Summaries of the CAC, Advisory Panel and Working Group Meetings (in chronological order)

Anastasia Gordon, Clean Energy Policy Fellow, ACE NY

November 2020

Climate Action Council – Tuesday, November 24, 2020

The Climate Action Council (CAC), tasked with developing a Scoping Plan to implement the NY climate law, held its fifth meeting on November 24. The main purpose of the meeting was to hear progress reports from several Advisory Panels as well as have key discussions on the Waste Panel and bioenergy.

After brief co-chair remarks and state updates, the Land Use and Local Government, Energy Efficiency and Housing, and Agriculture and Forestry Advisory Panels reported out on their progress and preliminary strategies for sector emissions reductions. Feedback from CAC members centered around school districts and communities hosting clean energy projects, promoting holistic strategies through cross-Panel collaboration, considering the conflicts and feasibility of potential policy recommendations, looking into perverse tax incentives, and concerns about the role of and lifecycle emissions renewable natural gas (RNG), among others. Environmental advocates on the Council raised questions regarding equity considerations for each sector such as the diversity of external stakeholders being engaged, benefit investments, and communities setting their own priorities.

Deputy Commissioner Martin Brand (DEC) and chair of the newest Advisory Panel also updated the Council on the Waste Panel’s progress to date. The Waste Panel, which is tasked to provide recommendations to reduce greenhouse gas emissions from the sector including landfills, has begun level setting, data collection, and quantifying emissions from waste in NYS. The Council voted to establish the Advisory Panel’s membership which comprise of environmental justice leaders, other environmental groups, local government waste management officials and industry leaders. All positions have been filled with the exception of a wastewater expert and labor representative.

They also voted to approve the addition of a labor representative on the Power Generation Panel, Jim Slevin of the Utility Workers United of America Local 1-2. DEC staff then gave an overview of its Draft Value of Carbon Guidance and on bioenergy provisions in NY’s climate law. According to the Department’s interpretation, the law allows the utilization of RNG based on how emissions are accounted for. NYSERDA’s Chris Coll also notified the CAC of the interim criteria for disadvantaged communities which will guide the work of the Panels and state agencies until the Climate Justice Working Group has finalized the definition and criteria for disadvantaged communities in summer 2021. Chair Basil Seggos (DEC) assured the CAC that they will discuss and delve deeper into these equity requirements under NY’s climate law on a regular basis.

In closing, chair Doreen Harris (NYSERDA) notified the CAC of an upcoming Deep Decarbonization workshop which will be held on December 8 at 2 p.m. It will cover topics on carbon capture and sequestration, green hydrogen, refrigerants, and long-duration storage. At the next meeting on December 15, the CAC will hear from the remaining Panels and Working Groups as well as review the work plan of the Waste Panel. They will also have further
presentations (including from the Agriculture and Forestry bioeconomy subgroup) and discussions on bioenergy.

**Power Generation Advisory Panel – Friday, November 20, 2020**

During the Power Generation Panel’s fourth meeting on November 20, NYSEERDA’s Carl Mas and E3’s Kevin Steinberger tagged teamed to give presentations and led discussions on NY climate law’s scoping plan integration analysis approach and on elements of the state’s electricity system including key technology priorities and impacts of electrification. Members identified ACE NY along with labor, customer groups, environmental justice and environmental groups and other external experts the Panel will engage with. Chair John Rhodes (PSC) also updated the staff team’s effort to synthesize and consolidate the Panel’s scope work topics on resource mix, equity, solutions for the future and barriers. He also made the Panel aware of a deep decarbonization workshop that Climate Action Council (CAC) staff will be organizing for the first week of December. Topics that will be covered include Carbon Capture and Storage, green hydrogen, HCFC refrigerant transition, and long duration storage. Presentations and notes from Advisory Panels and Working Groups meetings can be found [here](#).

**Land Use and Local Government Advisory Panel – Thursday, November 19, 2020**

DEC’s Dazzle Ekblad gave an overview of [Climate Smart Communities](#) at the fourth meeting of the Land Use and Local Government Panel on November 19. Subgroups then reported out on strategies under consideration on land use, clean energy, and adaptation and resilience. These included potential actions to promote smart growth planning, capacity building and coordination of municipalities, establish higher energy codes and building performance mandates, encourage community choice aggregation programs, and develop a climate change adaptation and resilience plan. Panel members also suggested utilizing funding from the Environment Bond Act for resilience efforts and energy ratings for rentals and for old buildings as well as developing funding mechanisms for efficiency upgrades, be considered. Engagement has begun with local government and other external stakeholders. A survey is being distributed and interviews are being conducted within Panel members networks. The next Panel meeting is scheduled for December 17. Presentations and notes from Advisory Panels and Working Groups meetings can be found [here](#).

**Transportation Advisory Panel – Thursday, November 19, 2020**

The Transportation Panel reconvened for a fifth time on November 19. The first half of the meeting was dedicated to a presentation on strategies to manage vehicle miles travelled and optimize system efficiency as well as report outs from subgroups. The rest of the meeting served as a public forum. Stakeholders gave input into the Panel’s 4 broad policy considerations including our very own Policy Analysis and Operations Director, Deb Peck Kelleher giving a statement. Common suggestions included investments into public transportation, adoption of the [Transportation and Climate Initiative](#) and a low carbon fuel standard, and policies to advance electric vehicle market and infrastructure development. In closing, the chair ensured the public that this would be the first other public meetings. Further comments can be submitted
through mail, email, or by completing this form. Presentations and notes from Advisory Panels and Working Groups meetings can be found here.

**Energy Efficiency and Housing Advisory Panel - Wednesday, November 18, 2020**

The Energy Efficiency and Housing Panel heard from the commercial and Institutional buildings subgroup at its fifth meeting on November 18. The subgroup reported out on policy options under discussion like mandates, financing and incentives, training/education on building efficiency and electrification. State staff then gave a presentation on NY building and energy codes, which center primarily on energy efficiency and new construction. They also shared potential approaches and targets to drive building efficiency and decarbonization. These approaches included appliance standards, building performance mandates and regulatory changes to energy and building codes. The Panel will continue to solicit public input via its survey (closes November 30) and will delve deeper into equity recommendations at its next meeting. Presentations and notes from Advisory Panels and Working Groups meetings can be found here.

**Energy-Intensive and Trade-Exposed Advisory Panel – Wednesday, November 18, 2020**

At its fourth meeting on November 18, the Energy-Intensive and Trade-Exposed Industries (EITE) Panel delved deeper into potential policies to reduce and report on emissions. These policies included competitive funding through a carbon challenge, technical guidance for strategic energy management, economic assistance for abatement technology, aid to procure an energy manager, developing an innovation roadmap, NY Buy Green, and a greenhouse gas reporting rule. Panel members also proposed ideas like a tax policy to create carbon neutral, entrepreneurial zones and clean energy mandates like in Europe and California. Input on these recommendations can be sent via email. The EITE Panel, which meets again on December 9, will be holding a public meeting in January 2021. Presentations and notes from Advisory Panels and Working Groups meetings can be found here.

**Agriculture and Forestry Advisory Panel – Wednesday, November 18, 2020**

The purpose of the Agriculture and Forestry Panel’s fifth meeting on November 18 was to go over recommendations coming out from subgroups for agricultural emissions reductions as well as land conversions, forestry and bioeconomy related to sequestration. A major recommendation endorsed by several Panel members is developing a Carbon Farm Plan template. Other policy considerations discussed included precision feed management, economic support for small farmers, lifecycle carbon accounting analysis for bioproducts, a statewide standard on soil health, and potential payment for practice and a Tree Corp programs, among others. The Panel’s next meeting is expected to be December 9. Presentations and notes from Advisory Panels and Working Groups meetings can be found here.

**Just Transition Working Group – Tuesday, November 17, 2020**
The Just Transition Working Group (JTWG) reconvened for its fourth meeting on November 17. State staff gave a brief overview of the tasks, scope of work and schedule of the business impacts subgroup, which is comprised of the working group and the Energy-Intensive and Trade-Exposed (EITE) Panel members. The subgroup reported out on its work on a definition and adoption of metrics to identify EITEs in New York State. They aim to share their findings December 2020/January 2021. The JTWG also received a presentation from Professor Greg Dotson (University of Oregon) on emissions leakage and updates on the job study consultancy and power plant and reuse subgroup from state staff. Further updates will be provided at the working group’s next meeting on December 3. Presentations and notes from Advisory Panels and Working Groups meetings can be found here.

Climate Justice Working Group – Monday, November 16, 2020

During its third meeting was held on November 16, the Climate Justice Working Group (CJWG) received a presentation from Amanda Dwelley (ILLUME) on a framework and rubric considerations for indicator selection, which will assist the group in developing criteria for disadvantaged communities. This led to a discussion and identification of multiple indicators that will be advanced for evaluation such as disproportionate COVID deaths and proximity to manufacturing sites. At the working group’s meetings on December 2 and 16, there will be engagement with Advisory Panels around climate justice priorities for their sectors. Presentations and notes from past CJWG meetings can be found here.

Energy Efficiency and Housing Panel Roundtables – November 10 and 12, 2020

The Energy Efficiency and Housing Panel held a series of online roundtables with sector experts throughout the state. The roundtable for builders, installers, and designers of both single and multi-family occurred on November, Tuesday 10 while the owners, landlords and managing agents’ roundtable was held on November, Thursday 12. The purpose of these roundtables was to garner input on the barriers, priority policies/actions, and promising approaches in other jurisdictions the Panel can consider to advance the state’s goals for housing decarbonization. Common considerations emerging from all the roundtables included the disparity of cheap natural gas compared to electricity rates, the need to provide low-cost financing, addressing market acceptance of low carbon technologies, and educating tenets, developers, property owners and installers. At the next meeting of the Panel on Wednesday, November 18, there will be a debrief of these and other issues discussed at the roundtables. Stakeholders can continue to provide input on potential strategies to decarbonize and electrify the sector via email or by completing this survey. Presentations and notes from Advisory Panels and Working Groups meetings can be found here.

Power Generation Advisory Panel - Thursday, November 5, 2020

The third meeting of the Power Generation Panel occurred on Thursday, November 5, it was decided that the Panel will address mitigating methane leakages in the natural gas pipeline
system. NYSERDA is working on an analysis of methane mitigation and associated costs. The Panel also got an update on Climate Justice Working Group's interim criteria for disadvantaged communities: census blocks meeting the low-medium income threshold located within environmental justice areas and NYS opportunity zones. Chair John Rhodes then led a discussion on key issues/barriers with regards to renewables penetration downstate, peaking resources, the role of fossil and renewable natural gas in the future, and community distributed generation, among others. It is anticipated that subgroups will meet discuss these and other scope topics prior to the Panel’s next meeting on November 20. Presentations and notes from past Advisory Panels and Working Groups meetings can be found here.

**Just Transition Working Group** - Wednesday, November 4, 2020

The third meeting of the Just Transition Working Group was held on Wednesday, November 4. Based on research undertaken by state staff, the Panel received a synopsis of just transition principles organized into several categories: stakeholder engagement, planning long-term goals, cultural sensitivity/recognition, repairing inequities, equitable and high-quality sustaining jobs, community redevelopment, development of a low-carbon supply chain, aligning industrialization and decarbonization, and climate adaptation. Comments on the principles can be emailed to NYSERDA’s Kara Allen. The business impacts subgroup will report-out at the working group’s next meeting on November 17. Presentations and notes from past Advisory Panels and Working Groups meetings can be found here.

**Transportation Advisory Panel** - Tuesday, November 3, 2020

On Tuesday, November 3, the Transportation Panel met for its fourth meeting. The Panel received an overview of MTA’s current sustainability initiatives and on electric vehicle (EV) trends, market barriers and opportunities in NYS from The Cadmus Group’s Geoff Morrison. Subgroups, which are tasked to develop mitigation strategies within four broad policy areas, were designated. These policy areas include (1) electrification and fuels, (2) market-based policies, financing and funding, (3) public transportation, and (4) smart growth/system optimization. The Panel is soliciting written feedback on these policy considerations via email, post or by completing this survey. There will also be a virtual public meeting on November 19 at 10.a.m. Presentations and notes from past Advisory Panels and Working Groups meetings can be found here.

**Agriculture and Forestry Advisory Panel** – Monday, November 2, 2020

At its fourth meeting on Monday November 2, the Agriculture and Forestry Panel focused on forestry. They received presentations on the role of and policies that support the carbon sequestration potential of forests. DEC’s Peter Innis also outlined recommendations for the forest sector, which proposed regulations, programs and funding/incentives for conservation/avoid conversion, improving public and private forest management as well as increasing NYS grown harvested products, afforestation/reforestation efforts, wood utilization in urban areas. There was support for the certification of foresters and encouraging manufacturing
in NYS. Some members suggested that the Panel should look at incentives for utilizing wood waste and displaced forest biomass, training and assistance for small forest holders, negative emission technologies such as biochar, energy crops and the general unintended consequences from proposed recommendations. The next Panel meeting will be on November 18, 2020. Presentations and notes from past Advisory Panels and Working Groups meetings can be found here.

October 2020

Land Use and Local Government Advisory Panel - Thursday, October 29, 2020

At its third meeting on Thursday, October 29, 2020, Land Use and Local Government Panel reviewed changes made to its the scope and work plan. These included additions of fostering greater intermunicipal collaboration and agreements, improving and ensuring equitable and affordable local community climate resilience as well as considering land use policies that increase sequestration (e.g., through wetland protection, green infrastructure and community gardens), promote smart growth and both mitigation and adaptation outcomes, enable clean energy, and avoid gentrification, displacement, and poverty concentration. Two subgroups reported out on emerging themes and priorities from their preliminary meetings. Regional coordination/capacity-building, interagency coordination, streamlining project review/approval, supporting priority growth areas through incentive mechanisms and municipal assessment tools, and alternative/enhanced local governance models, were among the emerging themes and priorities for the Land Use subgroup. For the subgroup responsible for increasing clean energy in municipalities, priorities included increasing efficiency through programs/incentives and local regulations like energy codes, reducing barriers to adoption with property assessed clean energy financing for example, and local government leadership (Smart City measures, public procurement, fleet electrification).

During feedback, Panel members also suggested other key considerations such as rewarding developers that go beyond environmental requirements, financial support for community-based planners, exploring different ownership models, forest protection for long-term carbon sequestration, and exploring the role of revolving funds and industrial development agencies in providing incentives. These themes and priorities identified by subgroup will inform the recommendation development process. The next working sessions for the Panel’s Land Use and Clean Energy subgroups are to be determined. However, the Adaptation and Resilience subgroup will meet November 5, 2020. The Panel also plans to begin external engagement throughout November. A survey is being developed for each Panel member to send out to their local government and community group networks. Official local roundtables will be held in November/December 2020 and a virtual public forum will take place in December 2020/January 2021. The Panel, which reconvenes on November 12, 2020, is also soliciting public feedback via email. Presentations and notes from past Advisory Panels and Working Groups meetings can be found here.

Energy-Intensive and Trade-Exposed Industries Panel - Wednesday, October 28, 2020
The Energy-Industries and Trade-Exposed Industries (EITI) Panel reconvened for its third meeting on Wednesday, October 28, 2020. The chair began the meeting updating the Panel that the CAC accepted its work plan without revision and thanked Panel members for volunteering in inter-panel collaborations with the Just Transition Working Group’s Business Impacts and the Land Use and Local Government’s Climate Adaptation and Resiliency subgroups.

The Panel then received a breakdown of the industrial emission sources in NYS which revealed cement, paper and primary metals subsectors contribute most to direct emissions. Some Panel members inquired for more information concerning geographical trends in emissions, monitoring processes and greenhouse gas emissions accounting methods which will affect benchmarking. NYSERDA staff also gave an overview of technology and process solutions to reduce industrial emissions. They highlighted that standard measures are already being utilized in manufacturing subsectors. However, there is a need for increased organizational focus and personnel capacity to achieve optimal process efficiency as well as significant study and investment in long-term emission reduction technologies. Panel members also gave other technology and solutions that can be considered such as blue and green hydrogen. Sean Mulderrig noted that the NYSERDA innovation team is exploring these options taking into consideration their commercially viability and lifecycle emissions.

Next, the chair outlined existing state financial and technical programs that facilitate sector emissions reductions, support the transition to a decarbonized economy and mitigates industry leakage and showed an illustrative map of EITI sectors spanning NYS. Panel members called for a more granular mapping of emissions hotspots in relation environmental justice (EJ) communities with Jason Curtis suggesting overlaying the EITI sectors map with an overlay of an EJ map that the EPA produces. The chair also presented policy options/examples the Panel can consider in their recommendations. These options include emission reduction financial and technical assistance programs, economic incentives, research, development and demonstration, low-carbon procurement policies, and rate design: low-cost power programs.

Other considerations Panel members brought up in subsequent discussion included workforce development and training being incorporated into technical assistance programs prioritizing EJ communities, a low carbon fuel standard, incentives for pilots and innovation test beds that are high impact and align with NY’s climate law and doubling down on tooling industries with standard measures. Some raised concerns and questions over the role of nuclear power in long term emission reduction plans, policy options like the Buy Green Act that are dependent on entities truthfully reporting on a product’s embedded carbon, and the lengthy time scale of fuel switching being a major barrier to a clean transition.

At the next meeting, which is scheduled for November 18, the Panel will go into a more detailed discussion of potential policy recommendations. The Panel and the public can continue to submit comments and prospective recommendations via email. Presentations and notes from past Advisory Panels and Working Groups meetings can be found here.
Power Generation Advisory Panel - Thursday, October 22, 2020

On Thursday, October 22, 2020 the Power Generation Panel met for a second time. Chair John Rhodes (PSC) revealed a new proposal from Climate Action Council staff for the Panel to address transitioning the power system from natural gas to carbon-free sources and leaks in natural gas infrastructure. There was overall support for the task of transitioning the power sector as it aligns with the NY’s climate law. However, environmental advocates within the Panel raised concerns over the reliability and carbon intensity of the technology options proposed, which included hydrogen, synthetic methane, carbon capture, utilization and storage, renewable natural gas, etc. A few Panel members called for the inclusion of long duration, dispatchable resources and storage to be added to these options. There were also varying views regarding natural gas leaks. Some believed that it was outside the remit of the Panel while others noted that this issue fitted into the gamut of broader issues the Panel should address, including the challenge of stranded assets. In the end, John Rhodes agreed to notify the CAC that the Panel will take on the new task but would not be “wedded to any of these specific options were listed.”

After a lengthy discussion on the scope of work topics, it was decided that the Panel will form 4 subgroups: resource mix, solutions needed for a carbon-free future, potential barriers to clean energy siting, delivery and interconnections, and equity. It is anticipated that subgroups will meet prior to its November 5 meeting. These meetings will be closed to the public, but notes will be made publicly available. The Panel plans to seek public input via email, a public forum in January 2021, and through public meetings scheduled through March 2021. Presentations and notes from past Advisory Panels and Working Groups meetings can be found here.

Transportation Advisory Panel - Wednesday, October 21, 2020

The Transportation Panel meeting convened it’s third meeting on Wednesday, October 21, 2020. Chair Commissioner Dominguez (NYSDOT) informed the Panel that could move ahead with its work plan having received no additional comments from the Climate Action Council. NYSERDA’s Adam Ruder gave a presentation on a pending study led by the Cadmus Group on a Clean Transportation Roadmap for NYS, analyses that will feed into Panel’s recommendations. Panel members suggested that these analyses should factor in the role of federal policies, COVID-19 realities, and an assessment of the current electric vehicle (EV) industry. The Panel then received an outline of the 4 subject areas from which sector recommendations will be developed.

For the first topic: Electrification and Fuels, members brought up considerations of the potential of a low carbon fuel standard and the Transportation and Climate Initiative, re-evaluating fossil fuel incentives, utilizing renewable fuels, and addressing waste, rate-design, co-pollutants in disadvantaged communities and the misalignment of incentives/regulation for dealerships needed scale the transition to electrification and low-carbon transportation fuels. Regarding subject area 2: Market-based programs, funding and financing, Panel members suggested utilizing incentives for lowering upfront costs of EVs and ensuring market programs generate
revenues to invest back into infrastructure and signal to manufacturers to scale production. They also reiterated the role of ports and public electric fleets in signaling the electrification transition to private markets and moving away from a gas to vehicle miles travelled (VMT) tax to pay for road maintenance. For Public transportation, the third subject area, Panel members identified the need to consider first mile – last mile connectivity, transit deserts, public education, expanding transportation infrastructure, service quality, frequency and efficiency, expanding micro-transit, and mobile ticket and scheduling. Lastly, for subject area 4: Smart Growth/System Optimization, Panel members stressed the importance of addressing truck parking and bottlenecks in the metro area.

Working groups will be designated for each subject area and will be engaging external experts. There will also be cross Panel collaboration with the Land Use and Local Government and Agriculture and Forestry Panels and the Just Transition and Climate Justice Working Groups occurring in October/mid-November and February 2021. The Panel will meet again on Tuesday, November 3, 2020. The Panel will reconvene on Tuesday, November 3, 2020. Presentations and notes from past Advisory Panels and Working Groups meetings can be found here.

Agriculture and Forestry Advisory Panel - Monday, October 19, 2020

On Monday, October 19, 2020, the Agriculture and Forestry Panel reconvened for its third meeting. Panel members first reviewed the final workplan and guidelines for sector recommendation contents before delving into mitigation recommendations for agriculture, specifically. For livestock, these emission reduction strategies included feed management, manure cover and flare, and increasing funding for pollution management and climate resilient farming programs. Strategies for soil management encompassed crop nutrient management, crop cover adoption, replacing annual crops with perennials and increasing agricultural environmental management. Panel member, Peter Woodbury emphasized potential emission reductions of the mitigation strategies have room for technical improvements. Recurring themes for further consideration emerged during feedback such as bioenergy, new funding sources, incentives for innovation and research and development, promotion of green certification markets and regenerative agricultural techniques, utilizing simple and tried-and-true practices in the first instance, environmental management concerns, for example of methane flaring and dry manure management, and assessing co-benefits and barriers to the adoption of these mitigation strategies.

From this discussion, the chair proposed subgroups that would deal with dairy and renewable natural gas, nutrient management, agroforestry, afforestation and reforestation, and cross-sector topics including avoided conversion, costs and innovative financing, public-private partnerships, food waste, fuel production, energy siting and wetlands. At its next meeting, which will be held on November 2, the Panel will be discussing recommendations for the forestry sector. Presentations and notes from past Advisory Panels and Working Groups meetings can be found here.

Energy Efficiency and Housing Advisory Panel - Friday, October 16, 2020
The Energy Efficiency and Housing Advisory Panel met on Friday, October 16, 2020 for its third meeting. The chair shared feedback on the workplan from Panel members and from the Climate Action Council (CAC) October 8 meeting, which informed adjustments to the Panel’s scope. These adjustments included the addition of energy efficiency in building operations and maintenance, site-based solar PV, cross panel work on codes and standards to reduce emissions, enabling policies to advance low-carbon new-construction and retrofits, workforce development, affordability and benefits for disadvantaged communities, and methods and metrics for evaluating building performance. The chair also set parameters and gave guidance on how the Panel should approach work on recommendations. A template for recommendations is being developed. Each subgroup (single family, multifamily, and commercial and institutional) then gave an overview of the current state, key barriers and mitigation strategies for the sectors as well as foundational resources and external engagement needed to inform their recommendations.

In ensuing discussion, Panel members identified cross-cutting themes among the subgroups including coordinating an approach on codes and standards, measuring and providing energy usage information to property owners on emissions, workforce development, addressing affordability, building conditions and housing stability for low-income communities, identifying new and existing funding sources, and incentivizing behavior through public education. NYSERDA’s Greg Hale then gave a presentation on a Carbon Neutral Buildings Roadmap for NY, which will inform the work of the Panel. He highlighted the benefits and the need for innovation, market development, and supportive policy to accomplish carbon neutrality in sector. The next Panel meeting is scheduled for October 29, 2020 from 1-3 p.m. Presentations and notes from past Advisory Panels and Working Groups meetings can be found here.

Climate Action Council - Thursday, October 8, 2020

The Climate Action Council (CAC), tasked with developing a Scoping Plan to implement the NY climate law, held its fourth meeting on Thursday, October 8, 2020. Each Advisory Panel and Working Group chairs reported out on their scope of work and external engagement plans. Recurring concerns Council members had regarding these work plans included the limited role of bioenergy and assessing cost impacts in meeting reduction goals as well as having local government representation on the panels. The CAC also approved the creation of a new Advisory Panel to evaluate emissions and recommend mitigation strategies for waste generating sectors. NYSDEC’s Martin Brand, who will chair the Waste Panel, informed the CAC that support staff will begin work before membership is finalized. Recommendations on membership will be sent to the CAC by October 15. CAC members suggested the Panel should focus on addressing methane leakages and collaborate with local waste treatment authorities and the Transportation Panel. The CAC also received two presentations on the NY electricity system. Rich Dewey (NYISO) outlined the challenges of transitioning the grid to accommodate renewables noting the need for technology and innovation to achieve carbon-free electricity by 2040. NYSDPS’s Tammy Mitchell gave an overview of policies and initiatives facilitating the
integration of renewable energy resources into the electricity system. The CAC will reconvene on November 24, 2020. Presentations and notes from past CAC meetings can be found here.

**Land Use and Local Government Advisory Panel** - Wednesday, October 7, 2020

At the second Land Use and Local Government Panel meeting held on Wednesday, October 7, Panel members received an outline of the proposed sectoral goals and key focus areas of subgroups. These included: (1) land use policies and practices to reduce cross-sector emissions, (2) clean energy policies and practices to promote energy efficiency and clean energy adoption, and (3) policies for sector-specific and cross-sectoral climate adaptation and resilience. While the subgroup structure is still being created, Panel members noted several considerations for their scope of work. These ranged from defining ‘resilience’ and its linkage to adaptation/futureproofing, utilizing freight and waterway transport, incentives for developers and inter-municipal agreements to accelerate emissions reduction goals to mechanisms to help stabilize and address health and safety of impacted communities, encourage coastal management, planning, smart renewable energy siting, open spaces, sequestration, and nature-based solutions, among others. There is a dedicated email for public input and the Panel will hold a virtual public forum and 2 roundtables of local officials in November 2020 and January 2021. The next Panel meeting will be on October 30, 2020. Presentations and notes from past Advisory Panels and Working Groups meetings can be found here.

**Energy-Intensive and Trade-Exposed Industries Advisory Panel** - Monday, October 5, 2020

The Energy-Intensive and Trade-Exposed Industries Panel met for a second time on Monday, October 5, 2020 to review the emission reduction goals and key assumptions of its work plan. Specifically, the Panel will look at emissions reductions of on-site fuel combustion, on-site non-combustion, and electricity use from manufacturing, construction, and mining. Additionally, the Panel will work with the Just Transition Working Group’s subgroup on business impacts developing policies to mitigate leakage and anti-competitiveness. In the discussion on the scope of work, Panel members raised concerns over of the E3’s Pathways analysis – the basis of the sector reductions goals. They also suggested engaging with experts and manufacturers and to consider issues of attracting manufacturers out of state, energy constraint load pockets, and power quality and reliability. Members also requested key information on fuel types, manufacturing production, and locations of industries in relation to impacted communities, to inform the workplan. The Panel, which meets next in November, will be taking public input via email and convening a virtual forum in January 2021. Presentations and notes from past Advisory Panels and Working Groups meetings can be found here.

**Agriculture and Forestry Advisory Panel** - Thursday, October 1, 2020

The Agriculture and Forestry Panel meeting held its second meeting on Thursday, October 1, 2020. It began with a presentation from Cornell University’s and Panel member, Peter
Woodbury’s on a Carbon Farm Study. He provided an overview of the latest research on sector mitigation actions that could derive the greatest emissions reductions. These included methane flaring, biochar, increasing feed efficiency, nitrogen use efficiency, planting trees on idle land, and improving woodland management. The Panel then received an overview of goals for the sector that would form the basis of its work plan. They included carbon sequestration, agriculture and cross-sectoral emissions reductions goals as well as goals for avoiding emissions leakage, resource conservation, and ensuring resilient food and forest product systems. In the ensuing discussion on the scope of work, Panel members brought up several considerations including the role of forestry, harvested wood products and wood substitutions in emissions reductions, carbon sequestration from wetlands, soil health, avoided conversion, afforestation, economic development, market incentives, bioenergy, and establishing resilience goals in recognition of long-term climate change impacts, among others. The chair concluded by commending the Panel for a productive working session on the work plan, which he will present to the Climate Action Council on October 8. Presentations and notes from past Advisory Panels and Working Groups meetings can be found here.

**Just Transition Working Group - Thursday, October 1, 2020**

During the second meeting of the Just Transition Working Group on Thursday, October 1, 2020, staff members detailed the responsibilities of the 4 subgroups that will be formed to address key elements of the work plan. Panel members raised additional topics to be considered in the subgroups, which will cover power plant and reuse, business impacts, just transition principles and the job study on the future clean energy workforce. On power plants and their reuse, they proposed creating criteria to help communities burdened by power plant pollution, leveraging existing power infrastructure, and remediating these sites. For business impacts, members called out the necessity for cost benefit analyses and data from manufacturing associations and also clarified that the subgroup should look at both carbon and business leakage resulting from a clean energy transition. All members agreed that the subgroup will establish just transition principles, a new addition to Panel’s scope. These principles will orient the work of the Panel and guide the Climate Action Council. Subgroups are set to meet later in October 2020. Staff members also updated the Panel on the scope of the job study, which will span buildings, transport, energy supply, industry, and natural and working lands. The process to hire an external consultant for this study is underway and work will begin this quarter. In a commitment to public engagement, the NYSDOL chair shared an email for which the public can give comments. A public engagement forum is scheduled for December 15, 2020. Panel members were tasked with volunteering for their preferred subgroups and sending resources that could inform the workplan. The tentative date for the next meeting is November 4, 2020. Presentations and notes from past Advisory Panels and Working Groups meetings can be found here.

**Climate Justice Working Group - Thursday, October 1, 2020**

*(Summary by Jeff Jones, Communications Consultant)*
In addition to the six advisory panels set up under the Climate Leadership and Community Protection Act (CLCPA) to support and inform the Climate Action Council (CAC), the law also led to creation of the Climate Justice Working Group. The CLCPA includes the requirement that 35% of investments made to fight climate change must be in disadvantaged, impacted frontline communities. With resources expected to run in the hundreds of millions over the life of the plan, a working definition of such communities is crucial. This defines the work of the Climate Justice Working Group, which met for a second time on October 1, and will continue to meet monthly, at least until it delivers its report to the Council. Indeed, in a slide presentation, Working Group members were told by the conveners that the "Long term approach to incorporating geo-based eligibility will depend on final definition of a Disadvantaged Community from [the] Climate Justice Working Group."

Working group members heard from several social and environmental justice mapping experts, including Amanda Dwelley from IllumE, a woman-owned consulting firm that worked on a similar project for the state of California. Known as CalEnviroScreen 3.0, it looks at as range of criteria. It also demonstrates how difficult, and important this element of CLCPA implementation will be. Obvious categories to be mapped include poverty-defined census tracts, state-designated Opportunity Zones, potential environmental justice areas, and proximity to existing environmental hazards such as Superfund sites, Peaker plants and neighborhoods with high asthma rates. In addition, Working Group members raised other possibilities related to public health and pockets of poverty within wealthier communities.

Several working group members referred to another California study, which documented increases in criteria pollutants in environmental justice communities after the first three years of the state’s cap-and-trade program for reducing carbon emissions. Focused on the years 2013-2015, the study, found that during the first three years of California’s cap-and-trade program, public health endangering criteria pollutants did increase in communities identified in the CalEnviroScreen, while carbon emissions were reduced in predominantly white and wealthier communities. It attributes this to the California law’s offset program, which allowed many of the worst polluters to claim their carbon credits by investing in forest and agriculture programs in other states, or by reducing the amount of coal-fired electric power they imported to California. As a result, the pollutants that disproportionately cause air and water pollution in disadvantaged communities were not reduced.

Starting with NYS-level lists cataloguing 20 environmental indicator datasets and 17 socio-economic indicator datasets, the working group will pursue an ambitious meeting schedule to achieve its goal of providing the required definitions to the Climate Action Council next year. Presentations and notes from past Climate Justice Working Group meetings can be found here.

September 2020

Energy Efficiency and Housing Advisory Panel - Wednesday, September 30, 2020
At the second Energy Efficiency and Housing Panel meeting on Wednesday, September 30, Panel members discussed and provided supplementary considerations to incorporate in the Panel’s scope including energy efficiency measures for new construction, retrofit/electrification readiness for affordable housing, equity implications, behavior and usage, market signals needed, building performance metrics, workforce training programs, remediation of old power station sites, among others. Following which, state staff outlined and identified the members of the 3 newly formed subgroups; residential, multi-family, and commercial and institutional buildings. Subgroups will meet during the week of October 5, 2020. Though they will initially be closed to the public, the Panel was advised, in response to questions raised by several members, that each subgroup could choose to make subsequent meetings open to the public and industry experts. After a synopsis of the NY Building and Housing Policy Landscape, the chair made several requests of the Panel: volunteer to work with the Land Use and Local Government Panel on climate adaptation and resilience strategies, provide foundational research using SharePoint, and give further input on the work plan by October 2. The public is also welcomed to provide comments via email. Findings from the subgroups will be discussed at the next Panel meeting in November 2020. Presentations and notes from past Advisory Panels and Working Groups meetings can be found here.

Land Use and Local Government Advisory Panel – Thursday, September 24, 2020

On Thursday, September 24, the Land Use and Local Government Advisory Panel met for its inaugural meeting. The chair outlined the main objectives of the Panel. In addition to sector-specific recommendations, the Panel is uniquely responsible for providing cross-sectoral proposals on climate resilience and adaptation. The Panel also received an overview of the state of the sector. Paul Beyer (NYSDOS) highlighted various smart growth, zoning tools, and land use planning considerations to reduce reliance on cars and vehicle miles travelled, while NYSERDA’s Brad Tito showcased current state programs like Climate Smart Communities, Clean Energy Communities, and NYPAr’s Five Cities Energy Master Plans which are supporting local governments and communities leading the way in climate action. Capacity building, streamlining state programs and funding, promoting conservation and urban forests for climate resilience, securing local economic development, comprehensive master planning, rural transportation, and garnering local government input through a possible working group, were among the key areas discussed. These topics will shape the Panel’s workplan. The Panel was tasked to consider avenues to collect public comments and promote transparency and is scheduled to re-convene in the first week of October 2020. Presentations and notes from past Advisory Panels and Working Groups meetings can be found here.

Energy-Intensive and Trade-Exposed Industries Panel - Thursday, September 24, 2020

The first meeting of the Energy-Intensive and Trade-Exposed Industries Panel was held on Thursday, September 24, 2020. After brief introductions, the Panel received a synopsis of the NY’s Climate Act. E3’s Tory Clark gave a presentation on Deep Decarbonization Pathways at the Energy-Intensive and Trade-Exposed Industries meeting. She noted that in order to meet sector emissions reduction goals, short-term focus should be on energy-efficiency and low-
carbon fuel substitutions. The Panel is tasked with identifying NY industries and policies to minimize emissions from the sector by 6% by 2030 from 2016 levels and by 80% by 2050. A key point of discussion was the potential role as well as concerns over the high costs and emissions intensity of renewable natural gas and hydrogen. The Panel was asked to provide further input on its draft scope and workplan, which will be considered at the next meeting. Presentations and notes from past Advisory Panels and Working Groups meetings can be found here.

**Transportation Advisory Panel** – Thursday, September 17, 2020

The Transportation Advisory Panel held its inaugural meeting on Thursday, September 17, 2020. The meeting started with brief introductions from chairs Commissioner Marie Therese Dominguez (NYSDOT) and Deputy Commissioner Jared Snyder (NYSDEC) and the 15 members of the Panel comprising of representatives from the MTA, environmental NGOs, transportation associations and unions, private sector, and academia. After receiving an overview of the roles and responsibilities of the Transportation Panel and a presentation on Deep Decarbonization Pathways with a focus on the transportation sector by E3, each Panel member raised issues important to them and that should be covered in the strategies and recommendations they put forward to the Climate Action Council. They discussed issues of electric vehicle infrastructure, incentives and affordability, mass transit and the need for electric buses, grid to vehicle connectivity, congestion pricing, smart growth and logistics, instituting a clean fuel standard, environmental justice considerations, the Transportation and Climate Initiative, funding, and engaging key stakeholders including utilities, among others. These topics will form the basis of the Panel’s work plan. The next meeting is expected to be held by the end of September 2020. Presentations from Advisory Panels and Working Groups meetings can be found here.

**Just Transition Working Group** – Thursday, September 17, 2020

On Thursday, September 17, 2020, the Just Transition Working Group, which will work with the Advisory Panels and Council to ensure the equitable transition of the New York’s workforce to a renewable energy economy, held its first meeting. The Working Group’s NYSERDA and NYSDOL chairs gave an overview of state workforce development programs and preliminary work on identifying power plants and their reuse opportunities to transition to a clean energy sector. They also outlined a plan to hire an external consultant to conduct a comprehensive job study on the future clean energy workforce. Group members were tasked to provide further information on job training programs and proposals that should be covered in the scope of work of the job study. The work plan for the Working Group and scope development of the job study will be discussed at the next meeting. Presentations and notes from Advisory Panels and Working Groups meetings can be found here.