945." Mendez et al. v. Westminster. Accessed April 23, 2024. https://www.dropbox.com/s/qidqlxehqpthtn4/Trial_Transcript_July%209_1945.pdf?e=1&dl=0.

"Trial Transcript - July 10, 1945." Mendez et al. v. Westminster. Accessed April 23, 2024.

https://www.dropbox.com/s/lbkneymsenlfke4/Trial_Transcript_July_10_1945.pdf?e=1&dl=0.

"Trial Transcript - July 11, 1945." Mendez et al. v. Westminster. Accessed April 23, 2024. https://www.dropbox.com/s/dcwxm7vxa1131wo/Trial_Transcript_July%2011_1945.pdf?e=1&dl=0.

Valencia, Richard. "*Mendez v. Westminster*." In *Chicano Students and the Courts: The Mexican American Legal Struggle for Educational Equality*, (22-49). New York: New York University Press. (2008).

Wollenberg, Charles. "*Mendez v. Westminster*: Race, Nationality and Segregation in California Schools." *California Historical Quarterly* 53, no. 4 (1974): 317–32. https://doi.org/10.2307/25157525.

Public Policy

Between Two Worlds: IMF and Public Pressure in Economic Policy Making in Pakistan (2018-2023)

Mohammed Zohayr Samie '25
Aitchison College
Lahore, Pakistan

Abstract

Economics and politics are often studied as two separate fields with distinct modes of analysis. However, in reality, political choices are limited by economic constraints as economic programs are frequently impacted by political decisions. The significance of this dynamic is especially pronounced when a nation grapples with the dual challenges of financial insolvency and political turmoil. This paper examines the tensions between a country's obligations to international creditors and its responsibilities towards its citizens. By studying the relationship between the International Monetary Fund (IMF) and Pakistan (2018-2013), this paper shows how two elected governments navigated the contradiction between satisfying the demands of the IMF and responding to pressures from the electorate. The IMF consistently demanded a reduction of public expenditures from the government of Pakistan, including slashing subsidies for key commodities such as petroleum, to ensure continued financial support for the country. Yet, such policies often led to price hikes and inflation, ultimately eroding public support for the government. Consequently, the government often violated the IMF's conditionalities to appeal to popular sentiment when necessary. The result of these contradictory tendencies was a constant switching of strategies by successive governments to respond to these two pressures, exacerbating both the financial and political crises in Pakistan. This research is expected to offer insight into understanding the intricate interplay between politics and economic policy-making in similar countries.

Introduction

Economists investigate the weaknesses or strengths of economic policies pursued by various governments. Yet, they frequently overlook the political pressures on policymakers, especially those in the developing world. This paper argues that an analysis of domestic politics can help frame a more nuanced understanding of the electoral pressures faced by governments as they navigate between the demands made by foreign creditors and the expectations of their electorate. More specifically, it shows how democratic governments in Pakistan are compelled to balance between sustaining their electoral base as well as negotiating with the staff of the International Monetary Fund (IMF).

The paper examines the decisions of the finance ministry in Pakistan between 2018 and 2023 as a nodal point for analyzing the tensions that arise from balancing IMF demands with electoral pressures. Apart from providing an alternative economic history of the period, it also shows that the governments have to respond to the IMF's demands for austerity, budget cuts, and fiscal discipline to receive loans from the IMF and other creditors. On the other hand, such measures can result in the diminishing of electoral support for political parties that feel obliged to adopt expansionary policies to bolster their political base. An expansionary policy leads them into a direct confrontation with the IMF and distorts the balance of payment, forcing them to return to the IMF's prescriptions. The paper thus establishes that domestic political instability significantly influences economic policy, which in turn has a profound effect on the political success of various actors.

The paper further explains that such tension is absent in countries under military dictatorships, as these regimes have the ability to delay elections and control dissent through repressive measures. Second, this dynamic is also curbed if the country receives generous aid from the US as part of a geostrategic alliance. Finally, countries like Pakistan are perpetually caught in the contradictory tendencies of IMF-induced austerity or politically motivated expansionary policies because of their inability to address a third reality: the grotesque elite capture of the economy that excludes the possibility of a sustainable and just economic developmental model. The paper makes the point by examining the history and economic structure of Pakistan before delving into a detailed analysis of the contemporary period through a close reading of the tensions between the Pakistan government and the IMF as reported in the media (2018-2023).

Pakistan's Turbulent History: A Brief Overview

Pakistan's economic weakness is deeply tied to the recurrent political crises that have marred the country's history. Since its inception, the country has been governed by the political and social elite that was formed during the time of the British Raj.[1] During the 1950s, the ruling elite chose to side with the United States in the Cold War against the USSR and entered into two military agreements, SEATO and CENTO.[2] As a result, Pakistan was offered aid from the US and its affiliated organizations, such as the World Bank, to modernize its economy.

One of the most important consequences of deepening US-Pakistani relations was the rise of the Pakistan military as the dominant actor in domestic affairs. The heightened sense of insecurity during the Cold War elevated the Pakistani military's role in the region and also facilitated its advent into direct politics. Resultantly, Pakistan's economic trajectory became defined by the interests of the country's elites, aid dependency on the West, and political authoritarianism by the military.[3]

This economic model led to the rise of an aid-dependent model under General Ayub Khan's military dictatorship (1958-1969). The military government embarked upon an ambitious industrialization policy, constructing Mega-Dams, energy infrastructure, several industrial units, and the "Green Revolution" to modernize the country's agriculture sector.[4] Despite the gains made in output, the country was marked by social and regional divisions. A scandal broke out when Mahboob-ul-Haq, a prominent economist, published his findings, which suggested only 22 families owned a majority of industrial, banking, and insurance companies. At the same time, real wages for workers did not grow for 11 years, landlessness grew rapidly among the peasantry, while the regional inequality between West and East Pakistan intensified.[5]

[1] Hassan Javid, "Class, Power, and Patronage: The Landed Elite and Politics in Pakistani Punjab," (PhD diss.), The London School of Economics and Political Science, 2012.
[2] Mussarat Jabeen and Muhammad Saleem Mazhar, "Security Game: SEATO and CENTO as Instrument of Economic and Military Assistance to Encircle Pakistan," *Pakistan Economic and Social Review* 49, no. 1 (2011): 109-32.
[3] Ishrat Husain, *Pakistan: The Economy of an Elitist State*, (Karachi, Oxford University Press, 1999).
[4] Shahid Javed Burki, "Ayub's Fall: A Socio-Economic Explanation," *Asian Survey* 12, no. 3 (1972): 201–12.
[5] Hamza Alavi, "Bangladesh and the Crises of Pakistan," *Socialist Register*, Vol.8, (March 1971): 289-317.

As social tensions simmered, an uprising overthrew the Ayub Khan government in 1969. However, the situation deteriorated further with an outright civil war in 1971 that led to the dismemberment of Pakistan and the creation of Bangladesh.[6] After a brief period of democratic rule (1972-1977), General Zia overthrew the government of Zulfikar Ali Bhutto and eventually proceeded to hang him in 1979. These events coincided with the Soviet intervention in Afghanistan, an event that made Pakistan a frontline state in the fight against Communism.[7]

The 1980s witnessed a large inflow of US aid into Pakistan to support the covert war in neighboring Afghanistan. Pakistan's economy experienced an economic boom in the 1980s, with the growing economy helping strengthen the role of the military in Pakistan's politics.[8] However, after the withdrawal of the Soviet troops from Afghanistan, the US lost interest in the region, and its aid to Pakistan dried up.[9] This turned the return to democracy (1988-1999) into a lost decade as civilian governments struggled with the debt burden, rising religious extremism (spillover from the Afghan War), and constant confrontations with the military that continued to pull strings in government.[10] The civilian setup was finally wrapped up when General Pervez Musharraf overthrew the government of Nawaz Sharif in 1999.[11]

The 9/11 attacks in the US once again made Pakistan a frontline state for the US, this time in the "war on terror". The close military collaboration between the US and Pakistan also led to more economic collaboration. Since the US used Pakistan as a base to launch its operations against the Taliban government in Kabul, the country once again witnessed generous aid and loan deferment packages from the

---

[6] Riaz, Ali. *Bangladesh: A Political History since Independence*, (United Kingdom: Bloomsbury Publishing, 2016).

[7] Wolpert, Stanley A. Zulfi Bhutto of Pakistan: His Life and Times. United Kingdom: Oxford University Press, 1993.

[8] Dhruv Banerjee, "How the Soviet Invasion of Afghanistan Strengthened Pakistan's Military Deep State," *The Diplomat*, January 4, 2024, https://thediplomat.com/2024/01/how-the-soviet-invasion-of-afghanistan-strengthened-pakistans-military-deep-state/.

[9] Crile, George. *Charlie Wilson's War: The Extraordinary Story of the Largest Covert Operation in History,* (New York: Atlantic Monthly Press, 2003).

[10] Zaidi, S. Akbar. *Issues in Pakistan's Economy*, (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2000).

[11] Al Jazeera Staff, "Pervez Musharraf: The Pakistani ex-president's chequered legacy," *Al Jazeera*, February 5, 2023, https://www.aljazeera.com/news/2023/2/5/obituary-pakistans-former-president-pervez-musharraf-dies.

Bush administration.[12] Moreover, the country "borrowed" its finance minister from the US, Shaukat Aziz, Executive Vice-President of Citibank. In 2004, General Musharraf elevated Aziz to the role of the country's prime minister, a position he held until 2007.[13]

Once again, the inflow of dollars created a boom in the economy, with economic growth reaching 6.4 percent, accompanied by a real estate boom. In 2008, the increasing costs of the Iraq War and the financial crisis in the US led to a decreased flow of funds for Pakistan. In an unfortunate repetition of history, this decline coincided with the return to civilian rule in 2008 with political governments struggling to cope with the exorbitant debt burden as well the rising costs of the war on terror, which eventually led to the death of over 70,000 Pakistani civilians and necessitated repeated military operations on Pakistani territory, leading to the loss of $126 billion in revenue for the country.[14]

Elite Capture and the IMF

In this entire history, the fortunes of Pakistan's economy were intimately tied to the geostrategic interests of the US. Similarly, the rise of the Pakistani military as the dominant political actor was also connected to the close cooperation between the two countries during the Cold War and the war on terror.[15] At the same time, however, the country failed to significantly expand its industrial base, increase its agricultural production, or meet its social objectives, including the provision of health, education, or employment to its citizens.[16] As a result, about 50 percent of diseases and 40 percent of deaths occur due

[12] Sanjoy Banerjee and Gitika Commuri, "A Strange and Bittersweet Relationship: Pakistan-United States Relations in the Musharraf Era." *Journal of Asian Security and International Affairs* 1, no. 1 (2014): 41–62.
[13] Josette Sheeran, "Shaukat Aziz: From Banking to Politics, Pakistan to the World," *Asia Society,* New York, June 28, 2016, https://asiasociety.org/new-york/events/shaukat-aziz-banking-politics-pakistan-world.
[14] Muhammad Shakeel Ahmad Siddiqui, Muhammad Imran Pasha and Saira Akram, "The Political Economy of Terrorisms: Economic Cost of War on Terror for Pakistan," *Journal of Development and Social Sciences 2*, no.4 (2021): 297-309.
[15] Siddiqa-Agha, Ayesha. *Military Inc: Inside Pakistan's Military Economy*, (London: Pluto Press, 2017).
[16] Hussain, Akmal. *Pakistan, Institutional Instability and Underdevelopment: State, People and Consciousness*, (Lahore, Folio Books, 2023).

to poor drinking water quality.[17] Moreover, 25 million children are out of school, and 40 percent of the population lives in poverty.[18]

A phenomenon that explains this economic stagnation is the elite capture that shapes Pakistan's political economy. As Haq showed in the 1960s, economic inequality was exacerbated by the rise of 22 families controlling large sectors of the country's economy. The situation has not changed much since then. In a recent study, it was revealed that 31 families own an overwhelming share of publicly listed companies, demonstrating the tightly-knit world of the financial elite in a country of 240 million people.[19]

Despite overseeing economic stagnation, how do these elites continue to amass immense wealth? The secret was revealed in a report written by Hafiz Pasha and published by the UNDP. Pasha shows how the elites in the country make most of their profits by receiving heavy subsidies from the state.[20] These include tax exemptions, protectionist policies, facilitating rackets across supply chains, lax labor and environmental laws, and loan write-offs for corporations, feudal landlords, and Generals. The total cost of these subsidies was calculated in 2019 as $17.4 billion annually, four times the amount spent on social welfare schemes, leading to allegations that Pakistan was a welfare state for the elite.[21]

Such subsidies fuel an elite lifestyle that increases imports in the country without increasing exports. Moreover, over 70 percent of Pakistan's budget is now spent on defence expenditures, repaying loans,

---

[17] M. K. Daud, Muhammad Nafees, Shafaqat Ali, Muhammad Rizwan, Raees Ahmad Bajwa, Muhammad Bilal Shakoor, Muhammad Umair Arshad, Shahzad Ali Shahid Chatha, Farah Deeba, Waheed Murad, Ijaz Malook and Shui Jin Zhu, "Drinking Water Quality Status and Contamination in Pakistan," *Biomed Res Int.* August 14, 2017, 10.

[18] Web Desk, "25MLN children out of schools in Pakistan, reveals Education minister," *ARY News*, January 24, 2024, https://arynews.tv/pakistan-25mln-children-out-of-schools-reveals-education-minister/; Times of India Staff, "Nearly 40% of Pakistan's population now living below poverty line: World Bank," *The Times of India*, September 24, 2023, https://timesofindia.indiatimes.com/world/pakistan/nearly-40-of-pakistans-population-now-living-below-poverty-line-world-bank/articleshow/103886595.cms.

[19] Shahbaz Rana, "Club of 31 families dominate PSX", *Express Tribune*, May 05, 2021. https://tribune.com.pk/story/2298276/club-of-31-families-dominate-psx.

[20] Hafiz A Pasha. "Growth and Inequality in Pakistan: Agenda for Reforms." Friedrich Ebert Stiftung, 2018. https://socialprotection-humanrights.org/resource/growth-and-inequality-in-pakistan-volume-i/.

[21] Asad Hashim, "Elite privilege consumes $17.4bn of Pakistan's economy: UNDP", *Al Jazeera*, April 13, 2021, https://www.aljazeera.com/news/2021/4/13/elite-privilege-consumes-17-4bn-of-pakistans-economy-undp.

and administrative costs for the executive branch of the state (bureaucracy). With increasing costs, elite subsidies, an unproductive economic base, and low taxation on the elites, Pakistan continues to face a balance of payment crisis as well as increased indebtedness. The solution found by the government for such chronic crises is to go to the IMF for loans to keep a decaying economic order afloat.[22]

Since the 1980s, Pakistan has gone to the IMF 24 times to seek a loan. In response, the IMF has demanded 'Structural Adjustment Programs" from the Pakistan government, which have often included demands for privatization of state enterprises, liberalization of price controls, and a decrease in public spending.[23] Such austerity measures are designed to "balance fiscal deficits," but also have a direct impact on the lives of ordinary people.[24] For this reason, it becomes increasingly difficult for elected governments to undertake such reforms without losing electoral support. Coincidentally, the geostrategic conditions during the military governments allowed dictators to avoid administering painful austerity on the public as aid inflows ensured that the public could be shielded from tough measures.[25]

For elected governments, they are pushed to strike a balance between the demands for austerity by the IMF and the real risk of losing electoral support. This tension marks the real world of economic policymakers in Pakistan who have to answer to IMF officials in Washington while also being held accountable by party bosses if the political party loses in elections. These contradictions stem from the fact that both the elected and military governments have refused to end subsidies for the country's elites or break their monopoly on the economy.[26] One of the primary reasons for this reluctance is that these same elites are overly represented in the governance structure, hence making it nearly impossible to initiate meaningful reforms.[27]

---

[22] The Economic Times Staff, "Tough Love: Pakistan has gone to IMF for bailouts 23 times in 75 years," *The Economic Times*, February 26, 2023, https://economictimes.indiatimes.com/news/international/world-news/tough-love-pak-has-gone-to-imf-for-bailouts-23-times-in-75-years/articleshow/98247038.cms
[23] Khurram Husain, "Pakistan and the IMF: The ties that bind," *Dawn.com*, January 11, 2015, https://www.dawn.com/news/1155958.
[24] Uddin, Fasih. *Pakistan under IMF Shadow*. IPS Press, 2016.
[25] Ali, Murad. *The Politics of US Aid to Pakistan: Aid Allocation and Delivery from Truman to Trump*, (Routledge, 2019).
[26] Armytage, Rosita. *Big Capital in an Unequal World: The Micropolitics of Wealth in Pakistan*, (Berghahn Books, 2023).
[27] Abbas Nasir, "It's the elite capture, stupid," *Dawn.com,* July 3, 2022, https://www.dawn.com/news/1697955.

Hence, the tussle between the government in Islamabad, which has to respond to an agitated electorate, and IMF officials who want to impose strict conditionalities, remains a perpetual point of contention in economic policy-making. Despite the serious political and policy repercussions of these competing tendencies in economic policy-making in Pakistan, academic literature on this topic is scarce. The next section examines a case study of IMF-Pakistan relations (2018-2023) to understand how these dynamics play out in the real world.

Pakistan's Polity (2018-2023): An Overview

Pakistan held general elections on 25th July 2018, where Imran Khan's Pakistan Tehreek-e-Insaaf (PTI) emerged as the frontrunner. The ex-cricketer who became a politician, Khan, established his reputation as a crusader against corruption, challenging the two dominant parties: the Pakistan People's Party (PPP) and the Pakistan Muslim League (PML).[28] He stayed in opposition for 22 years until his party won the 2018 elections; he emphasized the economic mismanagement and criticized the IMF-led policies of the incumbent governments, famously stating at a public meeting that he would "rather commit suicide than ask the IMF for a loan."[29,30]

Khan's critics claimed his rise to power was orchestrated by the military, which wanted to weaken the existing political parties.[31] Upon assuming office, the PTI-led government initiated a crackdown against political opponents, journalists, and human rights defenders, signaling its intent to curb freedom of expression.[32] On the other hand, the new government faced a massive financial crisis caused by the previous government, one that limited its space to maneuver on the economic front.

[28] Christina Goldbaum, "The Rise, and Fall, and Rise Again of Imran Khan," *The New York Times*, February 11, 2024, https://www.nytimes.com/2024/02/11/world/asia/pakistan-imran-khan-social-media-elections.html.
[29] Rameez Khan, "PM should honour his words and commit suicide: Sharif," *The Express Tribune*, September 22, 2021, https://tribune.com.pk/story/2321309/pm-should-honour-his-words-and-commit-suicide-sharif.
[30] Darjan 13. *Imran Khan: From Cricket to Political Leader*, (Independently published, 2023).
[31] Jan, Ammar Ali. *Rule by Fear: Eight Theses on Authoritarianism in Pakistan*. (Lahore, Folio Books, 2022).
[32] Gul Bukhari, "Imran Khan and the military: Allies today, foes tomorrow?," *Al Jazeera*, August 8, 2018, https://www.aljazeera.com/opinions/2018/8/8/imran-khan-and-the-military-allies-today-foes-tomorrow.

Despite reaching a deal with the IMF on an Extended Fund Facility (EFF) in 2019 (more details in the following section), the country witnessed unprecedented inflation, unemployment, and a decline in real wages. The exorbitant rise in petrol prices, which went from Rs. 90 per liter in 2018 to Rs. 170 per liter (almost a 90 percent increase) in 2022, was reflective of the inflation that was affecting the masses. The result was mass protests by workers, farmers, students, and other sections of society against the deteriorating economic situation.[33] There were also clear signs of electoral repercussions of the economic crisis as the Khan government lost a number of key elections, signaling the declining support for his government.[34]

In April 2022, PTI's government was dismissed after Khan lost a no-confidence vote in the parliament. His supporters accused the opposition of orchestrating Khan's removal with the covert support of the military and the US. The new government, led by the Pakistan Muslim League, was now faced with dual challenges: jump-starting a struggling economy and dealing with Khan, who began mobilizing his support base in massive demonstrations against the new government.

To make matters worse, inflation increased exponentially in 2022, hitting almost 40 percent on consumer items. The floods in August 2022, one of the greatest environmental disasters in Pakistan's history, cost Pakistan approximately $30 billion and compounded the country's economic crisis.[35] The result was that prices of petrol, food, and energy rose exponentially in a continued assault on the incomes of working people. The worst crisis appeared in July and August of 2022, when unprecedented electricity prices imposed by the IMF led to mass protests by citizens, quickly eroding the legitimacy of the new government. In the same month, by-elections were held on twenty seats across the province of Punjab. The PML, which had a large number of seats in by-elections during Khan's government, won only 3 seats, while the PTI was able to win 15 seats as it rode the wave of public anger against the new government.[36]

---

[33] Shah Meer Baloch, "'Imran Khan is crushing the poor': anger rises as inflation grips Pakistan," *The Guardian*, November 9, 2021. https://www.theguardian.com/world/2021/nov/09/imran-khan-is-crushing-the-poor-anger-rises-as-inflation-grips-pakistan.
[34] Imran Sadiq, "PML-N's Nosheen Iftikhar defeats PTI candidate to win Daska re-election," *Dawn.com*, April 10, 2021. https://www.dawn.com/news/1617450.
[35] Ammar Ali Jan, "The Floods Devastating Pakistan Are More Than a Natural Disaster," *Jacobin*, March 9, 2022. https://jacobin.com/2022/09/floods-pakistan-natural-disaster-global-south-climate-crisis.
[36] Christina Goldbaum, "The Rise, and Fall, and Rise Again of Imran Khan," *The New York Times*, February 11, 2024.

In all subsequent by-elections, the PTI handed defeats to the PML. This was an incredible reversal for a party that seemed to have lost public support. As a result, the PML, under pressure from the IMF for more austerity, delayed elections as it feared more public anger over the "tough" economic decisions it was taking. Eventually, the elections were delayed for 6 months and only occurred with Khan and his team in jail, unable to campaign for the PTI.

IMF and PTI Government (2018-2022)

A number of economists have argued that the field of economics often leaves out the real social and political events that shape it.[37] Governments cannot be beholden only to the markets, but they also have to respond to public pressures. This includes the pressure from the electorate/citizens who must be satisfied by the rulers to build legitimacy for the government.[38] Political parties can retain voters if their party imposes unpopular economic decisions on the public. In worst scenarios, economic discontent can also boil over into mass upheavals, as witnessed during the Arab Spring.[39] For countries facing a debt trap, this issue becomes even more challenging as they cannot ignore the conditionalities imposed by the IMF.[40] Relying primarily on media reports, the next two sections will show the tension between economic theory and material realities playing out in the real policy-making world.

The PTI arrived in power with a promise to "break the begging bowl", end corruption, and rebuild the country's sovereignty. Khan appointed Asad Umar, a former corporate executive who opposed austerity, as the new finance minister. Immediately after assuming office, he declared that Pakistan was in a dire situation, but the country did not need a new IMF program.[41] Instead, he embarked upon global diplomacy to seek financial support from friendly countries as well as cut the cost of the government.

https://www.nytimes.com/2024/02/11/world/asia/pakistan-imran-khan-social-media-elections.html.

[37] Komlos, John. *Foundation of Real-World Economics: What Every Economic Student Needs to Know*, (Routledge, London, 2023).

[38] Caplan, Bryan. *The Myth of The Rational Voter: Why Democracies Choose Bad Politics,* (Princeton University Press, Princeton, 2011).

[39] Talani, Leila. *The Arab Spring in the Global Political Economy,* (Palgrave Macmillan, London, 2014).

[40] Hickle, Jason. *The Divide: Global Inequality from Conquest to Free Market,* (W.W. Norton & Company, New York, 2018).

[41] Press Trust of India, "Looking for alternative option, not IMF for $8 bn bailout package: Pak FM," *Business Standard*, May 11, 2024. https://www.business-standard.com/article/international/looking-for-alternative-option-not-imf-for-8-bn-bailout-package-pak-fm-119011200444_1.html.

However, the policy failed as friendly countries refused to bail out Pakistan without prior support from the IMF. On the other hand, the negotiations with the IMF kept failing as the agency demanded "reforms" that included privatization, budget cuts, and deregulation of prices of a number of commodities, including those in the energy sector. The tussle between Umar and the IMF continued from September 2018 to May 2019, when the budget was due. By this time, the country's finances were on the brink as the export bill continued to mount in the face of declining imports and a depreciating rupee.[42]

In an abrupt shift, Prime Minister Imran Khan, who had earlier vowed to reject foreign pressure, removed his finance minister under IMF pressure and installed Hafeez Sheikh, a former World Bank employee considered close to the IMF.[43] Ironically, Sheikh was also the finance minister during the previous government, whom Imran Khan had called corrupt and incompetent. The newly appointed finance minister secured an Extended Fund Facility agreement with the IMF, valued at $6.5 billion, to be disbursed over the coming three years, with the IMF conducting routine reviews of reform progress.[44] Khan's spectacular reversal earned him the title "U-turn Khan," an allusion to his propensity to change position on key policies.[45]

The changes did not end here. The PTI government was also forced to import Reza Baqir, a former IMF employee, as the new head of the State Bank of Pakistan, the country's powerful central bank. More brazenly, the government passed a bill in the assembly that provided unprecedented autonomy to the State Bank of Pakistan, a move that the opposition described as a financial coup. Sheikh led a policy of austerity with severe cuts to the education sector, while also increasing energy prices.[46] Social discontent simmered with sporadic protests led by teachers, students, farmers, and trade unions against budget cuts and price hikes.

---

[42] Lalwani, Sameer. "Pakistan in 2019: Navigating Major Power Relations amid Economic Crisis." *Asian Survey* 60, no. 1 (2020): 177-88.
[43] Farhan Bukhari and Stephanie Findley, "Pakistan Finance minister resigns over IMF deal criticism", April 18, 2019. https://www.ft.com/content/6156ee8e-61e7-11e9-a27a-fdd51850994c.
[44] Reuters Staff, "Pakistan reaches accord with IMF on $6 billion bailout," *Reuters*, May 13, 2019. https://www.reuters.com/article/idUSKCN1SI0HT/
[45] Ammar Ali Jan, "A year of reversals," *The News International*, August 20, 2019. https://www.thenews.com.pk/print/514551-a-year-of-reversals.
[46] Asif Shahzad, "Pakistan passes IMF-backed law for central bank autonomy," *Reuters*, January 28, 2022. https://www.reuters.com/markets/rates-bonds/pakistan-passes-imf-backed-law-give-central-bank-greater-autonomy-2022-01-28/.

The COVID-19 pandemic has further decelerated economic growth and intensified unemployment and financial uncertainty. In 2021, indications of economic recovery emerged, partly due to the IMF relaxing conditionalities amidst COVID-19, yet the government faced significant political pressure. The party lost a number of bypolls, including a high-stakes election in Daska.[47] Moreover, it was widely reported that the opposition was planning to submit a no-confidence vote against Imran Khan in the parliament on the pretext that he had failed to stem the rising tide of inflation and unemployment. To make matters worse, Pakistan had only received 2 tranches of the $6 billion promised by the IMF, with the final tranche of $2 billion contingent on further austerity measures.[48]

Khan had to make a choice. Either he could continue taking dictations from the IMF and further erode his chances of electability as the country entered the election cycle, or he could reverse the austerity policy, increase social spending, and risk a breakdown of negotiations with the IMF. Eventually, he chose the latter, and as a result, he removed the IMF's favored Hafeez Sheikh as the finance minister and replaced him with Shaukat Tarin, a senior member of the PTI.[49] In another abrupt reversal, Tarin implemented a new plan for massive social spending as reflected in the expansionary budget presented in 2021, including an increase in spending on health and housing, as well as increasing wages for government employees.[50]

The pressure from the IMF, however, forced the government to present a "mini-budget" in January 2022, which again led to price hikes and "fiscal discipline".[51] This policy was also short-lived as the opposition announced a "Long March" against inflation with the explicit aim of removing the government and introducing the no-confidence

[47] Imran Sadiq, "PML-N's Nosheen Iftikhar defeats PTI candidate to win Daska re-election," *Dawn.com*, April 10, 2021. https://www.dawn.com/news/1617450.
[48] Adnan Aamir, "Pakistan's deal with IMF clouded as Khan faces confidence," *Nikkei Asia*, March 5, 2021. votehttps://asia.nikkei.com/Politics/Pakistan-s-deal-with-IMF-clouded-as-Khan-faces-confidence-vote.
[49] Press Trust of India, "Imran Khan appoints Shaukat Tareen as new FM in cabinet reshuffle," *Business Standard*, April 17, 2021. https://www.business-standard.com/article/international/imran-khan-appoints-shaukat-tareen-as-new-fm-in-cabinet-reshuffle-121041600770_1.html.
[50] Khaleeq Kiani, "Budget 2021-22: Govt on spending spree with third budget," *Dawn.com*, June 12, 2021. https://www.dawn.com/news/1628911.
[51] News Desk, "Govt bulldozes mini-budget, SBP bill through NA amid opposition's protest," *The Express Tribune*, January 13, 2022. https://tribune.com.pk/story/2338552/govt-bulldozes-mini-budget-sbp-bill-through-na-amid-oppositions-protest.

vote in the parliament.[52] As a response, Khan's government announced a Rs. 10 per liter decrease in petroleum prices at a time when petrol prices began rising sharply in the aftermath of the Russia-Ukraine War.[53] The IMF declared that it was unfeasible for Pakistan to provide petroleum subsidies as it faced dwindling exports and an increasing balance of payments crisis.[54] The government's choice to disregard the IMF's recommendations resulted in a stalemate in the discussions, culminating in the suspension of the scheduled third installment.[55] A month later, Khan was removed in a no-confidence vote, which he blamed on his adversarial stand towards the IMF and the US.[56]

PML Government (2022-2023)

PML President Shahbaz Sharif became the new Prime Minister of Pakistan in April 2022. Once again, he faced the dual challenge of restoring relations with the IMF and ensuring continued support from the electorate in a crucial election year. At the start of his tenure, Sharif appointed Miftah Ismail, a technocrat with a pro-IMF stance, as the country's finance minister. As Ismail entered negotiations with the IMF, the institution demanded stringent measures to restore confidence in the new government. Two measures stood out and had drastic impacts. First, his decision to end petroleum subsidies and hence increase prices, and second, his decision to liberalize the prices of electricity.[57] As a

[52] Rizwan Ghilzai, "Opp to 'protest against inflation' outside parliament on 14th," *The Express Tribune*, January 10, 2022. https://tribune.com.pk/story/2338037/shehbaz-bilawal-discuss-mini-budget-rising-inflation.
[53] Dawn Staff, "PM Imran slashes petrol prices by Rs10, power tariff by Rs5 as part of relief measures for public," *Dawn.com*, February 28, 2022. https://www.dawn.com/news/1677524.
[54] Atlantic Council Experts, "Experts react: Pakistani Prime Minister Imran Khan cuts fuel and electricity prices," *Atlantic Council*, February 28, 2022. "https://www.atlanticcouncil.org/blogs/southasiasource/experts-react-pakistani-prime-minister-imran-khan-cuts-fuel-and-electricity-prices/.
[55] Business Standard Staff, "Imran Khan's subsidies to destroy Pak's economy for next administration," *Business Standard*, March 22, 2022. https://www.business-standard.com/article/international/imran-khan-s-subsidies-to-destroy-pak-s-economy-for-next-administration-122032200105_1.html.
[56] Rhea Mogul and Sophia Saifi, "Imran Khan claims there's a US conspiracy against him. Why do so many Pakistanis believe him?," CNN, May 27, 2022, https://www.cnn.com/2022/05/27/asia/pakistan-imran-khan-us-conspiracy-intl-hnk/index.html.
[57] Khurshid Ahmed, "Pakistani finance minister defends fuel price hike after opposition from major political leaders," *Arab News Pakistan*, August 16, 2022. https://www.arabnews.pk/node/2143851/pakistan.

result, inflation reached 24.9 percent in July 2022,[58] leading to protests from citizens against the deteriorating economy.[59]

Yet, these tough decisions facilitated the release of half of the final tranche from the IMF in September, with the other half subjected to further conditionalities from the Pakistan government. This modest achievement was attained at a significant electoral expense. In July 2022, by-elections were held on 20 provincial seats across the province of Punjab. In a dramatic result, Khan-led PTI won 15 out of 20 seats, with the PML winning only three seats. The defeat was so massive that it led to the fall of the PML government in the Punjab, further weakening the federal government led by Sharif.[60]

Despite the breakthrough in negotiations with the IMF, PML leaders argued that the political cost of austerity was too high and that drastic changes needed to be made.[61] As a result, Miftah Ismail was fired from his post after 6 months, with one of the senior members of the PML, Ishaq Dar, replacing him as the finance minister in September 2022. Dar became the 5th person to occupy the finance ministry in four years, facing the same challenge of balancing the demands of the IMF with an angry, punishing electorate.[62]

Dar once again departed from the IMF's playbook by embarking upon an expansionary policy, reducing interest rates, and controlling the exchange rate. These measures led to the cancellation of the review of the EFF by the IMF in November 2022, expressing the widening rift between the two parties.[63] This breakdown of relations between the Pakistan government and the IMF continued for another eight months

---

[58] Price Statistics Team, "Monthly Review on Price Indices," Pakistan Bureau of Statistics, 2022. https://www.pbs.gov.pk/sites/default/files/price_statistics/cpi/CPI_Monthly_Review_July_2022.pdf.

[59] Bilal Hussain, "Business community irked over 'mounting' power prices," *Business Recorder*, August 29, 2023. https://www.brecorder.com/news/40260450.

[60] Dawn Pakistan, "Imran Khan's PTI stuns by winning 15 out of 20 seats in Punjab by-polls," *The Daily Star*, July 18, 2022. https://www.thedailystar.net/news/asia/south-asia/news/imran-khans-pti-stuns-winning-15-out-20-seats-punjab-polls-3073066.

[61] Dawn Staff, "Sanaullah blames inflation for PML-N's defeat to PTI in by-polls," *Dawn.com*, October 17, 2022. https://www.dawn.com/news/1715506.

[62] Abid Hussain, "Ishaq Dar takes oath as Pakistan's new finance minister," *Al Jazeera*, September 28. 2022. https://www.aljazeera.com/news/2022/9/28/ishaq-dar-takes-oath-as-pakistans-new-finance-minister.

[63] Khaleeq Kiani, "IMF blames Dar, Shau-kat Tarin for derailing programme," *Dawn.com*, July 24, 2023. https://www.dawn.com/news/1766395

as inflation devastated the country's economy, prompting Dar to suggest that the IMF was being targeted for geostrategic reasons.[64]

Eventually, Pakistan finally reached a new deal worth $3 billion with the IMF in June 2023.[65] The Short-term Financial Package was agreed upon as the Pakistan government agreed to implement market reforms and substantially increase electricity tariffs. In order to shield themselves from public anger, however, the government signed this agreement four weeks before leaving office, so that the interim government appointed to hold elections would be responsible for administering the tough reforms. In this manner, the PML hoped it would distance itself from some of the harsher measures of the interim government as it moved the country towards elections scheduled for February 2024.

Aftermath: Interim Government and Post-Election Scenario

The Sharif government's tenure ended in August 2023, with the interim "caretaker" government taking charge of the country with Anwar-ul-Haq Kakar as the new prime minister.[66] The primary job of the caretaker government is to ensure elections within 90 days and hand over power to a newly elected government. However, Kakar's government delayed elections for 6 months, ostensibly on a technical issue related to the census. Critics, however, argued that one of the primary reasons for the delay was the implementation of the IMF program that no elected government was willing to undertake.

The benefit of the interim government lay in its independence from public accountability and immunity to public pressures. Consequently, the implementation of the loan conditionalities proceeded with minimal reversals or conflicts with the IMF. For example, it was able to increase the price of energy to unprecedented levels, triggering mass protests across the country.[67] The government remained

[64] PTI, "Pakistan Finance Minister Ishaq Dar blames geopolitics for stalled IMF loan," *Deccan Herald*, June 16, 2023. https://www.deccanherald.com/world/pakistan-finance-minister-ishaq-dar-blames-geopolitics-for-stalled-imf-loan-1228303.html.
[65] Asif Shahzad, "Pakistan clinches last-gasp $3 billion IMF bailout," *Reuters*, July 1, 2023. https://www.reuters.com/world/asia-pacific/pakistan-imf-reach-staff-level-pact-release-stalled-funds-2023-06-30/.
[66] Press Trust of India, "Anwarul Haq Kakar Sworn in As Pakistan's Caretaker Prime Minister," NDTV World, August 14, 2023. https://www.ndtv.com/world-news/anwarul-haq-kakar-sworn-in-as-pakistans-caretaker-prime-minister-4296740.
[67] Dr. Zayar, "Pakistan's IMF-Dictated Electricity Price Hikes Spark Mass Protests," *Janata Weekly*, September 10, 2023. https://janataweekly.org/pakistans-imf-dictated-electricity-price-hikes-spark-mass-protests/.

committed to its policy, as it did not experience the pressure of competing in elections.

Similarly, the interim government kept the Central Bank's policy rate at 22 percent, slowing down business activity and causing an increase in unemployment.[68] These policies were in complete contrast to the expansionary policies often pursued by elected governments that fear public backlash. In January 2024, one month before the scheduled elections, the IMF expressed satisfaction with the progress made by the interim government.[69] This was in contrast to the simmering discontent among the masses, with inflation, unemployment, and poverty reaching unbearable levels.[70]

The elections of 2024 were marred not only by delays but also by increasing political polarization and claims of rigging by the PTI. Imran Khan was arrested in August 2023 on charges of corruption and mutiny, while hundreds of PTI workers were arrested for attacking government installations during riots that took place on May 9th, 2023.[71] Journalists and civil society members also claimed extreme pressure while reporting on election activity, raising concerns on whether the elections will be free and fair.[72] Finally, in January 2024, the Election Commission of Pakistan and the Supreme Court denied PTI an electoral symbol, a move widely believed to be targeted at influencing the outcome of the elections.[73]

The general elections took place on the 8th of February with the PML emerging as the largest party, eventually forming a coalition government with other parties.[74] PTI alleged widespread rigging and

[68] Amjad Ali Shah, "Business community demands cut in interest rates," *Business Recorder*, January 21, 2024, https://www.brecorder.com/news/40284830
[69] Shakeel Ahmed, "IMF 'satisfied' with Pakistan's significant progress in economic goals," Samaa, March 14, 2024. https://www.samaa.tv/2087311326-imf-satisfied-with-pakistan-s-significant-progress-in-economic-goals.
[70] Kunwar Khuldune Shahid, "Pakistan's Fatal Electricity Bills," *The Diplomat*, September 27, 2023. https://thediplomat.com/2023/09/pakistans-fatal-electricity-bills/.
[71] Imran Khan, "Pakistan's Imran Khan arrested after court convicts him," *Al Jazeera*, August 5, 2023, https://www.aljazeera.com/gallery/2023/8/5/photos-pakistans-imran-khan-arrested-after-court-convicts-him.
[72] International Crisis Group. "Pakistan: Inching toward Contested Elections." International Crisis Group, 2024. https://www.jstor.org/stable/resrep57951.
[73] Al Jazeera Staff, "Pakistan ex-PM's party loses election symbol. Will it hurt its prospects?," *Al Jazeera*, January 23, 2024. https://www.aljazeera.com/news/2024/1/23/pakistan-ex-pms-party-loses-election-symbol-will-it-hurt-its-prospects
[74] Alexandra Sharp, "Pakistan's PMLN Forms Governing Coalition," *Foreign Policy*, February 14, 2024, https://foreignpolicy.com/2024/02/14/pakistan-election-results-coalition-sharif-khan-pmln/.

claimed that the election results had been changed after the initial count.[75] The protests against the alleged rigging initiated by the PTI once again threatened to derail the fragile political system as the new government crackdown upon the protestors. Political instability continues to haunt the system as the two sides still refuse to negotiate a political settlement.[76]

In March 2024, the Pakistani government appointed Muhammad Aurangzeb as the country's new finance minister. Aurangzeb was a banker who served as the head of the Habib Bank and did not belong to any political party. His induction into the finance ministry as a technocrat was once again an indication that the government was prepared to implement "tough economic reforms" i.e. administer austerity on the public. This belief was cemented by the minister's statement in which he proclaimed, "It is not the business of the government to be in business."[77]

The elevation of Aurangzeb to the post of finance minister coincided with the IMF releasing the final tranche of $1.1 billion to the government and praising the advances made by Pakistan since August 2023.[78] In an overtly political report, the IMF blamed Ishaq Dar and Shaukat Tarin, the finance ministers of the PML and the PTI who pushed expansionary policies, as responsible for the earlier breakdown of negotiations.[79] Moreover, negotiations have resumed for a new bailout package that the Pakistan government hopes would be much "larger and

[75] Shah Meer Baloch, "Senior Pakistan official admits election rigging as protests grip country," *The Guardian*, February 17, 2024. https://www.theguardian.com/world/2024/feb/17/senior-pakistan-official-admits-election-rigging-as-protests-grip-country.
[76] Abid Hussain, "Pakistan's election chaos casts shadow on next IMF deal," *Al Jazeera*, February 23, 2024. https://www.aljazeera.com/news/2024/2/23/pakistans-election-chaos-casts-shadow-on-next-imf-deal.
[77] Naimat Khan, "Major Pakistan coalition partner opposes privatization of national airline ahead of IMF talks," *Arab News Pakistan*, May 6, 2024. https://www.arabnews.pk/node/2505706/pakistan.
[78] Ariba Shahid and Asif Shahzad, "IMF says it reaches a staff level agreement with Pakistan to disburse $1.1 billion," *Reuters*, March 20, 2024. https://www.reuters.com/world/asia-pacific/pakistan-imf-conclude-final-review-11-bln-disbursement-sources-say-2024-03-20/.
[79] IMF Staff, "Request for A Stand-By Arrangement – Press Release; Staff Report; Staff Statement; And Statement by The Executive Director For Pakistan," *IMF*, Country Report No. 23/260, July 18, 2023. https://www.imf.org/en/Publications/CR/Issues/2023/07/17/Pakistan-Request-for-a-Stand-by-Arrangement-Press-Release-Staff-Report-Staff-Statement-and-536494.

longer" than the previous ones.[80] In fact, Aurangzeb was in Washington DC in April 2024 to negotiate another IMF bailout with the country's foreign exchange reserves falling to dangerously low levels. Unfortunately, the country of 240 million people is set for more turbulent times of economic volatility in the midst of an ongoing political crisis.

Conclusion

This paper has demonstrated the dynamic relationship between public pressures, IMF demands, and economic policy. Indebted developing countries often grapple with the ongoing tension of addressing their impoverished citizens' needs while adhering to the conditions set by technocrats in the Global North through international financial institutions. This tension influences both domestic politics and economics; austerity measures may result in diminished electoral support for political parties, whereas expansionary policies could cause disagreements with the IMF.

The finance ministry often becomes the most critical site for the expression of these contradictions. The paper shows how appointments in the foreign ministry in Pakistan (2018-2013) reflected the balancing act between public pressure and IMF demands. Governments bring technocrats who follow orders of the IMF in implementing austerity measures when the balance of payment crisis exacerbates. Conversely, when their electoral chances begin to fade, they promote political appointees to the position of finance minister, with the hope that expansionary policies will reverse their waning political success.

All these decisions are made in the context of an elite capture of the state and its resources. The refusal to question the massive subsidies available to the elites shapes the background in which it becomes necessary to acquire loans from international financial institutions.[81] In other words, there remains an intimate relationship between power, politics, and economic policy. An analysis of economic policy can benefit significantly from looking at the dynamic interaction between financial and electoral pressures, allowing for a more nuanced understanding of both politics and economics in Pakistan.

---

[80] Saima Shabbir, "Pakistan wants 'larger, longer' IMF bailout, PIA privatization by early July – FinMin," Arab News, May 6, 2024. https://www.arabnews.com/node/2505431/pakistan.

[81] Zaidi, S. Akbar. "A Failed State or Failure of Pakistan's Elite?" *Economic and Political Weekly* 43, no. 28 (2008): 10-11.

Bibliography

Aamir, Adnan. "Pakistan's deal with IMF clouded as Khan faces confidence," Nikkei Asia, March 5, 2021. https://asia.nikkei.com/Politics/Pakistan-s-deal-with-IMF-clouded-as-Khan-faces-confidence-vote.

Ahmed, Khurshid. "Pakistani finance minister defends fuel price hike after opposition from major political leaders," *Arab News Pakistan*, August 16, 2022. https://www.arabnews.pk/node/2143851/pakistan.

Ahmed, Shakeel. "IMF 'satisfied' with Pakistan's significant progress in economic goals," Samaa, March 14, 2024. https://www.samaa.tv/2087311326-imf-satisfied-with-pakistan-s-significant-progress-in-economic-goals.

Ali, Murad. *The Politics of US Aid to Pakistan: Aid Allocation and Delivery from Truman to Trump*, (Routledge, 2019).

Al Jazeera Staff, "Pervez Musharraf: The Pakistani ex-president's chequered legacy," *Al Jazeera*, February 5, 2023. https://www.aljazeera.com/news/2023/2/5/obituary-pakistans-former-president-pervez-musharraf-dies.

Al Jazeera Staff, "Pakistan ex-PM's party loses election symbol. Will it hurt its prospects?," *Al Jazeera*, January 23, 2024. https://www.aljazeera.com/news/2024/1/23/pakistan-ex-pms-party-loses-election-symbol-will-it-hurt-its-prospects.

Alavi, Hamza. "Bangladesh and the Crises of Pakistan," *Socialist Register*, Vol.8, (March 1971): 289-317.

Armytage, Rosita. *Big Capital in an Unequal World: The Micropolitics of Wealth in Pakistan*, (Berghahn Books, 2023).

Atlantic Council Experts, "Experts react: Pakistani Prime Minister Imran Khan cuts fuel and electricity prices," *Atlantic Council*, February 28, 2022. https://www.atlanticcouncil.org/blogs/southasiasource/experts-react-pakistani-prime-minister-imran-khan-cuts-fuel-and-electricity-prices/.

Banerjee, Dhruv. "How the Soviet Invasion of Afghanistan Strengthened Pakistan's Military Deep State," *The Diplomat*, January 4,

2024. https://thediplomat.com/2024/01/how-the-soviet-invasion-of-afghanistan-strengthened-pakistans-military-deep-state/.

Baloch, Shah. "'Imran Khan is crushing the poor': anger rises as inflation grips Pakistan," *The Guardian*, November 9, 2021. https://www.theguardian.com/world/2021/nov/09/imran-khan-is-crushing-the-poor-anger-rises-as-inflation-grips-pakistan.

Baloch, Shah. "Senior Pakistan official admits election rigging as protests grip country," *The Guardian*, February 17, 2024. https://www.theguardian.com/world/2024/feb/17/senior-pakistan-official-admits-election-rigging-as-protests-grip-country.

Banerjee, Sanjoy and Commuri, Gitika. "A Strange and Bittersweet Relationship: Pakistan-United States Relations in the Musharraf Era." *Journal of Asian Security and International Affairs* 1, no. 1 (2014): 41-62.

Bukhari, Farhan and Findley, Stephanie. "Pakistan Finance Minister resigns over IMF deal criticism", *Financial Times*, April 18, 2019. https://www.ft.com/content/6156ee8e-61e7-11e9-a27a-fdd51850994c.

Bukhari, Gul. "Imran Khan and the military: Allies today, foes tomorrow?," *Al Jazeera*, August 8, 2018. https://www.aljazeera.com/opinions/2018/8/8/imran-khan-and-the-military-allies-today-foes-tomorrow.

Burki, Shahid. "Ayub's Fall: A Socio-Economic Explanation," *Asian Survey* 12, no. 3 (1972): 201-12.

Business Standard Staff, "Imran Khan's subsidies to destroy Pak's economy for next administration," *Business Standard*, March 22, 2022. https://www.business-standard.com/article/international/imran-khan-s-subsidies-to-destroy-pak-s-economy-for-next-administration-122032200105_1.html.

Caplan, Bryan. *The Myth of The Rational Voter: Why Democracies Choose Bad Politics,* (Princeton University Press, Princeton, 2011).

Crile, George. *Charlie Wilson's War: The Extraordinary Story of the Largest Covert Operation in History*, (New York: Atlantic Monthly Press, 2003).

Darjan 13. *Imran Khan: From Cricket to Political Leader*. Independently published, 2023.

Daud, M. K., Muhammad Nafees, Shafaqat Ali, Muhammad Rizwan, Raees Ahmad Bajwa, Muhammad Bilal Shakoor, Muhammad Umair Arshad, Shahzad Ali Shahid Chatha, Farah Deeba, Waheed Murad, Ijaz Malook and Shui Jin Zhu, "Drinking Water Quality Status and Contamination in Pakistan," *Biomed Res Int.*, (August 14, 2017): 10.

Dawn Pakistan, "Imran Khan's PTI stuns by winning 15 out of 20 seats in Punjab by-polls," *The Daily Star*, July 18, 2022. https://www.thedailystar.net/news/asia/south-asia/news/imran-khans-pti-stuns-winning-15-out-20-seats-punjab-polls-3073066.

Dawn Staff, "Sanaullah blames inflation for PML-N's defeat to PTI in by-polls," *Dawn.com*, October 17, 2022. https://www.dawn.com/news/1715506.

Dawn Staff, "PM Imran slashes petrol prices by Rs10, power tariff by Rs5 as part of relief measures for public," *Dawn.com*, February 28, 2022. https://www.dawn.com/news/1677524.

Goldbaum, Christina. "The Rise, and Fall, and Rise Again of Imran Khan," *The New York Times*, February 11, 2024. https://www.nytimes.com/2024/02/11/world/asia/pakistan-imran-khan-social-media-elections.html.

Ghilzai, Rizwan. "Opposition to 'protest against inflation' outside parliament on 14th," *The Express Tribune*, January 10, 2022. https://tribune.com.pk/story/2338037/shehbaz-bilawal-discuss-mini-budget-rising-inflation.

Hashim, Asad. "Elite privilege consumes $17.4bn of Pakistan's economy: UNDP", *Al Jazeera*, April 13, 2021. https://www.aljazeera.com/news/2021/4/13/elite-privilege-consumes-17-4bn-of-pakistans-economy-undp.

Hickle, Jason. *The Divide: Global Inequality from Conquest to Free Market,* (W.W. Norton & Company, New York, 2018).

Husain, Ishrat. *Pakistan: The Economy of an Elitist State* (Karachi, Oxford University Press, 1999).

Husain, Khurram. "Pakistan and the IMF: The ties that bind," *Dawn.com*, January 11, 2015. https://www.dawn.com/news/1155958.

Hussain, Bilal. "Business community irked over 'mounting' power prices," *Business Recorder*, August 29, 2023. https://www.brecorder.com/news/40260450.

Hussain, Abid. "Ishaq Dar takes oath as Pakistan's new finance minister," *Al Jazeera*, September 28. 2022. https://www.aljazeera.com/news/2022/9/28/ishaq-dar-takes-oath-as-pakistans-new-finance-minister.

Hussain, Abid. "Pakistan's election chaos casts shadow on next IMF deal," *Al Jazeera*, February 23, 2024. https://www.aljazeera.com/news/2024/2/23/pakistans-election-chaos-casts-shadow-on-next-imf-deal.

Hussain, Akmal. *Pakistan, Institutional Instability and Underdevelopment: State, People and Consciousness*, (Lahore: Folio Books, 2023).

IMF Staff, "Request for A Stand-By Arrangement – Press Release; Staff Report; Staff Statement; And Statement by The Executive Director For Pakistan," IMF, Country Report No. 23/260, July 18, 2023. https://www.imf.org/en/Publications/CR/Issues/2023/07/17/Pakistan-Request-for-a-Stand-by-Arrangement-Press-Release-Staff-Report-Staff-Statement-and-536494.

International Crisis Group. "Pakistan: Inching toward Contested Elections." International Crisis Group, 2024. https://www.jstor.org/stable/resrep57951.

Jabeen, Mussarat and Mazhar, Muhammad. "Security Game: SEATO and CENTO as Instrument of Economic and Military Assistance to Encircle Pakistan," *Pakistan Economic and Social Review* 49, no. 1 (2011): 109–32.

Jan, Ammar. "The Floods Devastating Pakistan Are More Than a Natural Disaster," *Jacobin*, March 9, 2022. https://jacobin.com/2022/09/floods-pakistan-natural-disaster-global-south-climate-crisis.

Jan, Ammar. "A year of reversals," *The News International*, August 20, 2019. https://www.thenews.com.pk/print/514551-a-year-of-reversals.

Jan, Ammar Ali. *Rule by Fear: Eight Theses on Authoritarianism in Pakistan*, (Lahore: Folio Books, 2022).

Javid, Hassan. "Class, Power, and Patronage: The Landed Elite and Politics in Pakistani Punjab," (PhD diss.), The London School of Economics and Political Science, 2012.

Khan, Imran."Pakistan's Imran Khan arrested after court convicts him," *Al Jazeera*, August 5, 2023. https://www.aljazeera.com/gallery/2023/8/5/photos-pakistans-imran-khan-arrested-after-court-convicts-him.

Khan, Naimat. "Major Pakistan coalition partner opposes privatization of national airline ahead of IMF talks," *Arab News Pakistan*, May 6, 2024. https://www.arabnews.pk/node/2505706/pakistan.

Khan, Rameez. "PM should honour his words and commit suicide: Sharif," *The Express Tribune,* September 22, 2021. https://tribune.com.pk/story/2321309/pm-should-honour-his-words-and-commit-suicide-sharif.

Kiani, Khaleeq. "Budget 2021-22: Govt on spending spree with third budget," *Dawn.com*, June 12, 2021. https://www.dawn.com/news/1628911.

Kiani, Khaleeq. "IMF blames Dar, Shaukat Tarin for derailing programme," *Dawn.com*, July 24, 2023. https://www.dawn.com/news/1766395.

Komlos, John. *Foundation of Real-World Economics: What Every Economic Student Needs to Know*, (Routledge, London, 2023).

Lalwani, Sameer. "Pakistan in 2019: Navigating Major Power Relations amid Economic Crisis." *Asian Survey* 60, no. 1 (2020): 177-88.

Mogul, Rhea, and Saifi, Sophia. "Imran Khan claims there's a US conspiracy against him. Why do so many Pakistanis believe him?," CNN, May 27, 2022. https://www.cnn.com/2022/05/27/asia/pakistan-imran-khan-us-conspiracy-intl-hnk/index.html.

Nasir, Abbas. "It's the elite capture, stupid," *Dawn.com*, July 3, 2022. https://www.dawn.com/news/1697955.

News Desk, "Govt bulldozes mini-budget, SBP bill through NA amid opposition's protest," *The Express Tribune*, January 13, 2022.

https://tribune.com.pk/story/2338552/govt-bulldozes-mini-budget-sbp-bill-through-na-amid-oppositions-protest.

Pasha, Hafiz A. "Growth and Inequality in Pakistan: Agenda for Reforms." Friedrich Ebert Stiftung, 2018. https://socialprotection-humanrights.org/resource/growth-and-inequality-in-pakistan-volume-i/.

Press Trust of India, "Looking for alternative option, not IMF for $8 bn bailout package: Pak FM," *Business Standard*, May 11, 2024. https://www.business-standard.com/article/international/looking-for-alternative-option-not-imf-for-8-bn-bailout-package-pak-fm-119011200444_1.html.

Press Trust of India, "Imran Khan appoints Shaukat Tareen as new FM in cabinet reshuffle," *Business Standard*, April 17, 2021. https://www.business-standard.com/article/international/imran-khan-appoints-shaukat-tareen-as-new-fm-in-cabinet-reshuffle-121041600770_1.html.

Press Trust of India, "Pakistan Finance Minister Ishaq Dar blames geopolitics for stalled IMF loan," *Deccan Herald*, June 16, 2023. https://www.deccanherald.com/world/pakistan-finance-minister-ishaq-dar-blames-geopolitics-for-stalled-imf-loan-1228303.html.

Press Trust of India, "Anwarul Haq Kakar Sworn in As Pakistan's Caretaker Prime Minister," NDTV World, August 14, 2023. https://www.ndtv.com/world-news/anwarul-haq-kakar-sworn-in-as-pakistans-caretaker-prime-minister-4296740.

Price Statistics Team, "Monthly Review on Price Indices," Pakistan Bureau of Statistics, 2022, https://www.pbs.gov.pk/sites/default/files/price_statistics/cpi/CPI_Monthly_Review_July_2022.pdf.

Rana, Shahbaz. "Club of 31 families dominate PSX", *Express Tribune*, May 05, 2021. https://tribune.com.pk/story/2298276/club-of-31-families-dominate-psx.

Reuters Staff, "Pakistan reaches accord with IMF on $6 billion bailout," *Reuters*, May 13, 2019. https://www.reuters.com/article/idUSKCN1SI0HT/.

Riaz, Ali. *Bangladesh: A Political History since Independence*, (United Kingdom: Bloomsbury Publishing, 2016).

Sadiq, Imran. "PML-N's Nosheen Iftikhar defeats PTI candidate to win Daska re-election," *Dawn.com*, April 10, 2021. https://www.dawn.com/news/1617450.

Shabbir, Saima. "Pakistan wants 'larger, longer' IMF bailout, PIA privatization by early July – FinMin," *Arab News*, May 6, 2024. https://www.arabnews.com/node/2505431/pakistan.

Shah, Amjad. "Business community demands cut in interest rates," *Business Recorder*, January 21, 2024. https://www.brecorder.com/news/40284830.

Shahid, Ariba and Asif Shahzad, "IMF says it reaches a staff level agreement with Pakistan to disburse $1.1 billion," *Reuters*, March 20, 2024. https://www.reuters.com/world/asia-pacific/pakistan-imf-conclude-final-review-11-bln-disbursement-sources-say-2024-03-20/.

Shahid, Kunwar. "Pakistan's Fatal Electricity Bills," *The Diplomat*, September 27, 2023. https://thediplomat.com/2023/09/pakistans-fatal-electricity-bills/.

Shahzad, Asif. "Pakistan passes IMF-backed law for central bank autonomy," *Reuters*, January 28, 2022. https://www.reuters.com/markets/rates-bonds/pakistan-passes-imf-backed-law-give-central-bank-greater-autonomy-2022-01-28/.

Shahzad, Asif. "Pakistan clinches last-gasp $3 billion IMF bailout," *Reuters*, July 1, 2023. https://www.reuters.com/world/asia-pacific/pakistan-imf-reach-staff-level-pact-release-stalled-funds-2023-06-30/.

Sharp, Alexandra. "Pakistan's PMLN Forms Governing Coalition," *Foreign Policy*, February 14, 2024. https://foreignpolicy.com/2024/02/14/pakistan-election-results-coalition-sharif-khan-pmln/.

Sheeran, Josette. "Shaukat Aziz, From Banking to Politics, Pakistan to the World," *Asia Society*, New York, June 28, 2016. https://asiasociety.org/new-york/events/shaukat-aziz-banking-politics-pakistan-world.

Siddiqa-Agha, Ayesha. *Military Inc: Inside Pakistan's Military Economy*, (London: Pluto Press, 2017).

Siddiqui, Muhammad, Pasha, Mohammad, and Akram, Saira. "The Political Economy of Terrorisms: Economic Cost of War on Terror for Pakistan," *Journal of Development and Social Sciences* 2, no.4 (2021): 297-309.

Talani, Leila. *The Arab Spring in the Global Political Economy,* (Palgrave Macmillan, London, 2014).

The Economic Times Staff, "Tough Love: Pakistan has gone to IMF for bailouts 23 times in 75 years," *The Economic Times*, February 26, 2023. https://economictimes.indiatimes.com/news/international/world-news/tough-love-pak-has-gone-to-imf-for-bailouts-23-times-in-75-years/articleshow/98247038.cms.

Times of India Staff, "Nearly 40% of Pakistan's population now living below poverty line: World Bank," *The Times of India*, September 24, 2023. https://timesofindia.indiatimes.com/world/pakistan/nearly-40-of-pakistans-population-now-living-below-poverty-line-world-bank/articleshow/103886595.cms.

Uddin, Fasih. Pakistan under IMF Shadow. IPS Press, 2016.

Web Desk, "25MLN children out of schools in Pakistan, reveals Education minister," *ARY News*, January 24, 2024. https://arynews.tv/pakistan-25mln-children-out-of-schools-reveals-education-minister/.

Wolpert, Stanley A. *Zulfi Bhutto of Pakistan: His Life and Times*. United Kingdom: Oxford University Press, 1993.

Zaidi, S. Akbar. *Issues in Pakistan's Economy*, (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2000).

Zaidi, S. Akbar. "A Failed State or Failure of Pakistan's Elite?" *Economic and Political Weekly* 43, no. 28 (2008): 10-11.

Zayar, Dr. "Pakistan's IMF-Dictated Electricity Price Hikes Spark Mass Protests," *Janata Weekly*, September 10, 2023. https://janataweekly.org/pakistans-imf-dictated-electricity-price-hikes-spark-mass-protests/.

Politics

The Formation of Charismatic Authority: An Analysis of Julius Caesar and George Washington

Persephone Reeves '25
Friends Academy
New York, United States

Abstract

The concept of charisma has recurred throughout history, particularly since Weber's renowned use in his "Politics as a Vocation" lecture, presented at the University of Munich in 1919. He revived an ancient Greek term to explain why people follow a ruler. Since Weber's time, the term 'charisma' reemerged in 2021 as #rizz, and was later named Oxford's Word of the Year in 2023. However, charisma is an elusive concept to define. This paper navigates the challenges of defining charisma's intangible aspects by analyzing two emblematic charismatic leaders, Julius Caesar and George Washington, focusing on the pivotal moments in their journeys to achieving charismatic stature. It concludes that their dual roles as military commanders and writers were key to their transformation. This study revisits Weber's explicit definition of charisma, anchoring the elusive term to its renaissance, and further explores how revolutionary leaders' use and manipulation of language bolstered their strategies. This played a crucial role not only in their self-creation as charismatic authorities but also in the dynamics of historical processes. It also charts how Washington was directly influenced by Caesar's writings, particularly *The Commentaries on the Gallic War*, and how, despite thirteen centuries separating the two revolutionary leaders, the written word enables transmission across time and place by engaging the imagination. Finally, this paper attempts to address the conundrum at the heart of charisma by positing an ingredient to its attainment.

Introduction

The term 'charisma' has shown a fascinating recurrence throughout history. Originally an ancient Greek word meaning gift of divine grace, it recently manifested in its internet incarnation as #rizz, named Oxford's Word of the Year in 2023.[1] Its recent spike in popular usage to refer to everything from teen drama to the political stage speaks volumes about the zeitgeist and merits analysis as a historical phenomenon.

In *Men on Horseback: The Power of Charisma in the Age of Revolution*, historian David A. Bell proposes that charisma is a factor to assess in understanding historical revolutions.[2] His insight builds upon Max Weber's view of charisma as a "revolutionary force"[3] that transforms values and breaks traditional norms, a disruptor of status quo bonds, to create new arrangements. In the second of his Vocation Lectures,[4] Weber revives the concept of charisma to address the question: why do people obey a ruler? He proposes three grounds for obedience: 1) traditional rule: customs sustained by habit, exemplified by patriarchs and hereditary monarchs; 2) charismatic rule: the authority of an exceptional individual endowed with the "gift of grace," such as prophets; 3) legal rule: authority bestowed by the legitimacy of law and rational rules, as seen in public servants.[5]

Only in the second instance, charisma, is there no reliance on coercion to obey. People willingly obey a charismatic leader because they believe in him.[6] Weber makes a basic distinction: the charismatic leader is answering an "inner calling to lead,"[7] remindful of spiritual leaders such as Moses. Weber refers to this as a vocation rather than an occupation. The charismatic lives "for" his work as opposed to "from" it.[8] He "organizes his life around it" and makes it his life's work, deriving meaning from it, instead of simply earning income. The charismatic has passion, a sense of responsibility, and a clarity of vision.[9]

---

[1] Nanji, Noor. "Rizz named word of the year 2023 by Oxford University Press." BBC, December 3, 2023.
[2] Bell, David A. *Men on Horseback: The Power of Charisma in the Age of Revolution.* Farrar, Straus and Giroux, 2020.
[3] Weber, Max. *Economy and Society: An Outline of Interpretive Sociology.* edited by Guenther Roth and Claus Wittich, trans by Ephraim Fischoff, vol. 1, Berkeley: University of California Press (1978): 244.
[4] Weber. *The Politicians Work*, 47.
[5] Ibid., 47-8.
[6] I use he/him to also include she/her.
[7] Weber. *The Politicians Work*, 48.
[8] Ibid., 55.
[9] Ibid., 95.

Weber further elaborates: "[Charisma is a] certain quality of an individual personality, by virtue of which he is set apart from ordinary men and treated as endowed with supernatural, superhuman, or at least specifically exceptional powers or qualities. These are such as are not accessible to the ordinary person but are regarded as of divine origin or as exemplary, and on the basis of them the individual concerned is treated as a leader."[10]

As David Bell suggests, "Charisma can illuminate the history of political leadership in the age of revolution"[11] – through its manifestation in specific charismatic figures during a particular time and place. Likewise, this paper explores two iconically charismatic figures, Julius Caesar and George Washington, and how they coincide with Weber's definition, homing in specifically on factors that set them apart from other leaders, as well as the striking similarities between each other. Though they lived thirteen centuries apart, both were pivotal in transitioning their nations from an old guard to the new in unprecedented ways.

Both Caesar and Washington are such prodigious figures, cushioned by centuries of myth, legend, and questionable historical data. Their accomplishments were far-ranging and legion, but there are transitional points in their careers, i.e., the joints, that may reveal the key to their dramatic rise to iconic status. In his article, "Julius Caesar: Politician or Statesman?"[12] Kayser makes a useful distinction that echoes Weber's between occupation and vocation: "Let us say a politician is one who strives for place, for the sake of place: a statesman one who uses place for the attainment of constructive ends."[13]

Kayser determines that the point of transition coincided "with Caesar's departure for the command of Gaul"[14] in 58 BC. According to Plutarch, "after this, he [Caesar] seems to begin his course afresh and enter upon a new life and scene of action."[15] During this hiatus as commander of the Roman army, Caesar wrote his masterpiece, *Commentaries on the Gallic War*, covering operations in Gaul from 52-58 BC. It is this conflation of military leader and author that consolidated his knowledge into mastery, marking the upward trajectory to

[10] Weber, *Theory of Social and Economic Organization*.
[11] Bell, *Men on Horseback, 240*.
[12] Kayser, Elmer Louis. "Julius Caesar: Politician or Statesman?" *The Classical Weekly* 50, no. 2 (1956): 20–22. https://doi.org/10.2307/4343856.
[13] Ibid., 20
[14] Ibid.
[15] Plutarch. *Lives: Volume III*. trans by George Long and Aubrey Stewart. East India Publishing Company, 2021: Caes. 15.

charismatic authority. It also served as inspiration and a model for future leaders, such as George Washington, who similarly took on dual roles, elevating him to comparable heights of hero worship and establishing him as an enduring cultural icon.

Weber specifically addresses the demagogue's reliance on words, such as Pericles' orations in antiquity, and its shift to the printed word in his day, "particularly those by political writers and more especially *journalists.*"[16] The written word, particularly during wartime, was invaluable: it facilitated communication with allies; maintained control of politics at the Capitol; and perhaps most critically of all, enabled secret intelligence operations that changed irreversibly the fate of the world. Through writing, whether first-hand narratives from the battlefront or encoded ciphers in intelligence strategy, Caesar and then Washington, in emulation, were able to manipulate perception and outwit their enemies, while organizing their experience not only for their own mental processing but ultimately for posterity. Both writers and soldiers, ruled by a singular vision, Caesar and Washington excelled as few men in profoundly understanding and utilizing in tandem pen and sword in conquering and consolidating.

Julius Caesar

Pen Mightier than the Sword?

According to Pliny the Elder, Julius Caesar was Rome's greatest general, unsurpassed in his military victories. (NH 7.92). But more spectacularly, Pliny continues: "We have been told that he (Caesar) was accustomed to write or read and dictate or listen simultaneously, and to dictate to his secretaries four letters at once on important affairs or, if he was doing nothing else, seven letters at once" (7.91). Plutarch further recounts episodes of Caesar, carried on a seat, dictating to a slave while another stood behind him with a sword (Caes. 17.3),[17] while Oppius, a close friend and confidante, claims that Caesar was able to dictate letters on horseback, requiring two secretaries to keep up.[18] There is a consensus about Caesar's enormous capacity for verbal output, whether letters or his extant classics, *The Civil War* and the *Commentaries on the Gallic War*, a ten-volume compendium recounting his experiences on the battlefield. The Roman historian, Suetonius, knew of Caesar's other

[16] Weber. *The Politicians Work*, 70; italics are my own.
[17] Plutarch, Caes. 17.4.
[18] Osgood, Josiah. "The Pen and the Sword: Writing and Conquest in Caesar's Gaul." *Classical Antiquity* 28, no. 2 (2009): 329.

writings, such as poems, speeches, and even a tragedy, *Oedipus*, which have not survived.[19]

Fragments of his lost book, *On Analogy*, indicate Caesar's painstaking study of language in line with "pure Latinity,"[20] a literary style with "a certain degree of elegance and subtlety," which Caesar espoused. Its pronunciation signaled "an elite Roman *urbanitas*, just as Attic pronunciation set it off from the usage of the rest of Greece."[21] Erudite and sophisticated, adherents of Latinity were designated as Atticists[22] as it harkened back to Hellenism and may be regarded as an appropriation of an elevated cultural tradition.

Hellenic style, in turn, derived from the Stoic doctrine that thought and language were separate manifestations of one mental attitude. Correctness of speech reflected accuracy of thought. Not surprisingly, considering his military precision, Caesar was considered an Atticist in his literary efforts, almost to an extreme: "The characteristic feature of his Latinity is a painstaking correctness or elegance in accordance with a much severer norm of idiomatic purity than Cicero anywhere reveals."[23] This stark stylistic foundation was the cornerstone of Caesar's *The Civil War* and *Commentaries on the Gallic War* as manifested by its seemingly effortless simplicity and conversational style, admired by generations of commentators and scholars. *On Analogy* shows Caesar's competitive drive within the literary arena as he sparred with Cicero, who in *De Oratore* devalued Latinity as easy to master and only a passing step, not a goal, of excellent rhetoric, which should proceed to embellishment: magnitude, intricacy, and variety.[24] But more critically, *On Analogy*, a polemic, likely brief, indicates a leader with a profound understanding of the power and utility of language. Everything Caesar accomplished bore the stamp of this deep linguistic knowledge, informed by a singularly correct mental attitude, which buttressed his military leadership.

The Written Word as Fixity and Consolidation

Based on the publication date of Cicero's *De Oratore* of 55-54 BC, Caesar likely wrote *On Analogy* in the spring of 54 BC,[25] two years before the end of the Gallic War. As the organization was paramount in a

---

[19] Suetonius, *The Twelve Caesars*. trans. by Robert Graves. Penguin, 2007: 280-330.
[20] Hendrickson, 98.
[21] Ibid., 107.
[22] Ibid., 98.
[23] Ibid., 102.
[24] Ibid., 108.
[25] Ibid., 115.

grand-scale military campaign, the practice of writing likely helped Caesar organize the various moving parts of the operation. In war, when efficiency and clarity were critical, there was little room for Ciceronian embellishment. Clear, correct writing unified his thought processes and reinforced his memory, enabling Caesar to send messages within his own army, maintain his hold on Rome from afar, and keep track of his scattered campaigns against various Gallic tribes. Considering the scenes of Caesar multitasking several letters while on the battlefield, it may be that this frenzied scribomania was more than a voluntary choice; writing may have been a necessity for Caesar in processing and organizing day-to-day affairs, acting like a net that held everything together in Caesar's mind.

Writing was effective against the Gauls, whose culture was oral and who still did not have a tradition of written literature.[26] News propagated through rumors is prone to errors, inconsistencies, and disinformation, making it an unreliable foundation for critical strategic decisions. Written communication safeguarded confidential instructions and intelligence across enemy lines, against traitors and messenger snafus. It also provided a tactical edge, with the potential to boost morale. In a breathtaking account, Caesar describes an episode at the end of 54 BC, during Rome's second invasion of Britain, when Cicero's younger brother, Marcus, who, detained by the Nervii, was able to convince a deserter with the promise of freedom to bear a letter to Caesar. Tying the letter to a javelin, he conveyed it successfully to Caesar, who in turn was able to send a reply that help was on the way.[27]

Caesar recounts how, through written messages, the Romans were able to use Gallic messengers, who could gain access but could not read the intelligence they were carrying. However, the Romans began to use Greek letters, revealing that the Gauls were beginning to decipher Latin or use Roman prisoners to do so. This began to level the playing field, so the Romans resorted to Greek as a coded encryption.[28] As a fascinating byproduct of this linguistic necessity, the Gauls were unwittingly assimilating to Roman culture by learning the language, paving over their own distinctive culture. Caesar is savvy in conveying these imperialist results indirectly through narration, which can in effect be seen as its own type of encryption passed onto future generations as shorthand lessons, among which is the ability of language to conquer and colonize more effectively and subtly than weapons. Again, Caesar deploys his profound knowledge of linguistics and literary theory quietly,

[26] Osgood, 330.
[27] Ibid., 337.
[28] Ibid.

without embellishment, as Cicero espouses, and this unassailable simplicity slips by the censors through the ages, almost guaranteeing its status as a classic.

In light of Caesar's literary skills, it is easy to agree with Josiah Osgood when he concludes that "writing helped to facilitate the Roman conquest of the Gallic peoples."[29] Like the independent, fractious Gallic tribes that Caesar consolidated under Roman rule, his practice of Atticism and its emphasis on austerity and rectitude provided a clearly organized, unifying infrastructure by which his mind processed and integrated the myriad logistics and operations necessitated during war. But on another level, the written word is the true war hero, or more specifically, the war hero's trusty, powerful weapon, which Caesar wields stealthily to his as well as Rome's advantage. On another level, Caesar's narration about Greek encryption also parallels Latinity's debt to Hellenism, which is also a sort of reverse imperialism, riding on the coattails of the more refined artistic, philosophical culture of the Greeks, a badge of status and intellectual elitism. Caesar signals that he is so well-versed not only in his own language but also in that of a higher, more culturally civilized culture of which he is proudly a part. This short passage is rife with commentary on language, writing, imperialism, status, and class.

The Role of Language in Charismatic Authority

Yet the question of charisma remains insufficiently answered, as there were many illustrious and talented writers among Roman politicians. Nor was demagoguery foreign to Caesar. Engaging in the big city politics of Rome taught him the buzz words and phrases that roused the people, along with the mass appeal of extravagant games and ceremonial thanksgiving tributes upon returning to Rome after a military victory. But beyond the obvious machinery, accessible to all politicians of his day, historians have highlighted Caesar's attunement to the times, conscious or not, and his ability to express the psyche of the mid-century Roman. A sensitivity likely related to his rapid adaptation to changing circumstances in war and with words.

Scholars have alluded to a coincidence of historical necessity and his unique temperament and talents as an equation for his extraordinary fame. In other words, "being born in the right place at the right time," which for Caesar was precisely as the Roman Republic had outgrown its mode of government and the old ways, no longer able to accommodate the new circumstances, teetered on collapse. Kayser calls Caesar

[29] Ibid., 328.

"history's agent…if it were necessary for one man to absorb in himself the totality of power in order to transmit to another."[30] Likewise, W.H. Russell of the United States Naval Academy deems Caesar's ten years in Gaul as the turning point in Caesar's career, during which "he learned the trade of generalship by passing slowly through the stages of apprentice, journeyman, and master…or, to use a more formal term, a doctor."[31] Whether "agent" or alchemical vessel, Caesar took in and assimilated all the traditional modes within himself and transformed them through his nimble, calculating mind, putting them to the test during the pressure cooker of war, to become an unquestioned authority.[32] In tandem, his perspective expanded, which may be equivalent to the "clarity of vision" that Weber cited as a defining trait of the charismatic leader. He later elaborates that this vision is connected to detachment. Weber states: "The single most important psychological quality a politician needs is the ability to keep people and things at a certain distance."[33] "What matters are a ruthless, practiced perspective on the realities of life and the ability to deal with these realities and deal with them psychologically."[34]

Realistically, there may not have been anyone else in Rome who would have had the administrative wherewithal on such a large scale, along with the necessary clarity of vision to assume the helm of the emperor, preventing the republic from regressing into a monarchy evocative of the past Etruscan tyranny. In fact, the main challenge, according to Weber, in the emergence of a charismatic leader is that it is rare to encounter a person who possesses both "hot passion and cool clarity of vision."[35] Just as the word charisma resurfaces in the appropriate zeitgeist as if calling for a charismatic, who can assimilate varying threads of tradition, uniting them to form a stable foundation on which to build the new. An intimate knowledge of the written word, as demonstrated above, was an integral ingredient in the process of nation-building. The charismatic treads the middle path, neither as an unmoored progressive nor as a captive to obsolete tradition, but as an artful transformer of one to secure the next.

[30] Kayser, 22.
[31] Russell, W. H. "Caesar, the General." *The Classical Weekly* 50, no. 2 (1956): 16. https://doi.org/10.2307/4343854.
[32] Kayser, 22.
[33] Weber. *The Politicians Work*, 96.
[34] Ibid., 113.
[35] Ibid., 96.

George Washington

Charismatic Process: From Insider to Outsider

Founding Father John Adams remarked that the era he lived in bore a striking resemblance to the late Roman Republic, despite being separated by a millennium and a half. If he changed the names in his Roman history books, "every anecdote" would be "applicable" to his times.[36] Aside from an agrarian economy and slavery,[37] a conspicuous similarity between the two civilizations is the revolutionary nature of the times, which calls forth potentially charismatic figures. Just as Julius Caesar came of age when Rome was transitioning from republic to empire, George Washington was born at a turning point in American history when the young nation was gaining independence from England. The old methods would not work in the new situation, but as with Caesar, the old were not completely obsolete but would serve as a foundation for the new. A figure who could act as an agent for the prodigious process requiring herculean effort and fiery passion, in other words, a charismatic authority, was in order, and George Washington, with his unique circumstances and talents, fit the bill.

In the centuries following Julius Caesar's death, a multitude of works have delved into his character and deeds, cementing a monolithic legend that has proven challenging to contradict. Apart from Caesar's own writings, which are known for their simplicity and suitability for Latin instruction in schools, Shakespeare's tragedy *Julius Caesar*, first staged in 1599, has achieved universality through its dramatic portrayal of the first Roman emperor. Just as a film version of a literary work can overtake the original in the popular imagination, Shakespeare had cemented into Western consciousness the defining scenes of Julius Caesar's life and made infamous his death with the supposed dying words, "*Et tu, Brute?*"[38] Whatever the case, Julius Caesar was already an iconic symbol, and the Founding Fathers, privy to his myth, further instilled by education, naturally compared their situation to the last gasp of the Roman Republic. They identified wholeheartedly with the bygone era as an ideological blueprint for an uncertain future.

Weber contrasts charismatic authority with traditional and hereditary forms of authority.[39] Implicit in the definition is an outsider

---

[36] Karl Baughman and Brook Poston. *Parallel Lives: Romans and the American Founders*. Routledge, London & New York 2023: 2.
[37] Ibid.
[38] Shakespeare, William. *Julius Caesar*. Folger Shakespeare Library.
[39] Weber. *The Politicians Work*, 47.

who has arrived at leadership through unconventional channels. Though Washington was born into landed Virginian aristocracy, the untimely death of his father diverted his path. His two older stepbrothers had received a classical, Latin-based education at Appleby School in England,[40] and Washington was expected to follow in their footsteps. But his father's death when Washington was eleven deprived him of the education typical for boys of his social standing, marking the initial change in the future president's status from an "insider" to an "outsider." The other Founding Fathers, Thomas Jefferson, Alexander Hamilton, and James Madison, were, as expected, educated in the law and the classics.[41] Washington would all his life be keenly ashamed of this lack of formal learning, lamenting privately that he was "conscious of a defective education."

Washington's self-valuation was corroborated by John Adams, who considered him "too illiterate, unlearned, unread for his station."[42] The enduring influence of Adam's estimation may have thwarted a true understanding of Washington's fiery ambition and disciplined pursuit of self-improvement as well as his diverse and wide-ranging erudition. The shame of a "defective education" fueled his ambition, driving him as an autodidact through purposeful reading and writing.[43] Furthermore, his misfortune turned out to be the lucky stroke that led him to study land surveying, which resulted in his first "big break," giving him the chance to prove his courage and prowess in a military mission. These two unconventional factors molded Washington with the right skills as a military man with practical experience to emulate his predecessor, Julius Caesar, as a writer and commander.

Fusion of Word and Deed

In 1753, when Washington was only 21 years old, the French trespassed onto Virginia territory. Due to his training as a land surveyor, Washington was instructed by Virginia Governor Robert Dinwiddie to travel to the Ohio Valley and deliver a letter to the commander of the French forces, Legardeur de Saint-Pierre, warning him to evacuate. Further, Dinwiddie assigned Washington the task of observing French activity and making alliances with the Native Americans.

---

[40] "Education." *George Washington's Mount Vernon.* https://www.mountvernon.org/george-washington/take-note/education/.
[41] "Education." *George Washington's Mount Vernon.*
[42] Ibid.
[43] Longmore. *The Invention of George Washington,* 8.

Much of what we know of Washington's 78-day mission to the French military post derives from Washington's own journals, which he kept daily during the assignment.[44] They comprised an adventurous, sometimes harrowing account, including near-death episodes and clever ruses of the young major's heroism, such as disguising himself as a Native American. On the group's return, the men braved the snow, bitter cold, and freezing rain: "Our horses were now so weak and feeble, and the baggage heavy…therefore, myself and others gave up our horses for packs…" and "…Mr. Gist [a well-known Virginia frontiersman] had all his fingers and some of his toes frozen."[45]

Upon returning to Williamsburg on January 16, 1754, Washington spent the entire next day writing his account from his journal entries made during the mission. Presented to the Virginia Assembly on January 18, the members acted immediately, raising an army of 300 soldiers to drive the French from the English territory.[46] If Washington had been educated as traditionally expected – and not as a surveyor – he would most likely not have been dispatched on his first foray into Ohio, nor the opportunity to produce so historically significant a document, the *Journal of Major George Washington*, which influenced the beginnings of the French and Indian War.

Contrary to John Adams' claims about Washington's lack of erudition, the latter was an avid and diverse reader. By the end of his life, Washington's personal library contained over 1,200 titles.[47] Though not formally educated in the classics, he read them as the Roman classics, which included Caesar's *Commentaries*, which served as an ideological guidebook for the American founders. He learned that Caesar and Marcus Aurelius, both emperors and military men, kept personal journals documenting their campaigns on the field. As Caesar explicitly stated as his objective in *The Commentaries*, namely that Roman readers might "in imagination live through" the difficulties and the heroic deeds of Caesar and his men,[48] these narratives likely impressed young Washington's imagination. The features of Washington's own journals appear to imitate Caesar's writing as a riveting first-hand account of frontier diplomacy, casting himself as a brave, physically vigorous hero, establishing his first notable distinction as a leader. Further in line with Caesar, Washington studied Roman stoicism, which was the underlying

---

[44] Washington, George. *The Journal of Major George Washington (1754).* edited by Paul Royster, University of Nebraska-Lincoln.
[45] Ibid.
[46] "George Washington's Journal." *varsitytutors.com*.
[47] "Library on the Potomac." *George Washington's Mount Vernon*.
[48] Murphy, Paul R. "Themes of Caesar's 'Gallic War.'" *The Classical Journal* 72, no. 3 (1977): 234.

philosophy of Atticism/Latinity. Knowing the rousing power of the printed word, he also used it to encourage his troops. When rations were short and morale was low, he used pamphlets, such as Thomas Paine's *Crisis*, and plays, such as *Cato*, to reignite their spirits.

After the *Journal of Major George Washington* was presented to the Virginia Assembly, it was printed in monograph form and was also published in several newspapers. The issues of the *Maryland Gazette* dated March 21, 1754, and March 28, 1754 contain two instalments of the complete *Journal*.[49] Later that year, in June 1754, the *Journal* was printed in Britain by Thomas Jeffers, an engraver from England's Board of Trade, with a map not included in the Williamsburg printing.[50] Whether Washington had any say in including the map, it is evocative of Caesar's redrawing of the map of Northern Europe in *The Commentaries*, which created a much larger Gaul to be subsumed under Rome, a notion that held after Caesar's death.[51] This visual manipulation may have impressed the young land surveyor. With these first publications, Washington became known both through the US colonies and influential circles in England.

Code, Cipher & Symbol

Despite the progressiveness of the Enlightenment (1750-1820), regarded as the prelude to the American Revolution, the virtues of war, such as honor, sacrifice, and glory, proved to be enduring values.[52] The soldier remained a symbol of valor and physical strength, and Washington was perfect for the part, radiating authority: "he was a head taller than most of his contemporaries and had a powerful physique, erect carriage, piercing eyes, and the profile of a Roman senator."[53] And he looked regal on a horse. A French author wrote in 1789: "When you see a portrait of our most famous Hero, do you feel your chest tremble under your hand? Does your eye grow wet with sweet and precious tears?"[54] Perhaps more than Caesar, Washington's abiding advantage was his physical appearance, which complemented and eventually overtook the influence of his own writing or specific political philosophy. Later, his public symbolism, reinforced by visual images, would overwhelm any personal inclinations, and he "appears in history only as a dignified and

[49] "George Washington's Journal." *varsitytutors.com*
[50] "The Journal of Major George Washington." *George Washington's Mount Vernon.*
[51] Osgood, 353.
[52] Bell. *Men on Horseback, 48.*
[53] Greenstein, Fred I. "Presidential Difference in the Early Republic: The Highly Disparate Leadership Styles of Washington, Adams, and Jefferson." *Presidential Studies Quarterly* 36, no. 3 (2006): 376.
[54] Bell, 49.

colorless figure moving mysteriously in the political background…"[55] a timeless paragon of morality who could not tell a lie as a six-year-old boy, confessing to his father that he had cut down the cherry tree.

Washington's impeccable façade worked well to conceal his extraordinary skills as a spymaster, analogous to Caesar's intelligence stratagems in Gaul. He had already shared in his journals his youthful penchant for disguise, which became more sophisticated and systemized through the Revolutionary War, during which he laid the groundwork for today's complex intelligence networks. He understood that secrecy was of paramount importance, stating: "For upon secrecy, success depends in most enterprises of any kind, and for want of it, they are generally defeated, however well planned and promising a favorable issue."[56] Strict secrecy to camouflage his true capacity and plans was incorporated into his deceptions at the tactical, operational, and strategic levels,[57] and at times, even his own generals were kept unaware until absolutely necessary. After the Revolutionary War, Major George Beckwith, London spymaster in the American colonies, famously admitted: "Washington did not really outfight the British; he simply outspied us!"[58]

Contrary to his virtuous persona, Washington was a master of deception whose ends justified the means. The relative weakness of his Continental Army against British forces necessitated that Washington compensate with his wiles.[59] He avidly spread disinformation, transmitting false messages about military maneuvers and impending assaults on fortifications via the postal system to ensure they were intercepted. Reminiscent of Caesar's virtuoso narrative on espionage against the Gauls, Washington's cunning and natural flair for spy games were in demand for the constant reinvention of codes and ciphers, due to interception by the enemy. This operation included the orchestration of informing entire spy networks, including larger branches such as the Culper Ring and smaller, nimble circles of shopkeepers, farmers, and a laundress sending signals with clothing on laundry lines. Washington's maverick mind extended to the pioneering of innovative novel spy tools, such as invisible ink with the help of John Jay's brother, James Jay, and masked letters, which required the recipient to home in on the true

---

[55] Bradley, Harold W. "The Political Thinking of George Washington." *The Journal of Southern History* 11, no. 4 (1945): 469.
[56] Roberts, Sam. "War of Secrets; Spy History 101: America's Intelligence Quotient." *The New York Times*, Sept. 8, 2002.
[57] Thompson, Edmund R. "GEORGE WASHINGTON: A MASTER AT DECEPTION." *American Intelligence Journal* 12, no. 1 (1991): 7.
[58] Roberts. "War of Secrets; Spy History 101: America's Intelligence Quotient."
[59] Thompson, 7.

message with the placement of a template over the original.[60] Later in the war, he resorted to recruiting double spies, one aptly named John Honeyman, a New Jersey weaver and veteran of the French and Indian War.[61]

Washington's diverse tactics reveal his arsenal of past military strategy gleaned from the written legacy of previous generals, not only Caesar but also guerrilla tactics deployed by Fabius Maximus against Hannibal. Washington's famous crossing of the Delaware River and victorious Christmas-time attack at Trenton, considered a genuine guerrilla attack, were directly inspired by one of his favorite military texts, Frederick the Great's *Instructions for his Generals*.[62] But more consequential was his practical education as a land surveyor in the wilds of Virginia and Pennsylvania, which equipped him with an experiential understanding of geography and real landscapes. The critical victory at Trenton in 1776 reversed the fortunes of the Continental Army, which had suffered a series of demoralizing losses. Washington, an avid fan of staged drama, further exploited the sensational visual impact of a thousand defeated Hessian soldiers marching through Pennsylvania to Philadelphia.[63]

Fusion / Conclusion

Like Caesar before him, Washington was a man of action who complemented his practical experience with extensive reading of lessons left by past generals and leaders since antiquity. Starting with the first expedition to Ohio, the subject of his published *Journals*, he paid his dues as a soldier in the Virginia Militia during the French and Indian Wars. His transformation from a politician to a statesman, or as Weber would say, from occupation to vocation, seems to have taken place during the Revolutionary War. It was then that his extensive knowledge, gained through both reading and experience, was honed by the pressures of the battlefield and the critical consequences for his nation, culminating in his emergence as a charismatic authority.

It is noteworthy that authority, rather than leadership, signifies a degree of unquestionable expertise. This cannot be acquired solely through books and theories but must be tested in reality and integrated into one's persona, beyond the possibility of pretense. But books were

---

[60] "Spy Techniques of the Revolutionary War." *George Washington's Mount Vernon*.
[61] Thompson, 8.
[62] Ibid.
[63] Polack, Peter. "George Washington: The Guerrilla King." *American Intelligence Journal* 36, no. 1 (2019): 170.

equally important in the transformation of George Washington into a charismatic authority, as he required theories and strategies to test, but perhaps most important of all, the inspiration of past charismatic figures such as Julius Caesar who wrote his *Commentaries*, as he stated, to engage the imagination of all who read and would read his book. Both charismatics share this essential quality of imagination. Perhaps due to fathers who had passed away early in their lives,[64] both men searched for inspirational role models through their reading, who, unlike mortal fathers, had no limits in their imagination. Consequently, it is interesting that Washington is dubbed the Father of the United States, and more so that he could have chosen Caesar as his spiritual father. In fact, literary trends during the American Enlightenment encouraged this emotional bond between reader and writer, identifying a unique quality in geniuses called "sensibility" – "a quivering sensitivity in their very nerve endings to the world about them."[65]

Certainly, the role of religion in Weber's theory of charisma is significant. He gives examples of "the two most important kinds of leaders," as magicians and prophets,[66] thereby introducing an irrational quality to the relationship, where the follower is seduced by a potency that transcends tradition or law. Implicitly, the work of the politician or demagogue, whom Weber eventually focuses on, enters the realm of religion. In *Economy and Society*, Weber refers to the mystical Native American Iroquois belief of *orenda,* an "extraordinary invisible power believed by the Iroquois to pervade in varying degrees in all animate and inanimate natural objects as a transmissible spiritual energy capable of being exerted according to the will of its possessor."[67] The concept of *orenda* may shed light on understanding the social, relational dynamics of Weber's charisma.[68] This dynamic operates not only between a leader and immediate followers but also across time, allowing the leader's teachings to be transmitted and passed down. Such transmission can inspire a potential charismatic figure even thirteen centuries later, when the zeitgeist calls for it, through the enduring power of words.

---

[64] Suetonius, *The Twelve Caesars*. Suetonius' chapter on J. Caesar opens with the death of his father when Caesar was still young.
[65] Bell, 42.
[66] Bell, 49.
[67] Hewitt, J.N.B. "*Orenda and a Definition of Religion.*" January-March 1902.
[68] Bragg, Melvyn, 2022. "Charisma." Interview with David Bell, Tom Wright and Linda Woodhead. *In Our Time, BBC Radio 4*, March 17, 2022. Podcast, 53 minutes.

Bibliography

Altman, William H.F. *Brill's Companion to the Reception of Cicero*. Leiden: Brill, 2015.

Andrew, Scottie. "'Rizz': What it means, who has it, and how to find your own." *CNN*, August 2023. https://www.cnn.com/us/rizz-meaning-explained-cec/index.html.

Antonakis, John, Marika Fenkey, and Sue Liechti. "Learning Charisma." *Harvard Business Review*, June 2012. https://hbr.org/2012/06/learning-charisma-2.

Bell, David A. *Men on Horseback: The Power of Charisma in the Age of Revolution.* Farrar, Straus and Giroux, 2020.

Bell, David, interview by author, July 14, 2023.

Bragg, Melvyn, 2022. "Charisma." Interview with David Bell, Tom Wright, and Linda Woodhead. *In Our Time, BBC Radio 4*, March 17, 2022. Podcast, 53 minutes. bbc.co.uk/programmes/m0015b6r.

Brocklehurst, Harrison. "Okay so what does 'rizz' actually mean, and why is everyone on TikTok saying it*?" thetab.com*, Nov 26, 2022. https://thetab.com/uk/2022/12/08/rizz-tiktok-meaning-explained-285136.

Burnett, Andrew. *Coinage in the Roman World.* London: Seaby, 1987.

"Caesar's Gallic War." *Livius.org.* https://www.livius.org/sources/about/caesar-s-gallic-war/.

Caesar, Julius. "De Bello Gallico and Other Commentaries." trans. by W.A. McDevitte. Everyman's Library. https://www.gutenberg.org/cache/epub/10657/pg10657-images.html.

Chernow, Ron. *Washington: A Life*. New York: Penguin Press, 2010.

Crawford, Michael. *Roman Republican Coinage*. Cambridge University Press, 1974.

Decatur, Stephen Jr. *The Private Affairs of George Washington, from the Records and Accounts of Tobias Lear, Esquire, his Secretary.* Boston: Houghton Mifflin Company, 1933.

Desmonde, William. *Magic, Myth and Money: the Origin of Money in Religious Ritual*. The Free Press of Glencoe Inc., 1962.

"Education." *George Washington's Mount Vernon*. https://www.mountvernon.org/george-washington/take-note/education/.

Ellis, Joseph J. *His Excellency George Washington*. Vintage, 2005.

Eustace, Nicole. *Passion is the Gale – Emotion, Power, and the Coming of the American Revolution*. Chapel Hill: University of North Carolina Press, 2008.

Faunt, Raymond J. "George Washington's Application of Denial and Deception Operations Supported by a Multifaceted Mix of Defensive and Offensive Counterintelligence Measures." *American Intelligence Journal* 35, no. 2 (2018): 51–59. https://www.jstor.org/stable/26566565.

Ferguson, Robert A. *The American Enlightenment, 1750–1820*. Harvard University Press, 1994.

Ferling, John. *The First of Men: A Life of George Washington*. Oxford, 2010.

Goldsworthy, Adrian. *Caesar: Life of a Colossus*. Yale University, 2008.

Hay, Robert P. "George Washington: American Moses." *American Quarterly* 21, no. 4 (1969): 780–91. https://doi.org/10.2307/2711609.

Hendrickson, G.L. "The De Analogia of Julius Caesar; Its Occasion, Nature and Date with Additional Fragments." *Classical Philology* 1, no. 2 (1906).

Hewitt J.N.B. "Orenda and a Definition of Religion." *American Anthropologist*, Jan-March 1902. https://anthrosource.onlinelibrary.wiley.com/doi/abs/10.1525/aa.1902.4.1.02a00050.

"Julius Caesar: A Numismatic Revolution in Ancient Roman Coinage." *romancoinbank.com*. https://www.romancoinbank.com/post/julius-caesar-a-numismatic-revolution-in-ancient-roman-coinage.

"George Washington's Journal." *varsitytutors.com*. https://www.varsitytutors.com/earlyamerica/milestone-events/george-washingtons-journal.

Goetzmann, William N. *Money Changes Everything: How Finance Made Civilization Possible*. Princeton University Press, 2016.

Grant, Michael. *Julius Caesar: A Bibliography*. Evans & Co, 1992.

Greenhalgh, Adam. "'Not a Man but a God': The Apotheosis of Gilbert Stuart's Athenaeum Portrait of George Washington." *Winterthur Portfolio* 41, no. 4 (2007): 269–304. https://doi.org/10.1086/523020.

Greenstein, Fred I. "Presidential Difference in the Early Republic: The Highly Disparate Leadership Styles of Washington, Adams, and Jefferson." *Presidential Studies Quarterly* 36, no. 3 (2006): 373–90. http://www.jstor.org/stable/27552236.

Hay, Robert P. "George Washington: American Moses." *American Quarterly* 21, no. 4 (1969): 780–91. https://doi.org/10.2307/2711609.

Hewitt, J.N.B. "*Orenda and a Definition of Religion.*" January-March 1902. https://anthrosource.onlinelibrary.wiley.com/doi/abs/10.1525/aa.1902.4.1.02a00050.

"Journals and Diaries." *encyclopedia.com*. https://www.encyclopedia.com/arts/culture-magazines/journals-and-diaries.

Kahlos, Maijastina. "Charismatic leadership in ancient Rome." *Routledge International Handbook of Charisma*, edited by José Pedro Zúquete, Routledge, 2021, 65-76.

Karl Baughman and Brook Poston. *Parallel Lives: Romans and the American Founders*. Routledge, 2023.

Kayser, Elmer Louis. "Julius Caesar: Politician or Statesman?" *The Classical Weekly* 50, no. 2 (1956): 20–22. https://doi.org/10.2307/4343856.

Labaree, Leonard Woods. Review of *WASHINGTON'S MILITARY LEADERSHIP*, by Douglas Southall Freeman. *The Virginia Quarterly Review* 29, no. 1 (1953): 131–33. http://www.jstor.org/stable/26439558.

Lendering, Jona. "Caesar's Gallic War." *Livius.org*. 1997. https://www.livius.org/sources/about/caesar-s-gallic-war/

Lendering, Jona. "Julius Caesar: Writings." *Livius.org*. 1997. https://www.livius.org/articles/person/caesar/caesar-11.

Lindholm, Charles. *Charisma*. Basil Blackwell Ltd., 1990.

Longmore, Paul K. *The Invention of George Washington*. The University Press of Virginia, 1999.

Machiavelli, Niccolo. *The Prince*. Reader's Library Classics, 2021.

Mazzerella, William. 'Populist Leadership and Charisma." *academia.edu*. https://www.academia.edu/66257195/Populist_Leadership_and_Charisma.

McGreevy, Nora. "How Magazines Helped Shape American History." *Smithsonian Magazine*, February 23, 2021. https://www.smithsonianmag.com/smart-news/how-magazines-shaped-us-history-180977069/.

Meier, Christian. *Caesar: A Bibliography*. Basic Books, 2008.

Melbrod, Cynthia. "A Journey Through Time: History of Journaling." *ccscreativecorner.com*, September 13, 2023. https://www.ccscreativecorner.com/post/a-journey-through-time-history-of-journaling.

Metcalf, William E. *The Oxford Handbook of Greek and Roman Coinage*. New York: Oxford University Press, 2012.

Murphy, Paul R. "Themes of Caesar's 'Gallic War.'" *The Classical Journal* 72, no. 3 (1977): 234–43. http://www.jstor.org/stable/3296899.

"NGC Ancients: Julius Caesar and His Coinage." *ngccoin.com*, April 12, 2016. https://www.ngccoin.com/news/article/5243/NGC-Ancients/.

Nanji, Noor. "Rizz named word of the year 2023 by Oxford University Press." BBC, December 3, 2023. https://www.bbc.com/news/entertainment-arts-67602699.

Osgood, Josiah. "The Pen and the Sword: Writing and Conquest in Caesar's Gaul." *Classical Antiquity* 28, no. 2 (2009): 328–58. https://doi.org/10.1525/ca.2009.28.2.328.

Paul, Heike. *The Myths That Made America: An Introduction to American Studies*. Transcript Verlag, 2014. http://www.jstor.org/stable/j.ctv1wxsdq.

Paul, Heike. "American Independence and the Myth of the Founding Fathers." In *The Myths That Made America: An Introduction to American Studies*, 197–256. Transcript Verlag, 2014. http://www.jstor.org/stable/j.ctv1wxsdq.8.

Plinius, Gaius. *Natural History*. trans. by John F. Healey. Penguin Classics, 1991.

Plutarch. *Lives: Volume III*. trans by George Long and Aubrey Stewart. East India Publishing Company, 2021.

Polack, Peter. "George Washington: The Guerrilla King." *American Intelligence Journal* 36, no. 1 (2019): 167–70. https://www.jstor.org/stable/27066350.

Pucci Ben Zeev, Miriam. "When was the title 'Dictator perpetuus' given to Caesar?" *L'Antiquité Classique*, vol. 65 (1996): 251-253. https://www.persee.fr/doc/antiq_0770-2817_1996_num_65_1_1259.

Richard, Carl. *The Founders and the Classics: Greece, Rome, and the American Enlightenment*. Harvard, 1995.

Richard, Carl. *Greeks and Romans Bearing Gifts: How the Ancients Inspired the Founding Fathers,* Rowman & Littlefield*,* 2009.

Ricks, Thomas E. *First Principles: What America's Founders Learned from the Greeks and Romans and How That Shaped Our Country.* Harper, 2021.

Rieff, Phillip. *Charisma: The Gift of Grace, and How It Has Been Taken Away from Us*. Random House, 2007.

Roberts, Sam. "War of Secrets; Spy History 101: America's Intelligence Quotient." *The New York Times*, Sept. 8, 2002. https://www.nytimes.com/2002/09/08/weekinreview/war-of-secrets-spy-history-101-america-s-intelligence-quotient.html.

Rowan, Clare. *From Caesar to Augustus (c. 49 BC – AD14): using coins as sources*. Cambridge, United Kingdom: Cambridge University Press, 2019.

Russell, W. H. "Caesar, the General." *The Classical Weekly* 50, no. 2 (1956): 17–19. https://doi.org/10.2307/4343854.

Shakespeare, William. *Julius Caesar*. Folger Shakespeare Library. https://www.folger.edu/explore/shakespeares-works/julius-caesar/read/.

Shotter, David. "Gods, Emperors, and Coins." *Greece & Rome*, vol. 26. no.1 (April 1979): 48-57. Cambridge University Press on behalf of The Classical Association. https://www.justor.org/stable/642497.

Stocker, Arthur Frederick. "JULIUS CAESAR AS A POLITICAL LEADER." *The Classical Outlook* 48, no. 2 (1970): 18–20. http://www.jstor.org/stable/43931181.

Suetonius, Gaius Tranquillus. *The Twelve Caesars*. trans. by Robert Graves. Penguin, 2007.

Syme, Ronald. *The Roman Revolution*. Oxford, 2002.
Tappan, Elizabeth. "Julius Caesar's Luck." *The Classical Journal* 27, no. 1 (1931): 3–14. http://www.jstor.org/stable/3290595.

"The Journal of Major George Washington." *George Washington's Mount Vernon*. Mountvernon.org. https://www.mountvernon.org/library/digitalhistory/digital-encyclopedia/article/the-journal-of-major-george-washington/#:~:text=The%20Journal%20of%20Major%20George%20Washington%20is%20of,indications%20of%20Washington%27s%20well-documented%20physical%20vigor%20and%20leadership.

Taylor, Lily Ross. "The Rise of Julius Caesar." *Greece & Rome* 4, no. 1 (1957): 10–18. http://www.jstor.org/stable/641006.

The New Jerusalem Bible. Darton, Longman & Todd Ltd, 1990.

Thompson, Edmund R. "GEORGE WASHINGTON: A MASTER AT DECEPTION." *American Intelligence Journal* 12, no. 1 (1991): 7–10. https://www.jstor.org/stable/44319061.

"Venus: Roman Goddess." *Britannica*. https://www.britannica.com/topic/Venus-goddess.

Washington, George. *The Journal of Major George Washington.* edited by Paul Royster, University of Nebraska-Lincoln, 1754.

Weber, Max. *Charisma and Disenchantment: The Vocation Lectures.* edited by Paul Reitter and Chad Wellmon, New York Review Books, 2020.

Weber, Max. *Economy and Society*. edited and trans. by Keith Tribe. Harvard University Press, 2019.

Weber, Max. *The Protestant Ethic and the Spirit of Capitalism*. edited by Peter Baehr and Gordon C. Wells. Penguin, 2002.

Weisholtz, Drew. "Rizz, jorts, mid and thirst trap – Merriam-Webster's latest definitions are Gen Z approved." *Today*, October 6, 2023. https://www.nbcnewyork.com/entertainment/entertainment-news/rizz-jorts-mid-and-thirst-trap-merriam-websters-latest-definitions-are-gen-z-approved/4746196/.

Wong, Ashley. "Do You Have 'Rizz'? Teen Slang Befuddles Parents—Again.*" The Wall Street Journal*, August 2023. https://www.wsj.com/style/rizz-meaning-teen-slang-3cf8e911.

Wright, Tom F. "Orenda and the Indigenous Roots of Charisma." *Symbiosis Journal*, 2021.

Yavetz, Zvi. "Caesar, Caesarism, and the Historians." *Journal of Contemporary History* 6, no. 2 (1971): 184–201. http://www.jstor.org/stable/259642.

Zadeh, Joe. "The Secret History and the Strange Future of Charisma." *Noema*, May 2023. https://www.noemamag.com/the-secret-history-and-strange-future-of-charisma/.