

Chapter 9

How *The Peace Maker* Has Been Wrongly Used to Promote a False Theory

The Peace Maker, which was printed for Udney Hay Jacob by the *Times and Seasons* printing office in Nauvoo, is very significant in the story of how polygamy entered the LDS Church, because much of the pamphlet's theology was woven into the LDS doctrines by Brigham Young and his coworkers. A number of writers have alleged that Joseph had Jacob write the pamphlet to be circulated among the Saints to see if they would tolerate the doctrine of polygamy. Existing evidence shows that Joseph did not collaborate with Jacob in compiling and printing *The Peace Maker*, and that the theory that he had Jacob do it to test the Saints is entirely false. As discussed in the previous chapter (chapter 8), the Prophet made a very strong attack on *The Peace Maker* soon after it was published, by printing:

There was a book printed at my office, a short time since, written by Udney H. Jacobs, on marriage, without my knowledge; and had I been apprised of it, I should not have printed it; not that I am opposed to any man enjoying his privileges; but I do not wish to have my name associated with the authors, in such an unmeaning rigmarole of nonsense, folly, and trash. JOSEPH SMITH. (*Times and Seasons* 4 [December 1, 1842]: 32)

Morgan Provided Information Concerning a Copy of *The Peace Maker*

On March 3, 1963, we, the authors, purchased a microfilm copy of Udney Hay Jacob's pamphlet, *The Peace Maker*, from the Utah State Historical Society in Salt Lake City. We found

that a “Note” had been added at the beginning of *The Peace Maker*, which gives information about it and the Jacob family. It is presumed that this note was added by Mr. Dale L. Morgan, to whom we are indebted for his having made a copy, from which ours was made. The note explains:

The transcript of Jacob’s pamphlet which follows is made from one of two known copies, that of Mr. Everett D. Graff, Winnetka, Illinois. . . . This is one of two known copies, the other being in the possession of the L.D.S. Church Historian’s Office in Salt Lake City. Mr. Graff generously placed his copy at the disposal of Dale L. Morgan, by whom this transcription was made. (See “Note” prefacing Udney Jacob’s pamphlet entitled *The Peace Maker, or the Doctrines of the Millennium: Being a treatise on religion and jurisprudence. Or a new system of religion and politicks*, 2–3.)

The note begins with a statement which implicates the Prophet Joseph in the production of the pamphlet, and questions his honesty and integrity by stating:

Note: The special interest of the Jacob pamphlet is that it was published at Nauvoo when plural marriage among the Mormons was first coming to be known, and notwithstanding the disclaimer of the author [Udney Jacob] in the Preface, the question arises whether this pamphlet may not have been inspired by Joseph Smith to break ground for the public adoption by the Mormons of the doctrine of plural marriage. Although after its publication he denounced it in the *Times and Seasons* [and] disclaimed all responsibility for it, *a mature judgment on this point hinges rather on what can be learned of Jacob himself*. (ibid., 1; italics added)

To suggest that making a judgment as to the authorship of the pamphlet hinges “on what can be learned of Jacob” rather than on Joseph’s published denial, is to be unfair to Joseph. The failure to give credence to the Prophet’s denial suggests a belief that the founder of the Church was dishonest. Joseph’s testimony on this subject has been ignored by most writers. They

have insisted that Joseph had Udney write the pamphlet to advance polygamy in the Church, in spite of there being proof that he never was associated with Udney. And Jacob's declaration of authorship has also been ignored—for he asserted, "The author of this work is not a Mormon, although it is printed by their press. It [the *Times and Seasons* printing office] was the most convenient" (ibid., 3).

What Has Been Learned of Jacob

Since the writer of the "Note" suggested that the decision of authorship of *The Peace Maker* "hinges rather on what can be learned of Jacob," some knowledge of his history is necessary:

Udney's son, Norton Jacob, kept a journal in which he recorded a history of the Udney Jacob family. Norton's journal and the "Archive Record" in the Genealogical Society in Salt Lake City agree that Udney was born April 24, 1781, at Sheffield, Berkshire County, Massachusetts. He married Elizabeth Hubbard, and Norton (their first son) was born in Massachusetts in 1804. The Jacob family lived in Massachusetts and New York before moving to Illinois. By the early 1830s Udney and his wife, their children and their families, had settled in Hancock County, Illinois, in the village of Pilot Grove Corners, also known as Jacob Corners.

Soon after the Saints settled at Nauvoo in 1839, missionaries were sent to eastern Hancock County where Udney resided. He was violently opposed to the missionaries and their Gospel message. In 1840 he wrote a letter to President Van Buren in which he expressed anger and disdain for Joseph Smith, Sidney Rigdon, and the Church. So great was his opposition to the Saints that he appealed to the president for finances to print his book, which he said would assure Van Buren of a political victory, and would defeat those candidates whom the Saints favored.

Norton Was Persecuted for Joining the Church

At that time Norton Jacob was the only member of the Jacob family who believed the good news of the Gospel. He wrote in his journal:

I was first led to investigate the principles and doctrines of the Church of Jesus Christ of Latter-day Saints in the summer of 1840 by reading a little pamphlet. . . . During the fall and winter following, I heard some of the Elders preach . . . and on the 15th of March 1841 I was baptized by Elder Zenos Gurley [Sr.] at La Harpe.

My father, mother, brothers, and sisters opposed me violently. My father said he had rather heard I was dead than that I was a Mormon. I found it was no place for me where I then lived, which was at Pilot Grove. . . . I built me a house on the prairie 7 miles from the city [Nauvoo], and moved into it in the fall of '41 . . . the 1st of November 1842 I removed my family to the City of the Saints. (Norton Jacob, *The Record of Norton Jacob*, 4; edited by C. Edward Jacob and Ruth S. Jacob)

An article appeared in the Church's paper on the subject of the success of Elder Gurley's missionary work at La Harpe. It was reported:

We learn verbally, that Elder Z. H. Gurley has been laboring for the last few weeks at Laharpe, in this county, with extraordinary success: In the short space of six days he had the unspeakable privilege of immersing 52 in the waters of baptism, and a prospect of great accessions to their number. Those baptized, we are informed, are of the first class of society. (*Times and Seasons* 2 [March 15, 1841]: 350; see also *RLDS History of the Church* 3:743–744)

After the Prophet's death, Seventy Zenos Gurley, Sr., became prominent in the Reorganized Church, where he served for years as an apostle.

In 1843 Udney Jacob joined the Church; however, a difficulty arose in the Pilot Grove Branch which caused Udney to request that his name be removed from the Church record. He was rebaptized November 2, 1845, by Norton, and confirmed by Norton, who was assisted by Zenos Gurley (see *The Record of Norton Jacob*, 12).

Joseph Was Exonerated in the *Millennial Star*

In 1850, six years after the Prophet's death, the *Millennial Star*, a Church paper started in England during Joseph's lifetime, upheld the Prophet's testimony pertaining to *The Peace Maker*. The letter, which was written by Eli B. Kelsey to Apostle Orson Pratt, head of the European Mission under Brigham Young's leadership, was printed in the *Star*. The title of the article which contained the letter, "A Base Calumny Refuted," is an affirmation in itself to Joseph's innocence. The letter stated:

Dear Brother Pratt,—I spent a day or two in Manchester a few weeks since. Whilst there I was shown a large bill purporting to have been issued by a Mr. Paul Harrison, who styles himself "formerly an Elder of the Church of Jesus Christ of Latter-day Saints," . . . He gave notice of his intention, upon an evening named, to make a general exposé of the various enormities believed in and practised by the Latter-day Saints. . . .

Upon enquiry I ascertained that he was formerly a member of the church, but was excommunicated sometime since for adultery and other transgressions; and now, like Satan after he fell from heaven, he is going about and bringing railing accusations against the Saints. He is accompanied by two women, one of whom, I suppose, is his wife, while the other holds the station of FEMALE friend. Whilst he is lecturing one of them stands at the door to receive the pennies, and the other is engaged in hawking pamphlets, purporting to contain copious extracts from a work entitled the *Peace Maker*, which he says was written and published by Joseph Smith, in Nauvoo, sometime in 1842, in proof of which he exhibits an original copy, with Mr. Smith's name attached as printer.

It is this last *crowning* falsehood that has led me to notice him. Was it not that I am desirous that no honest-hearted man or woman should be deceived with regard to the origin of this book, and thus be led to associate the name of Joseph Smith with such a nonsensical medley of stuff as it contains, I should consider it entirely unnecessary to pay the least attention whatever to the low scurrilous mess of balderdash of

which both his lectures and pamphlets are made up.

Sometime previous to the year 1842, Mr. Smith established a printing office in the city of Nauvoo, for the purpose of printing the various publications of the church, and executing job work for the convenience of the public. He placed a foreman over it to take charge of the printing department, and although the business was done in his name, it was frequently the case that he was not inside the office once in a month. A Mr. Udney H. Jacobs, not a member of the church, who lived a short distance from Nauvoo, came to the office and wished the foreman to print several hundred copies of a work, entitled the *Peace Maker*, written by himself. The foreman did so, and of course attached Mr. Smith's name as printer, who was entirely ignorant of the matter until he saw the work in print, with his name attached. Feeling indignant that his name should be associated, even in the character of printer, with the author of such a work, he immediately published an article in the *Times and Seasons*, vol. 4 page 32, dated Dec. 1st 1842, expressive of his feelings, that there might be no misunderstanding of the matter in the mind of any person whatever. A copy of which I subjoin.

“There was a book printed at my office a short time since, written by Udney H. Jacobs, on marriage; and had I been apprised of it, I should not have printed it; not that I am opposed to any man enjoying his privileges; but I do not wish my name associated with the author's in such an unmeaning rigmale of nonsense, folly and trash.”

“JOSEPH SMITH.”

Taking it for granted that enough has been written upon this subject, I close by subscribing myself, your brother in the gospel of peace,

ELI B. KELSEY.

(*Millennial Star* 12 [March 15, 1850]: 92–93)

Jacob Admitted to Brigham Young that He Wrote *The Peace Maker*

In March 1851 Udney Jacob wrote a letter to Brigham Young in which he stated that he had written *The Peace Maker*.

After being rebaptized in 1845, Udney had followed Brigham Young to Utah, where he was ordained a high priest.

An incident occurred in Salt Lake City which caused Udney to feel it was necessary to make a statement to President Young about *The Peace Maker*. An individual, who signed himself “Elijah,” wrote some papers and posted them on the Bowery, which was an outside meeting place where preaching services were held. Evidently Brigham Young and other leaders were not pleased with Elijah’s message. In attempting to discover the identity of the author of the papers, it was recalled that within *The Peace Maker* Jacob had declared himself to be Elijah. This made him a prime suspect. Jacob was informed that President Young suspected him of being the one who posted the papers at the Bowery. To dispel all doubt of his involvement, he wrote President Brigham Young, saying:

I cannot imagine why you suspected me unless it was that I wrote a pamphlet some years since entitled the *Peace Maker*—you have certainly a wrong idea of that matter. I was not then a member of this Church, and that pamphlet was not written for this people [the Latter Day Saints] but for the citizens of the United States who professed to believe the Bible. (*Brigham Young University Studies* 9 [Autumn 1968]: 52–53)

Once again it is evident that Jacob testified that he wrote *The Peace Maker*, which agreed with Joseph’s declaration that he knew nothing of the pamphlet until after its publication. Jacob and Joseph’s testimonies agree! But the majority of writers in the past have ignored the testimonies of both men in their efforts to convict Joseph of the crime of polygamy.

John D. Lee Proclaimed the “Feeler” Theory

In spite of the many evidences that the Prophet had no part in *The Peace Maker*, the rumor remained alive and grew among the LDS Church members. An example of this is found in the biography of Bishop John D. Lee, who was executed for his part in the Mountain Meadows Massacre. Lee said:

During the winter, Joseph, the Prophet, set a man by the name of Sidney [Udney] Hay Jacobs, to select from the Old Bible such scriptures as pertained to polygamy, or celestial marriage, and to write it in pamphlet form, and to advocate that doctrine. This he did as a *feeler* among the people, to pave the way for celestial marriage. This like all other notions, met with opposition, while a few favored it. The excitement among the people became so great that the subject was laid before the Prophet. No one was more opposed to it [*The Peace Maker*] than was his brother Hyrum, who denounced it as from beneath. Joseph saw that it would break up the Church, should he sanction it, so he denounced the pamphlet through the *Wasp* [the *Times and Seasons*], a newspaper published at Nauvoo, by E. Robinson, as a bundle of nonsense and trash. He said if he had known its contents he would never have permitted it to be published, while at the same time other confidential men were advocating it on their own responsibility. (John D. Lee, *Mormonism Unveiled; or the Life and Confessions of the Late Mormon Bishop, John D. Lee*, 1877, 146; italics added)

Lee gave no references to support his allegations against the Prophet. However, there was no way that he could truthfully reference his statement that “during the winter” Joseph directed Udney to write a pamphlet to “pave the way for celestial marriage.” Which winter did Lee have reference to? It could not have been the winter of 1838–1839, for Joseph was in Missouri that entire winter—a prisoner in the Liberty Jail. Or, was Lee inferring that Joseph directed Jacob to write the pamphlet in the winter of 1839–1840? Such was also impossible because Joseph was not in Nauvoo that winter either. The Prophet moved to Commerce (Nauvoo) in May 1839, and left there on October 29, 1839, to journey to Washington, D.C., to seek redress for losses suffered by the Saints in Missouri.

The Prophet arrived home just fifteen days before Udney wrote his March 19, 1840, letter to President Van Buren, informing him that he had a manuscript [*The Peace Maker*] ready for publication. Udney’s manuscript was evidently lengthy, for

the extract published at Nauvoo was taken only from chapters eighteen and nineteen. The extract consisted of thirty-seven pages—so if the other chapters were of the same length, the manuscript could have been over three hundred pages. This would have taken Udney months or years to research and write in longhand.

It should be remembered that Bishop John D. Lee was Brigham Young's adopted son. Young's will was Lee's will. Lee's statement is an example of the propolygamists' development and use of the false theory which states that Joseph had Udney write *The Peace Maker* to see how the Saints would respond to polygamy. There is another statement by Lee in the above, which is of major importance. His assertion that "... at the same time [that *The Peace Maker* was published] other confidential men [men other than Joseph] were advocating it [polygamy] on their own responsibility." This, of course, included Brigham Young and others, who were already either secretly practicing or advocating polygamy.

Fawn Brodie Unquestioningly Accepted the "Feeler" Theory

Fawn M. Brodie also gave credence to the false theory as late as 1945 in her book *No Man Knows My History*. She was one of the most noted of a number of writers who published an alleged exposé of Joseph's life, emphasizing the sensational. Her book has been hailed as one of the best-written and most-authentic documentations of Joseph's life. However, she followed the same line as popular writers by declaring that Joseph was a polygamist. She failed to consider the possibility that Joseph could have been telling the truth when he denounced *The Peace Maker*. In reference to it, Brodie wrote:

To break the ground before sowing broadcast the seeds of his [Joseph's] new doctrine [of polygamy], Joseph's press published a pamphlet in defense of polygamy by one Udney H. Jacob. Jacob produced a document of astonishing sophistication, advocating polygamy. . . . This pamphlet was published in 1842 in Nauvoo under the prophet's auspices (the title-page lists J. Smith as printer), although he was quickly

forced to denounce it. (Fawn M. Brodie, *No Man Knows My History*, 298–299)

Brodie made the charge that Joseph “was quickly forced to denounce” the pamphlet, without giving her source for that charge. In what way was the Prophet forced? There is no evidence that the Saints blamed Joseph for the publication of the pamphlet on the Church’s press, for it was common knowledge that the Twelve, and not the Prophet, were in charge of the publishing arm of the Church at that time. It is evident that the Prophet denounced Udney’s pamphlet of his own free will because he found it to be, as he declared, “an unmeaning rigmarole of nonsense, folly, and trash.” Brodie’s charge was unfounded and false.

Imogene Goodyear’s Use of *The Peace Maker*

In 1983 the Liberal Revisionists, who had taken control of the RLDS Church, were secretly making an effort to discard all Restoration distinctives and turn the Church into a liberal, Protestant denomination. One step in accomplishing this goal was to discredit Joseph Smith—for if the Saints should lose confidence in him, the rest would be easy. Accordingly, Church Historian Richard P. Howard wrote a paper, which was approved by the Church’s Joint Council, entitled “The Changing RLDS Response to Mormon Polygamy: A Preliminary Analysis” (*The John Whitmer Historical Association Journal* 3 [1983]: 14–29). In the paper Howard stated that the RLDS belief had changed from the belief that Joseph was innocent of polygamy to now believing that he was the author of it.

The paper was read in 1983 at a meeting of the John Whitmer Historical Society Association, and Imogene Goodyear made a “response” to it. At the time Goodyear, also a Revisionist, was “a member of the Editorial Department at Herald Publishing House” (see Imogene Goodyear, “Joseph Smith and Polygamy: An Alternative View,” *John Whitmer Historical Society Journal* 4 [1984]: 16). In her analysis she agreed with Howard’s stance of branding Joseph a polygamist, and referred

to *The Peace Maker* as proof. Goodyear wrote:

[Lawrence] Foster cites a pamphlet defending polygamy printed by the Mormon press in 1842, titled *The Peace Maker, or the Doctrine of the Millennium*, as evidence of Joseph's reaction to the women's movement. . . .

Although Joseph disclaimed authorship, the pamphlet contained ideas "strikingly similar to those Smith was formulating at the time as the rationale for temple sealing ceremonies connected in part with polygamy." (ibid., 18–19)

The suggestion that *The Peace Maker* was written, or printed, by Joseph as an evidence of Joseph's reaction "to the women's movement" is without foundation. What Imogene Goodyear did not consider, or explore, was the possibility that a "rationale for temple sealing ceremonies connected in part with polygamy" was the work of Brigham Young and those leaders who thought and believed as he did—and not Joseph's work—as the Mormons and the Community of Christ leaders choose to believe. They have never addressed the possibility that Joseph was honest, and that his denials of involvement with polygamy were words of truth.

Lawrence Foster Stressed the "Feeler" Theory

Imogene Goodyear quoted from a book by Lawrence Foster in which he called *The Peace Maker* a "brilliant" and "remarkable thirty-seven-page pamphlet defending polygamy" (Lawrence Foster, *Religion and Sexuality—The Shakers, the Mormons, and the Oneida Community*, 174). Foster stated that the authorship of *The Peace Maker* was "deliberately vague" (which it definitely was not) and implied that Udney was in "a leadership position in the Church" (ibid., 174–175), while the evidence shows that he was not a member, and had not even met Joseph when the pamphlet was published. Foster stated that "Smith mildly dissociated himself from the publication in a brief statement in the *Times and Seasons*," and that "the pamphlet was put forward as a 'feeler' to test Church opinion but was disowned when public reaction proved too unfavorable" (ibid., 175–176).

The failure by many to consider the possibility that Joseph's testimony about *The Peace Maker* could be relied on, demonstrates how much the Prophet's character, his integrity and honesty, has been damaged by those who charged him with introducing polygamy.

A Chronological Account of Joseph and Jacob's Activities

Since incorrect beliefs seem to never die (such as believing that Joseph had Udney write *The Peace Maker* to test the Saints' tolerance for polygamy), the following time line is provided. It shows that Joseph and Udney could not have cooperated in producing that pamphlet, because they were never together while it was being written:

Early 1830s—Udney Jacob, his wife, adult children and their families, lived at Pilot Grove, Hancock County, Illinois.

February 1, 1831—Joseph and Emma Smith moved from Pennsylvania to Kirtland, Ohio, arriving there February 1, 1831.

March 14, 1838—Joseph and Emma moved from Kirtland in January 1838, and arrived at their new home in Far West, Missouri, on this date.

October 31, 1838—Joseph Smith and other Church men were arrested at Far West on false charges. Joseph was imprisoned for a period of five-and-a-half months—most of that time in the dungeon of the jail at Liberty, Missouri.

April 16, 1839—Joseph, Hyrum, and others, with the help of their guards, were allowed to escape.

April 22, 1839—Joseph arrived in Quincy, Illinois, where he found Emma and their children.

May 10, 1839—Joseph and his family moved into a two-room log cabin at Commerce, Illinois (Commerce later became Nauvoo).

August 1839—Udney Jacob's daughter, Mary Jane, was married to Milton Hamilton at Pilot Grove in Hancock County (*The Record of Norton Jacob*, 2).

October 29, 1839—Joseph, Sidney Rigdon, Judge Elias Higbee, and Porter Rockwell left for Washington, D.C., to lay before Congress their grievances for the persecution of the

Saints in Missouri.

March 4, 1840—Joseph arrived back home in Nauvoo.

March 19, 1840—Udney Jacob wrote a lengthy letter to President Martin Van Buren, requesting him to provide finances to publish his manuscript of *The Peace Maker*, which he had already written.

Summer 1840—Udney Jacob's son, Norton Jacob, read a pamphlet written by Parley P. Pratt, which sparked his interest in the Church (*The Record of Norton Jacob*, 4).

Fall and Winter 1840—Norton Jacob attended preaching services held by Church elders in the vicinity of Pilot Grove, and "obtained" and "read with much interest" Parley P. Pratt's *Voice of Warning* (ibid.).

March 15, 1841—Norton was baptized at La Harpe by Seventy Zenos Gurley, Sr. Udney said, according to Norton, that "he had rather heard I was dead than that I was a Mormon" (ibid).

February 6, 1842—Ebenezer Robinson, owner, editor, and printer of the *Times and Seasons* sold the entire printing establishment to the Twelve. He wrote, "I gave possession of the establishment, to Willard Richards the purchaser on the behalf of the Twelve; at which time my responsibility ceased as editor" (*Times and Seasons* 3 [February 15, 1842]: 729).

February 15, 1842—It was announced that the Prophet Joseph Smith was the new editor of the *Times and Seasons*, with Apostle John Taylor assistant editor (see ibid., 695)—but Joseph had very little time for editorial work.

August 8, 1842—A deputy sheriff from Adams County and two assistants arrested Joseph based on an affidavit signed by ex-Governor Boggs of Missouri. Joseph escaped from his would-be captors and went into hiding until late December 1842, after the new Illinois governor had taken office.

Fall of 1842—Udney Jacob's pamphlet, *The Peace Maker*, was published on the *Times and Seasons* press at Nauvoo.

November 1, 1842—Norton moved his family into Nauvoo (*The Record of Norton Jacob*, 4).

December 1, 1842—Joseph Smith issued his statement in which he announced that he did not want his name associated

with Udney's pamphlet.

1843—Udney was baptized into the Church. A problem arose in the Pilot Grove Branch, where he attended, and he had his name removed from the Church record (*ibid.*, 12).

January 26, 1844—Udney wrote a letter to Joseph Smith in which he said, "I have not to be sure the pleasure of a personal acquaintance with you" (*Brigham Young University Studies* 9 [Autumn 1968]: 53).

June 27, 1844—Joseph and Hyrum Smith were murdered at Carthage Jail.

November 2, 1845—Udney Jacob was rebaptized by Norton Jacob and confirmed by Norton, assisted by Zenos Gurley (see *The Record of Norton Jacob*, 12).

March 15, 1850—Eli B. Kelsey's letter was published in the *Millennial Star* in England. Kelsey defended Joseph against charges by Paul Harrison that the Prophet participated in the writing and publishing of *The Peace Maker* (see *Millennial Star* 12 [March 15, 1850]: 92–93).

March 1851—Udney Jacob wrote a letter to President Brigham Young, in which he stated that he wrote the *Peace Maker* and that he published it before he was a member of the Church (see *Brigham Young University Studies* 9 [Autumn 1968]: 52–53).

Conclusion

This chronological listing is additional proof that Joseph and Udney did not know each other before *The Peace Maker* was published; and therefore, Joseph did not "set" Udney to write *The Peace Maker*. They did not have the time to work together on the manuscript—they did not even know each other. The "feeler" theory was developed and perpetuated by those who wanted to make polygamy a doctrine of the Church, with Joseph as its author. It did not matter how many times Joseph bore a testimony against polygamy. There were those who wanted to believe he was the author of it, so they chose not to believe that he spoke the truth. However, it can no longer be denied that there is ample evidence which shows agreement between the testimonies of Udney Jacob and Joseph Smith—that Joseph had no part in producing *The Peace Maker*.