

# Theology in a Post-Traumatic Church

John N. Sheveland  
Editor

ORBIS  BOOKS  
Maryknoll, New York 10545

Founded in 1970, Orbis Books endeavors to publish works that enlighten the mind, nourish the spirit, and challenge the conscience. The publishing arm of the Maryknoll Fathers and Brothers, Orbis seeks to explore the global dimensions of the Christian faith and mission, to invite dialogue with diverse cultures and religious traditions, and to serve the cause of reconciliation and peace. The books published reflect the views of their authors and do not represent the official position of the Maryknoll Society. To learn more about Maryknoll and Orbis Books, please visit our website at [www.orbisbooks.com](http://www.orbisbooks.com)

---

Copyright © 2023 by John N. Sheveland.

Published by Orbis Books, Box 302, Maryknoll, NY 10545-0302.

All rights reserved.

Portions of Chapter 7, “Malignant Narcissism and Clericalism: Psychological Perspectives on a Culture of Abuse,” originally appeared in “Seminary Human Formation: Lessons from the Causes and Context of Sexual Abuse Study,” *Seminary Journal* 19, no. 2 (2013): 10–19.

Portions of Chapter 3, “What Is Redemption?” originally appeared in “Clergy Sexual Abuse and the Work of Redemption: Gestures toward a Theology of Accompaniment,” *Buddhist-Christian Studies* 41 (2021): 71–86. doi:10.1353/bcs.2021.0011.

“Rewriting Psalm 55 Reflecting on Sexual Abuse” by Rev. Dr. Brad Hambrick is used with permission from the author.

No part of this publication may be reproduced or transmitted in any form or by any means, electronic or mechanical, including photocopying, recording, or any information storage or retrieval system, without prior permission in writing from the publisher.

Queries regarding rights and permissions should be addressed to: Orbis Books, P.O. Box 302, Maryknoll, NY 10545-0302.

Manufactured in the United States of America.

Manuscript editing and typesetting by Joan Weber Laflamme.

---

#### Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Names: Sheveland, John N., 1973– editor.

Title: Theology in a post-traumatic church / John N. Sheveland, editor.

Identifiers: LCCN 2022059670 (print) | LCCN 2022059671 (ebook) | ISBN 9781626985209 (trade paperback) | ISBN 9781608339822 (epub)

Subjects: LCSH: Child sexual abuse—Religious aspects—Catholic Church. | Child sexual abuse by clergy.

Classification: LCC BX1912.9 .T444 2023 (print) | LCC BX1912.9 (ebook) | DDC 261.8/3272088282—dc23/eng/20230309

LC record available at <https://lccn.loc.gov/2022059670>

LC ebook record available at <https://lccn.loc.gov/2022059671>

# Contents

<i>Foreword</i>	ix
HANS ZOLLNER, SJ	
<b>Introduction</b>	1
JOHN N. SHEVELAND	
<b>1. Resiliency, Hope, Healing</b>	
<i>Victims Assistance Ministry in a Trauma-Sensitive Theological Context</i>	17
HEATHER T. BANIS, PhD	
Principle 1: Be Victim-Centric	20
Principle 2: Honor the Sacred Story	21
Principle 3: Betrayal Trauma	31
Conclusion	37
<b>2. Critical Reflections on the Discourse on a “Traumatized Church”</b>	39
JENNIFER E. BESTE	
Trauma and Its Effects	39
The Discourse of Traumatization in the Catholic Clergy Sexual Abuse Crisis	43
Ethical and Theological Implications of the “Traumatized Church” Discourse	47
The Need to Reject Sweeping Claims of a “Traumatized Church”	49

	Theological Implications of Rejecting the “Traumatized Church” Discourse	61
	Conclusion	63
<b>3.</b>	<b>What Is Redemption?</b>	<b>64</b>
	JOHN N. SHEVELAND	
<b>4.</b>	<b>What Can Make Churches Unsafe?</b>	<b>87</b>
	<i>The Catholic Church as Total Institution</i>	
	CRISTINA LLEDO GOMEZ	
	Church Abuse of Vulnerable and Non-Vulnerable Persons	92
	Organizational Culture and Abuse Vulnerability in Churches	101
	<i>The Catholic Church as Alternative Moral Universe</i>	103
	<i>Catholic Churches and Human Nature and Transformation</i>	105
	<i>The Catholic Church and Total Institutions’ Extinguishing of Member Identities</i>	106
	<i>The Catholic Church and Promoting Secrecy</i>	108
	<i>The Catholic Church and Unique Power Structures</i>	110
	<i>Unique Informal Group Dynamics in the Catholic Church</i>	113
	Conclusion: From Abuse-Vulnerable to Trauma- Informed Churches	115
<b>5.</b>	<b>Visions of Survivor Healing and Empowerment in Response to Trauma</b>	<b>117</b>
	SCOTT R. A. STARBUCK	
	Pastoral Context	118

Prophetic Critique	119	
Isaiah 40—66	123	
Isaiah 55:1–13	124	
Isaiah 61:1–11	130	
A Healing and Restorative Path	134	
<b>6. Psycho-theological Functions of Laments</b>		
<i>Giving Voice to Anger and Grief</i>		138
LINDA S. SCHEARING		
Laments and Trauma	139	
Psalm 55 and Sexual Abuse	142	
Psalm 88 and Sexual Abuse	150	
Conclusion	154	
<b>7. Malignant Narcissism and Clericalism</b>		
<i>Psychological Perspectives on a Culture of Abuse</i>		155
FERNANDO A. ORTIZ		
Evaluation of Personality Risk Factors	161	
Evaluating Protective Factors	164	
Conclusion	170	
<b>8. Understanding and Resisting Clericalism and Social Sin</b>		173
B. KEVIN BROWN		
Clericalism and the Clergy Sexual Abuse Crisis	174	
<i>Clericalism and Bias</i>	174	
<i>Clericalism and the Clergy Sexual Abuse Crisis</i>	177	
Understanding Clericalism within the Church as Social Sin	181	
<i>Social Sin and Bias</i>	182	
<i>Addressing the Social Sin of Clericalism</i>		186

Resisting Clericalism through Theological Renewal	189	
<i>The Theological Roots of Clericalism</i>		189
<i>Toward Theological Renewal</i>	197	
<b>9. Worship among the Ruins</b>		
<i>Foundations for a Theology of Liturgy and Sacraments “after Abuse”</i>		201
JOSEPH C. MUDD		
Clerical Culture and the Dialectic of Authority	202	
<i>Clericalism and Dramatic Bias</i>	206	
<i>Ecclesial Illness and Psychic Conversion</i>		208
<i>Redeeming Sacrifice after Abuse</i>	211	
<i>Idolatry and Deviated Transcendence</i>		213
<i>Sacrifice as Self-Offering in Christ</i>	215	
Sacraments and Healing after Abuse	217	
<i>Reconciliation: Transformation of Histories of Suffering</i>	218	
<i>Healing and Worship</i>	221	
Conclusion	223	
<i>Contributors</i>		225
<i>Index</i>		227